CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS
International Research Conference

Women’s Entrepreneurship Conference Bangkok
17-19 April 201

Published by Bangkok University Press | Edited by David Achtzehn | ISBN 978-974-219-348-5
Foreword

This conference proceedings collection includes full papers or extended abstracts of research work presented at Women Entrepreneurship Conference Bangkok 2017 (WECB 2017). Authors retain copyright of their work.

Women’s entrepreneurship has been identified as an increasingly important contributor for economic growth and welfare, in particular for developing nations. In South East Asia alone there are 61 million female entrepreneurs, more than in Europe and the USA combined. Thailand presents a particularly interesting case as it is the only countries in the world where both nascent and established female business owners outnumber their male counterparts (GEM, 2015).

The papers presented in this proceeding aimed at investigate women’s entrepreneurship in a variety of cultural and contextual settings, with an emphasis on analysing the strengths, challenges and business models of female entrepreneurs as well as strategies to promote and support women entrepreneurship.

Topics include:
- Women’s Entrepreneurship Education
- Gender, Leadership and Professional Development
- Women’s Entrepreneurship Development in Special Contexts
- Values, Business Models and Growth of Women Entrepreneurs
- Institutional Context and Women’s Entrepreneurship
- Women’s Entrepreneurship and Finance
- Women’s Entrepreneurship and Networking
- Case studies focusing on female entrepreneurs

The three day international research conference was co-organised by Bangkok University School of Entrepreneurship and Management (BUSEM) and the Entrepreneurship Centre at the University of Cambridge, with the financial support of the British Council (Newton Fund) and the National Science Technology and Innovation Policy Office (STI).
## Table of Content

### Women's entrepreneurship education  
Pages 5-49  
Warhuus, Jan P. and Jones, Sally - A Cross-Cultural Analysis of Student Entrepreneurship Course Choice: The Impact of Gendered Language  
Gatchalian, Maria Luisa B. - A Holistic Entrepreneurship Teaching Model For Young Women in Tertiary Education  
Tang, Edward S. et al. - Entrepreneurship Education for Female Students: Fear of Failure or Courageous Entrepreneur?  

### Gender, Leadership and Professional Development  
Pages 50-89  
Karki, Shova Thapa and Xheneti, Mirela - Entrepreneurial Motivations, Aspirations and Formalisation Decisions amongst Informal Women Entrepreneurs in Nepal  
Al-Jubari, Ibrahim et al. - Investigating Entrepreneurial Intention of Female Undergraduates in Malaysia: The Role of Education, Motivation  
Wongsangiam, Jarupat et al. - The Proposed Model of the Measurement of Gender Differences and Family Background towards Entrepreneurial Orientation and Intention of University Students in Thailand  
Louangrath, Paul - Gender Difference in Entrepreneurial Intent

### Women’s Entrepreneurship Development in Special Contexts  
Pages 90-120  
Bhandari, Asha and Bhandari, Jitesh - Women Prisoners and their Social Integration: A Case Study of Model of Vocational Training and Entrepreneurship in India  
Handayani, Wuri and Sasongko - Weapon of the Weak: Experience of Disabled Female Entrepreneurs in Indonesia  
Chande, Sunanda and Pradhan, Kamini - Developing Women’s Entrepreneurship through Self Help Groups

### Values, Business Models and Growth of Women Entrepreneurs  
Pages 121-165  
Puaprongpitag, Suteera and Taylor, John - Towards Knowledge-Based Entrepreneurship: a Case Study of the University Outreach and the Delivering of Knowledge Service to Agricultural Enterprises Led by Women Entrepreneurs in the UK  
Sheikh, Shandana et al. - Social value creation through women’s entrepreneurial activity in Pakistan  
Basuki, Whysnianti - Female Entrepreneurs and their Aspiration towards Business Growth

### Institutional Context and Women’s Entrepreneurship  
Pages 165-206  
Guelich, Ulrike - Fear of Failure – Advocate or Bar to Urgency-driven Innovation?  
Leetrakun, Paweena and Jeenaboornrueng, Siripan - The Role of Women’s Economic Empowerment in Thailand’s Special Economic Zone (SEZ)  
McNally, Beverley and Khoury, Grace - Challenges to Women’s Entrepreneurial Performance: A Cross-Country Comparison in the Arab region  
Martinez Dy, Angela et al. – Gender and Enterprise Network: Analysing a UK Social Change Venture Autoethnography through Narrative

### Women’s Entrepreneurship and Finance  
Pages 207-238  
Guelich, Hans and Guelich, Ulrike - Crowdfunding – a dawn of hope for women entrepreneurs and their start-ups in Thailand?  
Sappleton, Natalie - Who gives, to whom and for what? The Impact of Gender Stereotyping on Crowdfunding Success  
Woodhams, Carol and Perkins, Graham - Small Businesses and Access to Start-up Capital: Exploring Gender Differences
Women's Entrepreneurship and Networking
Jiang, Nan and Xian, Huiping - Negotiating the Female Leader Role in Family Business Succession in Mainland China
Sheikh, Shandana et al. - Role of Social Capital in Opportunity Creation of women entrepreneurs: Case studies from Turkey and Wales
Schmidt, Klaudia – Behind every successful woman, is there a man?

Case studies focusing on female entrepreneurs
Prompatanapak, Arthon - Limitation of Young Female Entrepreneurs in Thailand
Chatterjee, Abha and Shaik, Rihana - excluded from proceeding
Doepping, Jesper - A Case Study of Female Entrepreneurship and the Construction of Strategy and Customers in the Service Industry
Women’s entrepreneurship education
A CROSS-CULTURAL ANALYSIS OF STUDENT ENTREPRENEURSHIP COURSE CHOICE: THE IMPACT OF GENDERED LANGUAGE

Dr. Jan P. Warhuus, Assistant Professor in Entrepreneurship
Department of Management, Bartholins Allé 10, DK-8000 Aarhus C, School of Business and Social Sciences, Aarhus University, Denmark. jan.warhuus@mgmt.au.dk.

Dr. Sally Jones, Reader in Entrepreneurship and Gender Studies
Sylvia Pankhurst Gender Research Centre, Faculty of Business and Law, Manchester Metropolitan University, Manchester, United Kingdom. sjones@mmu.ac.uk

INTRODUCTION

This paper examines the gendering of entrepreneurship in university entrepreneurship education (EntEd). It extends knowledge of the masculinization of entrepreneurship (Ahl, 2006; Jones 2015) into education and contributes to growing literature on critical entrepreneurship studies (CES). We analyze student responses to fictional EntEd course descriptions that use masculine-typed, feminine-typed and neutral language. In doing so we provide unique insights into students’ response to gendered language and its impact on course choice.

Today, most university students are women (OECD, 2013), yet they account for only a third of graduate entrepreneurs (Martínez et al, 2007). This disproportionate state is often explained by entrepreneurship’s masculinized image, which can act as a barrier to women (Ahl, 2006; Gupta et al, 2014). Indeed, there are ongoing calls for universities to examine and audit their approaches to attracting students to EntEd (Rae et al, 2012). In doing so, Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) would be better informed about who engages with and benefits from EntEd. This research addresses such concerns, offering insights on student EntEd course choice.

For feminist scholars, gender refers to socially produced distinctions between men and women (Acker, 1990). Subsequently, we take an approach to gender that distinguishes it from mainstream use as another term for biological sex. As such, we explore socially constructed notions and, in this context ‘sex’ “denotes the grouping of people into male and female categories whereas the term gender refers to the meanings that societies and individuals ascribe to these categories” (Malach-Pines & Schwartz, 2008:811).

Our previous research (Jones & Warhuus, 2014) found that university EntEd course descriptions mobilize gendered language and discourses depending on their approach. Three main approaches have been identified in EntED. The first are courses about entrepreneurship as an academic subject and social science phenomenon. In contrast, courses teaching skills for entrepreneurship and courses focused on students learning through entrepreneurship experiments and practical participation, focus on preparing students to become entrepreneurs (Heinonen & Hytti, 2010; Pittaway & Edwards, 2012). Our research suggests that there are indeed variations in the way that different approaches, and their suggested outcomes, are described, and this is reflected in the gendering of language used, with about-type courses using more feminine language and through-type courses using highly masculinized language.

We therefore ask four questions: i) What response does gendered language elicit in students? ii) How do such responses impact on their course preference? iii) Does the national-level cultural context affect student course choice? iv) Is it possible to write a feminized course description and would students prefer it when given the choice? This is all the more important, given that the positive, inspirational impacts of EntEd are greater for women than men who pursue university EntEd (Packham et al, 2010).
Course descriptions could therefore, act as a barrier for some students in exploring their entrepreneurial potential and developing skills and knowledge that are highly prized in broader society.

The paper starts by considering the impact of gendered language before exploring its influence on entrepreneurship discourses and how these might play out in EntEd. We then outline how students and universities use course descriptions to choose and promote EntEd courses. Next, we describe our methodology, before presenting and discussing emerging findings and their implications.

THE IMPACT OF GENDERED LANGUAGE
The word 'sexism' was coined in the 1960s (Miller & Swift, 1987) and the negative impacts of gendered language have been debated ever since (e.g., Lakoff, 2004 [1975]). Three main perspectives on the development and impact of gendered language are suggested: essentialist, environmentalist and constructionist (Leaper & Bigler, 2004). Essentialists view men and women as intrinsically different in their use of language, while environmentalists view environmentally gendered cues and norms as having the strongest influence on perceptions of and use of gendered language. Rather than viewing students as essentially ‘male’ or ‘female’, or as passively receiving and complying with gender cues, we take a constructionist approach, viewing students as ‘active agents who seek to extract and understand the important social categories in their environment” (Leaper & Bigler 2004:130).

Gender is not a proxy for biological sex and we should not presume that men will necessarily relate to masculine language and women to feminine language. However, men and women can have different responses to the cues they receive from gendered language, given different environmental and social influences, and related gendered expectations. (Ridgeway & Correll, 2004). We therefore, take a social feminist stance, which allies to our constructionist approach in recognizing “…difference but in a context of equality. This difference arises essentially from socialization processes which shape gendered forms of behavior.” (Marlow & Patton, 2005:721).

The use of, and responses to, gendered language can be subtler than the obviously sexist of using ‘he’ when talking about entrepreneurs or using terms like ‘businessman’. It can take more nuanced forms, in language that is often (subconsciously) linked to gendered stereotypes and assumptions. For example, Bem’s Sex Role Inventory (1974) is widely used to investigate the tacit assumptions linked to gender, with words such as ‘competitive’, ‘assertive’ and ‘risk-taking’ associated with masculinity, and words such as ‘gentle’, ‘yielding’ and ‘shy’, with femininity. When we add to this the unspoken assumption that masculinity and femininity directly correlate with the male and female sex categories, we can see how entrepreneurship might be positioned as a masculinized activity which is, by association, more accessible to those who relate to and/or enact masculine behaviors. Indeed, so pervasive are gender-binaries, gender hierarchies and gender cues that social cognition is said to be imbued with an ‘automacity of gender’ (Lemm et al, 2005:220).

With these issues in mind, since the 1980s there has been a call to use gender-neutral, and/or gender-free language in policies and text books and job advertisements (see Maggio, 1987 and UNESCO, 1999 for example guidelines). Such arguments move beyond the suggestion that gendered language is biased and sexist, and argue that gender-neutral language has more clarity and precision, and is less ambiguous (Kabba, 2011).

THE GENDERING OF ENTREPRENEURSHIP
The way that society understands entrepreneurship has been influenced by those who have developed it as a theoretical concept. In the twentieth century the development of entrepreneurship theory was greatly influenced by Schumpeter (1934). His ideas have been described as ‘an attempt to draw a large canvas setting out the forces that shaped Western culture’ (Zassenhaus, 1981: 179). Gomez and Korine (2008: 37) suggest that, for Schumpeter, ‘the entrepreneur takes the place in modern society
held in ancient society by the warrior’. This view is still prevalent today, with television programs such as The Apprentice presenting entrepreneurship as combative, status driven and all-conquering, with humiliation and rejection being the ‘price’ of failure (Swail et al, 2013). Contemporary thinkers continue to engage with these historically masculinized, and yet gender-blind, ideas of entrepreneurship (Ahl, 2004). This prompts suggestions that entrepreneurship is socially-constructed, co-opted and re-imagined to suit the perceived needs of a particular place and time (Chell, 2008). Such discursive constructions also ‘confer significance on the “world-making” actions of men alone’ (Fowler, 2005:5).

It seems counter-intuitive, but historical concentration on the male entrepreneur creates a sense of gender-neutrality, given that the male experience is traditionally positioned as the ‘human experience’ (Lewis, 2006). For this reason researchers argue for critical engagement with the very concepts upon which entrepreneurship is based (Ahl and Marlow, 2012); concepts that effectively normalize western, masculine-typified behaviors as entrepreneurial (Ogbor, 2000). In an increasingly ethnically diverse and female dominated university environment, this is problematic.

**Gender and Entrepreneurship Education**

The experiences and perceptions of entrepreneurship, developed at university, are an important precursor to entrepreneurial intentions and activity. In the UK, self-employed women are more likely to have a degree than female employees (Brooksbank, 2006) and self-employed males (NCGE, 2006). However, across European HEIs, male graduates are twice as likely as their female counterparts to have set up a business within four years of graduation (Martínez et al., 2007). This gender disparity has not lessened over time and there are ongoing calls for more women to become entrepreneurs (European Commission, 2012).

With contestation around what entrepreneurship is (Pittaway & Cope 2007; Trivedi 2014) and with its tendency to privilege traditionally masculinized behaviors and attitudes, there is a danger that, in seeking to encourage entrepreneurship, we are encouraging students to develop and internalize masculinized behaviours (Joness, 2014, 2015). Indeed, business students may already be conditioned to see masculine language as the norm, compared to the general population (Malach-Pines and Schwartz, 2008), and this ‘asymmetric gender social representation…hinders the acceptance of women as a social group.’ (Fernandes and Cabral-Cardoso, 2003:77). For these reasons, Simpson (2006:183) suggests that we should feminize business schools through challenging ‘hegemonic discourses of masculinity that underpin management education and set alternative orientations against this’.

Additionally, different types of EntEd course may attract particular students and incentivize them to become entrepreneurs to varying degrees. In examining EntEd in UK universities, Levie (1999) identified two main types of course; about-entrepreneurship, where entrepreneurship is studied as a ‘social phenomenon’ in a ‘detached manner’ (Laukkonen, 2000: 27) and for-entrepreneurship, focused on ‘what to do and how to make it happen’ (Laukkonen, 2000:26). More recently, a third type through-entrepreneurship have been suggested as promoting ‘personal involvement and learning through participation in entrepreneurial activities (Heinonen & Hytti, 2010).

In constructing such different courses, educators arguably have an ‘ideal’ student in mind when writing course descriptions. Course descriptions also delineate learning outcomes and how student knowledge, behaviors and abilities will change as a result. Subsequently, we argue that course descriptions offer insights into educator constructions of the ‘Fictive Student’, the student to which the curriculum is addressed; Bourdieu and Passeron (1990) argue that examples of ‘ideal’ students who take an educator’s course merely confirm this fiction exists and perpetuate the continuation of these practices.

**THE ROLE OF COURSE DESCRIPTIONS FOR STUDENTS AND HEIS**
The course catalogue and individual course descriptions within it, are important documents for any university. For students, the course description is equivalent to a product declaration. In many cases the course description is the most comprehensive body of information available to students and are an important precursor to course choice (Wilhelm & Comegys, 2004). Indeed, an exploratory survey we conducted with Danish students found that, of 73 students surveyed, 72 (99%) used the course descriptions with 51 (70%) indicating they only used the course description to select their courses.

Course descriptions have some limitations as a dataset (Pittaway & Edwards, 2012). At many institutions they are cumbersome to revise with long approval processes (Liddy, 2012) and change slowly. However, they have been used to study course selection (Babad & Tayeb, 2003; Della Giaia, 2008; Wolf, 2009) and practices in EntEd (Pittaway & Edwards, 2012; Warhuus & Basaiawmoit, 2014). Despite the limitations, they are the only texts available where educators address their audience—the Fictive Student—and, in their own words, express an understanding of what entrepreneurship is and what the Fictive Entrepreneur is like before students choose courses. Thus, in a previous study (Jones & Warhuus, 2014) we examined 86 course descriptions from HEIs in 21 countries. Our discourse analyses indicated that it is more common for educators to describe an about-course in gender-neutral terms and that course aims and learning outcomes are more generally academic. However, the masculinization of the entrepreneurship discipline is evident through-courses, where students engage directly with the entrepreneurial process. This might be linked with the supposed passivity of ‘thinking’ or learning about rather than actively ‘doing’ entrepreneurship. It may also be that, in order to emphasize the ‘doing’ rather than the ‘thinking’, more active than passive words are used, and these are invariably positioned as masculine in many cultures. The masculine language also emphasized the intellectual and visionary capacities needed to be successful and the competitive environment in which these individualized activities take place.

In light of our findings, we argue that an analysis based on course descriptions is an unobstructed way to achieve a focus on the role of the EntEd in reproducing or challenging traditionally gendered constructions of entrepreneurship. Additionally, we find no other studies like this in terms of scope and comparison, as we drew upon course descriptions from different continents, nations, and cultures to allow for cross-national analyses (following Janssen & Bacq, 2010; Janssen et al, 2013).

METHODOLOGY
Based on our previous research we created a suite of course descriptions consisting of seven one-page documents. They were based primarily on masculine and feminine words and phrases identified in existing course descriptions and covered combinations of gendered language and course types as illustrated in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Masculine</th>
<th>Feminine</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>About</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Course catalogue descriptions based on gender orientation and course type Note: The numbers indicate the order in which the course descriptions were presented in the participant package provided to the students.

With the differences in our previous work, and the relationship between culture and gender in mind, there was a strong justification for carefully considering the study setting(s). Two considerations drove this process. First, we sought nations that were different and yet comparable and, second, we wanted nations and cultures where English was the first or second language and institutions where most or many courses were taught in English. We used Hofstede’s (2006, 2001) studies and the GLOBE study
(House et al., 2004) to identify suitable nations. In this case we identified nations scoring differently on Hofstede’s femininity-masculinity index\(^1\), and with similar scores on the GLOBE gender egalitarianism index\(^2\). As a result we chose Denmark (DK), and the United States (US). Within these nations we selected business students, because entrepreneurship is generally viewed as a business discipline and, thus, choosing an entrepreneurship course is likely to be viewed as a ‘real’ consideration.

We introduced participants to the data production session, without revealing the course type or gendered nature of our research. Any concerns and practical issues were addressed at this point. The participants were then given a 16-page package consisting of: a front page; a table of contents; a consent form; a survey of entrepreneurial experience and exposure; step-by-step instructions and the seven course descriptions; and, a four-question survey about the course selections they had just made. Participants were asked to read the course descriptions and were prompted to make a total of five choices, as follows: i) Between a feminine and masculine framed For-type course; ii). Between a feminine, a neutral and a masculine framed About-type course; iii). The participant was then told that the neutral-framed course in #2 would not be offered this semester and, if the neutral course was selected as preferred, the participant would have to choose between the masculine and the feminine framed courses instead; iv) Between a feminine and a masculine framed Through-type course; v) To state an overall preference by “deselecting” two of the three courses chosen in choice 1, 2 and 4, above.

During the selection process participants were asked to follow a Think-Aloud Protocol (TAP), where they recorded a ‘voice memo’ on a smartphone, and were asked to ‘say anything that goes through your mind’ as they were reading and deciding which courses to choose. In making their choices they were also asked to explain why they chose as they did and how certain they were that they had made the right decision.

Afterwards, the participant packages were collected and arrangements for transfer of the voice recordings were made. Following that, most of the students participated in focus group debrief sessions. Each focus group was facilitated by a researcher and audio recorded.

RESULTS AND ANALYSIS
We collected 50 student accounts and five focus group sessions. Analysis is ongoing and in the following, we present analyses based on 50 participant-packages (survey answers and five course selection choices), plus content analysis (of 20 transcribed TAPs) and discourse analyses (of 12 TAP recordings), presenting an equal number of randomly selected female and male DK and US students.

National differences
The US and Danish students are comparable in terms of age (average age is 22), major (business), and predominately male (80% of US students, 56% of DK students). This is broadly in line with the male/female ratio studying business courses in these nations (Amundsen, 2016; Zlomek, 2016). Relevant to this study may be differences in the students’ work experience and exposure to parent’s self-employment. For example, 84% of the DK students vs. 28% of the US students, had a part-time job, and 44% of DK cases vs. 64% US had at least one parent who was, or had previously been, self-employed.

Collectively, the 50 participants made 211 choices between course descriptions, with the gender distribution as indicated in Table 2.

---

\(^1\) the degree to which a culture will be driven by competition and winner-take-all type success [high score] vs. [low score] the degree to which success can be measured as quality of life and standing out is less admirable

\(^2\) the degree to which a culture minimizes gender inequality.
Table 2: Course selection by gender and nationality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>DK</th>
<th>US</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Masculine</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feminine</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: the portion of Neutral choices is likely to be underrepresented as the option is available only in two of the five choices made (choice 2 and 5).

Although the proportion of female students is lower in the US cohort, US students prefer feminine-framed descriptions more often than DK students, and DK students prefer the masculine courses about one and a half times more often than US students. This is surprising, given the more feminine Danish culture. We presume that there are a number of factors involved. First, there are other cultural differences, such as power distance (DK/US: 18/40), uncertainty avoidance (DK/US 23/46), and the GLOBE assertiveness index (DK/US 3.6/4.4). These differences may be more pronounced in educational settings than in the business settings, where most national culture data originates. The more in-depth TAP suggests US students deliberately looked for clues about both what and how to learn that suggested fewer surprises. They were also far more sensitive to language perceived as intimidating.

In the fifth and final choice, each student was asked to state an overall course preference. Forty-eight answered this question and here the overall picture, in Table 2, was confirmed; the final choice for a feminine-framed course was DK 38% vs US 58% and none of the US students had the neutral option as their final choice. Regarding course type, an interesting trend is observed in Table 3.

Table 3: Final course selection by course type and nationality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>DK</th>
<th>US</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>About</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Danish students were more open to taking an about-course than the US ones, and less interested in acquiring skills or experiences of being an entrepreneur, than them. Indeed, while US students in focus groups shared the view of ‘practical’ as positive, a DK student said the reason for deselecting the through-course is that he ‘would like a little bit more academic approach’ and while at the university, he wanted to obtain ‘solid knowledge’.

Male/Female differences

By regrouping the participants by sex rather than nationality (Table 4), we explored how male and female students responded to gendered course descriptions.

Table 4: Course selection by student sex and course description gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total choices 1-4</th>
<th>Final choice 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masculine</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feminine</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: the portion of Neutral choices in ‘Total choices made’ is likely to be underrepresented as the option only is available in two of the five choices made (choice 2 and 5).
There appears to be a pattern where female students identify more readily with the neutral- and feminine-framed description than the masculine. However, the high proportion of males choosing feminine-framed courses (46% initially and 52% in their overall final choice) suggests that this is nuanced and biological sex and gender should not be conflated. This also suggests that both males and females can find feminine-phrased course descriptions more attractive (or perhaps be alienated by masculine language—see TAP analysis below). Using overtly masculinized language could therefore, repel students who are interested in entrepreneurship and would consider choosing a course, but who are more sensitive to the tacit messages of competition, individualism and professor ‘power’ implied by such language. Finally, there are indications that male students find it difficult to distinguish between neutral and masculine language when offered a choice. The female students appear more sensitive to the nuances of gendered language, more often choosing the neutral option as their final choice. In terms of course type, the most preferred overall by both sexes, but in particular males (see Table 5) was through courses.
TAP spoken word analysis

Instead of first transcribing the 20 TAP recordings, we opted to retain the richness of the spoken word in the initial analysis. Together, we listened to 12 recordings and coded them for expressions that we found informative and relevant. In total, we coded 415 expressions in Nvivo and created a node for nearly all of them. We then explored the TAP recordings through these nodes in three different ways. First, we explored them for expressions about the course descriptions themselves. Because we were able to isolate these nodes and go back and listen to how the student made the statement, we were able to determine whether the statement was a positive or negative comment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive</th>
<th>Masculine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Basic (no prior experience needed) -- ♂,DK,F</td>
<td>Action -- ♂,DK,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouraging -- ♂,DK,F</td>
<td>Ambitious -- ♂,DK,A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focused -- ♂,US,F/T (US focus group)</td>
<td>Appealing -- ♂,DK,A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fun -- ♂,DK,T</td>
<td>Challenging -- ♂,US,A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helpful -- ♂,US,T</td>
<td>Compelling -- ♂,DK,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusive -- ♂,US,T</td>
<td>Concrete -- ♂,DK,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More advanced -- ♂,DK,F</td>
<td>Exciting -- ♂,DK,A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More involved -- ♂,DK,F</td>
<td>Explicit -- ♂,DK,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More personal -- ♂,US,T</td>
<td>Hard work (= more perceived 'pay off' [learning] for the student) -- ♂,DK,A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More supportive -- ♂,US,T</td>
<td>Higher level -- ♂,DK,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More welcoming -- ♂,US,F</td>
<td>Leadership -- ♂,US,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newer approach -- ♂,US,F</td>
<td>More realistic -- ♂,DK,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No right answer -- ♂,US,T</td>
<td>More Professional -- ♂,DK,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not as technical -- ♂,US,F</td>
<td>Relevant -- ♂,DK,A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not easier but nicer -- ♂,US,T</td>
<td>Serious -- ♂,DK,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open -- ♂,US,T</td>
<td>Strategic - ♂,DK,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation (learn through) -- ♂,DK,A</td>
<td>Successful -- ♂,DK,A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practical -- ♂,US,T (US focus group)</td>
<td>Very structured -- ♂,US,A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant -- ♂,DK,T</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaks to me like a fellow student Writing to me -- ♂,US,A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relatable -- ♂,US,A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific -- ♂,US,A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Negative</th>
<th>Masculine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A discussion club -- ♂,DK,A</td>
<td>Basic -- ♂,DK,A (too basic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A little strange (too personal) -- ♂,DK,F</td>
<td>Cold-hearted -- ♂,DK,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boring -- ♂,US,A</td>
<td>Daunting -- ♂,US,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluffy -- ♂,DK,F</td>
<td>Harsh -- ♂,US,T/♀,DK,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lacking strategy -- ♂,DK,F</td>
<td>Headsy -- ♂,US,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less professional -- ♂,DK,F</td>
<td>Intimidating -- ♂,US,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower level -- ♂,DK,T</td>
<td>No flexibility -- ♂,US,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misty -- ♂,US,A</td>
<td>One-sided -- ♂,US,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not so impressed -- ♂,DK,T</td>
<td>Strict -- ♂,US,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not that relevant -- ♂,DK,T</td>
<td>Super strategic -- ♂,US,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Softer, more cultural -- ♂,DK,A</td>
<td>Too focused on start-up -- ♂,DK,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Too creative -- ♂,DK,A</td>
<td>Too much and too intense -- ♂,US,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Too loose -- ♂,DK,A</td>
<td>Very rigid -- ♂,US,F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Too Soft -- ♂,DK,T</td>
<td>Way too crazy -- ♂,US,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wordy -- ♂,US,A</td>
<td>Weird but fine -- ♂,DK,T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very soft and social -- ♂,DK,T</td>
<td>Weirdly specific -- ♂,US,A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5: Final course selection by student sex and course type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>About</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We then went deeper, to analyze the context in which these expressions were used and re-listened to the statements. As an example of this process, we highlight below (Table 7) the way the words ‘soft’ and ‘hard’ were used by the participants.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HARD</th>
<th>SOFT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>‘Tight deadlines’ … This class will be <strong>hard work</strong> (female student; not positive or negative but ‘good to know’)</td>
<td>Seems soft - ‘Not the way I learn well’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Enhance employability’ is good because it is hard to find jobs (female student)</td>
<td>‘Too soft’ (about learning style) – it seems like learning only happens through discussions (active participation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘hard work’ will lead to significant pay-offs for the student (male student)</td>
<td>Softer – about the course in comparison to the other choices provided – more focus on cultural aspects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘hard work and persistence’…’That is me’ (male student)</td>
<td>Soft – about the style of writing in the description, further elaborated on as ‘not as concrete’ implicitly in comparison to the account given in other descriptions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘It sounds like a hard class’… ‘But hard is not the same as dry’ (male student)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7: Participant’s use of the words ‘hard’ and ‘soft’

Third, together we re-listened to all of the nodes, in a more convergent effort to thematically group the statements. During this process, we identified six groups in addition to the statements about course selection (see Table 8). Each node was placed in the group or groups to which the statement was thematically relevant, thus the total number of statements (603) is higher than the number of nodes (415).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement category</th>
<th>Number of statements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statements about course description</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements about entrepreneurship</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements about ‘real’ world</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements about the course</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements about the professor</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements about the student</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements about course selection</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8: Thematic categories of TAP statements

**Forced selection away from a neutral-framed description preference**

In the TAP recordings, students commented that some of the course descriptions were similar and some found it difficult distinguishing them. Typically, these issues were related to comparisons of the neutral and the masculine-framed About-type course descriptions.

Thus, we set out to see if these statements were supported in any way by the choice patterns of all the participating students. As the reader may recall, in the Methodology, we outlined the five choices that each participant had to make during this session. The second choice was between a feminine, a neutral and a masculine-framed About-type course. The third choice involved those who had chosen the
neutral course, being forced to choose between the masculine and the feminine-framed courses instead. Table 9 outlines the participant’s choices.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants responding to Choice 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(feminine, a neutral and a masculine framed About-type course)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masculine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feminine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants responding ‘neutral’ in Choice 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Then forced to choose between the masculine and the feminine framed courses instead)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masculine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feminine</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9: Course selection by participants: Choice 2 and Choice 3 (see methodology section above)

Of the 12 students forced to choose another course, two selected a feminine course and ten a masculine one.

EMERGING THEMES
Although analysis is still ongoing, we have identified some emerging themes and insights. These crystallize around students’ emotional responses to highly gendered language, the suggestion of a masculine ‘norm’ in student perceptions, the possibilities for feminized descriptions and the potential influence of power distance.

Emotional Responses to Gendered Language
Highly gendered language evokes an emotional response in both male and female students – in a way that neutral language does not. Examples of this can be seen above and in these reactions to a feminine-framed course description: US, Male: ‘Ferguson more spoke to me, you know, as if a fellow student wrote it, and I liked that...it seems like a friendlier class.’ DK, female: “I think it is a little bit strange that it says (quoting from description) "My hope is that you will develop". It is like a person is talking to you and that’s strange...because who is talking to me in this?:. The emotional responses to the explicitly gendered language hinges on a sense of assertiveness and strictness in the masculine-framed courses and one of student-focus, support and openness in the feminine-framed descriptions. However, students respond to these perceptions in both negative and positive ways. For example, some equated strictness and assertiveness with clarity, certainty and a sense that they will be challenged, while others equated it with exclusion, aggression and constraint. Likewise, being student-focused, supportive and open was equated with a sense of flexibility, creativity, openness to new and diverse ideas, and positive, collaborative student-student and student-professor relationships by some. For others this evoked emotions linked to uncertainty about what they would learn, worries that the professor was not professional and awkwardness about being addressed so directly in the description. However, some students did appreciate the lack of gender ‘noise’ in the neutral description. Although all course descriptions were purposely kept to the same word count, one Danish female participant says: “it is very short and just cuts to the chase”. Such comments support arguments by Kabba (2011) about using gender-neutral language for clarity and precision.

The Masculine Norm
Lewis (2006: 454) argues that ‘One of the luxuries of belonging to the privileged gender group is that one’s own gender is often invisible to oneself’. This suggests that, when masculinity is the norm, neutral language may look the same to a member of the privileged group. This may, especially, be the case for males, who are socialized into masculinity. However, in a business school setting, this may also be the
case for female students, who may have assimilated (relative to the general population) through attraction to business disciplines. Thus, the students in this study, might be less attuned to differences between, especially, masculine and neutral descriptions. Our findings show that even 'conditioned' senior business students have clear preferences but also that, when forced away from a neutral preference, they default to a masculine option. Further, when given an open choice between all three options (feminine, masculine and neutral) males deselect the neutral option, suggesting that masculine is the default for most of these students (Merritt & Kok, 1995). This suggests that environmental influences, in the ways that male and female students are socialized, may impact on their cognitive approach to deciphering the situational cues in gendered language. This far in our analysis, the female students seem more attuned to these nuances. This confirms the merits of exploring how consciously changing the language in course descriptions may encourage students, who respond more favorably to feminized language, to study entrepreneurship. It seems that male and female students, with a more masculinized outlook, might not even recognize the subtlety of the change in language. This also emphasizes that we should not conflate female with femininity and male with masculinity and that there may be more influences at play, such as different cultural and institutional factors.

The Possibility of Reframing Entrepreneurship Education as a Feminized or Gender-Neutral Activity

Although students do respond positively to highly masculinized course descriptions, we have shown it is possible to create a feminized course description for a through-type course. Moreover, students can find such reframing attractive. Indeed, there are early indications that students with a more nuanced understanding of entrepreneurship – gained through prior experience - and who also engage with extra curricula, entrepreneurial activities, actually find the feminine course description more appealing, compared to those with no 'real' experience. One explanation for this could be that students who have experienced entrepreneurship may have a broader understanding of the complexities it entails, such as collaboration, sharing of ideas or team work. Subsequently, they may not be attracted by more mainstream, masculinized language emphasizing individualism and competition. Likewise, those students who either had no parental role models - or who only had parental role models - but had no direct experience of entrepreneurship and who had not engaged in extra-curricular entrepreneurial activities, were attracted to masculinized descriptions. This suggests that specific types of students, with specific backgrounds and experience of entrepreneurship are attracted to, or alienated by, aspects of gendered language. Although we need to investigate this across the whole cohort, it does seem that something as simple as a shift in the language used can attract different student cohorts, irrespective of their biological sex. If educators and institutions are judged by those students who are more likely to go on to entrepreneurial success, there is an argument for using highly feminized language, in order to attract those with greater interest, experience, understanding and motivation.

A Question of Power?

It appears that, for some students - particularly the Danish ones, who are more used to a professor-student relationship with low power distance – the further breaking down of this distance (through the use of feminine language) brings the professor far too close. The US students, however, seem wary of a professor who wields power, valuing one who is concerned about them, wants them to do well, and will help them to do well, rather than one who will "automatically fail" them if they do not conform to the professor's demands. It does seem hat, as Gaucher et al. (2011) suggest, the language might be mediated by whether students feel they will be accepted and 'belong' in these contexts. Perhaps this is why more US male students responded positively to feminine course descriptions, because they could see that they would 'fit in' and suited their learning style. Likewise, the female students who responded negatively to the feminine descriptions were put off by the suggested supportive, collaborative environment, as it did not fit their perceptions of either entrepreneurship or themselves as business students. However, it is worth noting that, ultimately, the majority of female students opted for a
feminized course description as their final choice and the majority of male students opted for a masculinized one.

CONCLUDING THOUGHTS
It is too early in the analysis process to come to firm conclusions but the emerging themes highlight some surprising and fascinating areas for on-going investigation and clarification. That said, we have identified some patterns and nuances in student responses, which are likely to resonate as our research progresses.

Ultimately, we envisage this research will offer both theoretical and practical contributions, not only for EntEd but also for higher education more generally. It does seem that situational cues, suggested by the gendered language in course descriptions, do sensitize students to the type of student who will benefit from and do well on these courses. As educators we may therefore, ‘filter out’ some potentially enthusiastic and engaged students, who do aspire to entrepreneurship, but who do not even enter our classrooms because they fall at the ‘first hurdle’ of course selection. This also suggests that educators should consider alternative ways of framing entrepreneurship courses and that it is indeed possible, and perhaps advisable, to find approaches that do not privilege masculinity and risk alienating both male and female students. Doing so would also help educators to reflect on how their own attitudes and beliefs about entrepreneurship, and the role of EntEd, are reflected in their course descriptions and how the learning environment they promote might be perceived by students as a result. It may also be possible to extend this reflection to include how we teach and write textbooks on entrepreneurship.

References
http://doi.org/10.1108/09649420310462352
A Holistic Entrepreneurship Teaching Model
For Young Women in Tertiary Education

Creative approaches and solution thinking models for teaching and learning
Entrepreneurship, the Philippine Experience

Paper Presentation by:

Maria Luisa B. Gatchalian.
Principal Researcher | Author
Department of Entrepreneurship | CBEA | Miriam College, Philippines
missgatch2@gmail.com

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS
The author is grateful to her friends and colleagues for their generous time, cheers and prayers. For helping craft the beginnings of this paper, Tere and Ian; my student volunteers Pauline, Kat, Judy, Mauee and Danielle for their kindness in helping out on the numerous and seemingly endless collations and tabulations; Oyie and Stella for the encouragement to pursue a teaching model for women entrepreneurship; Tony for always pushing me to my limits; Miriam College for giving me the opportunity to be part in developing young women to be leaders and change makers; for all my students who are her inspiration; to educators to whom her work and contributions are dedicated; Gi my husband and children Gio, Mitos, Niko and Gab who are so patient and understanding for the meagre time spent with them as I work on the many research I am passionate about which, in one way or another contribute for the advancement of entrepreneurship education.

ABOUT THE AUTHOR
Maria Luisa B. Gatchalian is the current Chairperson of the Department of Entrepreneurship of Miriam College, Philippines. She is also the Alternate Focal Point of the UNESCO EE Net Philippines, Miriam College. She is volunteer researcher on the "Supportive Ecosystem for Entrepreneurship in Universities in the ASEAN and Asia Pacific Region, The Philippine Report" and as program development volunteer for the 6th UNESCO APEID ASEAN Country Meeting, Philippines, 2017. She is also urgently working on the proposed MC - COE CHED Program on Capacity Building Programs for Entrepreneurship Education in the Philippines for 2017-2019.

She strongly advocates collaboration and partnership for action and inclusive growth in various local, ASEAN and international development programs on entrepreneurship for faculty development, youth, women, mSME’s, social entrepreneurship, among others. Authored various academic research, teaching models in entrepreneurship and impact programs and held leadership and volunteer positions in various local, ASEAN and International organizations (ENEDA, SERDEF, AEC, Spark, Enactus, British Council Active Citizens, Netherlands Fellows Phil. among others) in order to create a positive change, beyond borders.

Miss Gatch as her students and colleagues fondly call her; has been teaching in Miriam College for over 2 decades; married to her first boyfriend, Gi, for 40 years with children Gio, Mitos, Niko and Gab and misses Nikita, their family huskie.

Correspondence can be sent to: missgatch2@gmail.com | or viber and imessage 0917 530 4746 | or missgatchskype@gmail.com
Follow the link: http://www.terrapinn.com/exhibition/edutech-philippines/speakers.stm

Abstract
This action research is a live running study of a course in entrepreneurship for young women in college. It is a descriptive study and a chronicle of the pilot implementation of the enhanced course in Enterprise Planning under the Bachelor of Science in Entrepreneurship curriculum, in Miriam College, Philippines. The pilot program presents a holistic approach to teaching and learning entrepreneurship as it aims to establish a culture of creative, solution, growth and entrepreneurial mindset for young women. The program model considers their important developmental and maturation stage while they are forming and building their self, identity and image. The creative solution thinking models are tools to help them develop and organize their teams as well as identify opportunities and set up their project/ventures. This is participated by 54 sophomores, all young women, ages 17-19 years, in 2 class sections in Miriam College, conducted in the first semester from August to December of school year 2016-2017.

This study limits its scope on a 6 stage, PDCA + S and DT (Plan-Do-Check-Assess plus Show and Decide/Transition, for its conceptual and operational framework; a modified Deming, PDCA 4-stage cycle) of entrepreneurship process and progress from self-awareness (self-concept, purpose and aspirations, perceptions, gender awareness, environment, Johari window) to venture start-up preferences, among others. These helped them to be more reflective and introspective as they (re)discover their self and their entrepreneurial potentials in various stages of development, differentiated in the context of ones feminine gender genius’, attributes, concerns, capabilities, interests and challenges in their adolescent stage.

The creative solution tools and innovation models are classified in 4 categories from ideation to action. It presented choices that may be applied and rubrics to measure their performance and outcomes using the 10 PECS, 21st Century Achievement Skills, CHED Program Outcomes, among others. The 4 classification of models introduced are: a) The Essentials, (TE) composed of at least 6 creative solution and thinking models; b) Design Hack (DH); c) Substitute, Combine, Adapt, Modify, Put to Another Use, Eliminate, and Reverse (SCAMPER); and d) Theory of the Resolution of Invention-Related tasks for problem solving (TRIZ). The study further validates that “entrepreneurship can be taught and caught.” This also means achieving ones goal and harnessing ones potential while consisting of a confluence of factors rest heavily on ones motivation, resolution and action. In summary, students successfully prospected and organized 23 venture teams by the end of the term (16 food; 7 non-food; with 1 to a maximum of 3 members each).

The result is synthesized in a “diagram” which shows the “Link and Integration (or gaps) as Subsumed Across Program, Disciplines and Key Players” needed to foster a holistic culture of self and purpose, creativity and entrepreneurialism in campus. Along the course and student assessments, the following are the recommended improvements: a) more women entrepreneurship case models and empirical studies; b) integration of entrepreneurship and business courses; c) space the course progression with business exposures and other related supplemental co-curricular activities; to include leadership program (e.g. “on becoming an entrepreneur and as a responsible leader”); d) and other topics that are simplified according to their teen level of understanding on business management like negotiation skills; financial wellness, resource and risk management, among others, to better equip them with sound tools for the many decision challenges as young women and those values that matter; and e) to have dedicated mentor to spend time as they grow and develop their venture who treats them as co-entrepreneur more than a student.

**Key words:** Gender Awareness, Diversity, Developmental and Maturation Stage Creative Solution Thinking Models (TE, DH; SCAMPER, TRIZ) Entrepreneurial Mindset, Deming Cycle, PDCA+2, Commission on Higher Education (CHED) 10 PECS

**Background and Introduction**

The results in the Philippine Report on “Supportive Ecosystem of Entrepreneurship Education in Universities in the ASEAN and Asia Pacific Countries”, revealed that teaching methods and course
management in higher education is largely based on the development of a business plan. Agreeably, this not a lone case as educators in various ASEAN countries affirm in the same forum/meeting held in Bangkok during the 4th UNESCO APEID Meeting in October 12-15 2015.

A review of various curriculum on entrepreneurship as a formal education, in the tertiary level did not reveal any on the understanding on the self of the young adolescent learner, and in particular, the young woman aspiring to become an entrepreneur. Also, the program is vaguely measured in terms of the number of students turned entrepreneurs immediately after graduation, revealing a dismal figure. (Gatchalian, 2011, 2013, 2015)

Entrepreneurship education takes more than a business plan, tools, guides, management courses or opportunity identification and its implementation or the figures of students turned to be entrepreneurs immediately after graduation. As this study advocates, it needs to be centered on the “student, aspiring to become an entrepreneur.” A person, with a deep and meaningful sense of self-concept who understands one’s being in a more profound way. Which also, predisposes why, what, when, or how person develops. (1) In like manner, creative thinking, solution and innovation approaches for venture startups are helpful tools for these developments to happen. However, these not widely or clearly understood or seriously articulated that should be part of foundation discipline or formally recognized as a method or approach to entrepreneurial learning, which also remains undocumented (Gatchalian,2013,2015.)

This study highlights the holistic approach for teaching model underscores the importance of: a) rediscovering their meaningful self (Appendix 1. Terms of Reference); to which the program is intended to, for young women, in college, as they introspect and prospect their potentialities or limitation with a healthy resolve to achieve their goals; b) undergoing the systematic process of the creative and innovative solution approaches, thinking and action tools to generate better entrepreneurial venture ideation; c) becoming a woman entrepreneur leader, its attributes and competencies can be taught and caught; d) an enabling and supportive faculty and university environment help increase the likelihood of turning venture ideas from entrepreneurial intentions into action; e) a strong grounding on entrepreneurial values and the ethics of doing good is good for business and society.
Goals and Objectives
The study is conducted to contribute to the development of a holistic teaching model for young women aspiring to become entrepreneurs in higher education.

The following objectives are set to achieve its goal:
   a) Pilot-test for one (1) semester the enhanced ET 102 or Enterprise Planning 1 curriculum specified in its Course Outcomes and Learning Plan of sophomore students of B.S. Entrepreneurship in Miriam College for SY 2016-2017; in an attempt build a strong self concept and meaningful learning; draw out the innate creative, innovative and entrepreneurial skills and talents as they build their confidence, knowledge and skills, to become the kind of entrepreneur they aspire to be; 
   b) Observe and analyze the process and outcomes using assessment tools designed for the activities and, 
   c) Recommend measures for the improvement or enhancement of the course curriculum and its tools and approaches that may be adapted or replicated and thus contribute to the common typology of methods and approaches in teaching young adolescents in transition to adulthood.

Significance of the Study
This study is significant to the domain of entrepreneurship research studies on women as there is a dearth of existing studies on entrepreneurship education and on entrepreneurship teaching models for young women in tertiary education in the current literature (Velasco, 2013; Gatchalian, 2010, 2015).

The results and recommendations that may be crafted are significant to the academic community and stakeholders it serves, with a teaching model
   a) For developing similar curricula that centers on the development of young empowered, entrepreneurial women (which may also be adapted for young men); a model that may also adapted and modified as a 
   b) Standalone non formal or professional courses; or formal programs in Basic and Higher Education disciplines, to fit according to the learners maturation and learning development for a purposeful and effective learning; and to 
   c) Increase creativity and solution mindedness in order generate better venture ideas or identify needs and opportunities in creating innovation, impact or change.

Host School, Program, Participants, Locale and Scope
Miriam College is the school host of the study and located in Quezon City, Philippines.
It is a women college to pioneer entrepreneurship in higher education in the late 90’s. A move to develop women leaders and future employers as a potent human resource for nation building. A women college that strongly considers the developmental and learning dispositions of their feminine nature to their full potential.

The Bachelor of Science In Entrepreneurship of Miriam College is degree program that prepares and develops young women to become competent and well-balanced young entrepreneur-women leaders. Emphasis is on developing their entrepreneurial mindset and perspectives, values and behavior, key competencies, and lifelong skills. Students establish, operate and manage their own small start up ventures as they learn and hone their employer-ability and entrepreneurial leadership. These outcomes are aligned to the mandate of the Commission on Higher Education (CHED) and in the overall mission and vision of the college.

The Entrepreneurship Program offers three specialized fields of interests or program tracks in Culinary Arts, Fashion Technology, and Product Design and Development.. Likewise, these specialized courses are conducted in partnership with prestigious academic and service providers exclusive to the program under a Memorandum of Agreement. (2)

Theere fifty four (54) sophomore participants, ages 17-19, all women, aspiring to become entrepreneurs, enrolled in ET 102 or Enterprise Planning 1 under the Bachelor of Science in
Entrepreneurship, in the first semester of school year 2016-2017. Mostly, they are daughters of parents with above average income and would like to establish their own business in the program tracks enrolled. They are divided into 2 sections according to their tracks in Culinary and the Fashion and Product Design and Development. with an average of 27 students in each section. The researcher is also the faculty in charge of the course; with (2) faculty contributors and 4 student assistants.

The scope of the study revolves around the 2 important domain of the “self as a person, a young woman aspiring to become a succesful entrepreneur and the tools to enhance creativity, innovation and solution mindset” in a 6-stage cycle operational framework. This framework has categorized and applied 4 creative thinking and innovation models: a) The Essentials of creative design thinking and problem solving tools and techniques; b) Design Hack; c) SCAMPER, and; d) TRIZ. (Appendix 1, 2, 3a, 3b. Rubrics Et 102. Personal Assessment & End Of Course Assessment)

Enterprise Planning 1
An enhanced course curriculum towards a holistic approach to teaching entrepreneurship for young women in college

Enterprise Planning 1 or ET 102 is the first of a 2 series of a 3 unit-course each offered in 2 semesters (3). This is the feeder course to all the incubation and higher business functional and operations courses in the higher year levels.

This enhanced curriculum follows a 6-Stage cycle and process that attempts to guide students in their journey as they learn to understand themselves, as a woman, her recognition as valuable partners in all spheres of development and her priceless contribution in fuelling the nations’ overall dynamism and competitiveness, in the personal and professional levels. In particular, the course emphasizes the building of their capability and competencies in planning and building their enterprise, with an entrepreneurial perspective and mindset while in college.

Precisely, the creative and innovative learning process aims to prepare and develop their creative thinking solution mindset that should encourage them to take action on those needs or opportunities identified. The course is a microcosm of the entire entrepreneurship program which runs in a cycle that may repeated in other courses in their higher year level until one reaches the level they aim or intends to achieve.

Literature Review and Discussions
The blending of the “meaningful self” and the “creative and innovative solution and thinking tools” is the essence of this holistic course. The construct of this teaching program considers the developmental and maturation phase of these young women in their adulthood where they experience important changes in all aspects of their lives. Development and education psychologists like Elizabeth B. Hurlock in her book, Developmental Psychology: A Life-Span Approach highlighted that young men and young women contends that this is their stage where physical and mental development in life that they start establishing new attitudes, values and interests in life. It is in this time where they,

“Develop favorable self-concept, and thus make good adjustments” or otherwise; regard education as their stepping stone towards a particular occupation; and choose courses they feel useful to them in their chose field or work; a time where their moral, social, religious, intellectual interests, convictions and genuine ideals are either constructed or reconstructed, defined or redefined, built, changed or emboldened”

A review on personality, psychological and career testing results of the students from the MC Guidance office (e.g. Raven, VIESA) (4) and some findings from the previous focus group discussions in school years 2013-14 through 2015-16 served as a reference to better understand their fears, anxieties, aspirations and other concerns that may have a lot of bearing in teaching engagement and management of these young women (e.g. fear of future, doubts about self; low persistence to work at difficult task; low altruism; more oriented to the present than the future; preference to work only among
According to development psychologists and educators, this is also the time to build confidence and trust, dream, plan and make responsible choices as they establish their identity or career path. This is also the time to decide and aspire to have the meaningful self, they chose to be. This is where education and teaching models is crucial. The need for a teaching model that blends the person and the tools to help and empower students achieve their dreams and aspirations.

Creativity and innovation are two different things that are crucial in the early stages of entrepreneurial mind setting process for aspiring entrepreneurs, as this will later on ignite their passion into action. (Appendix 1. Terms of Reference) As Linda Naiman fittingly puts it,

“Creativity is the act of turning new and imaginative ideas into reality. Creativity involves two processes: thinking, then producing.”

“Innovation is the production or implementation of an idea. If you have ideas, but don’t act on them, you are imaginative but not creative.”

Theories, case studies, experiments and a variety of research methods have attempted to better understand the sources of creativity and innovation in individuals. While these efforts have contributed significantly to broadening the understanding of the subject, there is nonetheless disagreement between theories and many hypotheses that are yet to be fully corroborated. The challenge lies partially in the nature and definition of creativity itself. Broad, complex and multi-faceted, creativity can take many forms and can be found within a variety of contexts. Individuals with a broad range of personal characteristics and backgrounds embody it. According to Adams (2005) the only rule appears to be that there are no hard and fast rules concerning the sources of creativity.

But according to Nickerson’s article, “Enhancing Creativity” in Sternberg’s Handbook of Creativity, which reviews multiple creativity programs, concludes that it can indeed be enhanced. Other studies like Project Intelligence in Venezuela, (Nickerson, p. 403-404), showed small positive results. Adams asserts that current classroom practices do not focus enough on promoting creativity and innovation and even sometimes serve to destroy it. Cropley explains that teachers often view the creative, maverick personality as a troublemaker, stifling the student’s ability. (5) Thus show the virulent influence of the teacher factor.

**Theoretical Framework**

Deming Cycle is used as the theoretical framework of this study. This is also called the Deming Wheel after its proponent, W. Edwards Deming (6) This is iterative four-step management method used in business for the control and continuous improvement of processes.: Plan: Identifying and analyzing the problem; Do: Developing and testing a potential solution; Check: Measuring how effective the test solution was, and analyzing whether it could be improved in any way; Act: Implementing the improved solution fully. (Diagram 1. Theoretical and Conceptual/Operational Framework)

**Conceptual and Operational Framework**

The conceptual and operational framework in this study is patterned after the PDCA cycle and modified for this study. It added 2 more cycles the Show (S) and the Decision/Transition (D/T). The S cycle is the culminating stage of the course where students showcase their prototype and where the judges evaluate the output in terms of opportunity or solution the product is addressing or providing solution to; its potential in terms of its viability and sustainability; the use and application of creative thinking and innovation models and finally, its vertex. This is where market acceptability, aesthetics, function and commercial appeal meet. The D/T is the final stage where students make their decision
on how they intend to continue or not, modify change their venture for the next semester. The whole cycle shall be repeated but in a more advanced stage with higher expectations.

The investigation process as shown below provides a simple but effective approach for problem solving and managing change, ensuring that ideas are studied and tested through several process like market screening/acceptance and prototyping. The model focuses on how to develop the critical and general set of creative thinking models for problem solving, opportunity seeking, risk and sustainability, visioning management and metacognition regulation (Flavell, 1979, 1987; Schraw & Dennison, 1994) or decision making competences applicable in all walks of life while students experience their application in their projects or ventures in school.

The use of various divergent thinking, ideation, innovation and problem solving models with explicit instruction in both cognitive and metacognitive strategies present choices about the strategies students can employ in different contexts. Students learn to examine and develop their thinking process (Fogarty, 1994) and become focused through self-questioning, reflective reporting or synthesis writing, and discussing feedback or evaluation of their output and processes with other learners or experts. They become more skilled at using these creative and innovative thinking strategies, gain confidence and become more independent as learners.

The goal of these models is to help learners become comfortable with these strategies so that they employ them automatically to learning tasks, focusing their attention, deriving meaning, and making adjustments along the way. They do not think about these skills while performing them but, if asked what they are doing, they can usually accurately describe their metacognitive processes.

This process can be used in many learning environments from new product development, prototyping or its launching in the context of the study and later on to other case situations the entrepreneurship students will normally face in the course of their entrepreneurial journey beyond graduation.

Diagram 1. Theoretical and Conceptual/Operational Framework

Method, Process and Procedure
The 6-Stage Divergent Entrepreneurship Creative and Innovation Thinking Model
This action research process flow follows the Course Outcomes and Learning Program (COLP) of Enterprise Planning 1, its content, schedule sequence of the conceptual framework presented in 6 stages. The 6-stage cycle of operational stages is a sequence of activities starting from the self and segues to various application of divergent thinking tools and solution models as well as methods of observation and data gathering techniques (e.g. one on one interviews, forum, discourses, focus group discussions, story telling, activity worksheets, fieldwork, seminars, conferences, competitions, among others.) Each stage or cycle is evaluated with assessment tools or rubrics. (Appendix 1;2,3a/3b. Rubrics) These are then synthesized to draw the student development and progression.
Entrepreneurship teaching here brought together the central figure of the study: the “student, as a young woman aspiring to become an entrepreneur and the creative and innovative tools, approaches and methods as an attempt to help her understand the process towards her development to become one.”

Stage 1 is the critical foundation of the course. A good head start for entrepreneurship development is on discovering the entrepreneurial self (as a person, young woman, and an entrepreneur). Through a series of reflective, introspective, and prospective and project-outcomes-practice based activities, students are able to (re) view themselves as persons and as a young woman with a universal purpose (which is true for both woman and man); as a woman entrepreneur in culinary, fashion and product design program tracks. Students generally adhere to universal values; general awareness and respect of genders’ uniqueness, differences as well as her complementation qualities; diversity of culture and faith; with general understanding of what takes to be a successful woman entrepreneur and leader. (7) (Table 1: Concept of Self as a Person, Young Woman and Successful Woman Entrepreneur/Leader)

This action research encountered funny to serious discussions on their concerns in better understanding themselves as a person, as a young woman unique and with different qualities from man and has the capability to decide to reach ones potential. They are able to relate themselves as they better understand diverse cultures and peoples in the wider peripheries of the Asian and Western
societies. The inspiring stories of women model entrepreneurs has allayed their fears on how to live and survive in a highly competitive society.

The impact lies on the general acknowledgement of their a) initial intentions, goals and motivation to become a woman entrepreneur, (Table 2. Top 3 reasons for taking BS Entrepreneurship as a career path) (8); b) their entrepreneurial quotient; c) their perceived lack or limitations in terms of capacity, knowledge and competencies to become entrepreneurs, are all in general at the needs improvement and developing stage (Figure 1. Self-Awareness and Entrepreneurial Quotient) (9); (Figure 2. 10 Personal Entrepreneurial Competencies, in 3 clusters of achievement, planning, power) (10); with a general healthy resolve on how all these can work together, with self and others for their personal development; mapped out their areas for personal and professional development in personal values, attributes, skills and career competencies (Figure 3. Motivation, Teamwork, Goal Setting) (11).

The introduction of the foundation concepts and its applications in Stage 1 (e.g. Serendipity, Industry Research, and Environmental Scanning spread out in Modules 1 to 3) and the next level of creative thinking, innovation and solution models introduced in a progressive fashion from Stages 2 though 5 served as the microcosm of their entire Entrepreneurship journey. (Figure 4. Environmental Scanning, for Idea Generation Needs and Opportunity Identification: Serendipity/Industry Research/Business Exposures and Opportunity Identification) (12) Understandably, the students' initial performance and outcomes are generally within the range of developing and needing improvement stage.

Students are able to organize 16 food and 7 non-food or a total of 23 venture teams aligned to the program track as their career choice. All teams accomplished the experimentation and prototyping as they applied their preferred SCAMPER and some of the Essential models where results showed some modification of existing products and venture category inherent to their nature as young women, hard of innovation, yet. (Table 3. Food Category | Total number of food venture ideas and companies for development:16; (13); Table 4. Non-Food Category: Total number of non-food venture ideas and companies for development:7). (14)

Students tend to adopt a "solution-focused" strategy with an initial idea proposed early on. This primary generator is often derived from both a technical or creative inspiration of the individual, admired or favorite products, comprising of knowledge of particular production processes or materials, peculiar in their chosen program tracks such as culinary arts, fashion technology and product design. It is also observed that students learn how to make sense of combining existing or old things to make new ways or solutions for many interrelated problems. This allowed them to make alternative choices, though often with several mishaps and mistakes, with their perceived value to its intended client or market. While those models are preferred, they are not necessarily the best fit (due to their level of maturation and technical knowledge), just yet. The venture product proposal is reflective of their general capacity, as young women and her limitations as well.

Their accomplishments however, offered realizations on the following: a) it takes repeated series of tedious process, long hours of practice and roundabouts to achieve a certain level of progress and product acceptability; b) motivation, commitment, persistence, and perseverance are tested and learned; c) mistakes and shortcomings as part of any development process; d) a supportive environment and system are important enabler in any development process; s and progress e) the need for research, information and the use of technology are important in increasing knowledge; f) as well as the practical experience for hands-on and the g) generation and prudent management of resource are all important personal practical learning needed to increase the likelihood for success. Table 5. Product Development and Prototyping Support System of Students) (15)

As observed, the students recognize the value of applying the essential communication elements for effective product pitching. Such is also related to developing ones' persuasion and confidence in delivery. (Table 6. Top Communication and Entrepreneurial Soft Skills Needing Improvement) (16) Teams appreciated the value of interconnectedness entrepreneurship, leadership and business management functions through the stages this course. It is certain that students are gradually developing their entrepreneurial competencies alongside their initial experience in business
development and its operations in stages 1 through 4 (Figure 5. Development of Entrepreneurial Competencies and Business Functional Skills after Stages 1 through 4). (17)

Preview 1, Product Pitching and Reporting where ideas are turned into concrete products are measured using a range of critiquing, assessment and differentiated evaluation methods. Students recognized the importance of: a) problem solving as they learn to listen to what the market says they need or want; b) developing inquisitiveness through systems thinking; c) applying the creative thinking tools to sharpen solution thinking skills and decision making; d) managing time and their meager resources well; e) working well with others; or e) valuing the virtue of openness to correction and the perseverance to begin and begin again.

By and large, students are a work-on-progress and generally need to be closely engaged and hand-held through mentoring, at least in the infancy stage of development and weaned gradually as they develop over time.

The whole practice and experience-based activities made the students learn to make sense of their purpose as a person and how empowering it is to develop (gradually) one’s entrepreneurial mindset, values and discipline, which also build one’s confidence. Teams, in general, decided to continue to improve their venture ideas with changes on team’s organization as they learn that it takes more than friendship to build a working team; they also asserted that they will continuously ideate and iterate while operating their ventures in school; Figure 6. Over-all Performance Evaluation in the Course Major Activities (18) But more importantly, they also learned that they should go out of their comfort zone and courageous enough to be more daring to put their ideas into action (or not).

The whole 6-stage cycle shall be repeated until it satisfies the level of improvement or development in coming up with a viable, acceptable and marketable venture. (Figure 7. Creativity and Innovation Thinking Mindset Assessment) (19). This is also expected to run from their sophomore year through their senior year.

At their young teen age of 17-18, the learning of one’s meaningful maturation and entrepreneurial mindset is never too late to start. And as engaged, one can grow in depth through the varying learning outcomes but doing it over and over again. Figure 8. Comparative Assessment of 10 PEC’s at the Start (Stage 1) (20) and End of the Course (Stage 5) performance/evaluation. (21)

Conclusions and Recommendations
Although it would be unwise to draw firm general conclusions based on the relatively few cases from the school venture projects prepared by all young women in the ET 102 class of Miriam College, (16 food and 7 non-food ventures) a general pattern nevertheless, has been observed.

Understanding the self and purpose in relation to ones profession, work or career, culture and gender awareness and sensitivity using a wide range of tools and activities can be an effective teaching model for educators and course administrators to better understand how students process their learning and progress. Properly handled, students in return tend to increase their confidence as they successfully accomplish the course requirements while they grow as a person, a young woman aspiring to become an entrepreneur with a more realistic expectations or realizations about how they can act (or not) in reaching their potentials.

Nonetheless, students tend to employ a surface of the whole enterprise planning development This 3 unit course which extends to another semester repeats the cycle to test and improve what one has started until the concept eventually evolves and progress to something tangible and feasible. It is typical for students to confide the challenges they face like navigating the unknown and the frustration of endless trials and retrials in their product testing and experimentation, which grip their excitement and enthusiasm. They too have to comply with the other academic requirements and limitations in resources, (e.g. money, knowledge, facilities) which constrains their focus or in accelerating their progress. These too should be well considered in the course pacing, output (which is expected, in most
cases, done outside of class) and its impact to the over-all course management. Understandably, some of the limitations or weaknesses (e.g. knowledge or skills) will be later on resolved as students successfully complete the curriculum sequence and its graduated process.

Creativity is required throughout product development, not just at the early concept stage but also at the finished product stage. This study finds that specialist knowledge is not necessarily required to conceive a creative or innovative idea. However, domain-specific knowledge as well as technical and design expertise such as the program tracks in their bachelor’s program are almost always required to go beyond the idea to develop a workable product and viable or sustainable business model.

The Creative and innovative Learning and Teaching Models which served as tools for students to discover their creative potential is closely linked and inter-connected to their repertoire of knowledge, experience, achievement motivation, entrepreneurial competencies, exposures, resources, personal experiences or product, the supportive or enabling environment, curriculum, methods, approaches and their appropriateness to their age and maturation level and gender as a young woman, as well as the competency and proficiency of the teachers or facilitators, among others. These therefore, are as equally important and as useful to consider as the models introduced to foster their creativity or innovativeness among young adolescent women aspiring to become entrepreneurs.

The study highlights the importance of the strong link between fostering creativity and innovativeness and relevant assessment tools and evaluation processes for creative learning.

Over all, this action research stresses the importance of this link, interplay and integration of the benefits of understanding the self and the development of the entrepreneurial mindset as will be subsumed across disciplines. The results of the whole study is synthesized and depicted in Diagram 3. “Link and Integration of the Self, Creative Teaching and Learning Design Thinking Process - as Subsumed Across Program, Disciplines and Key Players.” This is a model that considers the confluence of factors that is seen to draw and develop the creative and innovation mindset of learners and therefore should be contained in the education of the new generation of youth. The new generation of lifelong educated youth with readiness to face the new challenges and impeding social and economic threats. Relevant education and human development is tightly intertwined, as ever, and undeniably should be on top of any development agenda.

Recommendations
The need for a holistic model that highlights the student/learner in ways that encourage development of competencies are not just subject-specific or that revolves around a business plan. Efforts should be made to integrate the understanding of the self and purpose in the larger society including the gender factor are one of the many ways to deepen the awareness self and others in the larger society. Likewise, there is a need for relevant methods and tools to draw out the best of their potentials. Entrepreneurship as the new generation of education and discipline prepares the youth for such.
Hence, there is a need for a holistic curriculum that is relevant, flexible, with simplified teaching tools and assessment, according to the learner's development and intellectual maturation levels. There is a need for an "entrepreneurship culture" to permeate that will not only promote the benefits of creativity for learning, but also links the development of the human person, (both man and woman) and their productive contribution to society and its system.

The result is synthesized in a "diagram" as shown and is needed to foster a holistic culture of self and purpose, creativity and an entrepreneurial culture in campus. (Diagram 3. The Link and Integration of the Creative and Innovative Learning and Teaching Process Subsumed Across Program, Disciplines and Key Player)

Along the course and student and faculty assessments, the following are the suggested additional improvements: a) more women entrepreneurship case models and empirical studies; b) integration of entrepreneurship and business courses; c) space the models and course progression with business exposures and other related supplemental co-curricular activities; to include leadership program (e.g. "on becoming an entrepreneur and as a responsible leader"); d) other topics that are simplified according to their teen level of understanding on business management like negotiation skills; financial wellness, resource and risk management, among others, to better equip them with sound tools for the many decision challenges as young women and those values that matter; and e) to have dedicated mentor to spend time as they grow and develop their venture and who treats them as co-entrepreneur more than a student.
References


Canon-Abaquin, Mary Joy. 2010. 8 Simple Secrets to Raising Entrepreneurs, Teaching Kids About Money, Business And Life (Go Negosyo). Philippine Center for Entrepreneurship Foundation Inc.


Diaz, Paz H. 1993. Entrepreneurial Competency Training, Students Workbook, Quezon City, Philippines, FAMD, PACSB, SERDEF, UPISSI.


Knowledge and power: the information theory of capitalism and how it is revolutionizing our world. Washington, DC: Regnery Publishing, Inc.

Gilder, G. F. (2013). Knowledge and power: The information theory of capitalism and how it is revolutionizing our world.

Global Policy Framework for the Promotion of High-Growth Firms. March 11-12, 2012


Entrepreneurship education for female students: Fear of failure or courageous entrepreneur?

Edward S. Tang¹
Hans Michael Guelich²
Ulrike Guelich³

¹ Stamford International University, Bangkok / Thailand. Email: edward.tang@stamford.edu
² Stamford International University, Bangkok / Thailand. Email: hans.guelich@stamford.edu
³ Bangkok University School of Entrepreneurship and Management, Bangkok / Thailand. Email: ulrike.guelich@gmail.com

Keywords: women entrepreneur, entrepreneurship education, fear of failure, risk-taking, Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (GEM)

Abstract
Fear of failure is an energizing agent for human behavior and influences an individual’s start-up decision and decisions to exploit a business opportunity or not (Welpe, et al., 2012). An individual’s perception of the own fear to fail influences the orientation and experiences towards failure in achieving goals especially in relation to risk-taking behavior. In Thailand, the fear of failure rate especially among female entrepreneurs is one of the highest in a global comparison (Guelich, 2014) and women “appear to show reluctance to scale their businesses or to enter new and less tested markets” (Kelley et al., 2013).

In this exploratory project, students from various countries studying in Bangkok were pushed into uncertainty and to step out of their comfort zones, to overcome their fears and be courageous enough to move the first step forward towards achieving entrepreneurial goals. This qualitative study aims to improve entrepreneurship education for female students by pushing them to pro-actively experiencing enterprise-like risk-taking situations which requires that they overcome their fear of failure towards achievement goals. We investigate, if behavioral patterns and outcomes exist among the students, and thus recommend to in series better prepare them for future uncertainties in their entrepreneurial journeys with adequate entrepreneurship education. The strategic implications of the research indicate that the willingness to act despite fear builds inner self-reliance and fosters a potential entrepreneur’s ability to exploit opportunities within ambiguous environments. Our findings highlight the importance of further education for strategic entrepreneurial competencies of future female entrepreneurs in Thailand.

Introduction
Previous research offers varying definitions on entrepreneurship, where the entrepreneur is the creator of new products, new markets or a combinations of both which eventually creates new economics of a nation (Schumpeter, 1934). Entrepreneurship is described as the process of discovery, evaluation and exploitation of opportunities to introduce new products and services (Shane, 2003) by the individual entrepreneur with the generic intention to start, run and maybe grow a new business venture (Taylor & Walley, 2004), which is related to innovation and economic goods and services (Yu & Si, 2012). While many studies emphasize on entrepreneurship in general without gender approach, there is an increasing discussion that there still is a gap in women entrepreneurship studies (De Bruin, et al., 2006). In this empirical project, we adopt the definition of entrepreneurship by the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (GEM) that “any attempt at new business or new venture creation, such as self-employment, a new business organization, or the expansion of an existing business, by an individual, a team of individuals, or an established business” to be the basis of this research (Bosma, et al., 2011). While GEM measures entrepreneurial activities in three business phases, namely potential entrepreneurs who intend to start a business in the next three years, early-stage entrepreneurs and established businesses, plus in the extension of its conceptual framework also an individual’s attributes towards entrepreneurship, our research study focusses on female entrepreneurship students who could be potential entrepreneurs intending to start a new business venture after graduation.
Background
Recent findings by the Global Entrepreneur Monitor 2016 on the female to male Total Early-stage Entrepreneurial Activity (TEA) in Thailand show a decline from 1.16 in 2015 to 0.83 in 2016. In response to this decline in female TEA, perceived capabilities of Thai entrepreneurs similarly receded from 46.2 percent (2015) to 43.5 percent (2016), whereas in the same period the perceived fear of failure increased by 11.8 percent to 52.1 percent. The rather sharp drop in the female to male TEA ratio in Thailand may be due to the fact that women in developing economies face higher employment barriers and limitations of available financial resources in the country (Minniti & Naudé, 2010). There is a gap in literature, if potential future entrepreneurs, who are the focus in this study, are equally constrained.

Self-confidence and self-efficacy
Contrary to the GEM Thailand findings, Minniti and Naudé (2010) conclude that women in developing nations tend to be more self-confident about their abilities to start a business as compared with developed nations. Beliefs in the own capability produce direct impact on entrepreneurial action (Cassar & Friedman, 2009) and a strong self-confidence about one’s own capability in terms of self-efficacy potentially drives an entrepreneur to accomplish a desired goal (Cassar & Friedman, 2009). Echoing the GEM Thailand findings, the deficiency in one’s own capability generates the sense of fear of failure which in turn diminishes one’s capability to further attain the desired outcomes which leads to action avoidance due to a perceived lack of control (Binney, et al., 1969). Following this logic, increasingly research findings emphasize on entrepreneurial self-efficacy and its influence on entrepreneurial success and venture creation (Boyd & Voizikis, 1994; Drnovšek, et al., 2010; Segal, et al., 2005). Entrepreneurial self-efficacy is closely linked with business intentions (Krueger, et al., 2000), new business growth and personal success (Drnovšek et al., 2010) and in combination with high risk preferences self-efficacy is an important trait to trigger entrepreneurial intent (Barbosa, et al., 2007; Wilson, et al., 2007). Despite different beliefs and feelings with respect to a challenging task, an individual with strong self-efficacy is more ready to excise control over negative thinking such as fear of failure in the process of entrepreneurial venturing (Ozer & Bandura, 1990).

Fear of failure
Previous studies show that the fear of failure as an energizing agent for human behavior influences an individual’s start-up decision (Arenius & Minniti, 2005; Caliendo, et al., 2009; Conroy & Elliot, 2004) and decisions to exploit a business opportunity or not (Welpe et al., 2012). Scholars in motivation research emphasize fear of failure and achievement goals as important determinants for goal processes and outcomes. An individual’s perception of the fear of failure is regarded as self-evaluation, influencing the own definition, orientation and experiences towards failure in achieving goals (Heckhausen & Baltes, 1991), especially when related to risk-taking behavior (Caraway, Tucker, Reinke, & Hall, 2003). In Thailand, the fear of failure rate specifically among female entrepreneurs is one of the highest in a global comparison (Guelich, 2014) and women “appear to show reluctance to scale their businesses or to enter new and less tested markets” (Kelley et al., 2013).

General agreement exists, that fear of failure interferes with the outcome of entrepreneurial intentions in a negative way (Cacciotti & Hayton, 2014). Many studies trademark fear of failure as risk aversion and define fear of failure as attitude to risk (Langowitz & Minniti, 2007; Minniti & Nardone, 2007; Morales-Gualdrón & Roig, 2005). Wagner and Sternberg (2004) suggest that fear of failure is an indicator for a high degree of risk aversion whereas Rauch and Frese (2007) treat it as personal inclination towards certainty or uncertainty in the entrepreneurial process. The fear to fail exerts a negative impact on nascent entrepreneurs (Arenius & Minniti, 2005; Minniti & Nardone, 2007) and is more prevalent for women entrepreneurs than for their male counterparts (Langowitz & Minniti, 2007; Wagner, 2007).

While some research put the fear of failure on par with risk aversion which asserts its high influence on entrepreneurship as a career option (Arenius & Minniti, 2005), others assume that a reduced perceived risk in starting a venture increases the possibility to pursue new entrepreneurial endeavors (Weber & Milliman, 1997). Individuals with high achievement tendencies accept moderate degrees of uncertainty
and risk and select certain entrepreneurial actions to counteract the perceived fear (McGregor & Elliot, 2005). The active engagement in entrepreneurial actions by individuals with a high fear of failure indeed produces better entrepreneurial outcomes (Hayton, et al., 2013; Decharms & Dave, 1965). If fear leads to greater entrepreneurial endeavor, it “sometimes can be a friend as much as a foe” (Martin & Marsh, 2003, p.38) and the best strategy for entrepreneurial success is to approach failure positively. Strong belief in entrepreneurial self-efficacy coupled with positive resonance towards fear of failure may let individuals respond to threats by moving towards them rather than to the opposite (Birney et al., 1969).

From the motivational perspective fear of failure may impact the outcomes of the entrepreneurial intentions and act as a moderator to shape an individual’s attitudes and beliefs in the entrepreneurial process (Cacciotti & Hayton, 2014; Wood & Rowe, 2011). Motivation by failure avoidance results in a tendency to persevere in self-esteem when encountering potential failure (Elliot & Thrash, 2004). Facing failure, individuals tend to select actions to deviate the perceived risk by pushing one’s self-efficacy successfully or deserting the situation altogether (Birney et al., 1969). However, avoidance behavior does not necessarily initiate the desire to avoid failure (A. J. Martin & Marsh, 2003). In fact, individuals in challenging situations may select different levels of difficulty in achieving the outcome, by making less effort and reacting differently to the fear of failure (Hayton et al., 2013). Since fear of failure is comprehended by perception and affect, changes in the environmental context influence the evaluation of the perceived risk and subsequently affects the likelihood of entrepreneurial actions by an individual.

**Entrepreneurship education**

Previous research indicates that there is a small yet significant correlation between entrepreneurship education and entrepreneurial intention (Bae, et al., 2014; Martin, et al, 2013). Action-based and experiential approaches to developing entrepreneurial capabilities are an important tool in developing entrepreneurial skill sets (Erkkilä, 2000; Gibb, 2008; Heinonen & Hytti, 2010). Objectives of entrepreneurship education intend to deliver broader perspectives, entrepreneurial knowledge base and skillset, and entrepreneurial behavior for future entrepreneurial activities to students (Blenker et al, 2006; Ilozor et al., 2006; Moberg, 2011). However, there is a gap in literature about when, how and why this learning environment contributes to the decision to become an entrepreneur which leaves this field open for individual assessments of individual courses (Moberg, 2011).

Wilson et al. (2007) suggest that entrepreneurship education is more important for females than for males by increasing self-efficacy as an important entrepreneurial trait. For potential women entrepreneurs, successful targeted entrepreneurship training can raise their levels of self-efficacy and increase their interest in starting a business (Wilson et al., 2007). Matlay et al (2010) found that female students generally perceived lower positive attitudes towards entrepreneurship after course completion compared to males whereas the course impact itself was perceived to be higher for female students. Results suggest that female students benefitted considerably from their learning experience in the entrepreneurship course in terms of perceptions of pursuing an entrepreneurial career (Matlay et al., 2010).

Our study tries to explore the reactions to fearful experiences of potential student entrepreneurs and how they eventually perform towards their entrepreneurial outcome. With the understanding of entrepreneurial self-efficacy, the nature of fear of failure and their implications on the entrepreneurial outcome, our findings intend to provide a practical approach in investigating the motivational reactions towards fear among the entrepreneurship students.

**Methodology**

Defining “Out of Comfort Zone” as the intention to challenge the fear of failure, our qualitative research utilizes reflection essays and videos of the results of 15 female entrepreneurship students after a five day project in November 2016 in Bangkok. Each student was assigned a 5-day task to challenge his/her tolerance of fear and how he/she would react based on his/her level of predisposed entrepreneurial self-efficacy. Students were required to perform acts beyond their comfort level and to describe their feelings and thoughts in a reflection report. In addition, students were required to video-
tape their actions to reflect on their behavior in performing their tasks. Five additional male entrepreneurship students participated in this project to independently check and balance this exploratory study against gender differences.

We defined tasks with a Likert scale of 5 where rating 1 is unchallenging and 5 being the most challenging task. While the categories of fear are self-explanatory, the easy-peasy task needs explanation. There was no restriction on which action would be considered as easy-peasy task. Students were free to take on tasks which may be considered as normal or easy by general common sense. Examples of easy-peasy tasks are ‘first time driving a car, trying a go-kart, jogging for non-jogger, taking up a golf swing’, and the likes. In this project, meditation, holidays at seaside, giving high-five to strangers, lone dining without friends, feeding a dog for non-pet lover, watching horror movies, food review and sleeping alone are to be considered as easy-peasy.

Figure 1: Level of Fear

The reflection reports and the videos are used to identify the motivational reactions of the subjects and their actions towards fear. These in turn will relate their self-efficacy with the outcomes within a defined intention. This study explores the impact of being pushed into uncertainty outside the comfort zone on female students and how they counteract their fear of failure and uncertainty. In this context, we try to identify patterns and possibilities for further improvement in entrepreneurship education.

Results and Discussion

Our initial results show that 6 out of 15 female students were able to take on the challenge to move a step forward towards the uncertainty. Their reflection reports indicate that a courageous step forward was able to break loose their comfortable zone and expanded their learning zone along the process. The remaining majority of the students was less willing to go beyond their comfort zone or did not push themselves harder to unleash the potential of predisposed entrepreneurial self-efficacy. As a comparison, only 1 out of 5 male participants was able to conquest the fear, which reaffirmed the trend in Thailand as one of few countries in the world where both nascent and established female business owners outnumber their male counterparts (Kelley, et al., 2016).

Despite suspicious reactions from a more conservative society in Thailand, five female students were able to challenge their fear by having meals with homeless people on a street in Bangkok. One student was able to challenge her fear by consuming exotic fried insects on the street. On the contrary, only one out of the five male students, as the highest fear level for male participants, challenged himself to do the same in the project, thus leaving the highest level of fear for male entrepreneurship students at level 4 of the Likert scale of fear.
Our findings confirm that the sense of fear shapes an individual’s attitude and beliefs in the entrepreneurial process (Cacciotti & Hayton, 2014; Wood & Rowe, 2011) which eventually influences the outcome of the intentions. In situations of high-perceived risk, individuals with high achievement tendencies, coupled with positive attitude and action, were able to accomplish difficult tasks whereas others would deviate to less challenging assignments. Our findings endorse the argument of Martin & Marsh (2003) that avoidance behavior does not pledge failure but rather that the majority of the participants were inclined to give fewer efforts to challenging tasks and to seek easy routes leading to less important entrepreneurial outcomes.

One interesting motivational behavior pattern within the group of these young potential entrepreneurs emerged. All participants evaluated the perceived risk with respect to the possible effects on self-esteem or self-image derived from the different tasks. Weighing positive and negative outcomes of the perceived risk on themselves, they incorporated their fear with their planned action resulting in the achievement of their chosen intended outcome.

Our experiment is evidence, that fear indeed can trigger positive outcomes for those female students who are highly engaged with the entrepreneurial process. Individual reports reflected that the high achievers tend to face fear with a positive attitude and hence treated fear as a friendly antidote for their entrepreneurial success. Our findings affirm that individuals with a strong belief in entrepreneurial self-efficacy coupled with positive resonance yield better entrepreneurial outcomes despite a high sense of fear of failure (Birney et al., 1969; Hayton et al., 2013), whereas those who took the easy-peasy task tend to score poorly with signs of lagging in the learning trajectory.

Most of the students commented that the project indeed helped them to strengthen their self-confidence. They learned “to overcome [their] fear and hesitation” by positively acting upon it. Almost all of the subjects “believe[d] that all those skills [are] important for those who want to start up their own business.” However, there is one alarming observation from one of the reflection reports. One subject who claimed to be addicted to modern mobile technologies reflected in her report that she could not be able to tell the time, as she couldn’t “read the time from the [analog] clock” as she could “understand only the digital numbers.” Would this warrant a serious review on the effectiveness of the education system that the modern digital technologies has indeed swerved away the basic capability of the new generation of the future?
Conclusions and Implications
Due to the significant contribution by small and medium enterprises to a nation’s gross domestic product and job creation, a tremendous number of higher institutions has since sparked the growing interest in entrepreneurship education in many parts of the world. In recent years, there is an emerging trend of entrepreneurship programs being offered with various areas of concentration by higher institutions. The majority of the academic programs focus on general knowledge about entrepreneurship while others are designed to provide knowledge on new venture creation. Most entrepreneurship programs deliver theoretical aspects of principles of small business or enterprise management, thus teaching, what entrepreneurship is and how to manage it. Rarely, programs target the enhancement of entrepreneurial attributes, behaviors and competencies. While an understanding of basic principles of business management is important, the development of entrepreneurial attributes, behaviors and competencies, however, is equally essential in the entrepreneurial process. Entrepreneurship education should integrate these aspects of entrepreneurial characteristics along with the basic principle of enterprise management (Kirby, 2004; McMullan & Long, 1987).

Scholars suggest that entrepreneurship education plays a significant role in developing self-efficacy among the entrepreneurs (Kirby, 2004; Kuratko, 2005). Proponents of mastery experiences (Zimmerman, et al., 1992), commonly known as learning by doing, argue that self-efficacy could be reinforced by performing tasks that are related to the desired intentions (Cox, et al., 2002). Nonetheless, research gaps on the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education are prevalent and inconclusive opinions on the theoretical relationship between entrepreneurship education and intended outcomes exist (Cox et al., 2002). The current method of assessing course performance and satisfactory criteria, adopted by most of the higher institutions, inadequately represent the actual effectiveness of the entrepreneurship education. More so, there is hardly any study using entrepreneurial self-efficacy and the attitude towards fear of failure as measurement criteria to examine effectiveness of entrepreneurship programs (Wilson et al., 2007a). However, a direct proposition exists in how a program was experienced by the individual and the perceived feasibility of starting a business (Peterman, 2000).

Our findings suggest that the active involvement in real business situations and entrepreneurial processes tends to enhance the predisposed self-efficacy towards better intuitive and rational thinking in a potential fearful environment, especially for potential women entrepreneurs. A positive attitude towards fear of failure and the ability to unleash the potential of one’s self-efficacy might stimulate positive outcomes of entrepreneurship education and enables potential women entrepreneurs to cope with uncertainty during the entrepreneurial venture.

Limitations of this study include the small number of participants and the unknown transferability of results to other contexts. Since this initial exploratory study was aimed as a starting point in the research of the impact which “stepping out of the comfort zone” has on female students, further surveys will try to implement and fine-tune our findings to receive more specific observations towards the “when, how and especially the why” this learning environment might contribute to the decision to become an entrepreneur.

References


Gender, Leadership and Professional Development
Entrepreneurial motivations, aspirations and formalisation decisions amongst informal women entrepreneurs in Nepal

Shova Thapa Karki and Mirela Xheneti
Business and Management
School of Business Management and Economics
University of Sussex
Falmer, UK

Abstract
It is assumed that entrepreneurs are motivated to engage in the informal economy out of necessity for survival rather than opportunity; therefore, lacking growth aspirations and avoiding formalisation. However, there is a lack of empirical research exploring entrepreneurial motivations and aspirations in developing countries. This research aims to fill this gap by exploring informal women entrepreneurs’ motivations, life aspirations and formalisation decisions in the case study of Nepal. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with 30 informal women entrepreneurs in Nepal’s second largest city, Biratnagar. Women entrepreneurs’ motivations to engage in the entrepreneurial activities were complex, dynamic and intertwined with wider social norms. These complex and dynamic motivations influenced their life aspirations in terms of business growth and personal development. Entrepreneurs, who aspired to grow perceived formalisation as next step towards business sustainability. The findings contribute to the debates on the formalisation of the informal economy and calls to recognise the variabilities among informal women entrepreneurs’ motivations and aspirations. Given the role of informal activities and women entrepreneurs aspirations formalisation could have significant implications on their business sustainability.
Introduction
The informal economy is prevalent in developing countries, contributing to 40 - 60% of non-agriculture GDP and more than 60% of total employment in non-agricultural employment (Schneider, 2002). Despite its prevalence, one of the pressing concerns is that the informal economy absorbs the most vulnerable and marginalised groups in a society (ILO, 2013). It is assumed that these groups are motivated to engage in the informal economy out of necessity for their survival (Lagos, 1995; Perry et al., 2007), lack of growth aspirations (Langevag et al., 2012) and to avoid formalisation due to its costs (Perry et al., 2007). However, there is a growing recognition that informal entrepreneurs are also creative, and use informal economy as a transitional space to test their capability and towards formalisation (Adom and Williams, 2012; Williams and Martinez, 2014). Similarly, recent evidence has shown that businesses that started as informal (i.e. unregistered) had higher firm performance as the delay in firm registration enabled management of resources for stronger foundations for growth as a registered firm (Williams et al., 2016). These findings state that entrepreneurs make strategic decisions to engage in the informal economy and to transition towards formalisation.

Whilst research on entrepreneurial motivations has advanced significantly, the extant literature continues to separate motivations based on the opportunity-necessity distinction (Reynolds et al., 2002; Smallbone and Welter, 2004; Hughes, 2006; Hessels et al., 2008). Against this, researchers have argued that this simplified categorisation neglects the complex and intertwined nature of motivation (Kirkwood, 2009) as often necessity and opportunity motivation can co-present (Snyder, 2004; Williams, 2008; Williams and Round, 2009). As motivations are often considered drivers of future aspirations (Hessels et al., 2008), this categorisation has direct implications for formalisation decisions and government policies. However, there is a lack of empirical knowledge on entrepreneurial motivations in developing countries, particularly beyond the binary distinction, and their aspirations to grow (Rosa et al., 2006; Williams and Round, 2009; Langevag et al., 2012). With the aim to fill this research gap, this paper explores informal women entrepreneurs’ motivations and life aspirations and how these might affect the choices they make in relation to business formalisation in the case study of Nepal. Three specific research questions guide the research aim:

1. What are entrepreneurs’ motivation to engage in the informal economy?
2. In what ways entrepreneurs’ motivations drive entrepreneurial aspirations?
3. How do entrepreneurial motivation and aspirations affect entrepreneurs’ formalisation decisions?

Women entrepreneurs in a developing country context are an important empirical object because they are overrepresented, have lower business registration rates than men, and are less likely to see the value of formalisation (Hampel-Milagrosa, 2011; Kabeer, 2012). In addition, various constraints and preferences, such as cultural and social norms restricting mobility, reliance on close networks, and locational choice to remain close to home to manage family duties have been found to influence women’s decisions in the informal economy (Williams, 2011; Babbitt et al., 2015). These decisions indicate that women’s business preferences (including choice of industry and sector) reflect tacit choices based on distinct motivations around lifestyle, family and values; and sit within significant challenges around subsistence and livelihoods vulnerability (Bardasi et al., 2011).

The paper makes several contributions to the literature. First, it presents new knowledge on the role of motivations and aspirations on formalisation decisions. Extant literature places an emphasis on costs-benefits rationality for lack of formalisation (Perry et al., 2007). Moving forward, this research shows that formalisation decisions are intertwined with motivations, various business constraints and entrepreneurs’ aspirations. Second, the relationship between motivations, aspirations and formalisation decisions are neither unidirectional nor static but dynamic. Third, building on previous studies on motivations, this research adds that informal entrepreneurs are motivated by diverse factors beyond opportunity-necessity bifurcations. These findings call for a recognition of women as heterogeneous groups, which should be considered when designing formalisation policies.

Entrepreneurial motivations and aspirations

Opportunity and necessity driven entrepreneurship
Entrepreneurial motivations have been a key focus of entrepreneurship studies and recently there has been a call to renew motivations research in new directions looking at the relationship between
motivations, aspirations and behaviour (Carsud and Brännback, 2011). Entrepreneurship literature on start-up motivations have evolved from personality traits theory to external factors focusing on ‘necessity – opportunity entrepreneurship’, also referred as ‘pull-push’ motivations (Reynolds et al., 2002; Smallbone and Welter, 2004; Hughes, 2006; Hessels et al., 2008). Necessity entrepreneurship refers to individuals pushed into entrepreneurship, influenced by structural factors such as unemployment and poverty, because of lack of alternatives, therefore, entrepreneurs are motivated to earn their livelihoods for survival (Minniti et al., 2006). Whereas, opportunity entrepreneurship refers to individuals who are pulled into entrepreneurship with a desire for autonomy, including independence and freedom, increased income, wealth, challenge, recognition and improved status (Kolvereid, 1996; Smallbone and Welter, 2004; Minniti et al., 2006). Opportunity-centred entrepreneurship emphasises individual choice whereby entrepreneurs exploit opportunity to create ventures.

This binary categorisation states that entrepreneurs are either necessity or opportunity oriented (Minniti et al., 2006). As evident on Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (GEM) surveys higher number of entrepreneurial activities in developing countries are driven by necessity-oriented entrepreneurship (40%) in comparison to developed countries where entrepreneurship is mostly opportunity-centred (20%) (Kelly et al., 2016). Mirroring the formal entrepreneurship literature, the structuralist view is also adopted on the informal sector stating that informal entrepreneurs are engaged in the informal economy out of necessity (Lagos, 1995; Adom, 2014). However, neo-liberal view emphasises on choices made by informal entrepreneurs to operate informally to avoid costs, time and effort in registration (Perry et al., 2007). Therefore, entrepreneurs choose to engage in the informal economy to achieve autonomy, freedom, and identity which is not available in the formal economy (Snyder, 2004; Aidis et al., 2006). In addition, recent evidence has shown that informal entrepreneurs are also motivated by opportunity and their motivations changed from necessity to opportunity over time (Williams and Gurtoo, 2011; Adom, 2014). Similarly, existing literature on the motives of informal entrepreneurs conventionally has stressed the static approach with research focussing on surveys at a specific time period (Adom and Williams, 2012). However, new research adopting in-depth qualitative approach have argued the “fluidity in the motives over time” (Adom and Williams, 2012:7). However, there is a lack of empirical knowledge exploring motivations in the developing countries (Rosa et al., 2006; Williams and Round, 2009).

Examining entrepreneurial motivations is important as often entrepreneurial motivations are associated with aspirations (Hessels et al., 2008). For instance, motivations associated with increased income are positively related with growth aspirations (Hessels et al., 2008). This has direct implications for the informal economy as it is considered that informal entrepreneurs motivated by necessity for survival have lower growth aspirations (Reynolds et al., 2002). This lack of growth aspirations might also influence their formalisation decisions as it is assumed that necessity focused entrepreneurs are pushed by circumstances outside their control rather than their choice. However, in a case study of Dominic Republic De Castro et al., (2014) show that informal entrepreneurs make multiple strategic choices to stage formalisation. As entrepreneurs were successful, they aspired to grow and decided to formalise to reduce costs of informality and capture wider benefits. Similarly, based on a World Bank Enterprise Survey (WBES) data, Williams et al., (2016) find that entrepreneurs made strategic choices to remain informal and delay formalisation in order to build relationships with suppliers and customers, and stronger foundations for growth leading to firm performance.

While these studies focusing on formalisation decisions and impact of being informal on firms’ performance did not examine motivations and future aspirations directly they emphasise the choices informal entrepreneurs make in relation to business formalisation. This paper argues that entrepreneurs also make choices based on free will to engage in the informal economy rather than pushed by necessity; and they also aspire to grow as opportunity-oriented entrepreneurs, which affect the choices they make in relation to business formalisation. However, there is a lack of research on aspirations of informal entrepreneurs in developing countries, and where exits it links informal entrepreneurs with lack of aspirations or links growth aspirations with job creation and market expansion (Langevang et al., 2012). There is a need to understand in-depth the ways individuals are motivated to engage in the entrepreneurial activities and how these motivations are associated with future aspirations (Langevang et al., 2012).
Informal women entrepreneurs' motivations, aspirations and their formalisation decisions

Informal economy provides an important source of income for women in developing countries (Chen, 2007). However, women entrepreneurship in the informal economy are characterised as small scale, operating in a highly clustered, niche and 'saturated' sector, less efficient in terms of productivity, less profits, and less inclination towards formalisation (De Bruin et al., 2000; Bardasi et al., 2011). While women entrepreneurs are also viewed to be engaged in the informal economy motivated by necessity this narrow view neglects to reflect that women are also motivated by a desire for greater income, self-fulfilment, and ability to balance work and family roles (Kantor, 2002; Gurtoo and Williams, 2009). These motivations to start a business in the informal sector as well as their future aspirations and formalisation decisions are restricted by norms and expectations on women's work (Brush et al., 2009; Franck, 2012) and are outcome of various constraints faced by, and preferences of women entrepreneurs (Babbitt et al., 2015).

Cultural norms shape beliefs about gender roles both at home and outside, or what is appropriate for men and women (Nelson, 1999). Due to these beliefs women often choose to hide their activities and be submissive as a mean of maintaining their traditional social positions as 'mothers' and 'carers' rather than successful business women (Bowman and Cole, 2014); and when they are successful, 'success' does not mean that women perceive themselves to be a business woman or have any intention to pursue a successful business career in lieu of other expected roles (Rouse et al., 2013). Similarly, expectations on women's roles, marriage and family obviates investment in girls' formal education creating barriers to economic participation (Kantor, 2002). Women are perceived to choose informality because it allows combining household work with paid work, making use of household resources and skills based on domestic roles, particularly space and cooking and caring, facilitating effective use of time by avoiding travel to work, and remaining active, life satisfaction, independence and income (Tipple, 2005). The desire to engage in entrepreneurial activities to achieve greater 'life satisfaction' is predominantly held by women (Bardasi et al., 2011). While most of the literature emphasise that women entrepreneurs operate within the constraints of social norms and have no aspirations to grow, this paper argues against this and states that women also aspire to grow.

Methodology

Study setting and the nature of informal economy

Nepal has a long history of conflict affecting private enterprise development, contributing to increase in the size and the nature of the informal economy, and displacing men forcing women to self-employment to maintain household livelihoods (Sharma and Donini, 2012; Menon and Rodgers, 2015). The stratified society with unequal power relations, primarily caste-based, and socially prescribed roles, behaviour and expectations for men and women (ILO, 2005) have contributed directly to the higher female labour participation rate (80%) in the informal economy, which is the highest among other South Asian countries (ILO Nepal, 2014). Women-owned enterprises are subsistence in nature, operate in highly clustered and saturated sectors, more concentrated in the microenterprise sector, and have low registration rate (5.4%) compared to men owned enterprises (47.1%) (ILO, 2005).

Data collection and analysis

Data for this paper were collected as part of a project concerned with the nuanced experiences of various groups of Nepali women in the informal economy along several socio-spatial contexts and enterprise sector dynamics. Given that entrepreneurial motivations are multi-faceted (Mallon and Cohen, 2001), quantitative surveys are unable to capture the complex decision process (Kirkwood, 2009). Therefore, this study adopts a qualitative approach as a research design and uses semi-structured interviews with 30 women entrepreneurs in Biratnagar, Nepal. Biratnagar is the industrial capital serving as the main economic and service hub for the eastern region, is the second largest city and borders India. A stratified sampling strategy design was used for the selection of women entrepreneurs on the basis of diverse sectors and a mix of formal and informal women entrepreneurs. This allowed to capture the diversity of women's life circumstances and a better understanding of their motivations, life aspirations and formalisation decisions. Interviews were conducted during December 2014 – March 2015 in Nepalese, and subsequently translated into English and entered in NVIVO for data analysis purposes. The semi-structured interviews lasted between 30 to 100 minutes. Interviews were analysed using thematic analysis and involved several iterative processes. At the first stage, the interview data was reviewed to identify three key themes: i) Motivations (motivations for engaging in the
entrepreneurial activities in the informal economy); ii) Aspirations (future ambitions/plans associated with business); and iii) Formalisation decisions (plans to formalise, no plans to formalise, and already formalised). At the second stage, the data was coded further to gain an in-depth understanding of the interviews within each theme. This stage was data-driven and new codes emerged through further analysis of interviews. At the final stage, codes were evaluated to identify patterns of relation between motivations, aspirations and formalisation decisions.

Findings and Discussion

Motivations to engage in the informal economy

As marginalised populations are widely engaged in the informal economy of developing countries, there is a widely held belief that they are motivated to do so out of necessity to sustain their livelihoods (Lagos, 1995; Minniti et al., 2006). However, others have argued against this view and stressed that informal entrepreneurs are also driven by their choice (Snyder, 2004; Williams, 2008). Whilst informal women entrepreneur in developing countries are mostly necessity driven, there is evidence of opportunity factors (Franck, 2012; Adom, 2014). Participants were motivated to engage in the informal economy based on opportunity and necessity oriented factors. Some participants stressed the opportunity factors, such as desire of independence, avoiding idleness and own one’s business as motivators for engaging in entrepreneurial activities. As evident in previous studies, majority of the participants were driven by the need to earn a living or due to the lack of alternatives. They frequently mentioned a ‘compulsion to get additional income for the household’ and highlighted their lack of education and skills as barriers to get into the formal economy. Lack of education and skills have been cited as the main reasons for higher number of women’s participation in the informal economy, where women are trapped in low threshold sectors because of low requirements in terms of skills, investments and assets (Tipple, 2005; Chen, 2007). However, even educated participants in this study cited inability to find jobs in the formal sector and being engaged in the informal sector.

Although most participants were driven purely by necessity, a complex combination of both opportunity-necessity drivers were also found to be the case. Biratnagar (3.1.3) clarifies how despite being educated, a lack of formal jobs or very low salaries in the formal sector drove her to engage in entrepreneurial activities. Her experience of running a readymade clothing store led her to finding an establishment in a good location, where to open a new shop. Similarly, Biratnagar (3.3.4) states that her husband did not have a job and she needed to earn a living but the desire to own business and avoid idleness pulled her towards entrepreneurship. In addition, Biratnagar (3.4.8) highlights how the compulsion to earn living and a market opportunity drove her family to start a mushroom farming business. She states, “We had gone to Kathmandu (capital of Nepal) last year looking for potential ways to earn income. In the suburban area, we saw mushroom farms and the demand in the market. We decided to come back to Biratnagar and start the farming rather than going abroad”. These cases illustrate the combination of motivations, the need of earning a living and unemployment with desire for independence and own a business, market opportunity, and past experience (Kantor, 2002; Williams and Gurtoo, 2011). Consistent with previous research that motivations change over time (Adom and Williams, 2012), this research also found that different motivations were not only combined but also changed over time from necessity to opportunity. The case of Biratnagar (3.2.1) portrays this, “When I had no alternative, I chose this business. We started commercial banana farming, but after first season strong wind destroyed all our plants. We did some research to identify plants with strong wind tolerance and came across lemon farming. We sold lemons of RS. 250,000 ($1 = RS 105 Nepalese rupees). I used to feel bad as I wanted to do an office job, but now I am satisfied in this business. I am earning more and employing people”.

Motivations as drivers of aspirations

Inquiry of the participants’ aspirations associated with their business identified three groups. Firstly, participants did not have any future aspirations with their business in terms of growth. Secondly, participants aspired to expand their business. Thirdly, participants’ business aspirations were associated with life aspirations of personal development. As motivations are drivers of aspirations (Hessels et al., 2008) and often necessity oriented motivation are not associated with growth aspirations (Reynolds et al., 2002), this research however, observed mixed findings. Some of the participants who were purely motivated by lack of alternatives and earn a living did not have any aspirations to grow. Their lack of aspirations were associated with lack of finance, human capital, high
competition and lack of sales, retirement and business exit and moving their business to the home location to reduce scale or remain invisible. As illustrated by the Biratnagar (3.2.2), “I don’t have money to expand, this belongs to my landlord I cannot do anything here. If I go somewhere else there might not be good sale or there could be high competition”. As necessity oriented entrepreneurship is based on survival, it is subsistence in nature, small scale and operate on saturated sectors (Bardasi et al., 2011). Although necessity driven entrepreneurs are depended on their venture and might aspire to grow various constraints might limit their potential or aspirations to grow (Hessels et al., 2008). These constraints were also the reasons emphasised by the participants for their lack of growth aspirations.

Few necessity oriented participants still aspired to grow. Their distinct family circumstances such as husband being abroad and supporting with finances, previous successful business experience, husband with formal jobs, and older children drove them to gain additional income and recognition, built confidence and in the process aspiring them to grow. As illustrated by Biratnagar (3.1.2), “I want to extend my business. I am now more confident on my business. When my husband returns from abroad I will extend my business. I will increase the number of pigs and also find large space for expansion”. These findings highlight that close association between life stories, family trajectories, social relationships and enterprise development and motivations (Langevang et al., 2012).

Necessity oriented entrepreneurship is also associated with family and caring responsibilities where often women pursue entrepreneurship to fulfill their gender roles of being ‘mother’ and ‘carer’ (Bowman and Cole, 2014). Therefore, their motivations are often intertwined with the lack of aspirations to grow with a perception that greater time is required for ventures to the detriment of children’s well-being. As Biratnagar (3.4.5) with two young children states, “I chose this business as it is flexible, I don't need to go anywhere and I can be with my children at any time. This cannot be done as an employee”. Her future aspiration is to shift the parlour to her home so that they can look after the children and family. This example illustrates the gendered nature of women entrepreneurship and the need to consider the wider environment in which women entrepreneurship is situated (Williams and Gurtoo, 2011; Langevang et al., 2012).

Participants who were driven to avoid idleness were aspired to grow their business. Their business growth were linked with expansion through increasing the size of their business, product diversification, increasing customer and clients, moving to larger space and hiring more workers. As illustrated by Biratnagar (3.2.6), “There is a high demand for meat in the market. I have plans to invest more and extend the business. I am confident and believe that I will compensate the loss I have suffered. The suppliers trust us now, with their trust we can expand further”. These participants chose informal economy to test their capability and viability of their business (Williams and Martinez, 2014). Having established themselves, gaining market knowledge and experience and developed trust with their suppliers they feel confident to survive and aspire to grow for long term sustainability. This case is also evident for participants where necessity and opportunity entrepreneurship co-existed. For instance, Biratnagar (3.4.8) was motivated to earn a living but also identified a market opportunity. She started her business and now has plans to grow further. She states, “I want to hire 150 workers and increase production. Currently, I have four cottages to grow mushroom, I want to add two more. This will increase the production, in addition I will also add goats and cow for meat and milk. My next plan to produce mushroom soup powder as there is a high demand due to being a healthy product”.

Participants also aspired more than just business growth but growth at personal level. Their personal development aspiration were associated with international business expansion and community development through acting as a role model of successful women entrepreneur and giving employment and encouraging other women towards self-employment. These entrepreneurs were mainly motivated by the desire to own a business and to do something. Often inspired through others (e.g. peers, successful entrepreneurs) these participants aspired to gain more knowledge in their field, manage their business well and employ more women in their community. As illustrated by Biratnagar (3.3.6), “I want to do more work outside Biratnagar. I am involved in many organisations. They have assured me that they will support in exporting my products abroad. I have the confidence to grow beyond here”.
Motivations and aspirations affecting formalisation decisions
Participants’ motivations and life aspirations also affected their formalisation decisions in terms of: i) having no plans to formalise; ii) having plans to formalise; and iii) already formalised. First, most of the women entrepreneurs motivated purely by necessity (e.g. earn living/lack of alternatives/family and children) did not aspire to grow, hence they did not have plans to formalise. As illustrated by a participant 3.3.9, who is engaged in the economic activities to earn living, neither aspires to grow nor has plans to formalise. She states, “I am satisfied with this business. I have no big dream. The business is running well. We bring coconuts of 2000 rupees and decorate with glitters and sell the next morning and again bring more materials. We go along with the flow of time. I have no plan to register”. For these participants without any life aspirations but a determination to continue with the flow, exit or retire from their entrepreneurial activities formalisation is a costly exposure and non-essential for their business sustainability.

Second, participants, who were motivated by a combination of necessity (e.g. earn living) and opportunity entrepreneurship (e.g. desire to own business/market opportunity) aspired to grow. These participants as they gained confidence on their capability, increased market knowledge and developed trust relationship perceived business growth through formalisation as pathways to their business sustainability. These group of women perceived that formalisation will give them visibility and legitimacy to access wider networks of employees, clients and suppliers enabling their growth and sustainability. These findings are similar to others which highlight how informal businesses who delay registration use their informal status to build stronger foundations (Williams et al., 2016).

Third, women entrepreneurs continuing the path of success and aspired to grow further in international arena, and influence other women in their community as a ‘role model’ had already formalised their business. These group of women, after testing their entrepreneurial capability in the informal economy, perceived that they can encourage other women towards economic independence. As illustrated by Biratnagar (3.3.4), “I am satisfied with it. I want to extend this business further, and want to be famous woman entrepreneur. I will hire many women workers in my business”. Their success as well as growth along the process aspires them to do more.

Figure 1. Conceptualising motivations, aspirations and formalisation decision within opportunity-necessity bifurcation and dynamic approach

The relationship between motivations, within the opportunity-necessity distinction, life aspirations and formalisation is shown in Figure 1. Despite this categorisation, the findings from this study and previous studies have shown that motivations are complex, dynamic and intertwined (Kirkwood, 2009; Langevag et al., 2012). Motivations influence life aspirations, and life aspirations influence formalisation decisions. However, as women entrepreneurs gain confidence and succeed in business, formalisation enables their business sustainability, which then again motivates them to engage in the entrepreneurial activities beyond their environment and pursue higher level aspirations, such as
international growth, personal development and community development. For others motivated by necessity, various constraints affected growth aspirations, influencing their decision not to formalise.

Conclusions and Implications
This research explored informal women entrepreneurs’ motivations and life aspirations and how these might affect the choices they make in relation to business formalisation. Informal women entrepreneurs were motivated by necessity, opportunity and a combination of both necessity-opportunity entrepreneurship. In consistent with the recent research, the findings also show that motivation changes over time and intertwined with entrepreneurs life circumstances. Examining the role of motivations on aspirations to grow showed that various constraints limit the potential of necessity-driven entrepreneur to grow. In contrast to exiting literature which states that wider social and cultural norms influence women entrepreneurs’ motivations and aspiration, this research shows that despite these some women aspire to grow. Their aspirations were associated with business success and confidence they gained in their venture. Business aspirations also influenced entrepreneurs’ formalisation decisions, where those with growth aspirations considered formalisation as the necessary step on their growth stage. While others with increased confidence and success had already formalised and still aspired to grow but beyond the home boundaries influencing others in their communities through their work. Whereas those without any aspirations to grow were satisfied with what they were doing and wanted to continue without formalisation. One interesting finding was that participants’ motivations and aspirations were closely associated with their distinctive life circumstances. This is a limitation of this study as the role of life circumstances, such as age, household size, household situation and access to networks were not examined. Future research could look into this and see how specific life circumstance can influence motivations, aspirations and formalisation decisions.

The findings make several contributions. First, it adds to the existing literature on entrepreneurial motivations in the informal economy stating that motivations are complex and dynamic, and women entrepreneurs are also motivated by opportunity. Second, women entrepreneurs also aspire to grow and that their aspirations are directly linked with confidence they gain from business experience. Finally, it makes a novel contribution to debates on the formalisation of the informal economy. Given that formalisation is continuously proposed as essential for business performance, it needs to recognise the variabilities among informal women entrepreneurs and the implications of formalisation on their business sustainability. References


ABSTRACT

Purpose: It is well-documented that entrepreneurship is a key driver of economic development and well-being of individuals and societies alike. It is also known that women participation in entrepreneurship is becoming significantly more noticed and recognized. Thus, it is critical to understand what drives or hinders their participation in entrepreneurial activities. Guided by two prominent theories; self-determination theory and theory of planned behaviour, the main purpose of this study is to examine the role that intrinsic and extrinsic motivation play in fostering female students' intention to start their own businesses and become entrepreneurs. Further, it aims at investigating the effect of entrepreneurship education on their intention as well.

Methods: Data were collected using questionnaires from 325 female students enrolled in two universities in Malaysia. Structural equation modeling was employed to test the hypothesized model and structural relationships.

Findings: The findings show that entrepreneurship education, intrinsic and extrinsic motivation are very critical predictors of entrepreneurial intention. Both intrinsic and extrinsic motivation influenced the female students' intention. However, interestingly, extrinsic motivation is shown to exert more effect on the outcome. For entrepreneurship education, it directly and indirectly influenced the intention via intrinsic and extrinsic motivation where they played a partial mediation.

Implications: This study contributes to female entrepreneurship research by integrating self-determination theory and theory of planned behaviour to have better understanding of their inclination to be entrepreneurs. Whether they are intrinsically or extrinsically motivated, a supportive culture that enhances such spirit should be acted upon. Further, entrepreneurship education plays a vital role and thus more programs, courses, events conferences etc should be readily available for students to make them realize their potentials.

Limitations: The findings of the current study limit its generalizability to a wider population since participants were from two universities only.

2 Corresponding author. Tel.: +60183747404  
E-mail address: aljubari@msu.edu.my
INTRODUCTION

The growing body of literature on entrepreneurial intention argues that intention plays a viable role in the decision to start a business (Almobaireek & Manolova, 2012; Krueger, Reilly, & Carsrud, 2000; Liñán & Chen, 2009). As entrepreneurship may be viewed as a process that occurs over time, entrepreneurial intention seems to be the first step to be taken by individuals when deciding on becoming entrepreneurs. This decision may be considered as a conscious and voluntary act in the evolving and long process of entrepreneurship (Gartner, Shaver, Gatewood, & Katz, 1994).

However, stereotype of gender role is argued to have great influence on people’s cognitions and actions (Heilman, 2001). Such stereotypes are reflected on the divide between men and women in many domains including starting a business (Gupta, Turban, & Bhawe, 2008). Gender is argued to matter in the entrepreneurial intention formation as it matters in other aspects of the entrepreneurship process (Hindle, Klyver, & Jennings, 2009). In fact, several researchers argued that gender stereotype influences both males’ and females’ intention to start a business (e.g., Davis & Shaver, 2012; Gupta et al., 2008). As starting a business is perceived, to some extent, to be associated with masculine characteristics (Bird & Brush, 2002; Lewis, 2006; Wilson, Kickul, & Martino, 2007), the stereotypical beliefs adversely affect the entry and development of women in entrepreneurship (Marlow & Patton, 2005). Many studies have found that female students showed lower self-efficacy and intention to start a business than their male counterparts (e.g., Chen, Greene, & Crick, 1998; Gatewood, Shaver, Powers, & Gartner, 2002; Kourilsky & Walstad, 1998; Wilson et al., 2007). To enhance their perception about the potential they have and about the fruitful outcome entrepreneurship may entail, earlier research suggested that entrepreneurship education plays a vital role in this perceptive. Not only it improves the skills and knowledge, but also it renders entrepreneurship more attractive and advantageous to them as well. Further, it enhances people’s motivation to start their own business. Motivation is an essential ingredient of doing any activity. Therefore, the main objective of the present study is to examine the role of entrepreneurship education on predicting entrepreneurial intention directly and indirectly via the intrinsic and extrinsic motivation constructs of Self-Determination Theory. The rest of the paper is organized as follow: the next section provides theoretical background on entrepreneurship education, self-determination of motivation and entrepreneurial intention. It is then followed by the methods section. Then data analysis and results are presented section 4 followed by the discussion.

THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

Entrepreneurial Intention

It is defined “as a self-acknowledged conviction by a person that they will set up a new business venture and consciously plan to do so at some point in the future” (Thompson, 2009: p. 687). In the area of university graduates’ entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial intention research has been widely used due to its predictive power of entrepreneurial behaviour (Almobaireek & Manolova, 2012; Krueger et al., 2000; Liñán & Chen, 2009).

Entrepreneurship Education and Entrepreneurial Intention

Entrepreneurship education is rapidly growing in universities and colleges around the world (Katz, 2003; Martin, McNally, & Kay, 2013). Indeed, entrepreneurship education plays a vital role in shaping and fostering students’ attitudes and perceptions towards entrepreneurship. While there are few studies that found that entrepreneurship education is negatively related to intention to start a business (e.g., Oosterbeek, van Praag & Ijsselstein, 2010), many others have found that entrepreneurship education positively reinforces students’ attitudes and intention towards entrepreneurial activity (Fayolle, Gailly, & Lassas-Clerc, 2006; Sánchez, 2013; Tkachev & Kolvereid, 1999; Yun, 2010).

To address the conflicts in the findings of the previous studies, Martin et al. (2013) conducted a meta-analysis and found support for entrepreneurship education and training. The study was based on the theory of human capital that indicates that those with higher knowledge and skills and other competencies are more likely to demonstrate better and greater performance than those with less or no
knowledge and skills. The results of the 42 independent samples, comprising a total of 16,657 students, reveal that entrepreneurship education and training were associated with higher levels of (a) total entrepreneurship-related human capital assets, (b) entrepreneurship-related knowledge and skills (c) positive perceptions of entrepreneurship, and d) intentions to become an entrepreneur. Further, the study found that entrepreneurship education and training was positively associated with (a) entrepreneurship outcomes in general (b) start-up and (c) entrepreneurship performance. In line with these findings, Morris et al. (2013) demonstrate that entrepreneurship education enhances the entrepreneurial competencies and intentions to start a business.

In support of the above studies, several studies have shown how entrepreneurship education positively affect students’ attitudes, skills and intentions to start a business. For instance, in the United States, Wilson, Kickul and Marlino (2007) conducted a study to investigate whether targeted education like entrepreneurship education can play a role in fostering self-efficacy and increasing confidence level among students. The study used two different student samples. The first sample comprised middle and high school students whereas the other set of sample was among MBA students from different American schools and universities. More than five thousand students participated in this study. The findings suggest that entrepreneurship education played a crucial role in fostering the perception of self-efficacy and intention in both sample groups, though the perception of self-efficacy was stronger among female MBA students. Another study in the U.S. has further investigated the role of entrepreneurship education and training in business venture effectiveness (Elmuti, Khoury & Omran, 2012). The findings of the study, which utilized two sample groups entrepreneurs and prospective entrepreneurs, found that entrepreneurship education and training were vital to the success of business ventures.

Consistent with Wilson et al.’s (2007) study, similar findings were found in the Chinese context (Wu & Wu, 2008; Yun, 2010). Yun (2010) conducted a study to empirically test the impact of entrepreneurship education on entrepreneurial intention mediated by self-efficacy using undergraduate management students. According to the study, there are three benefits of entrepreneurship education to students that included learning, inspiration and incubation resources. Findings suggest that learning and inspiration had significant influence on the intention to become an entrepreneur mediated by self-efficacy, whereas incubation resources impacted intentions directly.

Wu and Wu’s (2008) study focused on investigating how intention to start a business is influenced by the higher educational background of Chinese students. They employed TPB model for better prediction of entrepreneurial intention in a sample of 150 students of Tongji University in Shanghai, China and utilized structural equation modeling for analysing the data. They also investigated how the TPB’s four constructs were associated with different educational backgrounds (engineering, entrepreneurship related major and non-entrepreneurship related major). Results show that attitude was the most influential factor on intention followed by perceived behavioural control. Subject norm was not significant. Findings also suggest that intention was influenced by educational level through attitudes, where postgraduate students seemed less attracted to entrepreneurship. Further, it has been found that engineering students had more tendencies to start their own business followed by entrepreneurship related major. These findings highlight the importance of education and more specifically, entrepreneurship education. In line with these findings and still in the Asian context, Keat, Selvarajah and Meyer (2011) found that entrepreneurship education contributed to university students’ inclination towards entrepreneurship in Malaysia.

In Turkey, the moderating effect of higher education between personality and entrepreneurial intentions was investigated. Results show that students with a higher level of education tended to have higher entrepreneurial intention. Another key finding is that students’ risk-taking propensity interacted with education, so that for higher risk-taking students, university education tended to increase entrepreneurial intentions even more (Ertuna & Gurel, 2011).

In summary, entrepreneurship education and training are of particular relevance, interest and importance to governments and universities. From the discussion above, it is clearly demonstrated that it has an impact in shaping students’ perception, beliefs and intentions by equipping them with the necessary and right knowledge, skills and tools that make them more entrepreneurially-oriented. The role of entrepreneurship education cannot be neglected if we are to aim at improved economic growth.
and better societies. To conclude, economic growth needs more entrepreneurs and, in turn, entrepreneurs need entrepreneurship education.

**Self-Determination Theory**

Self-determination theory (SDT) is a macro-theory of human motivation, development and wellness. It has been extensively researched and widely used in different settings and various contexts such as parenting, education, work, relationships, physical activity, health care, sports environmental issues, psychotherapy and so forth (Baard, Deci, & Ryan, 2004; Deci & Ryan, 2008; Gagne & Deci, 2005; Hagger, Chatzisarantis, & Biddle, 2002; Vallerand, Pelletier, & Koestner, 2008).

It posits that human beings have an inherent motivation for growth and achievement (Stone, Deci, & Ryan, 2009) and they have natural motivational tendencies and readiness to learn, explore and assimilate knowledge and develop new skills (Deci & Ryan, 2000). These natural tendencies, however, can be either facilitated and supported or hindered by social contexts (Ryan & Deci, 2000b). Not only what makes people motivated is the interest of SDT, but also, what makes them thrive and flourish (Ryan & Deci, 2011). As it views motivation as the core of biological, cognitive and social regulation and it (motivation) involves the energy, direction and persistence of activation and intention (Deci & Ryan, 2000), SDT distinguishes between two types of motivation: intrinsic and extrinsic motivation. That is, SDT, unlike many other theories, is more concerned with the types of motivation, not the amount of motivation.

**Intrinsic and Extrinsic Motivation**

Intrinsic motivation refers the extent that individuals feel more autonomous and endorsed. They engage in activities, such as starting a business, because of the inherent personal satisfaction interest and enjoyment derived from that activity *per se* (Ryan & Deci, 2002). When intrinsically motivated, people do activities including acting entrepreneurially for the potential fun, excitement and challenge. These behaviours originate from within the self-associated feelings of curiosity and interest, rather than influenced by any external contingencies (Niemiec & Ryan, 2009). SDT maintains that people feel intrinsically motivated when they believe that they have fully chosen and endorsed their behaviours (Bloom & Colbert, 2011). Under the intrinsic motivation, the perceived locus of causality is believed to be internal and from within the self.

Vallerand (1997) categorizes intrinsic motivation into three forms: intrinsic motivation to know, to accomplish and to experience stimulation. The first refers to performing an activity “for the pleasure and satisfaction that one experiences while learning, exploring, or trying to understand something new” (p. 280). The second refers to the feeling of the sense of accomplishing and creation of new things, which is the source of pleasure and satisfaction. The latter refers to experiencing pleasurable intellectual or physical sensations. Intrinsic motivation is linked to many positive outcomes that has been found in a numerous of studies. For instance, it has been associated with higher self-esteem and coping with failure (Ryan & Deci, 2000), greater persistence (Vansteenkiste, Simons, Lens, Sheldon, & Deci, 2004), creativity (Sheldon, 1995) and etc. These are characteristics that shape the entrepreneurial personality and most needed by entrepreneurs. Therefore, intrinsic motivation will contribute greatly to the positive attitudes and intentions to be entrepreneurs.

Due to the fact that not all activities/jobs are intrinsically interesting and enjoyable to derive satisfaction from them. As such engaging in them is not for reasons inherent in them, individuals may engage in such activities for some instrumental extrinsic factors to get them motivated. Extrinsic motivation is thought to occur when people behave because they expect some desirable consequences or to avoid undesirable ones. That is, extrinsically motivated behaviours are pursued because separable outcomes such as receiving money, pride and prestige or even avoiding avoid punishment, guilt and unemployment are expected (Gagne & Deci, 2005; Ryan & Deci, 2000b).

Extrinsic motivation is treated as a multidimensional motivational construct that, according to Ryan & Deci (2002) comes in four types: external regulation, introjected regulation, identification regulation and integrated regulation. It is argued that extrinsic motivation can vary in degree from fully controlled by contingences external to individuals, such as expecting reward or avoiding punishment (being fired from work, salary cut, avoiding unemployment, etc.), to autonomous motivation which can be considered as the same degree as intrinsic motivation.
SDT argues that one can feel autonomously motivated when s/he engage in activities and work environments that facilitate the fulfillment of three basic organismic human needs namely: autonomy, competence and relatedness. If these needs are not supported or fully met by the social contexts, people’s intrinsic motivation will be undermined and diminished (Chirkov, Ryan, Kim & Kaplan, 2003; Deci & Ryan, 2000; Ryan & Deci, 2000b). Conversely, if these needs are satisfied, people will likely be more inclined to persistently complete the task with intrinsic motivation (Ryan & Deci, 2000b). That is, intrinsically motivated individuals will likely engage in activities with more quality ideas and persistent behaviours. On the other hand, people whose social contexts do not support their psychological needs will likely be controlled in their motivation and have less quality entrepreneurial ideas and behaviours (Deci & Ryan, 2000; Weinstein & Ryan, 2011; Wilson, Mack & Grattan, 2008).

Based on the above discussion, the following hypotheses are formulated:

H1a: Entrepreneurship education has a positive effect on female students’ intrinsic motivation. H1b: Entrepreneurship education has a positive effect on female students’ extrinsic motivation. 
H1c: Entrepreneurship education has a direct positive effect on female students’ intention to become entrepreneurs.
H2a: Intrinsic motivation has a positive effect on the students’ intention to become entrepreneurs.
H2b: Intrinsic motivation mediates the relationship between entrepreneurship education and students’ intention to become entrepreneurs.
H3a: Extrinsic motivation has a positive effect on the students’ intention to become entrepreneurs.
H3b: Extrinsic motivation mediates the relationship between entrepreneurship education and students’ intention to become entrepreneurs.

METHODOLOGY

The final sample of this study consisted of 320 female university students enrolled in entrepreneurship program at two private universities in Malaysia. The age distribution of the sample ranged from 18 years old (minimum) to 32 years (maximum). The mean age was 21.56 (SD= 2.32). All but 12 students are single and they come from three main ethnic groups: Malay (38.4%), Indian (28.7%), Chinses (28.4%) and 4.4% are others.

Entrepreneurial intention was assessed by a 6-item scale and entrepreneurship education was assessed by a 5-item scale, ranging from 1= “total disagreement” to 5 = “total agreement” (Liñán, Rodríguez-Cohard, & Rueda-Cantuch, 2011). Motivational constructs were measured using adapted scale from (Guay, Vallerand, & Blanchard, 2000).

ANALYSIS AND RESULTS

Descriptive Statistics

The descriptive statistics and intercorrelations among the constructs included in the study are displayed in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs [No. of Items]</th>
<th>Mean SD</th>
<th>Alphas</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurial Intention [6]</td>
<td>3.52 (.85)</td>
<td>924</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intrinsic Motivation [5]</td>
<td>3.72 (.71)</td>
<td>.838</td>
<td>.658**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extrinsic Motivation [4]</td>
<td>3.04 (1.1)</td>
<td>.909</td>
<td>.637**</td>
<td>.556**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship Education [5]</td>
<td>3.85 (.72)</td>
<td>.887</td>
<td>.627**</td>
<td>.593**</td>
<td>.426**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Structural Equation Modeling

Structural equation modeling (SEM) has become enormously popular among researchers (Kline, 2011; Ullman, 2006) and without a doubt it is regarded as one of the most important data analysis techniques (Kaplan, 2009). SEM has become a preferred tool for investigating the plausibility of theoretical models
in many scientific disciplines (Hu & Bentler, 1999).

**Measurement Model**

The hypothesized measurement model consisted of four unobserved latent constructs that were measured by 20 observed variables (indicators). To test the study’s measurement model, confirmatory factor analysis was performed. As depicted in Figure 1, the CFA yielded good and acceptable good fit indices: $\chi^2 = 493.554$, $df = 164$, $CFI = .926$, $TLI = .914$, $RMSEA = .079$, suggesting for further analysis.

**The Structural Model**

Following the successful fitting of measurement model, a full structural equation modeling (containing both measurement model and structural model) was then conducted using Amos 22. As mentioned earlier, the present study sought to examine the following relationships to understand students’ motivation and intention to start their own business. The hypothesized relationships among latent variables are as follow: entrepreneurship education (EE) $\rightarrow$ intrinsic and extrinsic motivation (IM & EM) and entrepreneurial intention (EI); intrinsic and extrinsic motivation $\rightarrow$ entrepreneurial intention. As depicted in Figure 2, these structural relationships had been tested and the results show that the full hypothesized structural model had achieved a good fit to the observed data: $\chi^2 = 535.201$, $df = 165$, $CFI = .919$, $TLI = .907$, $RMSEA = .083$. 

![Figure 2 Measurement Model](image_url)
Hypotheses Testing: Direct Effects
The results of the structural equation modeling indicate the current model is accepted for hypotheses testing. In this section, the hypothesized direct structural relationships are discussed. The significance of estimated paths were examined as it provided the basis to accept or reject a hypothesis. The following hypotheses of direct relationships were proposed for the present study. All were supported.

The result of H1a, H1b and H1c were significant: EE into IM, EM and EI (Standardized Coefficient = .72, z = 10.26, p = 0.000), (Standardized Coefficient = .51, z = 8.18, p = 0.000) and (Standardized Coefficient = .35, z = 4.57, p = 0.00) respectively. Also, the result of H2a, H3a were significant as well: IM and EM into EI (Standardized Coefficient = .34, z = 6.46, p = 0.000) and (Standardized Coefficient = .27, z = 3.92, p = 0.000).

Hypotheses Testing: Indirect Effects
To test for mediation, the bootstrap procedure, suggested by Shrout and Bolger (2002), was used to conduct mediational analysis. Given that an AMOS procedure only estimates bootstrap confidence intervals for total mediation effects only, Mplus was additionally used to examine the specific mediation effects.

It has been hypothesized that entrepreneurship education has indirect effects through intrinsic motivation (H2b) and extrinsic motivation (H3b) on female students’ entrepreneurial intention. As shown in Table 2, the total effect, which is the sum of all direct and indirect effects was significant (Standardized Coefficient = 0.716, z = 17.721, p = 0.000, [Bootstrap 95% CI= 0.637, 0.918]). Based on this results, it can be concluded that IM and EM partially mediate EE and EI relationship. That is, the effect of EE on EI is transmitted directly and indirectly.

Table 2: Standardized Total Indirect, Specific Indirect, Direct Effects of Entrepreneurship Education to Intention via Intrinsic and Extrinsic Motivation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effects</th>
<th>Estimate (Est)</th>
<th>Standard Error (SE)</th>
<th>Est/SE (Z score)</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
<th>Lower</th>
<th>Upper</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Figure 3 Full Structural Model
**Entrepreneurship Education to Entrepreneurial Intention**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total Indirect</th>
<th>EE → IM → EI</th>
<th>EE → EM → EI</th>
<th>Direct: EE → EI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.360</td>
<td>0.063</td>
<td>5.726</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.172</td>
<td>0.066</td>
<td>2.602</td>
<td>0.009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.483</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION**

The present study contributes to body of knowledge regarding entrepreneurial intention. Its originality lies in the attempt to examine the relevancy of self-determination theory to entrepreneurial intention. The main objective of the current study was to examine how entrepreneurship education is related to the shaping female students’ motivations and intentions to start their businesses. Specifically, the study tested the direct effect of EE on entrepreneurial intention and the its indirect effects through intrinsic and extrinsic motivation.

The results from the structural equation modeling show that entrepreneurship education is an influential factor in shaping female students’ inclination to be entrepreneurs. This is in line with earlier evidence that EE make students have more confidence about their skills and abilities and also make them aware of the positive outcome entrepreneurship may entails (e.g., Wu & Wu, 2008; Yun, 2010). Results also stress on the role of motivation in enhancing their motivations. In fact, EE explained around 72% and 52% of variance on the intrinsic and extrinsic motivation respectively.

Further, the results show that intrinsic and extrinsic motivation have a moderate direct effect on entrepreneurial intention and they play a partial mediation between EE & EI. That is, although

Overall, the model has explained 63% of variance in the entrepreneurial intention. This highlights the importance of entrepreneurship education as well as both intrinsic motivation and extrinsic motivation in forming female students’ intention to start a business.

In conclusion, with respect research on women entrepreneurship, the current study contributes to our understanding of women motivation to be entrepreneurs and how education can enhance such propensity. It is the role of governments and particularly universities to improve the entrepreneurial ecosystem so that such potential that the women have is not wasted. Women are a very powerful social force that can be effectively involved in shaping our societies.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**


Venturing, 28(2), 211–224.
The Proposed Model of the Measurement of Gender Differences and Family Background toward Entrepreneurial Orientation and Intention of University Students in Thailand

Jarupat Wongsangiam
Entrepreneurship Program, Stamford International University

Pakpoom Prechapanich
Asst. Prof. Dr. Suchart Tripopsakul,
School of Entrepreneurship and Management, Bangkok University

Abstract

Youth and next generation. Most of startup companies establish by young generation. Based on GEM data in 2013, showed that Thailand is a world leader in terms of its rate of established business owners – both male and female. Thailand has shown consistently high levels of female entrepreneurship over time. As a positive trend over the last three years, start-ups and young business owners are increasingly starting their businesses with a higher level of education, with more and more having attained a bachelor degree. Previous studies by scholars confirmed that entrepreneurial intention is one of the antecedents of behaviors (Shapero, 1982; Robinson, Stimpson, Huefner, & Hunt, 1991; Krueger, Reilly, & Carsrud, 2000)

The purposes of this study are (1) to formulate the unique model to measure the entrepreneurial orientation (EO) and intention (EI) effected by gender differences and family background among undergraduate students in Thailand. (2) to investigate the impacts of attitudes, aptitude, and demographic factors, which have an impact on entrepreneurial orientation and intention of young adults in Thailand. Based on the survey sample includes 200 undergraduate students in Bangkok. The questionnaires will be delivered to universities. Previous studies investigate on “gender differences and entrepreneurial intention” or “family business and entrepreneurial intention”, however, our study will be investigated “gender differences, family business and entrepreneurial intention”

This paper will extensively literate relevant theories on entrepreneurial intention, impact of gender difference on entrepreneurial intentions and family business background. The purpose of the research methodology is to find out the situation of entrepreneurial phenomenon in Thailand context.

Key words: Entrepreneurial Orientation and Intention, Undergraduate Students, Gender and Family background
Introduction

According to GEM Policy Brief 2017 report, during the last 30 years, Thailand’s economy has changed dramatically: from exporting primarily raw commodities such as rice and rubber to becoming one of the world’s largest exporters of hard disk drives, integrated circuit packages, cars, and auto parts. Electrical, electronic and automotive products now comprise about 40% of Thailand’s exports. The start-up ecosystem in Thailand has grown rapidly in the past four years – almost a hundred times in terms of total funds raised. Thailand has one of the highest levels of entrepreneurship in the world, as measured by the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor Total Entrepreneurial Activity indicator (GEM TEA), which measures the proportion of adults (18 to 65 years in Thai figures) engaged in starting up a business in the previous 42 months OECD (2011). Recently, the Royal Thai government has been involved in the promotion of start-up in Thailand. It has assigned considerable priority to the development of the start-up, with the expectation that it can make a positive contribution to economic growth in the next few years and possibly in the future. The Thai government has also been actively engaged in the formulation of policy measures and related support mechanisms in an attempt to boost start-up development.

With above mentioned, this study will be investigated the impacts of attitudes, aptitude, and demographic factors, and also gender differences and family background which have an impact on entrepreneurial orientation and intention of university students. The model of the measurement will be proposed and intend to find out the factors on entrepreneurial orientation and intention of university students in Thailand. Thus, we believe that cultural influence, gender differences and family business backgrounds may contribute to the findings of this research. Results from this research may also have very important development of entrepreneurship education in Thailand in the future. The organization of this paper is as follows: after this introduction, the section two presents the conceptual framework and hypothesis development. Section three presents research methodology. The last section gives the conclusion and future plan for this study.

Literature Review

Entrepreneurial Orientation

The definition of entrepreneurial orientation (EO) is originated by Lumpkin and Dess (1996). In accordance to Lumpkin and Dess (1996), EO refers to the processes, practices, and decision-making actions that lead to new entry as characterized by one, or more of the following dimensions: an inclination to act freely, a readiness to innovate and take-risks, and a propensity to be insistent toward competitors and proactive relative to business opportunities. EO consists of 5 dimensions; namely, Risk taking, Proactiveness, Innovativeness, Autonomy, and Competitive aggressiveness. Rauch, Wiklund, Lumpkin and Frese (2009) describes risk taking as an involvement of taking bold actions by venturing into the unknown, borrowing heavily, and/or committing significant resources to ventures in uncertain environments. Proactiveness is an opportunity-seeking, forward-looking perspective characterized by the introduction of new products and services ahead of the competition and acting in anticipation of future demand. Innovativeness is the predisposition to engage in creativity and experimentation through the introduction of new products/services as well as technological leadership via research and development in new processes. Autonomy is the independent action undertaken by entrepreneurial leaders or teams directed at bringing about a new venture and seeing it to fruition. And, Competitive aggressiveness is the intensity of a firm’s effort to outperform rivals and is characterized by a strong offensive posture or aggressive responses to competitive threats (Rauch, et al, 2009).

Entrepreneurial Intention

The previous researches concerning with entrepreneurial intention have focused on the internal and external factors influencing people to become entrepreneurs. There have been the previous studies representing the evidences of reasons people choosing to become business owners than employees such as desires of freedom, self-controlling, and potential affluent (Fernandez et al., 2009). Intention is the precedent variable of behaviour (Chuttur, 2009). In entrepreneurship field, Entrepreneurial Intention defined as the search for information that can be used to help fulfill the goal of venture creation (Krueger et al., 2000). Guerrero et. al. (2008) defined entrepreneurial intention as a
state of mind that people wish to create a new firm or a new value driver inside existing organizations. Starting a new business is a process with a planning rather than impulsive decision making. Krueger et al. (2000) also stated that a person who have a potential to start a new business, or sees a good business opportunity may choose not to start his business if he lack of an entrepreneurial intention. Entrepreneurial intention is influenced by three perception factors; namely, personal attraction to entrepreneurial activity, Perceived subjective norms, and Perceived behavioural control or self-efficacy (Krueger et al., 2000).

The relationship between entrepreneurship and risk perception has received some attention from researchers who have considered the relationship between entrepreneurial decisions and risk aversion. Risk perception or fear of failure is an important variable to have a negative influence to start a new business. A reduced perception of the likelihood of failure should increase the probability that an individual will start a new business ( Arenius & Minniti, 2005). According to Wagner (2007), there is a direct relationship between risk perception and entrepreneurial intention. Fear of failure is recognized as one of the barriers to pursue entrepreneurship (Shinnar, Giacomin, & Janssen: 2012). Arenius & Minniti (2005) stated that reducing fear of failure's perception should increase the probability that an individual will start a new business.

**Conceptual Framework and Hypothesis development**

The purpose of this study is to study the impact of gender differences and family background toward entrepreneurial orientations (EO) and Intention (EI). Based on the literature review of previous studies (Bolton, 2012; Lumpkin & Dess, 1996; Covin & Slevin, 1991), the proposed conceptual framework is as the figure xx.

**Figure xx: the proposed conceptual framework of this study**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Entrepreneurial Orientations</th>
<th>Gender Differences and Family Background</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovativeness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk Taking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proactiveness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The hypothesizes are

**H1:** The overall entrepreneurial orientations (EO) significantly positive effects on entrepreneurial intention (EI) of university students in Thailand.

**H1a:** Autonomy dimensions significantly positive effects on entrepreneurial intention (EI).

**H1b:** Innovativeness dimensions significantly positive effects on EI.

**H1c:** Risk taking dimensions significantly positive effects on EI.

**H1d:** Proactiveness dimensions significantly positive effects on EI.

**H1e:** Competitive Aggressiveness dimensions significantly positive effects on EI.

**H2:** Male students have higher level of entrepreneurial orientations (EO) than female.

**H3:** Male students have higher level of entrepreneurial intention (EI) than female.

**H4:** Students with family business background have higher level of EO than counterpart.
H5: Students with family business background have higher level of EI than counterpart.

**Research Methodology**

**Samples**
This study used a survey research method. The population of our study is undergraduate students in Thai universities. The sample will be 4 years-students from Bangkok University International (BUI) and Bangkok University School of Entrepreneurship and Management (BUSEM). They will be contacted and collected the questionnaires. Expected to complete the empirical data collection in July 2017.

**Questionnaire development**
This research adapted the previous study of Bolton (2012) and Lumpkin & Dess (1996) to measure entrepreneurial orientations (EO). 5 dimensions of entrepreneurial orientations (EO): namely, autonomy, innovativeness, risk taking, proactiveness, and competitive aggressiveness, will be measured by 15 items. And, entrepreneurial intention (EI) will be examined by 6 items of Linan & Chen (2009) study. The summary of constructs is as the figure 1.
Figure 1: the summary of constructs and items of this study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Item</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Risk taking</td>
<td>Bolton (2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I like to take bold action by venturing into the unknown.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I am willing to invest a lot of time and/or money on something that</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>might yield a high return.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I tend to act 'boldly' in situations where risk is involved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovativeness</td>
<td>Bolton (2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I often like to try new and unusual activities that are not typical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>but not necessarily risky.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I tend to do things the same and not try different, unproven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>approaches.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I prefer to try my own unique way when learning new things rather</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>than doing it like everyone else does.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I favor experimentation and original approaches to problem solving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>rather than using methods others generally use for solving problems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proactiveness</td>
<td>Bolton (2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I usually act in anticipation of future problems, needs or changes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I tend to plan ahead on projects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I prefer to 'step up' and get things going on projects rather than</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>sit and wait for someone else to do it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy</td>
<td>Lumpkin and Dess (1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>My employees have enough autonomy in their job to do their work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>without continual supervision.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>My business allows me and my employees to be creative and try</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>different methods to do our job.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employees in our business are allowed to make decisions without</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>going through elaborate justification and approval procedures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive</td>
<td>Lumpkin and Dess (1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aggressiveness</td>
<td>In dealing with competitors our business typically adopts a very</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>competitive &quot;undo-the-competitor&quot; posture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Our business is very aggressive and intensely competitive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Our business effectively assumes an aggressive posture to combat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>trends that may threaten our survival or competitive position.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurial intentions</td>
<td>Linan &amp; Chen (2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I am ready to do anything to be an entrepreneur.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>My professional goal is to become an entrepreneur.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I will make every effort to start and run my own firm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I am determined to create a firm in the future.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I have very seriously thought of starting a firm.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

Considerable research has established the significance conceptual framework and hypothesizes of the impact of gender differences and family background toward entrepreneurial orientation (EO) and intention (EI) based on 200 samples of students from Bangkok University International (BUI) and Bangkok University School of Entrepreneurship and Management (BUSEM). This study will show the importance of differences in sex, age, educational background, family business background, perceived desirability, personal attitude and subjective norm considered as the moderating effects that have an impact on orientations and intentions to start a new business. The results of this study will help to explain the factors that influence entrepreneurial orientation and intention of university students. The next step of this study is to create the questionnaires in order to collect information and analyze data.

Further research should examine other specific aspects and also find the exact effect on each other in more depth to gain a greater results and understanding of how all the variables and factors are significantly related to each other. Such research would provide insight into how further develop Entrepreneurship education in Thailand.

REFERENCE


GEM Policy Brief 2017 (http://gemconsortium.org/report)


World Bank, 2011; Thailand Economic Monitor April 2011; Section 3: Shared and Sustainable Growth (http://siteresources.worldbank.org/THAILANDEXTN/Resources/333295-1301999542341/TEM_April_2011_Section3.pdf)
Gender Difference in Entrepreneurial Intent

Asst. Prof. Dr. Paul Louangrath
Bangkok University International College
119 Rama 4 Rd., Klong-Toei, Bangkok 10110
Email: inpong.l@bu.ac.th & Lecturepedia@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This paper presents entrepreneurial intent measurement among university students. One research question is presented: “whether there is gender difference in entrepreneurial intent?” The answer to this question would provide practical utility for entrepreneurship education or project funding decision for entrepreneurial projects. We surveyed university students of mixed majors and nationalities. Students came from entrepreneurship and marketing faculties; they were comprised of Thai and non-Thai nationals. The instrument used was written survey. We collected 201 surveys from two sampling periods. The first sample consists of 91 surveys and the second survey is comprised of 110 surveys. Six months were allowed to elapse between the two data collection in order to affect Poisson testing. The dependent variable was entrepreneurial intent (Y). Three independent variables are used: personality traits (x1), social environment (x2), and desire to own business (x3). A proxy variables were employed to verify planned behavior, namely eBusiness (x4) as a stimulus. We found gender difference between male and female subjects in their entrepreneurial intent formation. Male subjects require social environment, desire to own business and business stimulus to form entrepreneurial intent (F = 25.43). In contrast, female subjects require only two parameters for intent formation, namely personality traits (F = 7.79) and desire to own business or personality traits and business stimulus (F = 15.15). This paper is a contribution to the field because we found empirical evidence to prove that females are more risk affine than males.

Keywords: ANOVA, entrepreneurial intent, gender difference, interaction effect

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The issue of whether entrepreneurship could be taught no longer occupies current research focus. The research question presented in this paper is whether there is a significant gender difference in entrepreneurial intent? We identify the followings as stakeholders to whom this research question is relevant: academics, lending institutions, and investors. If significant gender difference in entrepreneurial intent exists, academics and educational institution are faced with the challenge of balancing uniform educational content with nurturing a new generation of entrepreneurs along gender line.

An intentional disregard of gender difference may hinder the development of one gender at the expense of the other. Secondly, for lending institutions, gender difference in entrepreneurial intent may translate into differences in risk perception. This information is relevant to risk assessment and lending decisions. Lastly, the answer to the research question presented in this paper is relevant to decision making by investors. If intent correlates with actions, arguably gender difference in intent formation may leads to different course of actions in a given investment project. Therefore, differences in perceived risk may be gender relevant. This information would be helpful in investment decision.

We treat male and female students on equal footing. Students are tagged by their demographic data: sex, nationality and major. The rationale for these demographic tagging is to verify whether there is a significant gender difference in entrepreneurial intent formation. The use of nationality as a demographic indicator is supported by the needs to verify whether cultural factor plays a role in
determining entrepreneurial intent. Lastly, the use of students from marketing entrepreneurship faculties allows us to seek empirical evidence to support the efficacy of entrepreneurship education.

2.0 LITERATURE REVIEW

Gender difference in entrepreneurship research remains significant interests in the field. Gender equality in the business world remains a contested frontline. Although there had been a rise in women entrepreneurs in recent years (Weiler and Bernarsk, 2001), the gain remains unequal in comparison to their male counterpart. One study involving 43 countries showed that there was a rise in women entrepreneurs; however, this increase remains lower than men (Allen et al., 2007). Interests in gender difference in entrepreneurship research remain an active issue (Boyd, 2005; Bruni et al., 2004; Brush et al., 2006; Learner and Pines, 2010; and Pines and Schwartz, 2008).

Some literature explained gender difference in entrepreneurship by circumstances that “pushed” or “pulled” people into entrepreneurship. Thus, these publications divided entrepreneurship into two types: entrepreneurship by necessity (Allen et al., 2007) and entrepreneurship by opportunity (Orham and Scott, 2001). This dichotomous approach to entrepreneurship may be incomplete by focusing only on the environment or social factors. In this paper, we explore gender differences in entrepreneurial intent by looking at both innate and environmental factors.

Entrepreneurial intent is important because it converts ideas into action (Jenkins and Johnson, 1997; and Korunka et al., 2003). Thus, in entrepreneurship research, entrepreneurial intent becomes a focal point for dependent variable (Lüthje and Frank, 2003).

Current literature asserts that there are several factors influencing entrepreneurial intent (Boyd and Vozikis, 1994). These factors include personality traits (X1), social environment conducive to entrepreneurship (X2), desire for business ownership (X3) and eBusiness proxy (X4) (Zhao and Seivert, 2006). Some research findings also confirmed that cultural influence also plays a role in entrepreneurial intent (Mitchell et al., 2000; and Mueller and Thomas, 2001). The role of gender in entrepreneurial intent formation is a continuing research issue in the field (Wagner, 2007, and Wilson et al., 2007).

3.0 METHODOLOGY

This paper employed quantitative method to present a model under multiple regression. The dependent variable is entrepreneurial intent. Independent variable include personality traits (X1) (Krueger et al., 200), social environment conducive to entrepreneurship (X2) (Caesar, 2007), desire for business ownership (X3) (Carter et al., 2003; Sagie & Elizur, 1999; and (Wagner, 2007) and eBusiness proxy (X4) (Rotefoss and Kolvereid, 2005). The proposed model for non-interactive case is presented as:

\[ Y = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_1 + \ldots + \beta_k X_k + \varepsilon \]  

(1)

The hypothesis test for (1) is accomplished by:

\[ F = \frac{MSR}{MSE} \]  

(2)

where \( MSR = \frac{SSR}{p} \) with \( SSR = \sum \left( Y_i - \bar{Y} \right)^2 \); and \( MSE = \frac{SSE}{n - p - 1} \) with \( SSE = \sum \left( \hat{Y}_i - \bar{Y} \right)^2 \).

If there was interaction effect among the variable, the proposed model is:
\[ Y = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_1 + \beta_2 X_2 + \beta_3 X_1 X_2 + \ldots + \beta_k X_k + \varepsilon \quad (3) \]

where \( \beta_3 X_1 X_2 \) is the interaction term. The hypothesis test for (3) is accomplished by:

\[
T_{x1x2} = \frac{\beta_1 - \beta_2}{\sqrt{\frac{m_1 SE_1^2 + n_2 SE_2^2}{n_1 + n_2 - 2}}} \quad (4)
\]

where \( SE = \text{standard error} \) which is given by: \( \frac{\sigma}{\sqrt{n}} \).

### 3.1 DATA

One set of written questionnaire was used in collecting two sets of data with six months gap between the two surveys. The rationale for using two surveys from two periods was to test the Poisson effect: whether there was any significant difference in response with the lapse of time. We collected 91 surveys for the first set and 110 for the second set of data. The amount of survey collected was verified by minimum sample size requirement. In total, 201 surveys were collected for this research.

**Fig. 1:** Demographic Information of Survey 1

In the first survey: \( n = 91 \), there were more students from the Marketing Faculty than from Entrepreneurship Faculty. In the second survey: \( n = 110 \), there was a difference between the faculty mixing was about 6%. The difference in both periods was due to student enrollment, not discretionary design. In both periods, sex and nationality distribution were approximately the same.

**Fig. 2:** Demographic Information of Survey 2
3.2 INSTRUMENT CALIBRATION

The instrument used in this research consists of written questionnaire seeking quantitative data. Quantitative data was obtained through a scale in a form of (0,1,2,3) where 0 = none, 1 = low, 2 = medium and 3 = high. The reliability of this scale was calibrated through:

\[ \hat{R} = \frac{R + \hat{Z}}{2} \]  

(5)

The terms of (5) are defined as:

\[ R = \sqrt{1 - df(\alpha)} \]  

(6)

\[ \hat{Z} = Z_{obs} + Z* \left( \frac{1}{\sqrt{n - 3}} \right) \]  

(7)

\[ Z_{obs} = 0.50 \ln \left( \frac{1 + R}{1 - R} \right) \]  

(8)

Under this instrument calibration method, the scale (0,1,2,3) has a reliability score of 0.955 or 95.50% compared to the Likert scale (1,2,3,4,5) (Likert, 1932) which has a reliability score of 0.887 or 88.70%.

3.3 MINIMUM SAMPLE SIZE DETERMINATION

In this paper, we introduced a new minimum sample size calculation based on the Monte Carlo simulation (Metropolis & Ulam, 1949). The rationale for this novel approach is supported by the Central Limit Theorem (CLT) manifesting through repeated measurements as indicated by the iteration count. The new minimum sample size is given by:

\[ \langle n \rangle = N \alpha^2 \]  

(9)

where \( n \) = minimum sample size, \( N \) = Monte Carlo iteration counts and \( \alpha \) = level of precision. The Monte Carlo iteration is determined by:
where $\sigma = [(x - \mu) / z]\sqrt{n}$ taken from the components of Monte Carlo three elements: $x_1 = \max, x_2 = \min$ and $x_3 = (\max + \min) / 2$; and mid-point of the distribution curve $E = [(\max - \min) / 2] + 50$.

In the present case, 30 items from each variable were used to determine the minimum sample size. These variables include: entrepreneurial intent ($Y$), and three independent variables $X_1$ (personality traits), $X_2$ (social environment), $X_3$ (desire for business ownership), and $X_4$ (eBusiness proxy). The resulted minimum sample requirement was 56.25 or 56 using 99% confidence interval. In this research, we collected 91 surveys in the first group and 110 surveys in the second group. The sample used for this paper meets the minimum sample size requirement.

3.4 DATA TESTING
Preliminary data tests were made in order to verify randomness and data distribution. Both continuous and discrete data were tested for randomness. Distribution test was accomplished by verifying skewness and kurtosis.

The randomness test for continuous data was accomplished by the Adjacent Test (Kanji, 2016):

\[
L = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n-1} (X_{i+1} - X_i)^2}{\sum_{i=1}^{n} (X_i - X)^2}
\]  

For discrete data, the Runs Test (Wald & Wolfowitz, 1940) was used to verify randomness:

\[
R = \frac{R - \bar{R}}{S_R}
\]  

where $R = \text{runs count}; \bar{R} = (2n_1n_2) / (n_1 + n_2)$, and $S_R = \sqrt{\frac{2n_1n_2(2n_1n_2 - n_1 - n_2)}{(n_1 + n_2)^2(n_1 + n_2 - 1)}}$.

Table 1: Randomness Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>$L_{obs}(t_0)$ $n = 91$</th>
<th>$L_{obs}(t_1)$ $n = 110$</th>
<th>Conclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$Y$</td>
<td>1.57</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>Random</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$X1$</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>1.78</td>
<td>Random</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$X2$</td>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>Random</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Quantitative data for all variables showed that the data were randomly distributed. The decision rule states that the data is random if $1.37 < L < 2.63$. In the present case, all data points fall within the range in both periods.

Distribution testing was accomplished by looking at skewness (Groenwald & Madsen, 1984) and kurtosis (Westfall, 2014). Skewness test was determined by:

$$g_1 = \frac{n}{(n-1)(n-2)} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \left( \frac{X_i - \overline{X}}{S} \right)^3$$  \hspace{1cm} (13)

Kurtosis is given by:

$$g_2 = \left[ \frac{n(n-1)}{(n-1)(n-2)(n-3)} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \left( \frac{X_i - \overline{X}}{S} \right)^4 \right] - \left( \frac{3(n-2)^2}{(n-1)(n-3)} \right)$$  \hspace{1cm} (14)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable Tested</th>
<th>First survey; $n = 91$</th>
<th>Second survey; $n = 110$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Skewness</td>
<td>Kurtosis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>-0.51</td>
<td>-0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X1</td>
<td>-0.39</td>
<td>-0.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X2</td>
<td>-0.41</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X3</td>
<td>-0.41</td>
<td>-0.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X4</td>
<td>-0.43</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The decision rule for evaluating skewness is: highly skewed if $-1 < \text{skew} < 1$; moderately skewed if $-1 < \text{skew} < -0.5$ or $0.5 < \text{skew} < 1$, and approximately symmetrical if $-0.5 < \text{skew} < 0.5$. The first survey shows approximate symmetry and the second data has one instance of moderate skewed (Y: 0.78); otherwise, the data from all variables in both periods are approximately symmetrical.

The decision rule for evaluating kurtosis is $\pm 3.00$; the data is considered non-normally distributed, if the kurtosis exceeds $3.00$; and approximately symmetrical if $\pm 3.00$. In the present case, the data distributions are within the acceptable bound for both $t_0$ and $t_1$ periods.

There is no significant change in the data skewness and kurtosis with the lapse of time of six months. The $T$-values for the difference between $t_0$ and $t_1$ are $T_d = -1.47$ for skewness and $T_d = -0.62$ for kurtosis compared to the theoretical value of $T_d = \pm 1.64$ for 95% confidence interval.

### 4.0 FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

This paper attempts to answer one research question: “whether there is gender difference in entrepreneurial intent?” We answer this question in three parts in two time periods: (i) combined genders, (ii) male subjects, and (iii) female subjects.

#### 4.1 General Findings without Gender Segmentation
### 4.1.1 First Survey

In the first survey where a sample of 91 students were used, the combined genders model for male and female was \( Y = -0.91 + 0.51X_2 + 0.66X_4 \). When separated by gender, male subjects showed entrepreneurial intent as \( Y_m = -0.05 + 0.99X_4 \) and female \( Y_f = -0.25 + 0.58X_2 + 0.54X_3 + 0.54X_4 \). There was a marked difference in the number and type of explanatory factors for entrepreneurial intent among male and female subjects. The dependent variable \( X_4 \) (business infrastructure) as a stimulus was present in both male and female; therefore, this factor did not contribute to the difference between male and female. For male subjects, the formation of entrepreneurial intent had a natural basis of -0.05 which is almost nil yet with a stimulus, the stimulus contributes by a factor of 0.99. If intent foretells behavior and the behavior from entrepreneurial intent entails risk taking, male subjects are more risk affine than female because \( Y_f \) requires more parameters in order for entrepreneurial intent to form. For female subjects, social environment conducive to entrepreneurial activity \( (X_2) \) and the desire to own business \( (X_3) \) are required to stimulate entrepreneurial intent. These facts couple with an intrinsic entrepreneurial intent level of -0.25 showed that female subjects are risk averse. This finding was later refuted by the second survey with larger sample size.

It should be pointed out that the dichotomy between risk averse and risk affine is not an adequate basis to predict future success or failure of an entrepreneur. These perceptions may change over time as the entrepreneurs are exposed to business transactions. These two risk perception could only indicate the current risk perception of the individual. Therefore, this risk perception dichotomy should not lead to gender discrimination.

### 4.1.2 Second Survey

The general finding for the proposed model without gender segmentation is: 
\( Y = -0.18 + 0.27X_1 + 0.28X_2 + 0.20X_3 + 0.35X_4 \). The test for model efficacy was accomplished by ANOVA F-test which showed \( F = 21.25 \) compared to the theoretical value of \( F = 1.35 \).

Social environment \( (X_2) \) are independent from all factors and could not be combined with the other three factors. When \( X_2 \) was combined with the other three factors, the proposed model failed. However, when \( X_2 \) was regressed with \( Y \) separately, \( X_2 \) was statistically significant. This finding provides an interesting interpretation.

Social environment conducive to entrepreneurship \( (X_2) \) is an independent factor that does not correlate with other factors: personality traits \( (X_1) \), desire to own business \( (X_3) \) and eBusiness stimulus \( (X_4) \). The implication here is that in entrepreneurial intent analysis, we must treat personal and environmental factors independently. These two types of explanatory factors should not be combined.

### 4.1.3 Combined Survey

In the combined model, where all subjects are analyzed without gender separation, there is a difference between the first and second survey. In the first survey, two explanatory variables were significant, namely environment \( (X_2) \) and business stimulus \( (X_4) \).

In a follow up study six months later, the same population had been re-sampled. While business stimulus \( (X_4) \) remains a significant factor, business environment \( (X_2) \) had been replaced with personality traits \( (X_1) \) and desire to own business \( (X_3) \). When the two sets of data from survey 1 and survey 2 are combined, all factors are shown to be significant, including personality traits. These proposed models are presented in Table 3.
### Table 3: General Model without Gender Segmentation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Model</th>
<th>F Test ANOVA</th>
<th>$R^2$ ANOVA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Survey 1 $n = 91$</td>
<td>$Y = -0.48 + 0.52X_2 + 0.71X_4$</td>
<td>37.29$^*$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey 2 $n = 110$</td>
<td>$Y = -0.11 + 0.50X_1 + 0.26X_3 + 0.33X_4$</td>
<td>21.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined survey $n = 201$</td>
<td>$Y = -0.18 + 0.27X_1 + 0.28X_2 + 0.20X_3 + 0.35X_4$</td>
<td>29.79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The model was evaluated on the basis of the coefficient of determination for ANOVA. The theoretical value is $F = 1.35$ for all cases in this study.

$$ R^2 = 1 - \frac{\text{SSE}}{\text{SST}} $$ (15)

where $\text{SSE} = \sum (Y_i - \hat{Y})^2$ and $\text{SST} = \text{SSE} + \text{SSR}$ given that $\text{SSR} = \sum (\hat{Y}_i - \bar{Y})^2$.

### 4.2 Gender Difference in Entrepreneurial Intent

In both time periods, one common factor in combined calculation is $X_3$ (desire to own business). This nascent entrepreneurship is an unchanged characteristic of the group. Among the male subjects, there is a noticeable change in the $y$-Intercept. In the first survey, male subjects showed negative intercept; this value became positive six months later. This change may be attributed to the acclimatizing in the study environment, especially those who enrolled in entrepreneurship education. This result may be used to prove that entrepreneurship may be taught.

### Table 4: Proposed Model for Entrepreneurial Intent among Male Subjects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Model for Male</th>
<th>F Test ANOVA</th>
<th>$R^2$ ANOVA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Survey 1 $n = 48$</td>
<td>$Y = -0.94 + 0.64X_2 + 0.78X_4$</td>
<td>29.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey 2 $n = 63$</td>
<td>$Y = 0.35 + 0.50X_1 + 0.38X_3$</td>
<td>7.94 $^*$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$Y = 0.25 + 0.59X_1 + 0.33X_4$</td>
<td>8.46</td>
<td>0.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined survey $n = 111$</td>
<td>$Y = 0.36 + 0.34X_2 + 0.25X_3 + 0.26X_4$</td>
<td>25.43 $^*$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When we examine the combined data from two periods, it is surprising to see the gender difference between male and female. The combined data for male produces the following model: $Y = 0.36 + 0.34X_2 + 0.25X_3 + 0.26X_4$. According to this proposed model, male subjects requires social environment ($X_2$), desire to own business ($X_3$) and business stimulus ($X_4$) to form entrepreneurial intent. For male subjects, there are three requisite parameters for entrepreneurial intent formation.
In contrast, female subjects require only two parameters for intent formation: 
\[ Y = -0.60 + 0.34X_1 + 0.94X_4 \] where \( X_1 \) is personality traits and \( X_4 \) is business stimulus. In the alternative, female entrepreneurial intent also could be produce by 
\[ Y = -0.03 + 0.35X_1 + 0.67X_3 \] where \( X_3 \) is desire to own business. In both scenarios, female subjects showed negative y-intercept; this entails risk averse. Compared to their male counterpart, this value is positive. Nevertheless, the minimal number of parameters required for entrepreneurial intent formation among female subjects signified that female subjects are "risk affine." This finding contradicts popular belief that females are risk averse.

Further perceptual difference between male and female subjects is found in the role of personality traits. In the combined surveys, males do not require personality trait as an explanatory factor for entrepreneurial intent. However, personality trait is requisite for females.

### Table 5: Proposed Model for Entrepreneurial Intent among Female Subjects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Model for Female</th>
<th>F Test ANOVA</th>
<th>R-Squared ANOVA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Survey 1</td>
<td>( Y = 0.20 + 0.45X_3 + 0.44X_4 )</td>
<td>8.13</td>
<td>0.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( n = 43 )</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey 2</td>
<td>( Y = -0.38 + 0.44X_1 + 0.40X_2 + 0.38X_3 )</td>
<td>10.65</td>
<td>0.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( n = 47 )</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined survey</td>
<td>( Y = -0.60 + 0.34X_1 + 0.94X_4 )</td>
<td>7.97</td>
<td>0.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( n = 43 )</td>
<td>( Y = -0.03 + 0.35X_1 + 0.67X_3 )</td>
<td>15.15</td>
<td>0.42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 5.0 CONCLUSION

This scope of this research is limited to verifying gender differences among male and female subjects in entrepreneurial intent. The study is limited to university students sampled at one private university in Bangkok, Thailand in two time periods. The result of the research revealed interesting information. Firstly, personality is a significant factor among female but not for male subjects in this research. Secondly, there are gender differences between male and female in entrepreneurial intent formation. Male subjects require more parameters to stimulate entrepreneurial intent than female. This parametric requisite may be an indicator of risk perception. More parameters mean risk averse; less parameters means risk affine. We found that males are risk averse and females are risk affine. This finding breaks stereotypical assertion that males are aggressive and, therefore, are risk affine.

### REFERENCES


Women’s Entrepreneurship Development in Special Contexts
Women Prisoners and Their Social Integration-A Case Study of Model of Vocational Training and Entrepreneurship in India

Submitted by
Dr Asha Bhandari
Senior Assistant Professor
Coordinator (Head)
Faculty of Policy Science
Faculty In-Charge, Centre for Gender Studies
National Law University
Jodhpur,342001
(Rajasthan)India
Phone- +919829090543
Email- ashabhandari7@yahoo.co.in

Mr Jitesh Bhandari
CEO, AV Pharma
AV Tower
Opposite, ESI Hospital
Jodhpur, 342009
Rajasthan, India
Phone- +919829027531
Email-jitesh.avgroup@yahoo.co.in

Abstract (Principal topic, methods, results and implications)
Women Prisoners and Their Social Integration - A Case Study of Model of Vocational Training and Entrepreneurship in India

Prisons are an integral part of the Criminal Justice System and function as custodians of prisoners. While the purpose and justification of imprisonment is to protect the society against crime, retribution and punitive methods of treatment of prisoners alone are neither relevant nor desirable to achieve the goal of reformation and rehabilitation of prison inmates. The concept of Correction, Reformation and Rehabilitation has come to the foreground and the prison administrations are now expected to also function as curative and correctional centers. Our thrust, therefore, is on Reformation, Correction and Rehabilitation of the prison inmates and churn out reformed and better citizens from the prisons, who can lead a dignified life after their release. Often crime is a creation of compelling circumstances, unsuitable environment and emotional disturbance resulting in impulsive reactions. Prisoners who return to the society have many things to take care of upon release. These include housing, employment and re-establishing contact with family members, if any. The situation is worse for women prisoners. Various social, political and cultural issues affect the adjustment of women after release or discharge from prison. Criminal recidivism, mental condition of women, the attitude of the family members and her social circle has significant bearing on her capacity to reintegrate into society upon release. Studies have shown that provision of some form of support is therefore, crucial to the successful transition from prison back into the community and a return to independent living. In this context education and Vocational training in different trades and thus creating the entrepreneur for future is one of the important reformative measures to rehabilitate the prisoner for their post prison life. This helps them to make the prison inmates economically self-reliant.

In this background this paper makes an effort to understand that by providing vocational training in the jails and transforming the prison inmates (women particular) into an entrepreneur will help them to successfully re-integrate into society. The paper is divided into two parts: Part I highlights that employment is one of the basic problems faced by prisoners (especially women) upon post release and vocational training inside the prison will make them self-sufficient on post release. There is also an effort to discuss the various efforts done by government and NGO in India to improve the situation of women prisoners. Part II evaluate the existing vocational training programme and employment opportunities in India for women prisoners and provide the suggestions to achieve the basic goal of model of social entrepreneurship for women prisoners inside the prison. Providing these opportunities while in prison helps women prisoners to learn the skills necessary to have a productive life once they are released.
“Prisoners and entrepreneurs score similarly on the need for self achievement, aspiration for personal innovation, desire to plan for the future and desire for independence.”

Introduction

The incarceration of sentenced person in prison not only lead to his stigmatization but also causes his social disorientation owing to his having remained practically cut-off from social intercourse with the rest of the society. Loss of job, if employed and loss of means of livelihood are also one of the prime ill consequences of the incarceration. Hence, the most important single factor which can facilitate his reintegration with the society and prevent his relapse into the crime after release is the economic rehabilitation. Education, work and vocational training in the prisons are fundamental to the wellbeing, economic rehabilitation and social reintegration of prisoners. There long has been debate about the role prison-based education programs and vocational training can play in preparing inmates to return to society and keeping them from returning to prison. Vocational training and work in prison are critical for the prisoners, especially for women prisoners who are likely to have suffered gender-based discrimination and violence prior to imprisonment. Women are less likely to have been employed than men and many women become involved in criminal activity due to economic pressure. Therefore, the prison authorities can contribute significantly to the social integration of women prisoners by providing and facilitating adequate and equal opportunities for vocational training in prisons that are aimed at finding gainful employment upon release (UNODC, 2008).

In this background this paper makes an effort to understand that by providing vocational training in the jails and transforming the prison inmates (women particular) into an entrepreneur will help them to successfully re-integrate into society. The paper is divided into two parts: Part I highlights that employment is one of the basic problems faced by prisoners (especially women) upon post release and vocational training inside the prison will make them self sufficient on post release. There is also an effort to discuss the various efforts done by government and NGO in India to improve the situation of women prisoners. Part II evaluate the existing vocational training programme and employment opportunities in India for women prisoners and provide the suggestions to achieve the basic goal of model of social entrepreneurship for women prisoners inside the prison. Providing these opportunities while in prison helps women prisoners to learn the skills necessary to have a productive life once they are released.

Part I-Status of Vocational Training and Entrepreneurship for Women Prisoners in India

4 http://mha1.nic.in/PrisonReforms/pdf/BestPrisonPractice08112010.pdf
Women Entrepreneurs may be defined as the women or a group of women who initiate, organize and operate a Business Enterprise. Government of India has defined Women Enterprises as an enterprise owned and controlled by a women having a minimum financial interest of 51 percent of the capital and giving at least 51 percent of employment generated in the enterprise to women. When we speak specifically about the term “Women Entrepreneurship “we mean, an act of business creation and ownership that not only empowers women economically but also increases their financial strength as well as position in society.”

Prisons are an integral part of the Criminal Justice System and function as custodians of prisoners. Prison administrations are now expected to also function as curative and correctional centers. The thrust, therefore, is on Reformation, Correction and Rehabilitation of the prison inmates and churn out reformed and better citizens from the prisons, who can lead a dignified life after their release.

In this backdrop there are certain key issues which need focus:

(i) Why do we need vocational training programme for women prisoners?
(ii) How vocational training does change the prisoners into entrepreneurs?
(iii) What kind of work and vocational training should be provided to them?
(iv) What is the status of Vocational training programme in Indian jails?

Why do we need vocational training programme for women prisoners?

Prisoners who return to the society have many things to take care of upon release. These include housing, employment and re-establishing contact with family members, if any. The situation is worse for women prisoners. In general most of the women prisoners are illiterate or less literate and having on or less skill education. Most of them come from poor families; they were also left by the husband or families on release. Various social, political and cultural issues affect the adjustment of women after release or discharge from prison. Criminal recidivism, mental condition of women, the attitude of the family members and her social circle has significant bearing on her capacity to reintegrate into society upon release. Studies have shown that provision of some form of support is therefore, crucial to the successful transition from prison back into the community and return to independent living. Right efforts from all areas are required in the transforming the women prisoners into entrepreneurs and their greater participation in the entrepreneurial activities. Research has indicated that having a legitimate job reduces the chances of re-offending following release, especially among those with higher wages and higher quality jobs. However, as explained above, finding employment, let alone stable employment

---

7 Prisons is a State subject under List-II of the Seventh Schedule to the Constitution of India. The management and administration of Prisons falls exclusively in the domain of the State Governments, and is governed by the Prisons Act, 1894 and the Prison Manuals of the respective State Governments. Thus, States have the primary role, responsibility and authority to change the current prison laws, rules and regulations, [http://rajprisons.nic.in/Training/Overview%20of%20prisons%20in%20India.pdf](http://rajprisons.nic.in/Training/Overview%20of%20prisons%20in%20India.pdf), retrieved on September 9, 2016.

8 Agniezka Martynowicz, Martin Quigley, “It’s like stepping on a landmine…Reintegration of Prisoners in Ireland”, Report by the Irish Penal Reform Trust, May, 2010

9 Ibid
can be a challenge for an ex-prisoner. In addition to lack of necessary skills, education, work-experience; the social stigma associated with imprisonment makes it very difficult for ex-prisoners to find jobs. Research has shown that several women experienced gender-specific vulnerability: some of them employed as housekeeper or domestic aid were sexually harassed while other women ex-prisoners were approached with offers for prostitution and surrogate motherhood\(^\text{10}\). These problems may be overcome by providing them vocational training and skill development in prison. The objectives of reformation, correction and rehabilitation of prison inmates and transforming the prison into curative centers will definitely help prisoners to be self sufficient when they return to the society.

What kind of work and vocational training should be provided to them?

Reentry and reintegration of criminal justice clients are the primary goals of all criminal justice rehabilitative efforts. There is a need for a fresh approach to employment through entrepreneurial trainings and opportunities for prison inmates. In recent years social entrepreneurship has received great attention by business and foundations that have harnessed youthful entrepreneurial energy to work on many seemingly intractable social problems (Keohane, 2013).\(^\text{11}\) Vocational training and education should be based on the model of **Difference but equality**. Circumstances, problems of the women differ from men some in frequency and more because they apply to women only. Women who hope for a job post release should be given an equal opportunity to learn that skill in prison which in turn may give them good prospect in the labor market. It is important that the training and work provided should correspond to market demands and aim to increase women’s real chances of earning a living wage after release. Currently vocational classes and other activities, and education and skills training needs comprise an element of each prisoner’s sentence plan, to monitor progress. It is a common assumption that majority of women in India are economically non-productive as they are not involved in activities that are financially remunerative. Even Regimes in prisons have traditionally reproduced stereotypical roles where women learned to “cook, sew and do other domestic tasks” (Smart 1976, p. 140). But this trend is gradually changing. It is perhaps for these reasons that Government Bodies, NGO’s, Social Scientists, Researchers, and International Agencies have started showing interest in the issues related to entrepreneurship among women prisoners in India.

Status of Vocational Training for women in Indian Prison

Para 10.28.7: Treatment of offenders through diversified work programmes and vocational training should be the focal point of prison activities.

---

\(^{10}\) “Women Integration and Prison: An analysis of the processes of sociolabour integration of women prisoners in Europe”, Final Report, European Commission, September 2005

\(^{11}\) To further understand the nature of these re-entry training programs, one can look at the specific example of the Prison Entrepreneurship Program (PEP) of Texas. These programs provide instruction, workshops and mentoring, with the objective of preparing inmates and ex-convicts for both employment and self-employment.
Para 18.9.25: Proper employment on work programmes and recreational facilities should be provided to prisoners at sub-jails.12

The basic approach of social entrepreneurship in prisons and treatment programs involves the development of local industries and businesses that are integrated in the treatment plan. Training of prisoners in various vocational skills in the Prison Institution has received a lot of importance in almost all the States/UTs. These training programmes provide opportunities for the prison inmates to engage themselves in fruitful pursuits during the term of their sentence in jails. Training for prison inmates not only affords value for one’s work but also makes the prisoners learn skills which would enable them to follow a vocation after their release from the jail. The gainful work done by the jail inmates not only provides a corrective approach to the psyche of the offender but also goes a long way in developing a responsive and respectful attitude in them towards the society. The prisoners not only develop the self confidence and self esteem out of the valuable labour put in by them but these activities also lead them towards earning a honorable livelihood after their release from the prison. The training facilities available in the jails depend on the local conditions, the availability of raw materials, local market needs, demands and marketing of finished products. The following section of paper shows the some of the effort put forward by the state government to provide the vocational training inside the prison.

Type of Vocational Training in States /Union Territories in India13

Para 11.33.4: Vocational training programmes in self-employing trades and occupations should be organized in every central and district prison14. The following table shows the type of vocational training available in the various prison of states/UT in India:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No</th>
<th>Type of Training</th>
<th>Name of State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>Gujarat, Haryana, Himachal Pradesh, Madhay Pradesh, Punjab, Sikkim, Tamilnadu and Tripura</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Canning</td>
<td>Assam, Haryana, Madhya Pradesh, Meghalaya, Sikkim, Tripura, A &amp; N Islands and Chandigarh.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Carpentry</td>
<td>Andhra Pradesh, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Gujrat, Haryana, Himachal Pradesh, Jammu &amp; Kashmir, Jharkhand, Karnataka, Kerala, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Meghalaya, Mizoram, Odisha, Punjab, Rajasthan, Sikkim, Tamil Nadu, West Bengal, Chandigarh and Delhi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Handloom</td>
<td>Jammu &amp; Kashmir, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh and Mizoram. 5 Soap &amp; Phenyl making Andhra Pradesh, Assam, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Karnataka, Kerala, Madhya Pradesh, Odisha, Punjab, Tamil Nadu, Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Tailoring</td>
<td>Andhra Pradesh, Assam, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Goa, Gujrat, Haryana, Himachal Pradesh, Jammu &amp; Kashmir, Jharkhand, Karnataka, Kerala, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Mizoram, Nagaland, Odisha, Punjab, Rajasthan, Sikkim, Tripura, Uttar Pradesh, West Bengal, A &amp; N Islands, Chandigarh, Delhi and Puducherry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Weaving</td>
<td>Andhra Pradesh, Assam, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Gujrat, Haryana, Tamilnadu and Tripura</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12 http://164.100.52.110/pdfs/Mulla%20Committee%20implementation%20of%20recommendations%20-Vol%20I.pdf, retrieved on September 8, 2016
14 http://164.100.52.110/pdfs/Mulla%20Committee%20implementation%20of%20recommendations%20-Vols%20I.pdf, retrieved on September 8, 2016
A total of 52,228 prisons inmates were provided with various vocational training during the year 2012.

The number of jail inmates involved in various training programmes in the States/UTs of Madhya Pradesh, Uttar Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Gujarat, Delhi, Punjab, Maharashtra, Andhra Pradesh, West Bengal and Bihar were 8,261, 8,140, 6,107, 5,737, 5,084, 2,846, 2,292, 1,868, 1,706 and 1,651 respectively during the year 2012.

The maximum prison inmates were trained in ‘weaving’ (12.0%) (6,249 out of 52,228) followed by ‘tailoring’ (8.1%) (4,245 out of 52,228), ‘carpentry’ (8.1%) (4,208 out of 52,228), ‘agriculture’ (5.9%) (3,095 out of 52,228) and ‘soap & phenyle’ (0.9%) (486 out of 52,228) (Table-8.1). States/UTs wise details reveal that the maximum number of inmates trained in agriculture was reported in Madhya Pradesh (1,766), carpentry in Gujarat (1,634), canning in Assam (129), tailoring in Delhi (986), weaving in Gujarat (1,772), soap & phenyle in Uttar Pradesh (164) and handloom in Madhya Pradesh (167).\(^{15}\)

The study of the problems faced by the prisoners after release and the reasons for committing crime has guided prison authorities in India to initiate steps, which can go a long way in rehabilitating the prisoners after their release. Many of these programs have been run in collaboration with private business houses. For instance, in Tihar Jail and many other jails, various trades are taught to convicts in the jail factory itself to enable them to secure employment after release. These include pen manufacturing, book binding, manure making, screen printing, envelope making, tailoring and cutting, shoe-making etc. which has not only resulted in learning of the trade but also provides monetary gains to the prisoners. It also has a bakery, where prisoners make bread, biscuits and muffins. For the post-release rehabilitation of the prisoners, the Social Welfare Department of Delhi Govt. provides loans for setting up self-employed units\(^{16}\). According to some sources, The authorities also try to teach them skills that help them find jobs after they're released. ‘Rehabilitation Grant’, of Rs 50,000 to the released prisoners who have spent a period of incarceration above 10 years is also given to prisoners in Delhi.

---


In state of **Rajasthan** Industrial training Institutes (ITI) have been opened at Central Jails Jaipur and Ajmer by Department of Technical Education. One year and two year diploma courses in Fitter & House Wiring, Carpentry, Cutting & Sewing, Fitter and Diesel Mechanic course are being run for inmates at these centers. Computer training centers have also been established with assistance of our NGO associates at the Central Jails for imparting computer education to the inmates. Vocational training in various trades is provided to convicted inmates in nine jails of the state. These trades are making durries, niwar, cloth dyeing, carpentry, iron-smithy, stitching, hosiery cloth manufacturing, etc. **Karnataka** is one of the progressive states where attempts have been made for reforming the Jail administration. A number of rehabilitation programmes and training in different vocations have been started and the trades in which training is being imparted include carpet weaving, candle making, embroidery, tailoring, cloth making, assembling of transformers, typing, phenyl making and training in electrician/carpentry/ black smith trades. Various industries were started in prisons in the state of **Tamilnadu**, long ago with a view to impart vocational training to the prisoners, in keeping with the Governments policy of reformation and rehabilitation of the prisoners. Textiles and weaving industry, Tailoring. Soap making, Phenyle making, Book binding and Hand made paper industry, Tag making, Sealing wax making, Boot making, Aluminium, The articles produced in the above industries are being supplied to the Government departments free of cost.In Manipur vocational training is provided to female prisoners. They are taught to make things like detergent powder, incense sticks, cane stools, toys, embroidery and knitting. HIV/AIDS prevention and assistance is handled by Manipur Aids Control Society (MACs) and Manipur Network for positive People. **The Amritsar Jail** in association with various Government and Non-Government Organisations launched a number of projects for empowerment of women prisoners. Under the scheme, the female inmates are being taught how to weave, make toys, stitch and make embroidery items. Female inmates are also taking keen interest in the education and health advocacy programmes.‘Certificate Course’ in Dress Designing has been started by the Department of Adult Continuing Education and Extension of Guru Nanak Dev University, Amritsar.An initiative aiming at the welfare of prison inmates, vocational training programmes have been conducted at **Mysore Central** Prison and prisons across the state too. With participation of the Ministry of Labour, fisherwomen at Pondicherry were given training for alternate income generation opportunities after the Tsunami.

Above all Grant of Rs.5,000/- per prisoner is sanctioned by Women and Child Welfare Department for rehabilitation of released convict prisoners. Mahatma Gandhi Community College have been established in all central prisons, special prison for women, and borstal school, wherein, 9 different types of diploma courses are being imparted to the prisoners to impart job skills, so that after release from prison they may have employment opportunity

---

18 Punjab Social Welfare Board,Guru Nanak Dev University, Amritsar,Krishi Vigyan Kendra, Amritsar,India Vision Foundation ,Red Cross Society ,UNODC ,visited on Jnaury,8,2017
Above are the few examples of the effort put forward by the jail authorities for the rehabilitation of prisoners in general and women prisoners in particular. Such initiatives by the jail authorities will not only change the lives of the inmates, but will also help them lead a normal life in the future.

**Training programme by NGO in Indian Jails** - Vocational training programs provided to these inmates so that they can earn a living once they are released. Many of these programs have been run in collaboration with private business houses. This partnership model has proved to be quite effective. Some of the examples of these initiatives taken by various NGO are:

- Under Srijan (Prisoner Rehabilitation Program) SSRDP conducts various vocational training programs in the jails across India to empower prisoners to become self-reliant after they leave the prisons. SSRDP has a permanent Sri Sri Kaushal Vikas Kendra in Tihar jail where trainings are provided for Electrical work, Hand Made Paper products and Candle Making. Tinsukia Jail and Ranchi Jail also run electrical training programs with the help of Schneider Electric India Foundation.
- CIPHET scientists teach women the technology to make powder out of ginger and garlic to generate self-employment opportunities for them once released from jail. CIPHET has initiated a one-and-a-half-year-long training programme for women inmates and a total of 18 programmes will be conducted over the period. The training programme has been especially designed, aiming to generate self-employment opportunities after these women are released from jail.
- India vision foundation through creative partnerships, provide vocational trainings and skills development programmes to male and female inmates, which help them secure employment as well as financial independence post-release.

**Value of goods produced by inmates(Prison bazars)** In order to channelize the manpower of the prisoners towards a positive direction and to provide an opportunity of reformation and rehabilitation to the prisoners confined in prisons prison bazaars were established in Central Prison Complexes. The training of jail inmates in the vocational trades resulted in production of articles which have the market value. The articles manufactured in the prisons, such as Bakery items, Paper cups, Greeting Cards, Leather Shoes, Wallets, Mineral Water, Nursery Products, Detergent Soap/Powder, Candles, Mosquito Net, Rain Coat, Ready Made Garments, Honey, Masala Powder, Handicrafts etc., are sold to the public at nominal rates.

---

20 Kaushal Vikas Kendras are currently running in Tihar Jail in New Delhi, Yeradawa Jail in Pune, Bir Singh Munda Jail in Ranchi and Tinsukia Jail in Assam
21 Inmates of the Ludhiana Women’s Central Jail tried their hands in garlic and ginger powder making technology on Thursday, during a training programme on food processing conducted by the Central Institute of Post Harvest Engineering and Technology (CIPHET) on the jail premises. More than 80 inmates took part.
22 The details of the gross value of such produce in different States and UTs are - Delhi had reported the highest gross value of sale proceeds of ₹2,885.0 lakhs earned by the jail inmates followed by Bihar (₹1,708.6 lakhs), Uttar Pradesh (₹1,456.1 lakhs), Kerala (₹1,255.3 lakhs), Tamil Nadu (₹1,156.0 lakhs), Maharashtra (₹1,143.1 lakhs), Gujarat (₹818.3 lakhs), Andhra Pradesh (₹577.0 lakhs), Jharkhand (₹...
Part-II Vocational Training in Prison- Challenges and Recommendations

Vocational training and work experience are also key for the social reintegration of women prisoners when they return back to society. Though the Indians jails are providing the vocational training for prisoners but still there are various obstacles to achieve the objectives of prison reforms.

- Given the prevalent gender division of labour within the prison system, while the skills taught to men are generally framed in terms of preparation for employment on release – training as a mechanic, gardener, or carpenter – those taught to women rarely are.
- The vast majority of prisoners are engaged in menial and low-skilled work within prisons, and occasionally by outside employers. There is little distinction between constructive work, that is a beneficial way to occupy prisoner’s time, and vocational training that prepares them for work outside.
- Women are ignorant of new technologies or unskilled in their use, and often unable to do research and gain the necessary training.
- Among jail inmates, there are undertrials and short-termers. Many among them are undergoing ‘simple imprisonment’, for whom participation in Vocational Training or work programme is not binding.
- Furthermore, most jail inmates come from rural / agricultural background; and for whom industry-oriented Vocational Training has unclear relevance. Often, in jail setting, prisoners work to learn rather than learn to work.
- There is a lack of enrollment of women prisoners in the vocational training program organized inside the prison.

Recommendation and suggestions

The importance of vocational training in correctional institution can hardly be over-emphasized. However, this needs to be translated into decisions and actions. The following measures are suggested to empower the women to seize various opportunities and face challenges in business.

- There is a need to make the vocational training and formal education as a compulsory component in the prison. Work and skills, however, should not be as ‘gendered’ as they currently are.
- Ensure the proper enrollment for the maximum use of the training provided. An Awareness programme should be conducted on a mass scale with the intention of creating awareness among women about the various areas to conduct business and to learn skillful occupation.

296.6 lakhs), Chhattisgarh (‘ 269.5 lakhs) and Punjab (‘ 266.3 lakhs). The value of goods produced per inmate was highest in Delhi (‘ 23,817.4) followed by Chandigarh (‘ 21,812.0), Kerala (‘ 18,069.7), Tamil Nadu (‘ 8,760.9) and Gujarat (‘ 7,063.4) during the year 2012.
Ex Women prisoners in business should be offered soft loans & subsides for encouraging them into industrial activities. The financial institutions should provide more working capital assistance both for small scale venture and large scale ventures.

Self help groups of women entrepreneurs to mobilize resources in order to help the women in the field of industry, trade and commerce can also play a positive role to solve this problem.

Women should receive certificates on the successful completion of courses.²³

Sentencing plans should balance work, education and rehabilitation. Rehabilitation should therefore seek to do more than discourage further criminal behaviour but should also address some of the root causes of such behaviour, including poverty and abuse. In asking women's needs seriously, programmes must be specifically designed for women and not just adopted or adapted from men's programmes.

Peer education and vocational training by selected groups of prisoners with the requisite skills should be encouraged. This will have the additional benefit of increasing peer-educators confidence and work experience.

There is a need to increase the payment of work inside the prison. This would help in create enough funds to support the prisoner on release until she secures work on the outside.

There is a need to introduce the curriculum on Business, entrepreneurship and pro-social life skills curriculum for incarcerated women.²⁴ A more comprehensive pre-release programme should be implemented that addresses basic life skills and provides prisoners with technical knowledge needed to operate in society, including information about the banking system, job applications, and how to access support services.

Organize training programmes inside the prison to develop professional competencies in managerial, leadership, marketing, financial, production process, profit planning, maintaining books of accounts and other skills. This will encourage women to undertake business.

The model of skill training and campus placement of inmates, initiated by Tihar Jail Administration recently, may be replicated in other jails.²⁴

Various Memorandum of Understanding (MOUs) needs to be executed with different unit proposers under Private Public Partnership (PPP) for employment opportunity for prisoners post release.²

²³Para 11.33.67: Vocational training programmes should be developed in liaison with the Department of Technical Education, etc., and the inmates successfully undergoing training programmes should be awarded regular certificates by that Department.
Conclusion
It has now been recognized that to promote self-employment and to reduce the incidence of crime, some drastic efforts have to be made to accelerate self employment of women prisoners in various sectors. Successful reentry after incarceration benefits both the individual and our community. It reduces new crime and victimization, law enforcement costs, court costs and of course, the high cost of re-incarceration. Re-establishing a productive life also promotes economic self-sufficiency which minimizes the cost of reliance on state and county social service systems. These benefits, along with productive employment, will extend directly to the children and immediate families of these former prisoners.
WEAPON OF THE WEAK : EXPERIENCE OF DISABLED FEMALE ENTREPRENEURS IN INDONESIA

Wuri Handayani, PhD
School of Business Innovation and Technopreneurship
University Malaysia Perlis, Malaysia
Email: wuri@unimap.edu.my
(Corresponding author)

Dr. Sasongko
Faculty of Social Science and Politics
Universitas Negeri Jember
Email: saspasca@yahoo.co.id

Abstract
Building on qualitative and semi-structure interview, this paper attempts to portray disabled women entrepreneur’s daily struggles for surviving their life and their creativity in negotiating stigma toward disabled people. Persistence of certain cultural, legal and institutional barriers makes disabled women live in low and middle-income countries such as Indonesia is often subject of double discriminations: once because of their gender and because of their disability. Using the lens of James Scott’s conception on “everyday forms of resistance” and “hidden transcript”, this paper describes how disabled women in Indonesia react to such barriers and adopt specific strategies to covertly resist through developing themselves as entrepreneurs.

Keywords : everyday resistance, disabled women, entrepreneurs

Introduction
The field of entrepreneurs has attracted scholars all over the world for the last few decades (Jing et al., 2015), including women entrepreneurs. Literature present that women entrepreneurs have contributed a significant role in the expansion of entrepreneurship (Fleck, 2015). Hence, there are many attempts has been introduced to engage more women in entrepreneurial activities. Moreover, many studies have conducted to investigate obstacles that faced by women entrepreneurs (Chinomona & Maziriri, 2015) in order to identify the supports that can encourage them become the entrepreneurs. However, there is a dearth in the literature written about disabled women entrepreneurs.

Disabled women experience double labor discriminations due to their gender and their disability. In rural area, their situation is worse; they suffered from lack of education, inaccessible public transport as well as limited access to information that prevent them enter to labor markets (Mondejar-Jimenez et al., 2009). As a result, the level of unemployment among disabled people in general and disabled women in particular remain high. Therefore, one of the possible solutions is to encourage them become self-employment and entrepreneurs. There are many benefits reported that becoming self-employment help disabled people to increase their independence, to broaden their choices, to expand transferable skills as well as to improve managerial skills (Hwang & Roulstone, 2015).

However, setting up a business is challenging enough, but those with physical problems often have to work even harder. Having the right support, at the right time, is critical for them. Hence, this paper attempts to investigate the following issues: the motivations of disabled women become entrepreneurs,
the nature of their business and the challenges face by them in starting and expanding their business venture with reference of disabled women entrepreneurs in Indonesia.

The concept of everyday resistance
Since James C. Scott introduced the concept of everyday resistance in 1985, studies adopt this concept has grown particularly in the field of subordinate group such as subaltern, women, cultural, peasant or queer (Vinthagen & Johansson, 2013). Despite the term of resistance has been used by the scholars of different fields and different settings, however there is without or little consensus on the definition of resistance (Hollander & Einwohner, 2004). Consequently, the definition of resistance used might neglect some forms of resistance or overlook a certain group from the analysis (Thomas & Davies, 2005) such as disabled people.

Although resistance is defined differently such as “acting autonomously”, “active efforts to oppose”, “refuse to cooperation” and “abusive behavior” (Hollander & Einwohner, 2004), the scholars agree that the concept of resistance refers to the oppositional act (Vinthagen & Johansson, 2013). Similar to other forms of acts, resistance can be situated in a particular space, time, relation and might be engaged with different people, discourse and techniques (Vinthagen & Johansson, 2013). For Scott, analyzing everyday forms of resistance is based on his understanding of class relationship in which class is embedded in a specific histories of social relations that gains unique power (Sivaramakrishnan, 2005). This is linear to Foucault’s claims that if “where there is power, there is resistance” (Vinthagen & Johansson, 2013, p. 1).

There is a dichotomy of form of resistance that demonstrated by the subordinated group in dealing with the powerful group (Scott, 1985) : public transcript and hidden transcript. The former happens in forms of organized, open resistance, and collective activities such as social movement, demonstration or rebellion. On the other hand, hidden transcripts are “discourse that takes place of stage beyond direct observation by the power holder” (Scott, 1985, p. 4). In similar way, Thomas and Davies (2005) conceptualize resistance as a “routinized, informal and often inconspicuous forms of resistance in everyday practice” (p. 686). This everyday resistance typically hidden or disguise and manifests in forms of “getting by” and pragmatic adaption (Shi, 2008; Vinthagen & Johansson, 2013). As a pragmatic adaption, resistance should be seen as a continuing process of adaptation of dominant discourse in order to obtain the security and comfort (Thomas & Davies, 2005). In this respect, hidden transcript is become an effective form of resistance or “weapon of the weak” as called by Scott (1985).

The concept of everyday resistance has deployed by many scholars to explore the voice the subordinate or marginalized group. Within the context of academic milieu, the hidden transcript has been used to explore the phenomena of rejection among powerless of academics group toward a hegemonic power holders (Anderson, 2008; Gaus & Hall, 2015). Similarly, Shi (2008) also used the everyday forms of resistance to document the daily struggle of Chinese immigrant worker for material survival in the U.S. This concept was also adopted by Miller (1997) to shed light the gender harassment among army men. Researching everyday resistance poses a unique challenge as the form is not easily to recognize. It requires the researcher to define every resistance clearly through connecting to its historical social relation as suggested by Vinthagen and Johansson (2013). Thus, this paper attempts to follow other scholar’s footsteps in appreciating the marginalized women’s creative tactic of resistance within their real-life context with reference to disabled women. Only within their context, the covert, individual and everyday practice of resistance as forms of pragmatic adaptation and getting by can be revealed.

Research methods
This paper adopts a case study approach to provide personal stories of disabled women start their business and identify the challenges they face in running their business. According to Yin (2009), case study approach is considered as the appropriate approach when the researcher intends to understand “a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context” (p. 18).

In order to gain the understanding of their entrepreneurial experience, this study collects the data through interview with selected disabled women entrepreneurs in Indonesia. The number of them are limited, hence the criteria for selecting case was based on the length of their business of minimum 5 years. Since the first author of this paper is a disabled woman, the access to respondent was acquired from her networks. Most of respondents have been acquainted for many years and some of them were gained from the colleague recommendation.

This study attempts to explore the experience of disabled women entrepreneurs from different types of disability. However, due to limited access and time constraints, this study merely succeeds to manage respondents from the physical disability and hearing impairment/deaf, from different locations and type of business. The respondents were asked to explain the motivation of starting their business and the impediments they encounter when start and expand their business. The data then was interpreted using narrative analysis in order to formulate a description of their story. The list of respondents and their background is presented in table 1 below. In order to keep the respondents anonymously, their name is replaced with pseudonyms.
The following section discusses the experience of respondents in starting their business and the obstacles facing them, as well as their indigenous forms of resistance.

**Entrepreneurial motivation among disabled women**

A large number of literature on entrepreneurship distinguish the motives underpinning the decision to start a business into two categories: necessity-driven and opportunity-driven (Williams & Williams, 2014). The opportunity entrepreneurs are entitled for those who are active to start a new enterprise and pulled into entrepreneurship because they desire of money independent and increase their income (Bosma et al., 2008) whilst the necessity-motivated entrepreneurs is people who become entrepreneurs because there are no better options in earning in living (Acs, 2006).

Disabled people are one of vulnerable group that has a hard time finding decent jobs. The United Nations Enable estimates that the percentage of unemployment among disabled people working age is 80-90% in developing countries and 50-70% in industrialized countries (The United Nations Enable, 2007). This situation is worse for disabled women. The level of unemployment among disabled woman has been identified as higher as 75% compare to disabled men of 60% (Disabled Women's Network). The prejudice toward their capabilities, combined with environment, architectural barriers and limited access to transportation, building and education propel disabled women into poverty (Naami et al., 2012).

In Indonesia, the government has adopted a number of laws, policies, and initiatives to broaden the opportunity of disabled people to work. However, the issue here is lack of law enforcement on disability and employment (Adioetomo et al., 2014). As a result, disabled people are less likely to employed. Hence, they are more likely to be self-employed and become entrepreneurs.

As explained by Hotel, a physical disabled woman.
After finished my high school, I applied to the University of Gadjah Mada and I was accepted. However, due to financial constrain I decided not to pursue study in university. So, I went to the Vocational Rehabilitation Centre and took photography and expected to get a job later. Completed the training, I applied for a job in many companies. When they knew that I am a disabled people, they refused my application. I was keep applying for the job until 2 years and finally I said to myself “rather than put effort in searching a job, why I was not trying to create jobs”. Then, I started to make a patchwork doormats” (Hotel).

Golf was also having similar experience.

I was getting married and my husbands brought me and moved from Java to a somewhat remote area in Kalimantan Island. I could teach reading the Quran and I applied for a job in a special school for disability here. Unfortunately the headmaster rejected my application due to my disability. At the time, my husband’s salary was fluctuated; we needed the additional income to support our live that apart from family. Since I had skills in sewing, I asked him to buy a used sewing machine and I started become a tailor (Golf).

Charlie is a bit fortunate of disabled woman. She came from the wealthy family and live in Jakarta. So, compare to other disabled people in Indonesia that experience of lack of education, she had an opportunity to pursue a higher-level education. She held a Master of Communication from one of the reputable university in Jakarta. Despite holding a master degree, when she applied for a job, she also received rejections from many companies.

The companies refused to accept me as their employee. The reason was that they could not imagine how I could communicate with other people in this company. I said that I used a hearing aid and I could speak with other people. But, they still rejected me. (Charlie)

From the cases above, it can be concluded that failure to get a job is the main factor for disabled people pulling become the necessity-entrepreneurs. This situation is similar to disabled entrepreneur in other countries such as in Uganda where the majority of employers resist employing disabled people (Namatovu et al., 2012). As stated by John D. Kemp that “entrepreneurship has become a consequence of disability discrimination in the workforce” (Holub, 2001, p. 2).

Disabled women entrepreneurs’ barriers
By nature, setting up a business venture is challenging enough, but those with physical problems often have to put their efforts even harder. Entrepreneurs are encountered with many obstacles that limit their growth and survival. In addition, disabled women have to cope with negative prevailing social and cultural attitude, lack of educational and training as well as gender discrimination.

Intensive studies have been done to investigate challenges faced by female entrepreneurs. The findings revealed the impediment to women entrepreneurs comprise of lack or education and training, access to finance, gender discrimination as well as inadequate resources (Chinomona & Maziriri, 2015; Fleck, 2015). However, not many researches were conducted in investigating the challenges faced by disabled people, including women entrepreneurs, except study by Maziriri and Madinga (2016).

Disabled women entrepreneurs experience hindrance as well as women entrepreneurs in general. Yet, they experience of social stigma about disabled people that regarded as people who cannot doing anything and always needed to be help.
At the beginning when we started produce patchwork doormats, we became itinerant traders. My husband and me brought and sold my product door to door, from house to other houses and also from one shop to another shops. They thought we were beggars and offered some money. We refused their giving and explained what we were doing was offering doormats that may they wanted to buy (Hotel)

Starting business as a furniture maker was hard. Due to the limitation of my initial capital, I only could display few products on my shop. I offered to produce tailor-made furniture and asked customer to pay a fifty percent price as a down payment to buy the main materials. None of them were willing to order, perhaps because they did not trust me as I am using crutches (Delta).

The problems encountered by women disabled people are much more complex due to the nature of their disability. Physically disabled people experience of unsuitable premises, inaccessible places, adjusted working tools and low of mobility.

We rented a tiny premise as a garage to modify the three-wheeled motorcycle. Since we both are wheelchair users, we needed to adjust the premise by added a ramp and built a lavatory that can be accessed by a wheelchair user (Fanta)

My shop was too small and my wheelchair could not enter the shop. So, I left my wheelchair at front of my shop as I still could stand up as long as there is something that I could hold. Sometimes I have to crawl like a cat and walked use my both hands to move from one place to other places (Echo)

My feet were weak and I could not use it to propel a manual sewing machine. At first, we could not afford to buy an electric sewing machine. Hence my husband modified the machine that was enabling me to operate it (Golf)

As the modes of public transportations in Indonesia are inaccessible for disabled people, most of them experience of low mobility. In order to restock their supplies or material, they need assistance from someone else. Hence, the proliferation of mobile phones has changed their life. They can receive as well as place orders from different places without need to travel.

Furthermore, the deaf has a different problem compare to physically disabled people. They primarily face a problem in communicating with other people as they use a sign language that may difficult to be understood by their customers.

I operated both clothes shop and tailor. In shop, my employees who are deaf as well relatively did not face problem when serve the customers. In case the customers or my employees could not understand each other, I trained my employee to write in a piece of paper that I always prepared on the top of show windows. However, as a tailor, I sometimes experienced difficulties in understanding the expectation and demand of customers, particularly for first-time customer. If it happens, I asked my mum to translate it (Beta).

From the experience above, the different nature of disabilities impacts to different problems they encountered. Due to the limitation access of author, this study could not explore the experience of disabled women from other types of disability, such as blind.

Furthermore, disabled women entrepreneurs also face similar barriers of women entrepreneurs that are lack of access to finance. All the respondents used their own savings or get support from their family
when start up their business venture. Despite their business growth, they still used their own money to expand their business.

* I sold my car – a gift from my parent – when started my business of making cakes and donuts. I used the money to buy oven and other working tools as well as raw materials that can be used for few weeks (Alfa).

* We started our business from zero. My family could not lend money to as an initial capital to start our business. Fortunately, we have a small amount of savings from my previous jobs. We used this money to buy the basic needs required to run this business. We asked customers to pay the 50% of price as the down payment to buy the raw materials. This is the ways we could survive and we applied the same method until now. So, we do not need to borrow money from banks or other financial institutions, as we could not provide fixed asset as a collateral for the loan (Delta and Fanta).

The respondents also experience other problems such as lack of managerial skills, inability to expand the market and inadequate resources to support their business. In developed countries such as in the U.K. and the U.S., there are many resources and support available that provided by the government or non-government organization to promote, facilitate and help disabled entrepreneurs from running trainings, seminars, networking and mentoring programs as well as obtaining the fund (Holub, 2001; Conway, 2012). However, there are no such supports available in Indonesia. Yet, without support from the government or other institutions, they have demonstrated their ability to survive and growth their business.

**Discussion : disabled women entrepreneurs’ everyday resistance**

As discussed in the previous section, the form of resistance is not easy to recognize. Hence, Vinthagen and Johansson (2013) proposed some fundamental assumption to identify the form of resistance. Firstly, everyday resistance is a practice, so it is not certain conscious, intend or outcome. Secondly, everyday resistance is a result of historical entangled with the power. Hence, everyday resistance needs to be understood as intersectional with power that it engages with.

Following this assumption, in the aforementioned evidence the disabled women entrepreneurs have demonstrated the forms of everyday resistance in two ways. First, they demonstrate that living under man-dominated and able-bodied world in which disabled women are culturally, socially and politically constructed as inferior, they could rebel within the limit of their inferior position. A disabled woman in general experiences everyday stigma, stereotyping and prejudice that is a powerful discrediting label that influence judgment toward disabled women. Throughout the history, disabled people has been consigned into a particular role such as sick people, unable in performing job and dependent to other people’s assistance. In addition, disabled women is perceived as inappropriate mother for unable to bear their gender role of being mother and caregiver (Nario-Redmond, 2010).

Almost all respondent (only one is singe) was getting married and having children. Despite some of them married with disabled men, they could manage to share the responsibility in nurturing their children. In case of divorce respondent, the children are still upbringing by their mother (the respondents).

* I managed the finance, marketing, receiving order and shipping the products, while my husband focused on the technical issues of modifying the three-wheeled motorcycle. Everyday I woke up earlier, cooked foods, washed clothes, cleaned house and helped my son to get ready to school. Using my three-wheeled motorcycle, I dropped him to school and then I went to the garage and helped my
husband to manage the business. In the afternoon, I picked up my son and brought him home, but sometime brought him to the garage (Fanta).

Running this business made me financially independent and I could send my sons go to study in university without support from my ex-husband (Beta).

My daughter was 8 years old when my husband passed away 7 years ago. It was hard to run business without his support. However, my business has growth successfully, I could afford to pay her school fees without depend on my family. Last year, I could manage to perform umrah- Islamic religious journey to Mecca (Delta)

I have demonstrated that I can help people both disabled and non-disabled people to get rid from unemployment and be able to earn their own money. However, in my opinion being a successful entrepreneur is not necessarily having a lot of money. I believe that the successful people are those that bring most benefit to the rest of mankind (Hotel).

Secondly, from the subaltern’s perspective such everyday strategies are more meaningful and pragmatic to the degree that social movements. During last 20 years, disability movement in Indonesia has emerged and developed to raise the voices for the rights of disabled people. Disabled people designed campaigns and established different type of disabled people organizations to ensure their voices are heard. Moreover, the government and stakeholder are encouraged to remove all barriers that enabling disabled people can fully participate in all aspects of life. As a result, the Indonesian’s government has signed the Convention on the Right of People with Disabilities (CRPD) in 2011 and has enacted the Disabled People Law in 2016.

For the respondents in this study, rather than insist the government to promote, protect, respect and fulfill their rights, they adopt pragmatic approach to be able to live or deal with difficult situation. By doing this, they also indirectly take over the role of government in improving the quality of life disabled people in Indonesia. The Indonesian government has enacted a number of acts and regulation concerning disabled people. However, the implementation is still far away. As it explained by the respondents:

The government regulation on disability mandated of 1% quota, which means that one of every 100 employee of company or government agencies, should be disabled people. However, this regulation has never implemented and the government failed to enforce companies to implement this policy. That was the reasons why the companies keep rejecting disabled people because there was no punishment from the government (Hotel)

Considering that disabled people struggle in finding a job due to lack of skills and education, one of the respondent overcomes this issue.

My company was a social business that aims to help disabled people in empowering their economics in a creative way. We also expanded my network and offered service to companies in designing and creating corporate social responsibility program that have strong and sustainable impacts to disabled community. We also held regularly job fair for disabled people and provided them with the different skills for applying for the jobs (Charlie)

Besides that, Hotel also dedicated her house to accommodate disabled people to stay free of charge while they were trained to make patchwork doormats for at least three months. Once they were skillful, they have options whether work with Hotel or back to their family and start producing doormats. For latter choice, Hotel donates one sewing machine and raw materials for patchworks.
I knew that this should be the government responsibility to take care disable people. However, I could not have the heart to let them abandoned whereas I am in the position that could help them. So, I am doing this as I belief that life is not only in the world (Hotel).

Inaccessible public transport is also the main problems that hinder disabled people to actively participate in economic activities. Hence, Fanta decided to help poor disabled people by establishing cost subsidiaries. For those who could not afford to pay the cost to modify three-wheeled motorcycle, she offered a special price based on the amount of money they have.

Being disabled people, we experienced of suffering to get a bus when back went home from work during the busy time. The bus drivers were not willing to stop even I waved my hand many times. Almost everyday I have to wait for 3-4 hours in the roadside waiting for the kindness of bus drivers. So, I could feel how important the three-wheeled motorcycle for disabled people (Fanta)

In addition, most of respondents also made their effort to help disabled people by hiring them as their employees. At the moment, Alfa employs 13 employees and Beta 5 employees; all of them are the deaf. At the similar way, Hotel has developed mentor-mentee relationship and she claimed had trained more than 3,000 disabled people. Despite do not hire disabled people, Delta and Golf offered disabled people to do apprentice in her business. By doing this, they could train disabled people to do a business and encouraged them to start their own small business.

Conclusion
The findings drawn from this study demonstrated that most of disabled women become the necessity-entrepreneurs due to no alternatives to support their life. In general, disabled women experience of double discrimination because of their gender and disability. Stigma, prejudice and stereotype are part of everyday life. Borrowing the concept of everyday forms of resistance, this paper presented how disabled women entrepreneurs have demonstrated the forms of everyday resistance. Moreover, they reacted subtly through their ability to grow their business as an entrepreneur has been explained.

This study was conducted through interview as the only instrument to collect the data. In order to gain insight from disabled women entrepreneurs, it must be more beneficial to adopt an ethnographic approach that is enable researcher to reveal the real experience of disabled women entrepreneurs from different types of disability and difference places.

REFERENCES


Disabled Women’s Network. Factsheet: women with disabilities and poverty. In Disabled Women’s Network (Ed.).


“Just like a bird can’t fly with its one wing only, a nation would not march forward if women are left behind” Swami Vivekanand

Entrepreneurship is important as it promotes small business in society and small businesses create employment opportunities and that gives a boost to economy. Many a times entrepreneurial ventures started on a small scale lead to a bigger scale and culminates into an enterprise.

As per Statistic Year Book of India 2015 women comprise 48.5% of population in India. The literacy rate of women in India is 52% only. In India a paradoxical situation exists. On one hand, there are highly educated and well placed working women but on the other hand, majority are just barely literate and so they are not in a position to be gainfully employed. Such women are not confident and have low self-esteem. This has created a lag at economic and social levels. For the last two decades the scenario is changing in India. Women in the lower socio economic groups in urban and the rural areas have started forming Self Help Groups (SHG) as one of the ways to help themselves. Through SHGs they are participating and promoting entrepreneurial activities.

It is observed that there is a difference in motive for formation of Self Help Groups (SHG) in the western countries. In the western countries basis for SHGs is therapeutic and are also known by many other names. The original model self-help group was Alcoholics Anonymous (AA), founded in 1935 by “Bill W” (William Griffith Wilson) and “Dr. Bob” (Robert Holbrook Smith). SHGs are also known as mutual help, mutual aid, or support groups. These groups provide mutual support for each other. These members share a common problem, often a common disease or addiction. In these groups, specific modes of social support emerge. Through self-disclosure, members share their stories, stresses, feelings, issues, and recoveries. They learn that they are not alone; they are not the only ones facing the problem. This lessens the isolation that many people, especially those with disabilities, experience. There are numerous twelve-step groups modelled after AA, including Adult Children of Alcoholics, Al-Anon, Alateen, Cocaine Anonymous, Co-dependents Anonymous, Debtors Anonymous, Divorce Anonymous, Emotions Anonymous, Gamblers Anonymous, Narcotics Anonymous, Neurotics Anonymous, Overeaters Anonymous, and Workaholics Anonymous. Families Anonymous is a fellowship of relatives and friends of people involved in the abuse of mind-altering substances. These “anonymous” groups help their members to recover from their various addictive behaviours while maintaining member confidentiality. Such groups with therapeutic/restorative/remedial purpose are formed in all parts of the world. It is now estimated that 1 million people attend more than 40,000 groups in 100 countries (Borman 1992).

However, the thrust of this paper is on entrepreneurship development and economic empowerment of women through SHGs in India.
Objectives of SHG:
1. To inculcate the savings and banking habits among members.
2. To secure them for financial, technical and moral strengths.
3. To gain from collective wisdom in organising and managing their own finance and distributing the benefits among themselves.
4. To sensitize women of target area for the need of SHG and its relevance in their empowerment.
5. To enhance the confidence and capabilities of women.
6. It acts as the forum for members to provide space and support to each other.
These objectives highlight the benefits derived through the SHGs.

The three stages of SHGs are:
- Group formation
- Capital formation through the revolving fund and skill development and
- Taking up of economic activity for skill generation.

1. Group formation: SHGs are considered as one of the most significant tools to adopt participatory approach for the economic empowerment of women. The group of rural and urban poor have volunteered to organise themselves into a group for eradication of poverty of the members. Self Help Group is a group of 10 to 20 people, mostly women, who come together and gather small regular saving contributions till enough capital is formed. It is a group of people that meets regularly to discuss issues of interest to them and to look at solutions of commonly experienced problems. The group may or may not be promoted by Government or non-Government institutions. Generally all members of the group should belong to families below the poverty line (BPL). However, if necessary, 20% or 30% of the members in a group may be taken from families marginally above the poverty line (APL) living continuously with BPL families and if they are acceptable to the BPL members of the group. The group shall not consist of more than one member from the same family; a person should not be a member of more than one group. The BPL families must actively participate in the management and decision making. Further, APL members of the SHG shall not become office bearers (Group Leader, Assistance Group leader or Treasurer) of the group. The group should devise a code of conduct (Group management norms) to bind itself. This should be in the form of regular meetings (weekly or fortnightly) functioning in a democratic manner allowing free exchange of views, participation by the members in the decision making process. The group should be able to draw up an agenda for each meeting and take up discussions as per the agenda.
Who helps them to form SHG? Non Governmental Organizations (NGOs) Social Workers, health workers, village level workers, etc Informal Associations of local people Development oriented government departments, Banks, Bank personnel, Mahila Mandals, Yuvak Mandals, Facilitators, other individuals (in their personal capacities) Farmers’ Clubs under the Vikas Volunteer Vahini (VVV) Programme of NABARD and Other development institutions.

2. Capital formation: They agree to save regularly and convert their savings into a common fund known as Group Corpus. The members of the group agree to use this common fund and such other funds that they may receive as a group through a common management. Many SHGs are 'linked' to banks for the delivery of micro-credit. The members should build their corpus through regular savings. The group should be able to collect the minimum voluntary saving amount from all the members regularly in the group meetings. The savings so collected will be the group corpus fund. The Group Corpus Fund should be used to advance loans to the members. The members in the group meetings should take all the loaning decisions through a participatory decision making process. The group should operate a group account preferably in their service area bank branch, so as to deposit the balance amounts left with the groups after disbursing...
loans to its members. The group should maintain simple basic records such as minute’s book, attendance register, loan ledger, general ledger, cash book, Bank pass book and Individual pass books. These are some of the norms for formation and use of capital.

3. Skill development and taking up of economic activity for income generation: In today’s world, mastering a skill is not an option! It is a must! Being able to learn a new skill is the key to success. One needs to look out for opportunities to stretch away from our comfort zone. Identifying skills and developing and training is very crucial. Skill development will depend on the: ability and interest of the members; availability of resources like money and raw material and markets. Once the skill is identified; make sure that it is needed and check your readiness for it. Besides technical skills, a SHG member who hopes to an entrepreneur needs to be aware of and develop other skills such as: verbal and written communication skills, analytical skills, planning and organizational skills, social skills, decision making skills and; persuasion and negotiation skills. A member of the SHG group may not have all these and may not be aware of them but ultimately success does depend on possession of them. Many government and voluntary agencies and banks give training in selected fields.

What could be considered as indicators of a good SHG?

Homogeneous membership: The members should have similar socio-economic background. There should be no mutually exclusive interests among the members.

No discrimination: There should be no discrimination among members on the basis of caste, religion or political affiliations.

Small membership: Group size may not be too small for financial transactions to be insignificant. It should not be large so that members can speak openly and freely. The ideal group size is between 15 and 20, so that the members are participative in all activities of the SHG.

Regular Attendance: Regular attendance at group meetings strengthens the effectiveness of SHGs.

Transparency in functioning: All financial and non-financial transactions have to be transparent in an SHG. This promotes trust, mutual faith and confidence among its members. Maintenance of books of accounts and other records like the minutes book, attendance register also should be maintained.

Set of Byelaws: SHGs should have rules and regulations for its functioning and guidelines indicating roles and responsibilities of members. All this must be written in the form of set of Byelaws. The Self Help Promoting Institution (SHPI) and bank may guide the SHGs in this.

Thrift: The habit of small savings is fundamental to the SHG and helps in building up a strong common fund.

Utilising savings for loaning: Once an SHG has accumulated sizeable amount in the form of savings for a period of about 3-6 months, the members may be allowed to avail loans against their savings for emergent consumption and supplementary income generating credit needs.

There are many benefits of SHGs such as:

- An economically poor individual gains strength as part of a group.
- When SHGs have enough capital, they use the capital for lending or to start an enterprise.
- Financing through SHGs reduces transaction costs for both lenders and borrowers.
• While lenders have to handle only a single SHG account instead of a large number of small-sized individual accounts, borrowers as part of an SHG cut down expenses on travel (to and from the branch and other places) for completing paper work and on the loss of workdays in canvassing for loans.
• Where successful, SHGs have significantly empowered poor people, especially women, in urban and rural areas.

An economically poor woman gains strength as a part of the group. Where ever successful, SHGs have empowered women. There are other benefits of SHGs.

**SHGs are supported by:**

1. National Bank for Agricultural & Rural Development (NABARD)
2. Swarna Jayanti Gram Swarojgar Yojana (SGSY)
3. Mahila Arthik Vikas Mahamandal (MAVIM)
4. Linkage of SHGs with Banks
5. Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs)

1. **National Bank for Agricultural & Rural Development (NABARD)**

NABARD is set up by the Government as an apex Development Bank for facilitating credit flow for promotion and development of agriculture, small scale industries, cottage and village industries, handicrafts and other rural crafts. Under NABARD’s ‘SHG Bank Linkage’ program many self-help groups in India borrow once they have accumulated a base of their own capital and have established a track record of regular repayments. It is estimated that 2.2 million SHGs in India, representing 33 million members have taken loans from banks under its linkage program. This programme is popular in southern states like Andhra-Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Kerala and Karnataka. NABARD also has come up with Self help group training manual

2. **Swarna Jayanti Gram Swarojgar Yojana (SGSY)**

It is an initiative launched by the Government of India to provide self-employment to villagers through the establishment of self-help groups. It will also give sustainable income to poorest of the poor people living in rural & urban areas of the country. Activity clusters are established based on the aptitude and skill of the people. Funds are provided by NGOs, banks and financial institutions. The scheme was as an integrated programme for self-employment of the rural poor launched on April 1, 1999. The programme focuses on micro enterprises in rural areas. Respective State governments also provided training and financial aid. Since its inception, over 2.25 million Self-help groups have been established with an investment of 14,403 Crore (US$2.1 billion), profiting over 6.697 million people. This scheme also operates in urban areas as Suvarna Jayanti Shahari Rojgar Yojana.

The Government also assists villagers in marketing their products by organizing Melas or fairs, exhibitions, etc. The Swarna Jayanti Gram Swarozgar Yojna (SGSY) has been renamed as National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM).With this scheme will be made universal, more focussed and time bound for poverty alleviation by 2014.

3. **Mahila Arthik Vikas Mahamandal (MAVIM)**

Mahila Arthis Vikas Mahamandal (MAVIM) is the State Women’s Development Corporation of Government of Maharashtra, established on 24th February, 1975 on the occasion of International Women’s Year. MAVIM has been declared as a nodal agency by Government of Maharashtra on 20th January 2003 to implement various programmes of women empowerment through Self Help Groups (SHGs). Activities of MAVIM are best understood by it’s objectives:

• Organize women through Self Help Groups
• Build the overall capacity of women
• Enhance self confidence amongst women
• Entrepreneurial development of women
• Synchronize employment opportunities and market linkages
• Promote women’s initiative for equal opportunities, prosperity and participation in governance
• Build SHGs as a way forward to sustainable development

4. Linkage of SHGs with Banks

The linkages of SHGs with banks aims at using the intermediation of SHGs between banks and the rural poor for cutting down the transaction costs for both banks and their rural clients. The objective of the linkage programme could be:

a. To evolve supplementary credit strategies for meeting the credit needs of the poor by combining the flexibility, sensitivity and responsiveness of the informal credit system with the strength of technical and administrative capabilities and financial resources of the formal financial institutions.

b. To build mutual trust and confidence between bankers and the rural poor.

c. To encourage banking activity, both on the thrift and credit sides, in a segment of the population that formal financial institutions usually find difficult to reach.

There could be different models of the linkage between SHG and banks:

**MODEL 1:** The simplest and most direct is a model in which the banks deal directly with the individual SHGs, providing financial assistance for on-lending to the individual members.

**MODEL 2:** Another model, a slight variant of the first, is where the bank gives direct assistance to the SHG and the SHG promoting institution (SHGI), usually an NGO, provides training and guidance to the SHG and generally keeps a watch to ensure its satisfactory functioning.

**MODEL 3:** The third model places the NGO or SHGI as a financial intermediary between the bank and a number of SHGs. The linkage between the bank and the SHGs in this case is indirect. The NGO accepts contractual responsibility for repayment to the bank.

**MODEL 4:** The fourth model envisages bank loans directly to individual members of SHGs upon recommendations of the SHG and NGO. In this case, the NGO assists the bank in monitoring, supervising and recovery of loans.

The adoption or acceptance of a particular model would depend on the perception of the bank and the strength of the SHGs and the NGO.

There are many banks that support SHGs; to name a few: ICICI Bank, Bank of Maharashtra, Central Bank of India, Bank of India, New India, Greater Bank and some more.
5. Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs)

NGOs motivate members to form SHG. They educate and train the members to manage activities like maintenance of records, keeping accounts, conducting meetings getting credit and managing funds, help in identifying raw materials, local resources. They act as catalysts between SHGs and funding agencies. Thus, NGOs promote, monitor, nurture and strengthen SHGs.

Each supporting agency has a model to assist SHGs.

The Research Study

In order to gain insight into the entrepreneurship development of women a “Study of women entrepreneurs operating through Self Help Group in the city of Mumbai” with the following objectives:

1. To study the socio economic conditions of the selected women entrepreneurs.
2. To examine the various problems faced by these women
3. To document benefits of entrepreneurial venture through SHG.

Review of selected literature

Preeti Sharma and Shashi Kanta Varma (2008) in their study found that there was an increase in social recognition of self, status of family in the society, size of social circle and involvement in intra family and entrepreneurial decision making of women. There was an increase in self-confidence, self-reliance and independence of rural women due to the involvement in the entrepreneurial and other activities of SHGs. Awareness was created about various credit facilities, financial incentives and subsidies through Self Help Groups. As women were found to be technologically less empowered and they needed to be exposed to the labour saving, drudgery-reducing, and income generating and productivity-increasing technologies. Entrepreneurship education and trainings could be introduced at all levels from basic education.

S. Thangamani and S. Muthuselvi (2013) studied women empowerment through Self Help Group in Mettupalayam Taluk. It was found that the socio-economic factor has been changed after joining the Self Help Groups. Thus the economic activities of Self Help Group are successful in Mettupalayam Taluk.

Dr. SR Padala (2011) studied the emerging need to promote women empowerment among the rural women for eradication of poverty. Towards this end, delivery of micro finance to the micro enterprises plays a significant role. Studies have shown that the delivery of micro finance to the poor is productive, effective and less costly, if they are organized into SHGs. Self-employment, which is the best employment in the wake of paucity of employment opportunities is emerging to be a very important source of livelihood for women in Asia and South East Asia. The SHG movement in India in general and Andhra Pradesh in particular has changed the rural economic scenario perceptibly.

Sandhyarani Samal (2015) described that SHGs have proved to be harbingers of social development. These institutions have unlocked the door of opportunities for women. Women are earning money and becoming economically independent even without going out to work. They are gaining self-confidence and realizing their worth.

Mr. T. Thileepan and Dr.K. Soundararajan conducted a study on problems and opportunities of women SHG entrepreneurship in India (2013). Major findings regarding problems reported were: family discouragement; social barriers; caste and religion; lack of self confidence and risk bearing capacity; lack of practical knowledge and information of finance, problem of middleman and of marketing.
in obtaining credit facilities, Lack of self confidence, will-power, strong mental outlook and optimistic attitude amongst women creates a fear from committing mistakes while during their piece of work.

Ms. Nilisha Desai and Ms. Anuradha Gaikwad (2014) in the study of problems faced by women entrepreneurs from SHG in the city of Kolhapur reported that the main problems faced by SHG members were domination of male members, male chauvinism and lack of cooperation in case of joint families. Political parties used SHGs as vote banks. Members of SHG lacked knowledge marketing, advertising, branding and its impact on sale. They needed training in practically all aspects of business. Thus, this brief review of literature throws light on advantages and problems faced by SHGs.

This review of literature will not be complete without the mention of “Skill India” launched by our Prime Minister Shri. Narendra Modi on 15th July 2017. This programme includes four landmark initiatives of the Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship: National Skill Development Mission, National Policy for Skill Development and Entrepreneurship 2015, Pradhan Mantri Kaushal Vikas Yojana (PMKVY) scheme and the Skill Loan scheme. Through an initiative known as ‘Recognition of Prior Learning’ (RPL), 10 Lakh youth will be assessed and certified for the skills that they already possess. Non-profit organizations (NGOs) are involved in capacity building of marginalized and special groups, development of livelihood, self-employment and entrepreneurship programs. Under such a scheme girls and women will benefit in more than one ways: women who have skills but no certification will get one, women will be able to get trained in a skill and start an enterprise of their own, SHGs can avail of this opportunity so that gap between demand and supply of skills will be lessened.

**Description of Sample:** Data was collected as per the following details from 50 women of 23 SHGs focusing on micro-finance and service activities. It was collected from members of 23 SHGs in order to get a representative data.

Ninety six percent of women belonged to a registered SHG; only 4% of the belonged to non-registered SHGs. Seventy two percent of respondents belonged to SHGs supported by Bombay Municipal Corporation; 20% were supported by NGOs; 6% were supported by a government department (Mahila Bal Kalyan); 2% were formed by themselves.

With respect to size of the SHG group: 70% of the respondents belonged to a group of 10 members, 26% belonged to a group of 12 members, 2% belonged to a group of 9 members and 2% belonged to a group of 15 members.
Analysis:
Socio-economic profile:

Graph-1

The above show that 40% of ladies were in the age group of 41-50 years, 22% were in the age group of 31-40 years and 16% were from the age group of 21-30 years. It could be because women in the age group of 21-30 years are working in office and other commercial establishments. With respect to education only 4% are illiterate, 84% have completed high school and 2% are graduates. So, it can be said that majority of the women are literate. Only 4% of women are unmarried, 6% were widowed and 90% were married. As far as family size is concerned only 8% had more than 8 members in the family, 38% had less than 4 members in the family and 54% had 5-6 members in their family. Their income from the SHG activity ranged from 1000 Rs to 7000 Rs. per month. Thus, it can be concluded that average age of members of SHG is 41 years, most of them are high school graduates, they are married, most of the member’s family size is less than 6 and their income is Rs.2940.
Graph 6 shows years in which SHGs are established. It shows that 10% of them are started in 2001, only 4% are started in 2016, 24% are started in 2014. Majority of them are less than a decade old. None of the members own their business; all of them are associated with friends. Four % of the respondents are engaged in handicraft like making designs, 6% in services like babysitting, catering for lunches and snacks and 90% in production activities jewellery making, candle making, pickle making, Papad making, Diya making, stitching, making bags, block printing, file and folder making, Agarbatti making, and bag making as shown in graph 7.

Graph 8 throws light on the training aspect of respondents. Majority (78%) of them are trained by Bombay Municipal Corporation (BMC) under Suvarna Jayanti Shahari Rojgar Yojana. The BMC provides training in imitation jewellery making, sewing, stitching, candle making, bag making, embroidery, drawing, painting, Mehendi, Flower making and similar skills. Centre for the Study of Social Change (CSSC) is an NGO which trains SHG members in many similar skills as BMC.

Twenty two % of SHG members have not taken loan; 68% have taken loan from banks as shown in graph 8. Namely from bank of Maharashtra, Central bank of India, Syndicate bank, New India bank, Grater bank and 10% from NGOs. The amount of loan varies from Rs. 5000.00 to Rs. 500000.00.

Benefits of joining SHG: All the members have reported that they have benefited greatly by joining SHG. These are:

- Gain self confidence
- Recognition
- Financial benefit
- Sense of independence
- Developing social and communication skills
- Ability to take decisions
- Capacity to deal with difficult circumstances
• Acquire new skills
• Gained knowledge
• Gather information
• Healthy way to spend free time.

Difficulties faced by SHG members:

Graph-9

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Difficulties in running an enterprise</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>relations with suppliers, customers</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>attitude of people</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>public acceptance</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>legal paper work</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>deciding the enterprise</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>obtaining required licence</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>registration</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>getting raw material</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>infrastructure</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>procuring finances</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>family support</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>production</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>marketing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>use of technology</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Graph 9 throws light on the difficulties faced by the SHG members. It revealed that 72% of respondents felt the need to learn to use technology and 66% felt the need to acquire skills in marketing. Forty four % of the respondents found difficulties in all production related activities.

Graph-10

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>measures to solve difficulties</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>89%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in graph 10 only 11% of respondents suggested measures to solve the difficulties, 89% of them didn’t give any suggestions. It could be because they are not confident.
Measures suggested by the respondents to solve difficulties & strengthen SHG:

- Think collectively and solve the problem
- People from supporting NGOs offer help
- Took help of friends who gave lot of information
- Tried to explain and convince the ladies to cooperate
- Taken help from seniors and members of other SHG group
- Used self experience
- Through meetings
- Group discussions

Conclusion:
Women have the ability and desire to learn, they are ready to work hard, so they must be encouraged and assisted to form SHG. SHGs can collaborate with banks, NGOs, and other agencies of the government like: National Bank for Agricultural & Rural Development (NABARD), Swarna Jayanti Gram/SHahari Swarojgar Yojana (SGSY), Mahila Artik Vikas Mahamandal (MAVIM) and Skill India. Respondents belonging to 23 SHGs are trained in skill development by BMC under Suvarna Jayanti Shahari Rojgar Yojana and by Centre for the Study of Social Change (CSSC) an NGO that gives extensive support to SHGs. However, members do require training in marketing and use of technology for all the activities such as research about the product, availability of raw material, stock maintenance and accounts keeping. SHGs must find trainers to train them for these skills.

There are many benefits of SHGs such as: gain in self confidence, recognition, financial benefit, sense of independence, developing communication and social skills, ability to take decisions, capacity to deal with difficult circumstances, acquire new skills, gain in knowledge and information, and a healthy way to spend free time. They do have difficulties but they try to take care of them by taking help of supporting NGO, seniors, friends, thinking collectively and solve the problem through meeting, group discussions and persuasion skills to convince people.

This will lead to establishment of enterprises by women. It will make them economically empowered and raise their self-esteem and confidence. Small enterprise will turn into big business which will create jobs for people and give a boost to economic growth and prosperity.

References:
https://www.gdrc.org/icm/nanda-link.html
https://www.slideshare.net/rupeshjain165685/role-of-ngo-os-in-self-help-groups
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/261031749_A_study_of_problem
http://www.impactjournals.us/download.php?fname=2-14-1401847639-9.%20A
http://planningcommission.nic.in/reports/sereport/ser/ser_shg3006.pdf
http://www.impactjournals.us/download.php?fname=2-14-1401847639-9.%20A
http://mavimindia.org/index.php/component/content/article?id=13
http://drdachamba.org/schemes/SHGs/main.htm
https://www.icicibank.com/rural/microbanking/shg.page
http://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1023&context=esr
http://www.skilldevelopment.gov.in/nationalskilldevelopmentcorporation.html
http://pib.nic.in/newsite/PrintRelease.aspx?relid=123296
Values, Business Models and Growth of Women Entrepreneurs
“Towards Knowledge-Based Entrepreneurship: a Case Study of the University Outreach and the Delivering of Knowledge Service to Agricultural Enterprises Led by Women Entrepreneurs in the UK”

Dr. Suteera Puangpronpitag
Mahasarakham Business School, Mahasarakham University, Thailand
Email: suteera.p@acc.msu.ac.th

Professor John Taylor
Lancaster University, United Kingdom
Email: taylorjr@lancaster.ac.uk

ABSTRACT

This is an empirical case study of agricultural enterprises led by woman entrepreneurs in the Northwest of England. It examines the knowledge transfer delivered through activities of the university outreach to its local enterprises. It looks to identify essential elements of the collaboration that help facilitating the formation of systematic knowledge exchange between the university and the studied enterprises. It also analyses the strengths, challenges, opportunities and obstacles of the development towards the knowledge-based entrepreneurship of these enterprises from the perspectives of their women entrepreneurs. The case setting is based at a leading UK university in the Northwest region and included in the setting are three local agricultural enterprises located in the university's surrounding region. Documentary analysis and in-depth interviews are used as the data collection methods. Two Research and Enterprise Managers of the universities and three Women entrepreneurs are interviewed and observed for their participations in the university outreach and knowledge networking activities. A grounded theory is employed as the data analysis approach.

INTRODUCTION

Creativity and innovation is acknowledged to be a principle means by which regions foster economic growth and competitiveness (Capello and Nijkamp, 2009; Harris, 2011). University engagement plays important role in regional development as it deliver new knowledge recognised as the key element of creativity and innovation. For small firms, such as local enterprises and SMEs, new knowledge can be obtained when the firm actively taps into knowledge sources, such as universities and entrepreneurial networks. Firms able to employ this strategy are known as knowledge based entrepreneurs. This paper presents and empirical study looking to the development of knowledge-based entrepreneurship in UK agricultural enterprises. Its investigation employed the notion of Triple Helix model as it investigate the development of knowledge entrepreneurs by taking into account a tri-lateral collaboration between university-industry-government in new knowledge delivery to local agricultural enterprises in the UK.

ADOPTING THE TRIPLE HELIX IN UNIVERSITY ENGAGEMENT

Triple Helix is internationally recognized as a tri-lateral networks and hybrid organizations of three parties namely academia, industry and the state (Etzkowitz and Leydesdorff, 2000) (see also Figure 1); in this sense, it is recognized as a derivative of innovative systems that promotes the making use of academic discoveries in the development of the society and economy underpinned by academia-industry-state relations. Leydesdolff and Meyer (2003) assert that the model has an ability to generate a systematic knowledge transfer engaged by the three parties of university, industry and government. With respect to this basis, researchers in countries around the world have studied the implementation of Triple Helix in a diverse range of contexts, both developed and developing, including the UK (Yokakul and Zawdie, 2009).
METHODOLOGY

This is a case study using qualitative research method and grounded theory analysis approach. The case setting includes a UK university located in the North West England. The university engagement delivering knowledge to three local agricultural enterprises was investigated. These enterprises include a dairy farm, an organic vegetables farming and delivery and a hill farm. These enterprises are led by women, one is a family member and two are managers of community enterprises.

There are four domains of inquiry into the university engagement. These domains are recognised as the four elements of knowledge based entrepreneurship including: (1) entrepreneurial skills, (2) interpersonal skills, (3) productivity and (4) management of financial resources.

The qualitative research methods used for the data collection were documentary analysis and interviews. The interviews participants included 2 academic members of the university, an academic manager, a director of research and enterprises of the university and three entrepreneurs of the selected agricultural enterprises.

The data collected were rich and detailed. A grounded theory approach was therefore used for the data analysis. The approach will be utilised with respect to its ability to deal with data complexity. The researchers will use analytic coding technique which the collected primary and secondary data, both quantitative and qualitative, will be systematically coded for the building of explanatory theory emerging

RESEARCH FINDINGS

The first domain of investigation looks into the entrepreneurial skills in all participating entities of the engagement network of university, industry and government. The empirical evidence showed that, in order for university engagement to promote agricultural enterprises to become knowledge based entrepreneurs, the entrepreneurial skills were identified as compulsory qualification of participating university. To explain further, local universities perceived as actively engage with local agricultural enterprises are regional agricultural collages, rather than larger universities with international reputation. As expressed by the business leader, location is not the matter; the knowledge delivering programmes offered rather are. Regional agricultural colleges were seen as having both institutional and academic entrepreneurship. From the business’s point of view, the programmes they provide are more responsive and practical than those offered by larger universities. Academic members of these colleges offered the knowledge in need for the local business, known as problem-based programmes.

The second domain of investigation focuses on the matter of interpersonal skills in the engagement. Such skills were found to be essential for the participating agricultural enterprises, known as the industry entity in the Triple Helix term, existing entrepreneurial skills are not the preliminary requirement as they engage with the university engagement. Traditionally, the leaders or the owners of agricultural enterprises are either farmers themselves or having relationships to farmers in various forms such as family members of neighbours. Their primary networking is personal connections. Personal references are very important to get them involved with the engagement. As a result, despite no preliminary entrepreneurial skills present from the
beginning of their engagement, such skills would eventually developed through peers’ observation. By so doing, the new knowledge, creativity or any innovation perception would be exchanged better via personal connections. Engagement programmes were perceived as the networking tool whiles personal connections and peer observation are rather perceived as the effective approach to the knowledge based entrepreneurship in these enterprises.

The third domain takes into account the productivity aspect. The increase in the productivity of engaged enterprises significantly related to the entrepreneurial skills of the enterprises. Referring to the finding presented earlier, entrepreneurial skills were compulsory for participating universities to facilitate the promotion of knowledge based entrepreneurs. The benefit participating business gain from the promotional scheme would rather depend on the entrepreneurial skills of each individual. The skills consist of five elements:

1. Professional skills: ability and experience in doing their business.
2. Management skills: ability to understand aspects of business management, rather than relying on own existing traditional knowledge.
3. Opportunity skills: ability to recognise and handle changes in the business circumstance at both micro and macro level.
4. Strategic skills: ability to review, reflect and revise business planning and making decision.
5. Co-operation / networking skills: ability to work with the others, internally and externally.

The fourth domain examines the management of financial resources in the university engagement for developing of knowledge based entrepreneurship. The government play significant role in this aspect. Engagement activities are mainly framed by available funding schemes from public sources such as the Department for Environment, Food & Rural Affairs (DEFRA) of the UK, the Economic and Social Research Council and the local government agencies. Engagement programmes offered by local universities are normally of relevant to the purposes of the funding schemes. Primary form of support is one-way knowledge delivering from the university to the enterprise. Two-way knowledge exchange is fairly limited. Evidence showed that, from the industry point of view, knowledge exchange is more preferable as it leads to the problem based engagement. Despite the finding, recent tendency is moving towards the knowledge exchange where the university could propose for engagement support based on the local problems, rather than policy from the central level. For enterprises with more entrepreneurial skills, private sources of financial support are also the option where well developed business planning is part of the engagement.

DISCUSSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

It can be seen from the findings that elements of the knowledge-based entrepreneurship development in local agricultural enterprises are not equally essential to be found in all the participating collaborators, given the tri-lateral collaboration of university-industry-government is the central focus of this study. That is, entrepreneurial skills are essential for the university. Inter-personal skills are essential for participating enterprises. Productivity is the element that can significantly be increased in the engagement of university and the participating enterprises both having entrepreneurial skills. Finally, the management of financial resources are concerned with funding and support provision of government sources. The engagement is mainly framed by the schemes consequently influencing the knowledge delivery. As a result, given the findings, there are challenges found in the existing knowledge delivery. These challenges include limitation of networking channels, insufficient support systems for the knowledge exchange, the lack of sufficient identification of knowledge needed and challenge for sustaining the knowledge network.

Bearing in mind that agricultural enterprises have their traditional networking based on personal connections and references, networking in this industry should take into account this norm. Also, these enterprises prefer problem-based knowledge delivering programmes, the university and government agency trying to deliver the service should be more active in terms of getting involved with them based on personal references. These references could consequently promote the expansion of the network from informal personal references to a more formal and systematic engagement.

CONCLUSION

The study identifies elements of the knowledge-based entrepreneurship in the studied agricultural enterprises in various aspects, including entrepreneurial skills, interpersonal skills, the management of financial
resources, the assessment of the productivity and profitability of the enterprise. Outreach activities of the university are also examined in terms of the provision of system for university supports, forms of knowledge delivery and the formation of networking between the university and the local enterprises. The implications of the results lead to issues and discussions, based on the perspectives of women entrepreneurs, on the ways in which the university outreach could help the enterprises to be developed towards the knowledge-based entrepreneurship. Also, the research results identify challenges found in the existing knowledge delivery concerning the networking and the sustainability of the knowledge services of the university. These challenges are the limitation of networking channels, insufficient support systems for the knowledge exchange, the lack of sufficient identification of knowledge needed and the challenge for sustaining the knowledge network. These results help laying a foundation for improving practical framework for the building of knowledge service network and the knowledge delivery from universities to their local enterprises. Included in the discussions of research implications is a proposed framework for improving university outreach activities and the promotion of sustainable knowledge networking.

REFERENCES

1. INTRODUCTION

The impact of entrepreneurship has been studied across various areas, such as the establishment of new industries (Audretsch et al., 2006; Baumol, 1986, 2010), improving the quality of life (Baumol et al., 2007; McMullen and Warnick in press), and promoting economic growth in both developed and developing economies. Although entrepreneurial outcomes related to financial performance, wealth creation and firm survival are significant, focusing on these outcomes alone results in a one-sided analysis, wherein entrepreneurship is evaluated and appraised solely on monetary terms without reference to its social impact (Zahra et al., 2009). Certainly, this excludes social entrepreneurs whose primary motive is to create social value (SV) and to fulfill the unmet needs of their community. However, by restricting the discussion of social value creation (SVC) to social enterprises and entrepreneurs, the scope of value creation of all entrepreneurial activity beyond social entrepreneurship becomes limited. In doing so, the general heroic interpretation of an entrepreneur is overlooked, and, underpinning that interpretation, a successful entrepreneurial activity cannot be carried out by disadvantaged and marginalized groups, e.g., women, ethnic minorities, disabled and youth (Welter, 2011). This essentially disregards value-related outcomes accruing at multiple levels, such as micro or small-scale women's entrepreneurial ventures, which may offer significant contributions to the economy. Hence, capturing a multiplicity of entrepreneurial outcomes and impacts is crucial to recognize entrepreneurial efforts (Eccles, 1991; Haugh, 2006).

Reflecting upon the dual sociality of WE, the objective of this paper is to explore how female-owned entrepreneurial ventures constitute a contribution to SV. The impact of entrepreneurship, particularly in the context of WE in developing countries, is generally studied either at the individual level, the local, regional or macro level, with only a few studies focusing on the multiple-level impact of women's entrepreneurial activity (WEA) (Malecki, 1994). Specifically, we explore how women entrepreneurs in Vehari, a district of Southern Punjab district in Pakistan initiate entrepreneurial ventures and create value across multiple levels, one that goes beyond economic value. Our sample includes interviews with 17 women entrepreneurs who are trained under the USAID Dairy Project initiative wherein they get training on dairy farming and animal health and care. Livestock and dairy farming is a major source of income in rural areas in Pakistan. Moreover, women being the primary caretakers of animals, have an important role in animal produce and its processing. Thus, by training women as livestock extension workers, the Dairy Project provides them with a necessary skill set and a tool kit (initial supply of animal fodder and/or medicines) which enables them to initiate their entrepreneurial venture and create value across various frontiers.

Researching WE from a social-value lens and in a rural and/or developing economy context can enable a deeper level understanding of the diverse ways in which women entrepreneurs add value beyond economic gain and wealth creation, to their lives, to their businesses, to their family and household as well as to the society. Such an approach to researching WE would help to highlight the importance of women as agents of change for the society and the economy. Consequently, this could enable these invisible entrepreneurs to receive recognition and appreciation for their entrepreneurial efforts. It would also help to shift the focus of research from questions like ‘what entrepreneurs do’ to ‘how they do it’ (the unique ways in which value is created by each women entrepreneur), and ‘who they do it for’ (the SV created through WEA and the beneficiaries of the value) (Zahra et al., 2009). Such a line of research has the potential to initiate a break from dominant methods of positivistic research to more exploratory ones, involving qualitative techniques that help to capture the real impact of entrepreneurship at multiple levels.

2. SOCIAL VALUE CREATION THROUGH WOMEN ENTREPRENEURSHIP
In the context of Women entrepreneurship (WE), studies have documented the economic importance of female entrepreneurs in terms of employment generation and poverty alleviation, but less attention has been paid to the SV and change that female entrepreneurs bring to a society because of their entrepreneurial initiatives, large or small. SVC through WE extends beyond social enterprise initiatives and includes the social change resulting from female-owned enterprises at the individual, business, household and community level. These vary across different types of female-owned entrepreneurial activities and contexts.

Female entrepreneurs across the world face several constraints within their entrepreneurial environments, because of which they are not able to realize their full potential in business, or achieve as high growth and performance as their male counterparts. Such differences in entrepreneurial activity among males and females are attributed to a variety of factors, including lack of finance, inadequate educational background, lack of role models, weak social status and demands on time with respect to family responsibilities (OECD, 2004). For example, developing countries like Pakistan, which are characterised with political instability, weak legal and institutional structures, low economic growth, and strong socio-cultural and religious norms, gender roles and attitudes, present unique challenges to rural female entrepreneurs. Additionally, gender bias in entrepreneurship restricts female entrepreneurial activity and contributes to the growing differences between the number of male and female enterprises. Gendering of entrepreneurship portrays business ownership and entrepreneurship as mostly masculine, and, consequently, men are the dominant entrepreneurial role models (Ahl, 2006; Marlow et al., 2008), and this implies that women are not fit to take on the role of an entrepreneur (Achtenhagen and Welter, 2005). Empirical research related to perceptions suggests that individuals typically associate the entrepreneurial role with masculine traits such as self-reliance, competitiveness and assertiveness (Gupta et al., 2009), which further confirms that there is a stereotypically masculine image of entrepreneurship. Nevertheless, despite being embedded in a constrained entrepreneurial environment, women are a significant source of economic and social value across the globe and WE is a pathway to progress in developing nations. Women do initiate and pursue an entrepreneurial idea, creating not only economic but also SV, both for themselves and for the broader community. Current research on WE discusses the role of women in economic growth and development with little emphasis on their role in SVC. Hence, to overcome this gap in literature, in this paper, we highlight the ways in which female entrepreneurs create SV through their entrepreneurial efforts in the rural areas in Pakistan. In doing so, we also aim to explore the lived experience of women and how they undertake entrepreneurship as a mechanism to improve their lives as well as the lives of others (Welter and Xheneti, 2015). Thus, we argue that to advance the discussions on the outcomes of entrepreneurial activity, a multi-lens approach to SVC must be incorporated - one that extends beyond social entrepreneurship activity and in which value is captured at different levels and in different social contexts. This would help to cultivate a debate with a focus on social as an enabling resource (social networks), social as a context (social environment) and social as an outcome (SV) in any type of entrepreneurial activity. Evaluating the outcome dimension with a social lens, across various forms of entrepreneurship, would enable a deeper and multi-dimensional analysis of enterprises with regards to their growth and performance (Korsgaard and Anderson, 2011).

3. MULTIPLICITY OF SVC IN THE WOMEN’S ENTREPRENEURSHIP CONTEXT

In this chapter, we propose that the social impact of WE can be observed at multiple levels and on different actors that are part of the environment in which women entrepreneurs operate (Day, 1987; Morris and Lewis, 1991). Broadly, we define SV accruing through WE at four levels: (i) the individual level (value accruing to the female entrepreneur herself); (ii) the business level (value accruing to the entrepreneurial activity being undertaken); (iii) the household level (value accruing to the family of the female entrepreneur, the household and its members) and; (iv) the community or society level (value accruing to the society and its members).

3.1. SVC at the Individual Level

Female entrepreneurs can add immense value to their own lives because of their engagement in entrepreneurial activities. Entrepreneurship provides women with opportunities that may help them to improve their bargaining power in their personal life choices (i.e., enhanced agency and decision making), which can
consequently promote their personal growth and development and improve their overall well-being and quality of life (Beath et al., 2013; Haneef et al., 2014; Haugh and Talwar, 2014; Kantor, 2003). We propose that the three aspects of value creation at the individual level, as a result of a women’s engagement in entrepreneurial activity, include: (i) enhanced agency; (ii) greater involvement in decision making; and (iii) enriched personal growth and development. A brief account of these aspects is presented below to aid the holistic understanding of the value creation at the individual level.

### 3.1.1. Enhanced agency.
Agency includes factors such as engagement in paid work outside the home, management and control over family assets, mobility outside home, involvement in household and family decisions as well as investment and property-related decisions (Schuler et al., 2010). Entrepreneurship and business ownership has the potential to provide women with increased agency and control over their lives, which can lead to greater empowerment. The empowerment process is a combination of internal and external factors where internal factors include agency over and access to productive resources to recognize new opportunities in the environment. Thus, even if women have access to entrepreneurial resources within their environment, their ability to translate these resources into business activities depends on the level of agency exerted by women that can ultimately enable them to make life choices and act upon them (Kabeer, 1999). This results in an ability to overcome resistance from families and society, to pursue one’s personal choices, and to exert control over decisions regarding one’s life and possessions.

A woman’s agency may be identified in various aspects of her life. For example, in contrast to women in paid employment, a female entrepreneur and business woman may have greater control over the income that she generates from her business as well as more of a say about how the income is spent in the household (Haneef et al., 2014; Kantor, 2003). Independence in earnings may also lead to an overall sense of well-being and improved quality of life and satisfaction among female entrepreneurs, particularly in rural economies it can help them to move beyond the state of poverty. Additionally, the entrepreneurial status may result in increased agency and control over investments and assets, which women may not have had access to prior to becoming an entrepreneur (Beath et al., 2013).

### 3.1.2. Greater involvement in decision making.
Women’s engagement in entrepreneurial activities and contribution towards the household income can lead to positive individual-level outcomes such as their greater involvement in decision making regarding family, income and household matters (Haugh and Talwar, 2014). For example, engagement in entrepreneurial activity may result in women having a greater say in reproductive health, such as child spacing and fertility (Kabeer, 2001; Mayoux and Mackie 2007). They may also have increased involvement in decisions related to their children’s education and marriage particularly for female children. They may also have greater control in decisions regarding the amount spent on food, housing, clothing, medicines and leisure activities (Beath et al., 2013). In developing economies, discrimination against education among girls results in low levels of skill and knowledge among the female population (Jones et al., 2011). Thus, as a result of having a say in decision making, female entrepreneurs may promote equality of resources between male and female children.

An enhanced role in family decision making may also be prevalent in a woman’s choice of political participation, i.e. the ability and control to make decisions about themselves related to their political choices, voting for elections as well as standing for positions in political parties. This is not just limited to politics but women may also be able to take decisions regarding their social interactions in their community, business or non-business. For example, women need permission from their family or must be accompanied by a male member of the household in order to leave their homes, even if this involves visiting a doctor, a family member, or attending social meetings (Kantor, 2003). The stereotypical attitudes and gender bias in the society view men as sole income earners and women as caretakers of their homes and family. This, in turn, restricts women from accessing opportunities that may benefit their business, such as recruit new customers and access new markets. Hence, amidst all the constraints and barriers faced by women, entrepreneurship may be a means of empowering them and increasing their role in decisions that affect their life directly and indirectly, contributing to value creation for the individual woman entrepreneur.

### 3.1.3. Personal growth and development.
Despite the barriers faced by women and the constraints on their performance and growth in business,
female entrepreneurs are nevertheless able to add value to their lives by enhancing their personal growth and knowledge base through experience in business activity. Business ownership may encourage women to fight for their rights and against injustices perpetrated against them. By owning and managing a business, women may gain in confidence and self-esteem, which, in turn, positively influences their psychological and emotional well-being (Haugh and Talwar, 2014). Moreover, despite being limited in their opportunities and resource base, women entrepreneurs may enhance their knowledge base in terms of learning to run the business and dealing with clients and suppliers as well as equipping themselves with a variety of skills, such as marketing, financial, leadership, management and social skills. Improvement in all these aspects of life tends to elevate their status leading to an overall development and growth for women in general (Sahab et al., 2013). Beyond knowledge and skills, entrepreneurship may also result in a growth in positive self-perceptions and confidence that may motivate women to develop their businesses despite the hostile entrepreneurial environment (Haugh and Talwar, 2014). Additionally, through their entrepreneurial activity, women’s perceptions may be transformed regarding gender roles in the society, attitudes and tolerance towards discrimination against women in society, decisions regarding personal life and family. Hence, through individual transformation, women entrepreneurs create value which transcends beyond economic value and contributes to significant social change at the individual and societal level.

3.2. SVC at the Business level.

3.2.1. Access to resources. Female entrepreneurs are constrained by the social and cultural norms within a society in terms of restricted access to resources including education and training, access to networks, and social support for entrepreneurship which are essential to foster WEA, particularly in developing economies where barriers to female entrepreneurship are high (Subramaniam, 2011). For example, one of the major impediments faced by female entrepreneurs is access to finance, as women are often declined access to business loans etc. by financial institutions and banks on account of their poor formal education, the lack of technical skill and knowledge to start and develop competitive businesses, the small-scale nature of the business, or poor collateral to secure loans or credit (Dzisi and Obeng, 2013). Moreover, socio-cultural barriers restrict women from accessing social networks to build the social capital that would enable them to access key resources for business. This, in turn, restricts their growth potential and performance as compared to their male counterparts.

Female entrepreneurs gain access to resources mainly by utilizing social networks. Social networks help individuals to identify key opportunities in terms of new markets, customers, and suppliers as well as new processes that enhance value creation in business. By developing relationships with business and personal contacts, female entrepreneurs can build strong networks, which help them to serve new markets and customers. Networks also become an integral source of financial capital for entrepreneurial women. Furthermore, beyond social networks, human capital, i.e., a combination of education, experience and learning can significantly help female entrepreneurs to access resources such as finance and markets. In economies where women have low levels of education and have negligible experience in employment, vicarious learning aids women to sustain and develop their businesses. Vicarious learning is acquired when information and knowledge is gained from observing others, as in case of scrutinizing other entrepreneurs (Shane, 2000; Santarelli and Tran, 2013). This form of learning is crucial for new entrepreneurs, who possess little prior experience, and can learn from the example of other entrepreneurs. Learning by doing plays a significant role in enhancing the intellectual development of entrepreneurs, adds to their human capital throughout the entrepreneurial process and helps the entrepreneur to make better decisions and take actions in times of uncertainty (Malerba, 2007; Shane and Venkataraman, 2000). Thus, even when women have limited access to resources, their human capital and knowledge base as well as social network base helps them to obtain access to key resources for their businesses, and so adds value to their enterprise. Consequently, while an adequate resource base is a pre-requisite for entrepreneurship, the opposite may be true in the context of WE, as women initiate an entrepreneurial idea from their boundaries of their homes, build and utilize their networks and knowledge base in order to access resources, which then help the business to grow and develop. It may, therefore, be suggested that women's entrepreneurship may create resources and hence contribute SV to their business by means of their entrepreneurial efforts.
3.2.2. Access to networks. Participation in entrepreneurship can be a source of network access for women, enabling them to exploit increased opportunities and thus create more value. Networks present entrepreneurs with opportunities for access to financing (Shane and Cable, 2002), knowledge and technological opportunities (Owen et al., 2004) and help to hone entrepreneurial skills (De Carolis and Saparito 2006). Entrepreneurs embedded in many networks are more exposed to opportunities and ideas (Cooper and Yin, 2005), which enables them to create more value for their businesses. One significant source of opportunity recognition in an entrepreneur’s network is the knowledge of other entrepreneurs. Female entrepreneurs whose networks consist of other successful women can benefit from their experiences and learn from how they overcame challenges in business. Moreover, family is an important source of contacts for female entrepreneurs and can significantly help them to solve business-related problems, arrange resources for business activity and direct them to resourceful people who may help to solve complex problems (Kao, 1993). Beyond family, the access to mentors within the entrepreneurial environment of women can inculcate positive entrepreneurial attitudes within them, increase access to key resources for women through mentor’s contacts, and encourage other women towards entrepreneurship (Latu et al., 2013). Thus, access to a network base builds up the social capital of female entrepreneurs and supports them in the process of value creation. Networks bring a variety of benefits for female entrepreneurs, enabling them to create SV through their business.

3.2.3. Access to institutional support. The institutional context of entrepreneurship consists of the formal and informal institutions that influence women’s ability to succeed in business and hence create value within it. Formal institutions include political and economic laws and regulation (e.g., for market entry and exit or private property rights), which limit opportunities for entrepreneurship and thus restrict entrepreneurial outcomes of value creation. Alongside formal institutions, regulatory institutions relate to the routine process of the government including rules and regulations that increase the difficulty of starting a business. For example, difficult procedural requirements of new ventures could slow down entrepreneurial activity and may also affect the growth of existing ventures which would cause bureaucratic costs to rise (Autio, 2011; Estrin, 2012). Informal institutions, including the socio-cultural environment, shape the behaviour of female entrepreneurs and influence their potential to create value. Economies with weak institutions tend to have a negative perception towards women in business, have lower levels of women’s entrepreneurship and hence less value creation. Women may gain institutional support as a result of their entrepreneurial efforts, particularly economic contribution through their business activity. Moreover, because of experience and reputation in business, female entrepreneurs may be able to build contacts in order to gain access to institutional support. Differences in the context of entrepreneurial activity determines the extent of institutional access and support that women may be able to secure for their business. For example, women in developing countries may face strict barriers in accessing institutional support due to gendered institutions and bias in distribution of resources among entrepreneurial actors. Moreover, the socio-cultural norms prevailing in the society may cause difficulties for women operating within institutional voids restricting entrepreneurial activity and, thus, the SVC.

3.3. SVC at the Household level.

Women’s entrepreneurial activity (WEA) can lead to significant changes in the household dynamics which may have an impact on the value creation process in female-owned businesses. Value creation at the household level is considered to be a critical factor in explaining women’s entrepreneurial development and social change (Donor Committee for Enterprise Development (DCED), 2013). Two broad value aspects within the household level can be identified with WEA. First, the positive impact of increased income on the household members can lead to an overall increase in the well-being and quality of life. Second, the possibility of an alteration of attitudes towards women, who can viewed as independent and entrepreneurial. These value aspects are discussed in brief detail below.

3.3.1. Impact of increased income. With WEA comes increased income which may have a positive impact on the household members, provided the income is utilized within it. This positive impact can be seen in improved standards of living and an increase in the overall happiness and well-being of the family (Dszizi and Obeng, 2013; Haugh and Talwar, 2013; Kabeer, 2001). In particular, higher income may support greater expenditure on food of higher nutritional value for the family, especially for children. Additionally, it may also
improve the living conditions of the house by enabling better sanitation, sewerage and water facilities, particularly in rural economies where housing conditions are poor. Hence, the impact of increased income from WEA may bring positive value creation within the household by adding value to their families, homes and improve their well-being and happiness in life (Kabeer, 2001).

3.3.2. Attitudes towards women. WEA may also have a positive influence on changing attitudes and gender roles within the household. In this regard, scholars have discussed the spillover effects of work on family (Greenhaus and Powell, 2006), including the love and respect received by the family as a result of participation in paid work (Hammer et al., 2002), improvement in women’s status, increased recognition and respect for work, sharing of domestic responsibilities, and reduction in genital mutilation, domestic violence and abuse, polygamy and early marriages. WEA can also influence attitudes towards gender roles and the power relations within the household, therefore contributing towards value within the household. Particularly, in patriarchal societies, women are expected to bare the responsibilities of the house, their children and the elderly, while men are expected to be in employment or in business and bare the responsibilities of supporting the family (Mayoux, 2001). This restricts the time and energy that women can devote to business and thus lowers their growth prospects. However, by embarking on entrepreneurial activity, gender roles in the household may change, such as sharing of unpaid work much of which is generally expected to be borne by the women of the house.

3.4. SVC at the societal level.

The impact of WEA at the societal level has been discussed in several domains including economic vitality, stability and the availability of goods and services through entrepreneurial activity. In terms of social impact, the security, values, attitudes, lifestyles and norms in a society are important factors that may be influenced as a result of WEA. The first aspect at the societal level entails addition of value in terms of contributing towards the overall development and growth of the community. This includes increasing well-being, raising the quality of life for community members, creating employment for people, promoting gender equality and ensuring satisfaction of life of the members of the society (Haugh and Talwar, 2014; Nicholls, 2009; Welter and Xheneti, 2015; Zahra and Wright, 2015). The second aspect involves changing perception and attitudes towards women in society resulting in greater support for female entrepreneurs.

3.4.1. Development and growth of the community. Female entrepreneurs can become agents of social change for their society by promoting the overall development and growth of the society through entrepreneurship. Social outcomes in this regard pertain to the local development within the community as a result of WEA, for example, employment creation for the local population (Haugh, 2006) and provision of goods and services to meet the needs of the society. Female entrepreneurs may contribute to the provision of better goods and services in the society, thus creating more choices for community members. For example, in societies with strict religious and traditional norms that restrict a woman’s mobility outside the home, a female-based enterprise, such as a health service, may be a significant source of service provision to other women in the community, thus contributing to value creation at a community level. Beyond society’s development and growth, female entrepreneurs can add SV by influencing the personal lives of the members of the community. Women could become role models and set an example for other people, especially for other women, to become entrepreneurial and contribute to the community in a similar way (Hockerts et al., 2006; Haugh and Talwar 2014). Additionally, women may play an active role in resolving conflicts between members of the society as a result of their respect and status in the society. They may assist other women to set up their business by improving their confidence and skill set (Haneef et al., 2014; Korsgaard and Anderson, 2011).

3.4.2. Changing perception and attitudes towards women in the society. WEA is influenced by external elements within the entrepreneurial environment, including attitudes, perceptions of and behaviour towards women in the society, specifically the male members, social and cultural constraints that constrain women’s opportunities and institutional policies that limit the participation of women in economic and political activity (Schuler et al., 2010).

In the presence of the social constrains imposed on women in the society, entrepreneurship can bring about social change by empowering women to fight for their rights and change gendered assumptions about
women. Through entrepreneurial efforts, women can prove that they can be agents for social change and justify increased freedom and mobility. They may exercise agency and have control over their life decisions and overcome resistance of the society to follow their goals in their personal and professional life. Moreover, being a woman in business can result in respect and recognition in society (Haugh and Talwar, 2014). Similarly, women may influence gendered institutions in their entrepreneurial environment as a result of their entrepreneurial efforts and contributions towards value in their society. In this regard, women may gain access to entrepreneurial resources from institutions, which initially were only available to the male entrepreneur. Additionally, being in business can help women gain knowledge of ways of doing business, the rules and regulations regarding business activity in different markets as well as strategies to overcome institutional voids. Entrepreneurship empowers women and enables them to fight for their rights and thus overcome injustices that may hamper business performance and affect their personal lives (Mayoux and Mackie, 2007; Tankard and Paluck, 2016; Kabeer, 2001; Zahra and Wright, 2015). Thus, a woman can add value to the society and positively influence the entrepreneurial environment by means of her entrepreneurial efforts.

4. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Current studies concerning women entrepreneurs have serious methodological limitations (Stevenson, 1986), including the dominant reliance on quantitative research methods which are ill-suited to study women as entrepreneurs. Thus, in line with Ahl's (2006) proposition, this research aims to adopt a constructionist approach to understand the lived experiences of women entrepreneurs as embedded in their context.

Around 80% of the milk production in the livestock and Dairy sector in Pakistan is carried out in rural areas. Despite poor quality and low international standards, the livestock and Dairy sector contribute around 11% towards Pakistan's GDP. In the context of women, approximately two-third of livestock work is carried by women and a large proportion of women are also involved in the dairy sector. Women are closely connected to the dairy sector through livestock activities. Nearly every household in the rural areas own between 2 and 5 animals where the primary caretaker of the animals is a woman (Pakistan Dairy Development Company, 2006). Despite that women spend a lot of their time in taking care of their animals and processing their produce, their contribution towards the economic and social value of the economy go unnoticed. Therefore, to increase the market participation, and enhance the role and recognition of women in the economy, efforts have been made by processor companies to reach out to farmers for procuring milk. A major initiative has been undertaken by the US Aid Development Agency (USAID) which through their dairy development projects have engaged rural women and enabled them to empower themselves by overcoming challenges. The dairy Project of USAID aims to improve women empowerment by developing livestock skills in women and enabling them to earn an independent income. By training women as Livestock Extension Workers, the USAID trains women with necessary skills and tools including animal vaccination, deworming, animal health management, importance of nutrition and Mastitis control and treatment, thus improving livestock productivity and income which results in increased empowerment of the marginalized and unemployed rural women of Pakistan.

17 in-depth interviews were conducted with women entrepreneurs trained under the Dairy Project initiative of USAID. Participants were asked to reflect their experiences of being a woman entrepreneur in their respective context (Vehari, a district in Southern Punjab, Pakistan) and describe the multiple forms of value that they perceived was created through their entrepreneurial activity.

5. FINDINGS

5.1. Individual value creation through women entrepreneurship

At the individual level, women entrepreneurs add value by contributing in four spheres mainly enhancing their personal development; increased confidence levels and positive self-perceptions about oneself, positive self-perceptions about one’s abilities, enhanced management skills, enhanced agency over one’s life; confidence
to make one’s own life choices, control over income earned from the business, agency over asset ownership and other resources, and greater involvement in decision making pertaining to various aspects of one’s life.

(i) Personal Development. Women entrepreneurs experience positive feelings about oneself after starting the business. In particular, business ownership gives a sense of accomplishment, higher levels of self-confidence and positive self-perceptions about one’s ability to do business and enhanced ability to manage things.

“I feel that starting a business has taught me a lot of things and I am certainly more confident now” (AN: 23)

“I felt that my confidence to meet people improved. The number of visits I make in business to different people helped me increase my frequency of communication with them and has made me more confident about myself. I was not aware of this before and I feel very good about myself now” (TK: 39)

“My confidence has improved a lot after I started my business. My husband did not allow me to go outside before. When the training for this project started, my husband’s friend advised him that he should let me get this training as it will improve the household conditions too and then my husband agreed” (RK: 36)

Beyond confidence and positive self-perceptions, women also create value at the individual level by experiencing change in oneself and gaining enhanced ability to fight for one’s rights as expressed below:

“I think I have changed a lot after starting the business. I learned how to sit and talk with people and interact with them. I go out more as compared to before. I learned how to talk to strange men, learned about operations of a bank and how people are there. You need to have a certain way of talking to deal with them. I didn’t know I was capable of doing all this until I actually started the business” (MB: 32)

“I do express my opinion about things. For example, when my husband tells me that our children should not study tuition I make him understand that it is important for their future and for their performance and at the end he agrees to my decision” (AN: 23)

(ii) Involvement in decision making. Women entrepreneurs also experience enhanced decision making as a result of becoming business owners. Analysis of the accounts suggest that most women have greater decision making power to make choices for their ownself. However, not all women make decisions even if they have the agency and control over decision making. Major reason for this finding is the patriarchal norms and values underlying Pakistani culture which gives men major power and control over decisions regarding women as well as the family. Thus, even where women are running their business and earning an independent income, they are not the sole decision makers but rather make decisions collectively, either in consultation with their parents or spouse.

“My husband listens to the positive things I say but we make decisions together. I think as a couple we can do better” (RB: 36)

“I make the decisions at home. My husband leaves everything to me related to house matters. He goes out in the morning and works till evening. I make all the decisions to cook, the groceries and all. It has been like this always” (SA: 30)

With regards to freedom over spending one’s own income, majority of the women entrepreneurs express that they have full freedom over decisions related to spending of the income generated from their business. However, in majority of the cases, women spend their income in fulfilling household needs or for fulfilling the desires of their children including paying the tuition fee, buying uniform and books. Only in a few cases, women spend their income on buying things for themselves such as clothes, shoes or other things for personal use.
“Previously I used to depend on my husband for everything and used to ask him for money to buy stuff and he couldn’t save money due to our expenses. Now I have my own income and can spend it the way I like. I also bought an internet compatible mobile for myself” (RB:36)

“I have the freedom to spend my income the way I like. I buy medicines from a fraction of my income and spend the rest on paying household expenses” (MP: 32)

(iii) Enhanced Agency. Another aspect of value creation at the individual level includes enhanced agency that women experience as a result of starting their business. This pertains to agency over choices governing a woman’s own life, mindset about women in general and attitudes towards them, agency over asset ownership and involvement in political decisions and other social interactions which empowers them and in turn gives them control over their lives.

With regards to political participation, 5 out of 17 women express their participation in voting after starting their business. Majority of the women did not participate due to their own personal reasons while some did not have permission from their family to participate in political meetings and voting campaigns. Additionally, only 7 out of 17 women express their increased participation in community meetings and societal affairs. This is due to the increased interaction with the village people and outside the village community which enables women entrepreneurs to participate and get involved in community matters. With regards to asset ownership, none except one woman bought any assets or land from their business savings.

“Yes. I bought a few things from the money I made in business, including 3 goats, a sheep that costed me 16000Rs and an asset worth 6000Rs. All this, I got from my own savings”. (MA:22)

In majority of the cases, the income saved was not enough to invest or purchase property or other assets. However, all women expressed their desire to buy land and property in case they had savings from their business. In particular, most women expressed their desire to buy assets under their own name while some women preferred to buy on their husband’s name. The latter preference was due to personal preferences of the woman but mainly centered around the perception that assets should be bought under a man’s name and not on a woman’s name. Women perceived it to be more prestigious and honorable if their husband’s owned land or other assets.

“No Madam. I haven’t had enough to buy assets or property from my business. If I ever will, I think it will be on my husband’s name because it looks good to me that way. He is the man of the house and I think he should be the owner of all asset or property. Also, even if it is under his name, it is ours and eventually our children’s. So, it doesn’t matter to me. I would prefer it to be on his name.” (SM: 27)

Agency also encompasses changing perceptions of women regarding gender roles and attitudes towards women. By gaining control of their own life, women may experience changed perceptions regarding women in general including young girls. A sense of business ownership gives confidence to women to take control of their life and enable them to voice their concern for other women in the society, thus helping them to empower themselves.

Analysis of the data suggests that all women experience positive attitudes towards women and in particular for women who are working either in paid jobs or are part of entrepreneurship. Due to the positive self-perceptions, majority of the women express changed perceptions about the role of a woman in the society and the attitudes of the society towards her. This also reveals the change in gender role attitudes, which previously were male dominated. Owning a business and managing it gives women the confidence and self-esteem to manage one’s life and be independent and thus changes the underlying mindset regarding the role of women in the society which is largely perceived as domestic and non-entrepreneurial.

“I feel that women should maximum education so that they are not dependent on anyone at all. It is very important for women to be educated. I realized this even more ever since I started my business” (MA: 22)

“I know women are able to achieve a lot of things; they just have to put a little effort and stand up for themselves” (MP:32)
“When I started the business, I did not have any idea that I could do it; I believed in myself but never even did I have the opportunity or the means to test my abilities. I believe that a woman can achieve a lot and it is very important that she is educated. Education will make her survive in the society and in her household. In our society, village people do not like when women study or work but still women should fight for their education. It is better for them” (RK:36).

“I think a man does not need to help a woman. If a woman is running her own business, she does not need any man to help her. Women can get through every phase of life and can even get financial help if they need to and they don’t need a man to be with them” (IB: 34)

(2) BUSINESS VALUE CREATION THROUGH WOMEN ENTREPRENEURSHIP

Value creation at the business level entails access to resources which women acquire through their experience as a business owner. This includes knowledge and informational resources which help to develop the skill set of women as business owners and help them to sustain and grow their business. It also includes access to resources such as financial, human and social capital which aid women in the smooth operations of their business ventures. Additionally, business value entails access to institutional support including formal and informal support which enables women to overcome the challenges within their broader entrepreneurial environment.

(i) Access to Resources. Access to resources, specifically informational resources is an important component of value creation at the business level. Women entrepreneurs create value through their business by increasing their knowledge about the business, enhancing their skill set and gaining access to information which enables them to achieve success in their business. Based on the interviews, all women experience increase in knowledge and have better access to information regarding their business domain. Specifically, starting a business enables women to get hands on experience with animals, learn about the various diseases of these animals and the treatments available to cure them. Learning by doing thus develops the human capital of women entrepreneurs and helps them to perform better in their business. For example, an unusual disease of an animal and learning to deal with it may help a woman livestock extension worker to treat other animals with a similar disease, thus building her expertise.

“Before starting the business, I did not know how to read the names of the medicines and what medicine was for what disease. Now, I have a lot of confidence about this” (AN: 23)

“My understanding of the business improved drastically. More importantly my skill and expertise to handle the animals improved and this was problematic especially when people don’t cooperate during the treatment and would just expect you to do it” (RB: 36)

“There are several times when a medicine does not work on the animals and I need to give an alternative one. Sometimes I may not be able to know the cause of an unusual disease or the reason for the animal not getting better. Then I usually ask my trainer or read from the book. You always learn when you are into a situation” (SN:38)

Also, women entrepreneurs develop a sense of business acumen through their experience of running the business. By experiencing entrepreneurship, women develop a sense of doing business, and thus can acquire skills and implement them in business for long term success.

“It was easy to sell to the people I knew already but I needed to make new connections to sell to people whom I didn’t know, to get their support. I used to give my stock on trial basis and told people that they could pay later so that people would be more receptive to try my products. I think you need to market your product wisely even if you have the finances for it” (SM: 36)

With regards to financial resources, none of the women got any financial support from any source, neither government sources nor family or friends. Most women operated their business from the cash flow generated from the business, reinvested part of the income in the business while used the remaining to meet their daily expenses. Moreover, getting financial help from external sources was perceived as negative among women
due to the high interest premiums associated with loan repayments and the perceived inability to secure financial resources as a woman in the first instance.

(ii) Access to networks. One of the major components of value creation at business level includes access to networks for women entrepreneurs. Networks, both professional and personal enable women to increase their clientele and expand their business to other areas beyond their local vicinity. Moreover, networks are an important source for word of mouth marketing for women entrepreneurs. The small-scale nature of women owned businesses in rural areas does not allow them to access big avenues for marketing their business and therefore the main source of spreading information about their business is through existing customers and suppliers. Thus, being in business enables women to expand their client base and expand their business to other markets. Additionally, networks also present women with other benefits such as advice and support, both business related as well as emotional and moral support.

“The contacts I make in business have a positive effect on my repute and hence bring in more business. You know Madam, it happens like that for us” (MP: 32)

“I get a lot of referrals from my existing customers. If I treated an animal and it goes through a speedy recovery, then the owner would definitely spread positive information about my business. Sometimes it also happens that the animal does not recover and the owner spreads bad information about my business and me. (NK: 33)

“I hold camps with the village people and tell them about Wanda (animal fodder) benefits and how it would help to increase the milk production of the animals and consequently the income of the owner. People here used to give oxytocin injections to their animals to increase the milk supply. This was harmful not only for the animals but for those who consume their milk and thus I educated people about the harmful effects of oxytocin and advised them to increase the milk supply of the animal naturally.” (RB: 36)

(iii) Access to Institutional Support. With regards to institutional support, none of the women entrepreneurs added value through their entrepreneurial ventures. No women accessed institutional support including financial or regulatory support after starting a business. Prominent reasons for this include lack of information regarding government policies and support for women entrepreneurs, perceived inability to access support from formal sources and lack of skills and knowledge to apply for institutional support. In case of informal support, only a few women (3) expressed socio-cultural support for their businesses. Majority of the women felt that culture was a negative factor that impacted entrepreneurial activity in rural Pakistan. The stereotypical norms and values pertaining to women in Pakistan restricted them from realizing their full potential. Moreover, gender role attitudes and gender inequality restrained women to be at par with men, as a result of which women remained confined to their gender roles including domestic responsibilities while men were perceived as the heroic entrepreneurs.

(3) HOUSEHOLD VALUE CREATION THROUGH WOMEN ENTREPRENEURSHIP

Women entrepreneurs create value at the household level by contributing positively to their family and children’s lives. This is mainly through the impact of increased income that women earn by becoming entrepreneurial and thus independent. Increased income results in benefits such as better housing and nutrition, better standard of living and happier children and family. Additionally, household value also encompasses change in attitudes towards the woman after she becomes entrepreneurial and independent. This entails respect and recognition for her work, respect earned by the family and spouse in case of a married woman, changing gender role attitudes including sharing of the domestic and family responsibilities by the male members and general attitude towards woman in the house.

(i) Impact of increased income. The main value created by women entrepreneurs is through the income that they earn from their business. Despite being a small amount (2000Rs to a maximum of 100,000Rs), women add value to their household. In case of unmarried women, they spend a part of their money for reinvesting in the business (to buy animal fodder and/or medicines) and the rest for household expenses or for personal use.
For married women, the remaining fraction of income after meeting business expenditures is spent on mainly meeting children’s needs and contributing to their better standard of living.

“There is a stark difference in what I could afford for my children before and now and that’s all because I am earning through my business. I can spend more money on my kids. I always wanted to buy them uniform and books for their school but never could do that before.” (NK: 33)

“My children could not get tuition before since we had so financial constraints. Now, with my income, both of them go for tuition” (RK: 36)

“My daughter is 7 and has just started going to school. Previously she used to be at home since we could not afford her schooling. The money I get from my business, I use it to buy things for her. She wanted a doll and I got her one. I also saved some money and bought furniture and some silver jewellery for her. I know she is very young but I still wanted to get things for her instead of spending money on myself. (RB: 36)

“Previously my kids used to go to a government school but after I started earning, they now go to a private school” (SA: 30)

(ii) Attitudes towards women. Starting a business and being independent enables women to influence the attitudes of the people around them. Pakistan being a patriarchal society is characterized by norms and value that perceive women to be inferior than men, particularly in entrepreneurship. Socio-cultural and religious norms dictate the behavior of women and their role in the society. Women are mainly perceived as caretakers of the house, family and children while men are perceived to be the bread winners of the family. Additionally, in rural areas, due to limited resources, women are less preferred and thus have less access to resources including education due to which they are far behind men in every sphere of life. However, despite of living in constrained environments, we find that women create value in their household by proving their potential and by influencing the generic inferior perception of women.

“ My husband and family have always given me importance and never mistreated me. However, after the business, my husband has started believing in me more. If I want to buy something, I would say to him “Ahmed, I want to buy this and he would say to me that you know better so just do what you want to do. Now I even buy things for my husband” (SA: 30)

“My husband appreciates me a lot and often tells me how happy he is with me. We used to have a lot of fights before, not because he was a bad person but just because we were too tight financially. My children used to ask for money and we didn’t have enough to fulfill their needs and then both me and my husband would get frustrated and fought. Now we are happy that there is no such problem. My husband acknowledges other women who are doing a tailoring business in the village and says how good it is that they are doing something valuable” (RB: 36)

Despite some positive value in the household, women entrepreneurs still face challenges pertaining to stereotypical gender roles. Operating in a patriarchal society wherein women are perceived to be the caretakers of the house, women still are burdened with the responsibility of domestic responsibilities. They do get appreciation for their professional work but simultaneously are expected to fulfill their domestic role as a woman. Thus, despite professional uplift and independence, women are still fighting to strike a balance between work and family responsibilities. All women except two get support from their family/spouse for managing family and house responsibilities.

“My husband always supported me and helped me a lot. My child was only 3 months old and was very weak but my husband still encouraged me to take the training and he looked after our child. He would stay at home and take time off to stay with our child while I was out to work. I have been very lucky”. (TK: 39)

The interviews also reveal self-perceptions regarding gender roles wherein women themselves believe that it’s woman’s job to look after her house and children and hence a woman should not expect her husband to do this kind of work. In other cases, even if a woman expected and desired her husband to help her with the house and family responsibilities, she did not achieve that.
“I manage all the house work myself. My husband comes late from work and he is very tired so I don’t expect him to help me with the house work after a long day outside. I take care of the house work and let him rest because he goes out and earns for the family” (SM: 36)

“I do the house work myself. My husband does not help me, even if I am not well. He just doesn’t consider this to be something that he should be doing. He thinks it’s a man’s job to go outside and work and not do the house work. My daughter helps me and I think we manage it well together” (IB: 33)

The analysis of the data also reveals the change in thinking that women experience after they get an exposure of the business. The way women think about their life, about their daughter’s and the aims and goals they have in life. For example, previously if women submit to their husband’s need to have as many children as he would want, after starting the business and getting exposure, perceptions about family planning changed among women. Women considered less children with happier, successful and healthier homes and they would voice their concern to their husbands and make them understand about the importance of utilizing scarce resources among fewer children.

“I had an operation previously but my child passed away. If I must have more operations, there will be only two, not more. I want to give my children good quality education and a good living. My husband will agree with me and if he doesn’t, even then my decision will prevail because I have to give birth” (MB: 33)

(4) SOCIETY VALUE CREATION THROUGH WOMEN ENTREPRENEURSHIP

Societal value from WE is experienced in two components mainly development and growth of the community wherein women entrepreneurs contribute towards the community needs and provide them with a service. Additionally, value is also generated in terms of the changing attitudes and perceptions of the people in the society. Seeing women getting success in business influences the mindset of the society and changes their perceptions regarding women in general and about those who step out of the house to work. It also changes attitudes towards the type of work women are perceived to be suitable for, i.e. women are not only confined to the home and domestic care or work in the fields but can also carry our entrepreneurial activities such as providing a service for animal healthcare.

(i) Development of the community. The most important value that women create is that provide a service to the people of the community at a time when they need it. Livestock and Dairy being the main income source for people of the community in Vehari, requires service providers, mainly veterans and doctors who are trained to treat the animals and advise good care for them. Hence, women being trained in livestock and dairy farming can rent their services to the people of the community at convenience and less cost.

“We didn’t have any doctor in the village so many animals lost their lives because of being infected with diseases. If someone hired a doctor from outside, it would be very expensive and also incompetent. He would be giving bad medicines to the animals and making them sick further. Hence, I am happy that I am able to help my community” (AN:23)

“The community and the people here benefit in terms of their animals. Their animals are their income source. So, when I am able to make their animals better, they feel happy and I feel proud of myself” (SN:38)

Beyond provision of a service, women entrepreneurs also add value by influencing other people’s lives and helping them to develop themselves, particularly girls and other women. By being an example and role model for others in the community, the women influence other people and encourage them to make their lives better. Moreover, women also become a source of professional and emotional support for others in the community as a result of their status as an entrepreneur.

“I give people advice about matters they consult me on. For example, there is a woman in my neighbourhood who had a personal problem and she approached me and asked my advice saying ‘sister’ you know better about it.” (SM:23)
“There were a few girls in my community who did not study. Their father did not let them go to school. So I asked their mother to send them to me and I taught them a few subjects. Slowly, when I started teaching them, they somehow started studying and their father agreed to send them to school. Now they are studying by the grace of God.” (RB:36)

“There is a house next to ours and that woman’s husband is away. She has two daughters and two sons and she does wheat harvesting too. She has a few animals too but wasn’t getting much benefit from them. After the training I taught her how to manage her animals better so that she could earn better income from them. I also put her in touch with another friend of mine who needed a teacher for her kids. Now she teaches her kids too and is doing fine.” (RB: 24)

(ii) Changing perceptions about women. Through their entrepreneurial success, women are able to generate value at the community level by changing mind set of the people regarding the role of women in the society. Through their strength and resilience, women face challenges in their entrepreneurial environment but still make efforts to realize their potential in business. Consequently, they are able to influence and in some ways change the attitudes of the people from negative to positive. For example, people who perceived women to stay confined to the boundaries of the house, were forced to change their perceptions and accept women to go outside and be involved and successful in entrepreneurial ventures like men.

“Previously not many women used to go out in our village, even if they were educated. Now, girls have started to go out. Maybe their parents have realized the importance of education and women being independent. In my own house, my uncle saw me getting successful in my business and thus my niece is also now studying. She finished her MA and has now started to work” (RB:36)

“Seeing me now, people who did not let their daughters get educated regret a lot. They say we should have let our daughters study so that they could have also done something similar to what Ayesha is doing. They would also have stepped out and made a difference to the society” (AN: 23)

“When I used to go to people’s house to treat their animals, they would ask me, “will you be able to do this?”. Being a woman can you treat the animal? Will you be able to control it? I responded yes to everything but still they said to me that I could not manage this sort of work. Madam, it is a perception that women cannot treat animals or that it is a man’s job and women are not fit to do this kind of job. Later on, when these people heard from others what good work I was doing, they gained trust in me and starting calling me over often to treat their animals. Now, they praise me.” (MB:33)

5. TAKING FORWARD: DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

Entrepreneurship is a multi-faceted concept in which a variety of factors, such as the entrepreneurial context, the individual entrepreneur, the entrepreneurial environment, and the entrepreneurial product or service, combine to create the outcomes of the entrepreneurial process. Previous research has mainly documented the entrepreneurial outcomes of WEA from an economic lens, e.g., employment generation and poverty alleviation. While, less attention has been paid to the SV and change that female entrepreneurs bring in a society because of their entrepreneurial initiatives. The aim of this chapter was to evaluate the entrepreneurial outcomes from a social lens, one that goes beyond the idea of social entrepreneurship and meeting social needs of people.

We suggest that the debates around entrepreneurship and its impact, particularly in the context of WEA, can be advanced by viewing value creation from a social perspective. This social perspective differentiates between value created in terms of wealth and employment creation and focuses on the social change that entrepreneurial activity can create at multiple levels including individual, business, household and society level. Our research suggests that despite being involved in home based and small scale entrepreneurial activity, women create value at multiple levels and contribute towards their society and hence the economy. Thus, it is important to understand and acknowledge the contribution of marginalized and invisible women in the economy and include them as change agents of the society. To do so, it is crucial to understand the context in which entrepreneurship takes place and in which value is created, no matter how minimum it is.
Scholars need to move beyond high growth oriented and successful firms and their value generation and focus on entrepreneurs who make an effort to bring about value in their respective way and in the presence of all the challenges within their entrepreneurial environment (Aslund and Backstrom, 2015).

Our research also opens debates around the interplay of gender and entrepreneurship. Previous research comparing men and women in entrepreneurship is mainly based around the economic contributions of entrepreneurship, focusing on wealth creation, performance, growth orientation and profit making. Hence, the contribution of entrepreneurs from a social perspective is largely ignored. Comparisons based on SVC of men and women in entrepreneurship will therefore help to highlight the value or impact of female entrepreneurs from a variety of perspectives. This will, in turn, help to change stereotypical assumptions surrounding women in businesses and has the potential to highlight their role as agents of social change, which may be a significant contribution.

REFERENCES


Female Entrepreneurs and their aspiration towards business growth

Basuki, Whysnianti

1. Introduction

It has been acknowledged that entrepreneurship plays an important role in economic and regional development (Minniti and Levesque, 2008). Global Entrepreneurship Research Association (2017) also claims that “entrepreneurship is now widely acknowledged as a primary driver of sustainable economic growth” (p. 35). In the same line, the contribution of female entrepreneurs in economic development (Costin, 2012; Verheul et al., 2004) has been recognised due to their contribution in employment creation, economic growth, and the diversity of entrepreneurship in the economic process (Verheul and Thurik, 2001). Both the number of female entrepreneurs and the size of their businesses would be imperative in making this contribution, with the belief the bigger the number of female entrepreneurs and the bigger their businesses would increase their contribution to the economy.

To date, the number of female entrepreneurs across the world has increased. However, the size of firms owned by women has been considered small (Mitra, 2002) or smaller than firms owned by men (Brush et al., 2009; Robichaud et al., 2015). Therefore, it is important to ensure that female-owned businesses are growing in order to keep their contribution to the economy.

In terms of female entrepreneurship study, there has been a lack of studies of female-owned businesses compared to the studies of those owned by males (Brush, 1992; Brush and Edelman, 2000), and these studies have mainly focused on the characteristics of the women (Gatewood et al., 2003; Verheul et al., 2002, 2004). This is confirmed by a study conducted by Watkins and Basuki (2008). Their study explores how the field of Entrepreneurship and Small Business Studies come to recognise gender difference through explicit study of businesses established and/or run by women. The result suggests that the proportion of the entrepreneurship literature focusing on gender is below seven percent. Newer study conducted by Ahl and Marlow (2012) claim that research on gender and entrepreneurship is reaching an epistemological “dead end” (p. 545).

With regard to growth, the topic has been researched in entrepreneurship field (Achtenhagen et al., 2010; McKelvie and Wicklund, 2010). However, some researchers argue that our understanding of growth in smaller businesses is still rather limited (Kirkwood, 2009). In addition, Wicklund et al. (2009, p. 351) suggest “little is still known about the phenomenon, and conceptual development has been limited”. With regard to female-owned businesses, Greene et al. (2003) state that a clear understanding of the aspirations and strategies of women entrepreneurs is not apparent from the existing research. In addition, Carter and Shaw (2006) argue there is lack of cumulative knowledge and a failure to adequately conceptualise and build explanatory growth theories. Growth can be considered as a criterion of small business success (Costin, 2012). Therefore, a better understanding is needed to reveal the factors that hinder women from growing their firms (Amine and Staub 2009), so that recommendations could be made to the policy makers and other interested parties to assist female entrepreneurs’ particular needs to grow their business.

The purpose of this paper is to investigate the aspiration of female entrepreneurs towards business growth and how they pursue the growth. In addition, it will identify the factors that hinder their potential to grow.

The paper starts with an introduction that includes the purpose of the investigation. It then continues with section 2 which is a literature review to define female entrepreneurs and business growth, to identify the characteristics of female entrepreneurs, and to identify the aspiration of female entrepreneurs towards growth and the factors that affect female entrepreneurs in growing their business. Section 3 describes the methods employed. Section 4 presents the findings that are obtained from the empirical data. Section 5 is conclusion.
2. Literature Review

2.1. Definition of female entrepreneurs and business growth

There have been different definitions of female entrepreneurs. Amongst these definitions, Belwal et al. (2011) consider women entrepreneurs as “women who initiate, organise, and operate business enterprises” (p. 51). These entrepreneurs are creating both profit and employment opportunities (Jesurajan & Gnanadhas, 2011). In this study female entrepreneurs are considered as women who start and run business ventures.

Similarly, there has been no single definition of business growth (Haber & Reichel, 2005). Costin (2012) suggests that business growth could be measured by financial measures (e.g. profitability and turnover) or non-financial measures (e.g. the number of employees). This study uses the numbers of employees to measure the business growth due to the difficulty in obtaining profitability/turnover figure from the participants.

2.2. The characteristics of female entrepreneurs

Compared to male entrepreneurs, female entrepreneurs have been described as slightly younger than male entrepreneurs (Brush, 1990; Robb and Wolken, 2002; Shaw et al., 2006; Robichaud et al., 2015); the majority are married with children (McClelland et al., 2005); less educated (Robichaud et al., 2015), if educated they are more likely to have liberal arts degrees (Hisrich and Brush, 1986) or possess a tertiary level qualification in the areas of education, fashion, teaching, counselling, nursing and social science, with only a minority of them holding degrees in business, engineering or technical disciplines (McClelland et al., 2005).

These women entrepreneurs have less work experience and less variety of work experience compared to men (Carter and Shaw, 2006). If they had work experience, the experience was not relevant for entering self-employment, particularly in non-traditional business sectors (Robb and Wolken, 2002; Watkins and Watkins, 1984). This condition restricts the type of business women can run; in this case it tends to be within the traditionally female occupied sectors, such as retailing and low-order services (Marlow and Carter, 2004; Jung 2010). Contrary to this, Brush (1992) who reviewed empirical research studies on women business owners found that they had previous work experience. However, their work experience tended to be in teaching, retail sales, office administration or secretarial areas rather than executive management, scientific or technical position. Contrary to these, Buttner (1993) argues that female entrepreneurs of the 1990s have worked in large organisations, gaining skills and knowledge that previous female entrepreneurs lacked. Marlow and Carter (2004) point that there are a growing number of women who are entering the liberal professions such as law, accountancy, and medicine because of their attainment in education. Auster and Olm (2000) also claim that women have increasingly become involved in previously male-dominated, task-oriented occupations. Furthermore, almost all of the women involved in McClelland et al.’s (2005) study have previous industry experience. Although their business experience tend to be shorter (Chabaud and Lebegue, 2013).

2.3. The aspiration of female entrepreneurs to grow their business and the factors that affect business growth.

Some empirical studies show that female business owners deliberately chose to keep their firms small (Goffee and Scase, 1985; Lee-Gosselin and Grise, 1990). Other studies reports that female entrepreneurs have growth intention (Roimi et al., 2009; Costin 2012), although they have slow growth strategy (Cliff, 1998). To the contrary, other female entrepreneurs demonstrate a strong intention to grow their business (Gundry and Welsch, 2001) although they focus on “less measurable criteria such as commitment to employment and helping others” (Costin, 2012, p. 121). In the same line, Brush (1992) suggest that women have been viewed as focusing on goals other than growth and economic performance, and women rank commercial growth as the lowest measure of success (Anonymous, 1997). This is in line with a study
conducted by Buttner and Moore (1997) that reveal that the female entrepreneurs in their study did not view sales and growth as supreme objectives.

As well as the above factors, human capital (Carter et al., 2003) that women possess influences the growth of their business. Human capital measures the education, industry management, and start-up experience of entrepreneurs (Carter et al., 2003; Davidsson and Honig, 2003).

In terms of education, Storey (1994), Kinsella et al. (1994), and Wiklund and Shepherd (2003) suggest that faster growing businesses is associated with the entrepreneurs education. As stated above that female entrepreneurs are less educated than male entrepreneurs (Robichaud et al., 2015) or if educated only the minority have degree in business, engineering or technical disciplines (McClelland et al., 2005), hence these could lead to the slower growth rate of female owned businesses.

With regards to work experience, Venkatraman (1997) state that previous work experience has a positive relationship with the success of the firm because the entrepreneur gain the knowledge based from the work experience. Brush et al. (2002) add that female entrepreneurs who had experience in their business field were more likely to be successful in growing their businesses than female entrepreneurs with no experience in the business field. In the same line Manolova et al. (2007) assert that experience is also positively associated with growth expectancies. Costin (2012) argues the negative effect of having less working experience impacts on their business survival and the growth of their business. In relation to this, entrepreneurs with domain-relevant training and experience are likely to spend less time seeking, gathering, or analysing information due to the familiarity with the industry and institutional infrastructure (Forbes, 2005). This would increase their confidence and this will lead to higher performance (Manolova et al. 2007). As well as work experience, a lack of experience for women managing a growing business is considered as a factor that affects the growth orientation of female entrepreneurs (Cliff, 1998). As mentioned above in section 2.1 there have been mixed results of the study in the working experience of female entrepreneurs, so it would be interesting to see this paper results particularly whether work experience impact on the business growth.

Motivational factors can also affect the decision to start and grow a business (Costin, 2012). There are two factors that motivate women to start up a business, which are “push” and “pull” factors. The “push” factors are associated with the necessity factors that make them start up (Alstete, 2002); for example, redundancy, unemployment, dissatisfaction with previous job, flexibility, child care, and glass ceiling effect. The “pull” factors are associated with factor of choice (Orhan and Scott, 2001) and the desire for entrepreneurial aspiration (Deakins and Whittam, 2000). Some examples of the “pull” factors are the need for independence, personal goals, self fulfilment, and so on. Researchers suggest that “push” factors are associated with lower levels of business success, while “pull” factors increases business growth (Hechavarria and Reynolds, 2009; Stemberg and Wenneker, 2005). However to the contrary, Kariv (2011) stresses that “push” factors did not negatively affecting business success.

Household responsibilities (Brush, 1992; Gofee and Scase, 1985) also have impact on business growth. Research shows that women's careers were more frequently interrupted (Brush, 1992) and parenthood leads to more interruptions to the working lives of women than men (Carter and Shaw, 2006).

Another factor that affects business growth is access to capital/finance. A number of studies reveal that women have difficulty in accessing capital for starting-up and recurrent finance because of the discrimination women face in the workplace (e.g. the gendered pay gap (Women and Work Commission, 2006), occupational segregation (Manning and Petrongolo, 2004), and unequal employment opportunities (Brindley, 2005; Winn, 2004). In addition, discrimination by lenders (Brophy, 1989; Brush, 1992; Neider, 1987; Scherr et al., 1993) also has negative impact on women business growth. Women are charged higher on interest rates (Coleman, 2000; McKecnie et al., 1998); for example one percent higher rates of term loans (Fraser, 2005). Women face higher collateral requirements (Coleman, 2000; Riding and Swift, 1990). The reason may be because of loan officers’ perceptions of successful entrepreneurs. Commonly, successful entrepreneurship tends to be attributed to men rather than women (Buttner and Rosen, 1988). Although there are similarities in the criteria used to assess the women and men applicants, Buttner and Rosen (1992) suggest that there is a difference in the sex of the lending officers who are dealing with the loan application. This means that the sex
of the lender, rather than the sex of the applicant, affects the loan process and decision (Godwin et al., 2006). Discrimination by lenders, however, has not been found in more recent research. Loan officers treated the entrepreneurs in comparable businesses similarly, and gender bias was rated as the least likely reason for rejection (Buttner, 1993). In addition, the sex differences seem to disappear when the industry type, business size, and age are controlled for (Coleman, 2000; Fabowale et al., 1995).

3. Methods

This section outlines the methods employed to gather the data. The present study will collect data from 20 semi-structured interviews to female entrepreneurs in the UK who own small and medium-sized companies. The study do not use survey methods as large number studies on female entrepreneurship have employed survey method (Brush, 1992), hence to avoid the trend. Most importantly, by employing semi-structured interviews rich data will be obtained and this will allow addressing the purpose of the paper. Therefore, the study adopts qualitative approach which based on the assumption that human beings are seen as creators of their own world, making sense of it through meaning systems and their experiences (Saunders et al., 2016). In addition, semi-structured interview is more flexible than structured interview and it allows the researcher to probe if necessary. The time required is shorter than unstructured interviews, but the rich data gathered enables the researcher to address the purpose of the research. For the pilot study (this paper), 3 semi-structured interviews to female entrepreneurs in one of the city in the South of England have been carried out. The three semi-structured interviews were conducted in February 2017, and the length of each interview was about 30 minutes. Convenience sampling was used to select the female entrepreneurs who participated in the study. The semi-structured interviews, then were transcribed and manually analysed to address the paper’s objectives.

4. Findings

4.1. The characteristics of the participants and business description

In total 3 semi-structured interviews to female entrepreneurs in one of the city in the South of England have been conducted for the pilot study (this paper). Table 1 shows the demographic details of the participants and the business description.

Table 1 shows that there are roughly 10 years age difference between participant 1 and 2 and participant 2 and 3. Participant 3 is the youngest participant of the pilot study (31 years of age), and participant 1 is the oldest participant of the study (52 years of age). In terms of marriage, all of them are married but participant 1 stated that her marriage is almost over (almost divorce). Both participant 2 and 3 have children dependants, whereas participant 1 has 3 grown up children. In terms of marriage and children dependant, the findings of this paper are in line with the results of previous research conducted by McClelland et al. (2005) who found out that the majority of their participants are married with children.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant 1</th>
<th>Participant 2</th>
<th>Participant 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Almost Divorce</td>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No of children dependants</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description of</td>
<td>Brewery</td>
<td>Hair dressing salon</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Demographic details of the participants and business description
The table also indicates that all participants run a business in the service sector; in which participant 1 runs a brewery business, participant 2 owns a hair dressing salon, and participant 3 runs a retail and distribution of ethnic make-up. Although all participants run businesses in the service sector, this does not mean that they do not have relevant work experience. In fact all participants have work experience in the field of their business.

### 4.2. The aspiration of the participants to grow the business and factors that hinder them to grow the business

The findings of this paper identify that all participants have aspiration to grow the business and these are consistent with previous studies (Roomi et al., 2009; Costin, 2012). Participant 2 planned to grow the business, but she said “not now” and “looking forward to grow it”. In addition, participant 1 did not want to grow too quick. She said “you can’t be able to wear it at once” and “you need to get the people you can absolutely rely on” and “trust is important”. Such findings correspond the previous studies that suggest female entrepreneurs deliberately chose to keep their firms small (Goffee and Scase, 1985; Lee-Gosselin and Grise, 1990) or they seem to have a manageable rate of growth (Cliff, 1998). In vice versa, participant 3 said that she had “high aspiration with an attitude of team building to grow the business” and this particular finding aligned with a study carried out by Gundry and Welsch (2001). This could be an indication that she viewed business growth as her main objective, in which it contradicted Buttner and Moore’s (1997) study who argued that women did not see growth as an objective.

#### Table 2. Aspiration to grow the business

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Participant 1</th>
<th>Participant 2</th>
<th>Participant 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aspiration/attitude</td>
<td>Do not want to grow to quick</td>
<td>Plan to grow it, looking forward to grow it, but not now</td>
<td>High aspiration to grow the business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>toward growth</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To pursue the business growth participant 1 and participant 2 affirmed that they keep working hard to enable them to grow their business. In addition, participant 2 explained “What we doing here is we are training particularly the strong member of the team to actually take on those businesses once we are in a position to let go a little bit. We hoping in 5-8 years time my business partner and I can take more on executive role and just look after managers and keep the whole thing going with those. So its people we trust. We have already got probably 5 that are been trained and eventually have what they perceived to be their own places but overseen by us”. Participant 3 has various plans to grow the business include develop team building, carry out exhibitions, online marketing, popup shops, and referrals. From these findings, it can be summarised that these female entrepreneurs pursue their business growth through different ways.

#### Table 3. Number of employees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Participant 1</th>
<th>Participant 2</th>
<th>Participant 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year of start up</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No of employees</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>when started</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No of employees now</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>1 FT and 1 PT</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2017)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 illustrates the number of employees when starting-up and in February 2017. The number of employees of the three businesses has increased, so these businesses can be considered as growing since they started.

Table 4. Human capital of the participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Participant 1</th>
<th>Participant 2</th>
<th>Participant 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Highest education</strong></td>
<td>GCSE/O Level</td>
<td>Hair Dressing course</td>
<td>MBA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Work experience</strong></td>
<td>Sales person in brewery industry</td>
<td>Hair dressing</td>
<td>Make-up artist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Business experience</strong></td>
<td>No business experience</td>
<td>Hair dressing</td>
<td>Retailer for other make-up brand and designer of beaded jewellery (and sell these)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Previous studies suggest that female entrepreneurs are less educated (Robichaud et al., 2015) and only a minority of them holding degrees in business, engineering or technical disciplines (McClelland et al., 2005). The findings of this study reveal that two of the participants possess degrees in business (MBA) (participant 3) and in Hair dressing (participant 2) that is linked to her business. Both qualifications are of importance to run/grow their businesses. And the fact that both businesses have grown in terms of the number of employees employed, it could be suggested that education affects business growth.

With regard to work experience, all participants had work experience in their business field. Participant 1 used to work as sales person in brewery industry for more than 10 years before she started her own business. Participant 2 said “I worked for 3 different hairdressing shops” and participant 3 was a make-up artist. This means that all participants have work experience that is similar to the field of their businesses. Looking at their business growth (Table 3), all participants’ businesses have been growing in terms of the number of employees employed when started and in February 2017. Therefore, it can be suggested that their work experience have an impact on the growth of the business. The possible reason for this is because the work experience assists them to acquire relevant skills and knowledge to run and grow their businesses (Venkatraman,1997). The findings are consistent with previous studies (Venkatraman,1997; Brush et al., 2002; Manolova et al., 2007; Costin, 2012).

When asked “Did you have any prior business experience?” Participant 2 said “Yes, but, not in here (UK), but in China. I had a hair salon in China”. Participant 3 said “Yes, I worked as a freelance make-up artist and retailer for other make-up brands. I also designed and sold ethnic beaded jewellery”. Therefore, all participants, except participant 1, have previous business experience (i.e. run businesses in the same industry). All of these business experiences facilitate them to run/grow the business due to the fact that they are familiar with the industry (Forbes, 2005) and would increase their confidence to perform better (Manolova et al., 2007).

Table 5. The motivation to start the business

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Participant 1</th>
<th>Participant 2</th>
<th>Participant 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Main motivation to start the business</strong></td>
<td>Love with brewery industry</td>
<td>Encouraged by husband Flexible</td>
<td>Difficult to find a good make up brand for darker skin Passionate to make people feel good with</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Costin (2012) suggests that motivational factors can affect the decision to start and grow the business. Regarding motivation to start the business, the three participants had different motives to start the business and can be considered as mixed of “push” and “pull” factors. Participant 1’s motivation to start the business can be classified as “pull” factors, particularly because the motivation was related to her personal goals and self-fulfilment. She explained the reasons she started her business because of “My love with brewery industry which I fell into in my early 30s and found that I have a passion .. not just about beer or drinking it but where it came from.” In addition, she said “I love being a woman in a male industry. I really really do and I wanted to prove... Well in the early days I wanted to prove that I could do something... I always told that I would never be employed, I never had a career so I set out to prove everybody wrong”. Moreover, she adds “We just want to create an amazing space for people to enjoy and for us to leave our children something. That’s why we are doing it”. This is similar to participant 3 who see a business opportunity in the industry her business is (“pull” factor). She stressed “Having worked as a make-up artist for over eight years, I found it was very difficult to find a good make-up brand that provides wide foundation shades to match the darker skin”. In addition, “I am very passionate about making people feel good about themselves. I find myself doing this a lot with my business”. On the contrary, participant 2’s motivation can be considered as “push” factors, as she mentioned “my husband encouraged me to do something”. The other reason was “because it is flexible”.

When looking at their aspirations towards business growth, both participant 1 and participant 3 had aspiration towards business growth, hence the findings aligned with studies carried out by Hechavarria and Reynolds (2009) and Sterberg and Wennekers (2005) who reveal that “pull” factors increases business growth (Hechavarria and Reynolds, 2009; Sterberg and Wennekers, 2005). On the contrary, participant 2 started the business because of “push” factors (flexibility). In terms of aspiration towards growth, participant 2 also intended to grow her business. This contradicts the above studies, but corresponds Kariv’s (2011) study that stresses that “push” factors did not negatively affecting business success.

In terms of access to finance, all participants did not have any problem to finance the business to grow. The findings refute the previous studies that women experience problem in accessing capital (Women and Work Commission, 2006). All participants use profit from the business to grow the business. As well as profit from the business, participant 1 explained that she could access money from investors as well she said “And I know if I need investment there are certain people I can go and they are going throwing money at me, which is a lovely position to be in”. However, she added “Hopefully we won’t have to borrow anymore, touch wood we doing well enough to have our projected forecast with good profit”. Participant 3 also used family saving, aid from friend, grant from University she studied, and loan from bank as well as profit from the business. Although participant 3 did not have difficulty in getting bank loan to grow the business, she had difficulty in getting loan to start the business. She state that “the bank she approached would only provide loans based on how much capital she had invested in the business”. Therefore, her application was rejected not because of she is a woman. The findings aligned with Buttner’s (1993) study that loan officers treated the entrepreneurs in comparable businesses similarly, and gender bias was rated as the least likely reason for rejection.

Table 6. Access to finance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Finance to grow the business</th>
<th>Participant 1</th>
<th>Participant 2</th>
<th>Participant 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Profit from business</td>
<td>Profit from business</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investor will through money at them with</td>
<td>Profit from the business</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family saving</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the success that they have  
Aid from friend  
Grant from University  
Loan from bank

| Problem in raising capital to grow the business? | No, good projected profit | No | No |

Previous studies (Brush, 1992; Gofee and Scase, 1985) suggest that household responsibility have an influence on business growth. This paper findings are in line with those studies’ findings. Table 7 illustrates that participant 1 and participant 2 experienced problem relating to the gender role/family conflict because they still have family/children to look after. On the contrary, participant 1 did not have this problem, she describes “they (her children) all left home and that why it has been successful, is because I don’t have any dependent anymore, but wouldn’t able to do this before when they were small”. One of the reasons why participant 2 did not want to grow the business now (although she had an aspiration to grow it) was because it was quite difficult for her as she needed to look after her family.

Another factor that affect them to grow the business is to find good/right staff. This was mentioned by all participants. Participant 3 revealed that “Getting to hire staffs who as passionate about selling the product is a challenge for me”. Participant 2 added that “it was difficult to find good staff” and participant 1 added that “we had staff who rip us off”.

As well as problem with finding staff, there are other factors that hinder the participants to grow the business. Participant 1 mentioned that she had problem with the kitchen equipment and other things, so she “needed to keep the money in bank to fund replacement”. She said “Unfortunately, we just spent £20,000 this week on a new boiler which is already broken down. So every time you get a little forward something will happen”. She added “We still paying out as much as we made since constantly updating and getting right”. Imitation was also a problem for participant 3, as other brewery start to imitate them, “People start to imitate us, fitting their bar with the same stool, the same with the bar top”.

Table 7. Other factors that affect the participants to grow the business

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender role/family conflict</th>
<th>No (do not have dependent children)</th>
<th>Yes (family to look after)</th>
<th>Yes (children to look after)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Other factors</td>
<td>Challenges with staff</td>
<td>Difficult to find good staff</td>
<td>Personnel: getting the right staff (who are passionate about selling the product)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Updating and getting right</td>
<td></td>
<td>Team building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Replacement to something broken</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>People start to imitate them</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8. Support from the government/other organisations when growing the business

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Support from government to grow the business</th>
<th>Participant 1</th>
<th>Participant 2</th>
<th>Participant 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No, but the council encourage them to take on another council building</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advice and information from any other organisations to grow the business</td>
<td>No, just business partners and staff</td>
<td>No, just staff and husband</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When asked “Did you obtain support from the government to grow your business?” All the participants stressed that they did not obtain support from the government. However, participant 1 said “the council is now trying to encourage us to take on another building because the council has seen our success”. In addition, she said “the council were very keen for women to be involved”. However, it was not clear there were particular supports for female entrepreneurs.

When asked “Have you sought advice and information from any other organisations to grow your business?” All participants did not obtain advice from other organisations. In fact, they all just talked to their business partners/staff/husband. Participant 1 said “No, just partners really. Really me, and my business partners”. Then we put certain member of our team”. Participant 2 mentioned “I talked with my staff and husband”. Sometimes she talked to her friend who has a hair salon in Manchester. But, she added “Yeah we talked sometimes, but we are quite busy, we talked on the phone sometimes”. This reflects that they prefer to obtain advice from people closed to them. This can be suggested that women have “strong tie” networks (Cromie and Birley, 1992; Starr and Yudkin, 1996). The disadvantages of a “strong tie” relationship are that it is more inward-looking, concentrating on mental rather than business support (Essers, 2002), and is characterised by emotional intensity, mutual confiding and intimacy (Carter et al, 2003). The high ratio of familial contact disadvantages women entrepreneurs and it will impact on the success of their businesses (Godwin et al., 2006) because kin ties are less likely to offer instrumental resources and unique information than non-kin ties (Fischer and Oliker, 1983; Moore, 1990). The ideal position for an entrepreneur is to be centrally embedded within a network of weak contacts (Aldrich, 1987; Granovetter, 1992).

### 6. Conclusions

This paper tries to investigate the aspiration of female entrepreneurs towards business growth, how they pursue the growth, and the factors that hinder their potential to grow.

The findings suggest that female entrepreneurs have aspiration to grow although the level of aspiration seems to be different. The ways how they pursue growth are also different, such as keep working hard, train the strong member of the staff, develop team building, and so on.

The paper also finds that there is mixed evidence regarding the relation of education and business growth, as the three participants have different type of education, but all of the three businesses have grown. In terms of work experience, the paper reveals that work experience have an impact on business growth.

The results of the relation between motivation and business growth is inconclusive due to the fact that the paper offers that both “push” and “pull” factors influence the business growth (or aspiration towards business growth).

In terms of finance, the findings identify that female entrepreneurs do not have problem in accessing finance to grow the business. However, gender role/house hold responsibility and finding the right staff creates problem for them to grow the business.

Although the female entrepreneurs did not obtain support from the government, it does not mean that there were not support for them. In addition, these female entrepreneurs seemed to have “strong tie” network.
Based on the findings the paper offers the following recommendations to the policy makers and other interested parties:

1. Training that is relevant to grow the business particularly for female entrepreneurs who do not have relevant education and work experience should be available.
2. Information regarding supports for female entrepreneurs should be easily accessed by female entrepreneurs.
3. Assist female entrepreneurs to join networks, particularly networks that offer access to increased information and opportunities for resources.

The limitations of the study are as follows. First, the study only focuses on small number of data. Secondly, convenience sampling technique was applied in the study. Third, the study only interviewed female entrepreneurs who own small business in the service industry in the UK. Therefore, the findings of the study cannot be generalised and larger samples are required.

References


Anon. (1997). Female entrepreneurs' different priorities (self-determination and personal growth rank above attaining wealth, according to a study by University of North Carolina researcher Holly Buttner). USA Today, 126, pp.1-3.


Institutional Context and Women’s Entrepreneurship
Fear of failure – advocate or bar to urgency-driven innovation?

Ulrike Guelich

BUSEM Bangkok University School of Entrepreneurship and Management, Bangkok
ulrike.guelich@gmail.com

Abstract

Studies on the impact of innovation for entrepreneurship indicate that innovation is important to foster businesses through new or improved services, products or processes. The ability to identify and to access opportunities is regarded as an important entrepreneurial capability for innovativeness. However, internal and external business pressures can also force an entrepreneur to innovate in order to survive. In addition to business pressures, the perceived fear of failure can turn the scale for good or bad, as it adds additional pressure. There is a gap in literature on the impact a perceived fear to fail has on innovativeness of entrepreneurs and which forces can drive innovation under business pressures. This study explores if fear of failure hinders or fosters innovativeness of entrepreneurs who are driven by urgencies in their businesses. Can entrepreneurial networks balance fear of failure and innovativeness in a crisis and are there gender-related differences?

The study findings suggest that gender-related differences exist how fear of failure impacts innovativeness of entrepreneurs in crisis business situations. Entrepreneurs of both genders who also experienced fear of failure showed that urgency situations influence their innovative behavior. Business pressures might lead to urgency-driven innovation for male entrepreneurs, irrelevant of existing network resources. In contrast, urgencies led to less innovativeness for women entrepreneurs. For women entrepreneurs only, entrepreneurial networks fostered innovativeness whereas family and friends were counter-productive. The findings highlight the importance of entrepreneurial networks for an innovative business approach in urgency-driven business situations, specifically for women entrepreneurs with their proportionally higher fear of failure rates.

Keywords: women entrepreneurs, innovativeness, fear of failure, urgency-driven innovation, innovation, business networks, Global Entrepreneurship Monitor

Introduction

Identification and access to opportunities is regarded as an important entrepreneurial capability for innovativeness (DeTienne & Chandler, 2007; Hanson & Blake, 2009; Shane & Venkataraman, 2000). Studies on the impact of innovation for entrepreneurship indicate that innovation is important to foster businesses through new or improved services, products or processes. According to Drucker (1985), entrepreneurship and innovation are profoundly entwined and overlap (Simmons et al, 2009). A crisis situation can be regarded as a time of increased uncertainty accompanied by ambiguity about what knowledge is needed for innovation. Anderson and Li (2014) argue that entrepreneurs and their entrepreneurial stakeholders are required to collaborate, connect and to combine their knowledge in order to produce innovation under internal and external business pressures. An uncertain business environment with access to dispersed knowledge can be a resource for entrepreneurial action (Dew et al., 2004). In addition to business forces, the perceived fear of failure can turn the scale for good or bad, as it adds additional pressure. Especially women entrepreneurs perceive higher fear of failure rates than men (Kelley, et al., 2013). Uncertainty is an important part in entrepreneurial theories (McMullen & Shepherd, 2006) and a crisis can be regarded as a time of increased uncertainty accompanied by ambiguity about which knowledge is needed for innovation.

There is a gap in literature on the impact a perceived fear to fail has on innovativeness of entrepreneurs and which forces can drive innovation under business pressures. This study explores if fear of failure hinders or fosters innovativeness of entrepreneurs who are driven by urgencies in their businesses and if their business networks can help to balance fear of failure and innovativeness in a crisis situation.
Innovation Capability

Entrepreneurship and innovation are closely linked and positively related (Miller & Friesen, 1982) and the innovation process is one important factor for firm performance and economic growth (Yu & Si, 2012). The capability to innovate relates to several fields of research in strategy and organization and classic management theories of firm and growth (Schumpeter, 1934). These theories introduce the importance to seek innovative use for existing resources to enable new ideas, processes and products. Rogers (2010) defines innovation capability as the outcome in the development of any new product, process or idea. Innovation has been discussed by various researchers by virtue of paired terms like Normann (1971) who defines it as “variation” and “reorientation”. “Variation” implies refinements in existing products, processes and ideas whereas “reorientation” implies fundamental changes. Knight (1967) and Nord and Tucker (1987) define innovation as “routine” and “non-routine” depending on innovation producing minor or major changes respectively in the products, processes or ideas.

Nochian and Schott (2012) constructed an organizational innovation confidence index in entrepreneurship from the same questions used by Levie (2008), however combined with a measurement for innovation by two questions: Do customers consider the product or service new and unfamiliar, and: are the technologies or procedures required for the product or service new? Their findings show that organizational confidence in innovation had a significant impact on an entrepreneur’s innovativeness. Entrepreneurs who are able to see and promote new products, services, technologies and in addition acknowledge their positive effect on the business will in series act more innovative (Nochian & Schott, 2012).

Gender differs in biology, psychology, behavior and an experience set, attached to being a male or female. Gender diversity may bring to an organization multiple skills, knowledge, perspectives, and backgrounds. The combination of different knowledge and skills, such as mathematics and interpersonal skills, leads to higher levels of creativity and innovation (Ali, Kulik, & Metz, 2011). In venture innovation or risk situations and strategies for new and established enterprises, where innovation is defined as creating a new, unique, and different product or service, no gender differences prevail (Sonfield et al, 2001). In almost all countries men are found to be more entrepreneurial than women. Specifically in lower income countries, more women than men pursue their businesses out to necessity, lack of employment or other income options. In addition, women tend to take a more conservative approach to start new businesses, requiring less start-up capital, using rather existing than newer technologies, and operate in well-known and well-served markets (Minniti & Nardone, 2007).

Fear of Failure

Fear of failure can be seen as a motive to avoid disappointment (Carsrud & Brännback, 2011) and is a perceptual variable in the decision process influencing an individual’s start-up decisions (Arenius & Minniti, 2005). It is closely related to uncertainty and risk-taking and therefore an important constraining factor for entrepreneurial activity, especially for start-ups (Calieito et al., 2009). In addition, fear of failure directly influences an individual’s motivation on his achievements and aspirations (Burnstein, 1963) and his decisions on if to exploit a business opportunity or not (Welpe et al., 2012).

An entrepreneur’s expectations about business failure act as incentive value—both for failure and for success. The fear to fail is perceived by self-evaluation and influences an individual’s orientation towards goal achievement (Heckhausen & Baltes, 1991). For entrepreneurs, failure is connected to emotions such as shame or embarrassment in dependence on the difficulty of the problem or task: easier problems tend to increase feelings of shame, and the greater the shame, the greater the incentives to avoid failure (Carsrud et al., 2009). The need to avoid failure due to cognitive dissonance (Cohen & Zimbardo, 1969) could explain why entrepreneurs often do anything to avoid business failure and why they show resilience and higher tenacity (Baum & Locke, 2004; Baum et al., 2001). From a gender perspective, women in general and specifically in Thailand experience higher fear of failure rates than their male counterparts and tend to be deterred from growing their businesses by their fear (Guelich, 2014; Kelley et al., 2013).

According to Deniz, Boz, and Ertosun (2011), fear is a strong emotion that can hinder progress toward goals’ achievement and thus impacts innovativeness in products, services and processes. Positive and negative emotions significantly decrease time and resource allocation of entrepreneurs to exploit new opportunities.
47

and to innovate (Grichnik, 2008). Moreover, feeling threatened by potential failure is one of the reasons for actual business failure (Brun de Pontet, 2004), leading to a behavior of avoidance and inaction, finally resulting in failure.

Urgency-driven innovation

While the prevalence of entrepreneurial intentions is a good predictor of future action, little is known about the link between intentions and actions (Bird & Schjoedt, 2009; Brännback, et al., 2007; Edelman, et al., 2010), specifically about the activator of subsequent action and under what conditions this evolves (Carsrud & Brännback, 2011). Previous theories suggest that an internal stimulus, such as hunger or fear, can drive actions of an individual who in series seeks a way to reduce the resulting tension. Psychological studies on cognitive dissonance focus on how individuals strive for consistency when they perform an action that contradicts existing beliefs or values or when they are confronted with situations that contradict their beliefs, values, and ideas. The resulting need for tension reduction thus represents the individual’s motivation (Festinger, 1962; Freud & Riviere, 1970; Murray, 1938).

Uncertainties in combination with fear of failure might trigger innovation, since the greater uncertainty is, the higher is the opportunity for innovativeness in entrepreneurs (York & Venkataraman, 2010). In this paper, we argue that the link between intentions and actions is the motivation stemming from an urgent external or internal business situation contradicting their personal fear of failure.

The role of business networks for information search and uncertainty reduction

Research in organizational learning suggests that organizational units can be more innovative if they utilize networks that provide access to new knowledge developed by other units (Tsai, 2001). An entrepreneur’s network connects to other stakeholders, people and organizations, thus complements their own personal resources (Aldrich & Martinez, 2001; Greve & Salaff, 2003). Entrepreneurs, especially small and medium-sized business owners, make use of their network resources by being in contact with other entrepreneurs, customers and even former employees as source of information (Chell & Baines, 2000; Sheehan, et al., 2013). Chell and Baines’ study on 104 entrepreneurs in the UK found that entrepreneurs actively use business-related networking in further channels such as chambers of commerce, who provided access to relatively diverse sources of information.

In Asian countries and in Thailand specifically, social networking in order to access resources is an important business success factor (Chittithaworn, et al., 2011). Informal channels tend to be more successful for knowledge transfer than official attempts of technology transfer resources (Belton, 2012). Networks of entrepreneurs change when constraints differ and firms strategically adapt their networks to receive access to resources and information which is relevant for their entrepreneurial progress and success (Greve & Salaff, 2003). Besides access to tangible resources like finance, entrepreneurial networks also provide access to intangible resources such as knowledge, advice and external skills, all of which add competency and thus reduce uncertainties for entrepreneurs which could help them overcome crisis situations in their businesses.

Gender affects the entrepreneur’s access to a network, its composition and effectiveness (Blake & Hanson, 2005). Both men and women use their networks for opportunity recognition, but differ significantly in the process itself. For both male and female entrepreneurs, entrepreneurial challenges and thus an entrepreneur’s network change through the phases of their “business life cycle”, for start-ups to running a new and later an established enterprise (DeTienne & Chandler, 2007). Women entrepreneurs tend to have a lower proportion of men in their networks and larger social networks than their male counterparts. No gender differences prevail in entrepreneurial networks’ density and proportion of kin, business relations, or proportion of emotional support relations (Klyver & Terjesen, 2007).

Methodology

Data were collected in the Adult Population Survey of the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor GEM survey 2015 in Thailand with a representative sample of 3,000 adults of the national population (age 18 to 64), thereof 1,134 entrepreneurs. The entrepreneurs were asked if there was a trend to develop any innovation in their business and if the innovation originated from certain types of business pressures. The 244 respondents who
affirmed the questions consisted of 127 male and 117 female entrepreneurs. Additional questions explored if they had undertaken innovation in the last three years, if they experienced fear of failure and if they asked for advice from network contacts.

The network questions follow the superior network classification of Kelley, Bosma, and Amorós (2011). Adopting the grouping of the network variables from Schott and Sedaghat (2014), the 18 possible advisors were split in the 2 variables “family & friends network” and “entrepreneurial network”. Family and friends consisted of spouse, parents, other family and friends, whereas the entrepreneurial network included a start-up, an experienced business owner, an accountant, a lawyer, a bank, a potential investor, a researcher, a public counselor, a collaborating firm, a competitor, a supplier, a customer, someone outside the country and someone from abroad.

Regression analysis was used to answer the questions
(1) if fear of failure hinders or fosters innovativeness of entrepreneurs who are driven by urgencies in their businesses,
(2) if business networks can balance fear of failure and innovativeness in a crisis, and
(3) if there are gender-related differences.

One dependent innovation variable was computed from the four questions, if the entrepreneur had—in the last three years- introduced new products or services to their customers, or implemented any new operational systems, e.g. new sales system, purchasing system, etc., or used new technology tools or machines, or improved their products and services.

Independent variables were a set of 17 different business pressures leading to innovation: the markets had changed dramatically; cut-throat competition in my industry; we lost sales because the customers stopped buying our products / services; we had to improve because the old way did not work well anymore; lack of money to replace outdated facilities / machinery; lack of money to invest, it forced me to do things differently without money; the banks demanded innovation and offered finance; threatening of the banks forced me to innovate; regulations forced me to innovate; changes in technology forced me to innovate; I had to innovate because I had losses; I had to innovate because I had no profitability; I had to innovate because I had little profitability; I had to innovate because I had not enough revenue; I had to innovate because I had too high costs; I had to innovate, because I could not afford the leap in investment for modernizing; and I had to innovate because I was close to insolvency. In addition, gender and the 2 network groups were added as independent variables.

Results and Discussion

The initial findings suggest that gender-related differences exist how fear of failure impacts innovativeness of entrepreneurs in urgency-driven business situations. For entrepreneurs, who did not experience fear of failure, the relation between urgencies or crisis situations and innovativeness was not significant. Significance was found for entrepreneurs of both genders who experienced fear of failure, affirming its influence on innovativeness. Table 1 displays that significance is found for few of the various urgency situations, different for female and for male entrepreneurs. On average, business pressures tend to lead to urgency-driven innovation for male entrepreneurs, however irrelevant of any network resources. In contrast, urgent pressures were counter-productive to innovativeness for women entrepreneurs.

Table 1: Regression analysis: The influence of urgency business situations and networks on entrepreneurs who fear to fail and their innovativeness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>female</th>
<th></th>
<th>male</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Network family and friends</td>
<td>-.480</td>
<td>.033</td>
<td>-.318</td>
<td>.145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Network business</td>
<td>.447</td>
<td>.014</td>
<td>.218</td>
<td>.163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased competitive pressure</td>
<td>-.515</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>-.639</td>
<td>.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The markets had changed dramatically</td>
<td>-.432</td>
<td>.063</td>
<td>1.020</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cut-throat competition in my industry</td>
<td>-.011</td>
<td>.932</td>
<td>.122</td>
<td>.356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We lost sales because the customers stopped buying our products / services</td>
<td>-.099</td>
<td>.454</td>
<td>-.077</td>
<td>.568</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We had to improve because the old way did not work well anymore</td>
<td>.072</td>
<td>.632</td>
<td>.459</td>
<td>.007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of money to replace outdated facilities / machinery</td>
<td>-.331</td>
<td>.045</td>
<td>-.046</td>
<td>.785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of money to invest, it forced me to do things differently without money</td>
<td>.165</td>
<td>.281</td>
<td>-.014</td>
<td>.930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The banks demanded innovation and offered finance</td>
<td>.049</td>
<td>.770</td>
<td>-.342</td>
<td>.047</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threatening of the banks forced me to innovate</td>
<td>-.063</td>
<td>.715</td>
<td>-.163</td>
<td>.332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulations forced me to innovate</td>
<td>.032</td>
<td>.856</td>
<td>-.045</td>
<td>.762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes in technology forced me to innovate</td>
<td>.015</td>
<td>.938</td>
<td>.105</td>
<td>.515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I had to innovate because I had losses</td>
<td>-.152</td>
<td>.561</td>
<td>-.030</td>
<td>.938</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I had to innovate because I had no profitability</td>
<td>.119</td>
<td>.638</td>
<td>-.246</td>
<td>.629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>had to innovate because I had little profitability</td>
<td>.149</td>
<td>.366</td>
<td>-.217</td>
<td>.107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I had to innovate because I had not enough revenue</td>
<td>.062</td>
<td>.749</td>
<td>.144</td>
<td>.308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I had to innovate because I had too high costs</td>
<td>-.169</td>
<td>.346</td>
<td>.089</td>
<td>.565</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I had to innovate, because I could not afford the leap in investment for modernizing</td>
<td>.161</td>
<td>.473</td>
<td>-.289</td>
<td>.125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I had to innovate because I was close to insolvency</td>
<td>.371</td>
<td>.145</td>
<td>-.189</td>
<td>.331</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For both genders innovativeness decreased under “competitive pressures”, slightly more for men (-.639/.003), than for women (-.525/.003), in addition for women under “lack of money to replace outdated facilities” (-.331/.045), and for men when “banks demanded innovation and offered finance” (.342/.047). However, men were able to reverse and counteract the effect, leading to urgency-driven innovation when “the old way did not work well anymore” (.459/.007) and especially when the “markets had changed dramatically” (1.020/.001).

Networks could foster innovativeness only for women entrepreneurs, where business networks had a positive effect on innovation (.447/.014), whereas a network of family and friends was counter-productive to innovation (.480/.033).

**Conclusion and Implications**

Fear of failure is advocate to urgency-driven innovation for male entrepreneurs in certain business situations, whereas it is bar to two others for men. On the other hand, fear to fail prevents women entrepreneurs to become innovative. Our findings highlight the importance of business networks for an innovative business.
approach, specifically for women entrepreneurs with their higher fear of failure rate compared to their male counterparts. However, we cannot confirm Dew et al (2004) that an uncertain business environment with access to dispersed knowledge can be a resource for entrepreneurial action, since – despite a positive relation of business networks to innovation for females – the uncertain business environment is negatively related to their innovativeness. Similarly, Anderson and Li (2014), who argue that entrepreneurs and their entrepreneurial stakeholders are required to collaborate, connect and to combine their knowledge in order to produce innovation under internal and external business pressures, are not supported with findings in this study. Our results also contradict findings of Chittithaworn et al (2011) for Thailand that a social and informal network, such as family and friends, might be a business success factor. In a crisis situation, male entrepreneurs are not impacted by their social networks and for women entrepreneurs in Thailand they rather achieve the opposite outcome and can even be toxic for their innovativeness. The findings in this study support Deniz et al. (2011), that fear is a strong emotion that can hinder progress toward goals’ achievement and thus impacts and even counteracts innovativeness in products, services and processes, more relevant for women than for men.

Our argument, that the link to positive action is the motivation deriving from an urgent external or internal business situation proved relevant only for male entrepreneurs who were able to innovate despite their personal fear of failure, confirming York and Venkataraman (2010), that uncertainties in combination with fear of failure might trigger innovation. The relatively high fear of failure rate for male entrepreneurs in our sample might contribute to a gender-specific opportunity for innovativeness, since this is not the case for women entrepreneurs. A similar result is prevalent for the reasoning that entrepreneurs often do anything to avoid business failure and show resilience and higher tenacity (Baum & Locke, 2004; Baum, et al., 2001), however again only for male entrepreneurs.

Limitations of this study are the relatively small sample size for the different urgency-driven business situations, since not every entrepreneur had similar experiences and the specific country context which could have an influence on behavioral patterns. However, as a first indicator our findings give directions for future research. If business networks are positively related to women entrepreneurs’ innovation – what specifically is needed to counteract their un-innovative behavioral pattern in urgency-driven business situations? There are gaps in literature on which urgent and uncertain business situations might be able to trigger innovation as there are gaps in gender-specific research in crisis situations which might be worth further being explored. Crisis and urgency-driven situations in business are perceived on a personal level and many more influencing factors might contribute to a stronger or a less strong innovative behavior.

References


The Role of Women’s Economic Empowerment in Thailand’s Special Economic Zone (SEZ)

Paweena Leetrakun25
Siripan Jeenaboornrueang26

Abstract

Principal Topic: Women play a significant role in driving Thailand’s economic growth and the establishment of special economic zone (SEZ) brings challenge to the country’s economy as well. The purposes of the paper are: 1 (to analyze the working situation of women in the labor market in SEZ and 2 (to analyze the factors affecting female entrepreneurs).

Method: Literature reviews and conceptual framework were from the concept of entrepreneurship and theory of the allocation of time. The primary data used in this study was collected by using in-depth interview. Secondary data was the statistical of women entrepreneurs conducted by the National Statistical Office of Thailand.

Results and Implications: The findings indicated that women worked predominantly in the informal sector. However, the number of female entrepreneurs was about 30.84 percent of work force in 2016. Additionally, the results showed that factor of households is the major factor affecting female entrepreneurs. Moreover, the pull factors such as the need for independence, self-achievement and self-employed were the motivation for starting the business. Besides, being women does not affect the entrepreneurship in Special Economic Zone. On the other hand, there were advantages of being women such as meticulous, flexible and responsible, which lead to their success. The result of the study showed that the participation rate of women labor force in SEZ was still low. Therefore, the policy makers should support more women to enter the labor market.

Introduction

According to The United Nations goals called Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and government strategies to develop their countries’ sustainable economy, there was a very important indicator for the development which is the equality of men and women in education, economies, social and politics (Kulksrni, 2013). In supporting women’s role especially economic opportunity, will affect the sustainable development and decrease poverty. Therefore, both the developing and developed countries see the importance of providing opportunities to women to access services that support women in the labor force. At the same time, taking care more of women’s family by sharing duties between men and women to open up the opportunity for women to enter the labor force (The OECD DAC Network on Gender Equality: GENDERNET, 2012).

One of the most important policy in the developing countries is setting up the Special Economic Zone, which its objective is to increase investment both in the countries and abroad. Such policy increases an economic opportunity of the countries, rate of employment both skilled and unskilled labors including the start of new businesses and new entrepreneurs, which will result in the development of economy in the nearby community and also the development of the countries’ economy (Tripopsalul, 2015a). For women who live in the Special Economic Zone, will have opportunities to work and it also open up chance for women to work in the formal sector (Aggarwal, 2007) with the government welfare provided and a chance for women entrepreneurs in the Special Economic Zone as well (Kulksrni, 2013). According to the study of GENDERNET (2012), it took survey from registered small and medium enterprises all over the world and found out that the number of women who run their own businesses was at 38 percent. The number of women entrepreneurs in the small and medium enterprises in Asia, Latin America and Africa increase rapidly which result directly in increasing rate of employment and decreasing the poverty.

Table 1: Gross Provincial Product in Chiang Rai Province (Reference Year = 2002)

---

25 Faculty of Management Sciences, Chiang Rai Rajaphat University, Chiang Rai, Thailand; corresponding author: e-mail: Paweena.lee@gmail.com
26 Faculty of Management Sciences, Chiang Rai Rajaphat University, Chiang Rai, Thailand
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>10,036</td>
<td>10,073</td>
<td>10,136</td>
<td>10,498</td>
<td>11,116</td>
<td>12,320</td>
<td>12,275</td>
<td>12,592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>2,237</td>
<td>2,643</td>
<td>2,549</td>
<td>2,425</td>
<td>2,555</td>
<td>2,619</td>
<td>2,669</td>
<td>2,672</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade Sector and related*</td>
<td>18,500</td>
<td>18,274</td>
<td>18,779</td>
<td>19,251</td>
<td>20,344</td>
<td>22,300</td>
<td>24,908</td>
<td>24,294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Sectors</td>
<td>12,171</td>
<td>12,661</td>
<td>13,188</td>
<td>13,900</td>
<td>14,911</td>
<td>16,236</td>
<td>16,010</td>
<td>15,395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gross provincial product (sum up)</td>
<td>40,707</td>
<td>41,008</td>
<td>42,103</td>
<td>43,649</td>
<td>46,371</td>
<td>50,856</td>
<td>53,193</td>
<td>52,281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gross provincial product (CVMs)</td>
<td>40,462</td>
<td>40,944</td>
<td>41,909</td>
<td>43,368</td>
<td>45,996</td>
<td>50,646</td>
<td>52,215</td>
<td>52,210</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Trade Sector and related = Total of GPP in Construction sector + Wholesale and retail trade; repair of motor vehicles, motorcycles and personal and household goods sector + Hotels and restaurants sector+ Transport, storage and communications sector + Financial intermediation sector + Real estate, renting and business activities sector

Source: Calculated by the author using Gross Provincial Product in Chiang Rai Province from 2007-2014

According to continuing development of the border trade development policy to the Special Economic Zone policy in 2015, the Special Economic Zone has been set up.

There are three districts in Chiang Rai that was selected to be a Special Economic Zone, which are Chiang Khong, Chiang Saen and Mae Sai. As data shown in table 1 Gross Provincial Product of Chiang Rai in 2007 – 2014, found that trade sector and related sector such as construction, real estate, hotel and restaurant has increased compare to agriculture, manufacturing and other sectors. As a result, Chiang Rai as a Special Economic Zone has benefited very much from the investment. Therefore, the development of SEZ can increase economy’s opportunities for women, this will lead to economic sustainable development.

This research is to study the roles of women working in Chiang Rai Special Economic Zone which conform to the policy of creating entrepreneurs. The researchers studied factors influencing women to become entrepreneurs and obstacles of women entrepreneurs and to find guidelines to support women in the Special Economic Zone.

Literature reviews and Theoretical Framework

According to the literature review, Krainara, C. and Routry J. (2015) mentioned the theory of international trade of David Ricardo that the countries have to consider of comparative advantage of export goods. The concept of international trade has been developed continuously and become country’s economic integration which divided into six categories; trading area, the free-trade area, the customs union, the common market, economic and monetary union and economic integration (Carbaung, 2009) to create trade cooperation and investment in the region. The Special Economic Zone policy of Thailand developed from such concept. The development of SEZ leads to direct and indirect employment, which helps open up an opportunity for women (Narang, 2015). Although the SEZ policy provides opportunities for women to work, however, the decision of women to work can be explained by theory of the allocation of time (Gary Becker, 1965) which explain the motivation of women to choose between work and family. The theory can be summarized that making decision to work depends on opportunity cost of women or reservation wage. If hiring rate is higher than reservation wage, women will decide to work. Besides, Bojar (2016) mentioned that the decision to enter the labor force is because the hiring rate is higher than reservation rate, so it attracts women to enter the labor force and cause the higher participation rate of women in the labor force. Whether or not the number of working hour increase depends on the income effect and substitution effect. If women want to take care of the family, has more children, want to go for vacation or have more extra income, this will result in the change of women labor supply too.

Moreover, this study used the concept of motivation of becoming entrepreneurs as a conceptual framework to find out factors affecting women entrepreneurs in SEZ. Triopsakul (2015) stated that the concept of Wikland and Shepherd (2003) concerning the motivation of becoming entrepreneurs consist of push motivation, which means necessity in doing business and pull motivation, which means chance of doing business. Therefore, this paper has brought up the ideas of economic and concept of motivation of entrepreneurs to analyze the role of women in labor force and factors influence entrepreneurs in SEZ.
Methodology and Data

This study was a mixed method using qualitative and quantitative analysis by analyze of women’s role in Chiang Rai Special Economic Zone in 2016. The data from the National Statistical Office of Thailand has been used to analyzed the employment rate of SEZ in Thailand. Chiang Rai was used as a sample of this study. Descriptive statistics was used to analyzed data. Twenty people were in-depth interviewed to find answer for factors influence women entrepreneurship in Chiang Rai Special Economic Zone and content analysis was used to analyze qualitative data.

Empirical Results

Role of women in labor Force in SEZ Chiang Rai

Result of the study showed the participation rate of male and female in Chiang Rai in the last ten years, though the continue development of economic in Chiang Rai was developed from border trade to SEZ and the development of potential area for tourism. The change of women participation rate in labor force in the past ten years was 20 percent less than men. According to 2016 data, female labor force participation rate in Chiang Rai was at 58.45 percent, which lower than female labor force participation rate of the whole country which showed 60.61 percent at 2016 while male labor force participation rate was close to male labor force participation rate of the country in 2016 about 77 percent.

![Labor force participation rate of population aged 15+ years in Chiang Rai, overall and by sex](image)

Source: Calculated by the author using labor force surveys from 2007-2016

When consider male and female labor force participation rate in Chiang Rai according to age, picture 2 showed that age between 15-24 has low rate of participation because of school age. Age between 25-54, the rate of participation was higher because they were already graduate and at the same time they have not yet consider of retirement, which Steinberg and Nakane (2012) called them prime-age, the most efficient in labor force.
According to figure 2, the participation rate of male labor force was higher than female labor force in all ages and female participation rate was at the highest rate at age between 40-49. This happened because they have no burden taking care of children so they can participate more in the labor force.

If analyzing the employment status of male and female in Chiang Rai in 2016, it showed that the proportion of employees working in the informal sector was high both female and male at 77.24 percent and 70.50 percent respectively. Female and male working in the formal sector was at 21.54 percent and 25.68 percent respectively. The proportion of female and male employers was only at 1.22 percent and 3.82 percent (shown in Table 2).
In this study defined entrepreneurs as employers and own-account workers. If consider the proportion of entrepreneurs in Chiang Rai, it showed that the proportion of male entrepreneurs was high equal to 57.48 percent of total male labor force while female entrepreneurs was equal to 30.48 percent of total female labor force. Besides, proportion of male in labor force was slightly higher than female. If considered wage of labor force, it showed that average wage of female in formal sector was higher than male. Female received average wage at 10,711.60 Bath while male received average wage at 10,634.43 Baht. However, there were nearly 50 percent of female worked in informal sector which most of them were unpaid family workers (table 3).

Table 3: Formal sector, Informal sector worker and Entrepreneurs in Chiang Rai Province by sex, 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Entrepreneurs*</th>
<th>Formal sector</th>
<th>Informal sector**</th>
<th>Mean Wage in formal sector (Bath per month)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>57.48</td>
<td>25.68</td>
<td>16.84</td>
<td>10,634.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>30.84</td>
<td>21.54</td>
<td>47.62</td>
<td>10,711.60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: *Entrepreneurs, which accounts for employer and own-account workers  ** Informal sector consisting of unpaid family workers and Group  
Source: Calculated by the author using labor force surveys for 2016

Considering educational level which reflects the efficiency of labor force, it showed that most of female and male entrepreneurs were less educated. However, the proportion of female entrepreneurs had bachelor degree more than male. In 2016, female entrepreneurs who graduated bachelor degree or higher was equal to 5.77 percent while male entrepreneurs was equal to 3.5 percent. Moreover, the proportion of female who worked in formal sector held bachelor degree two times more than male.

If classify by occupation of female and male in Chiang Rai to see the relations of occupation and trading which were the main occupation in SEZ. The result in Table 5 showed that most of female in Chiang Rai are skilled agricultural and fishery workers. The trend of such occupation is lower continuously while female working in trading such as service workers and shop and market sales workers and craft and related trades workers have higher proportion. Furthermore, the proportion of female in Chiang Rai working as white-collar workers such as legislators senior officials and managers, technicians and associate professionals had higher proportion.

Table 5 : Percentage of Distribution of Female Employment by Occupation , 2011-2016
The participation rate of female labor force in Chiang Rai was low compared to the participation rate of male labor force in the province and compared to the participation rate of labor force of the country. If classified by employment status, found that the proportion of male in Chiang Rai mostly work as skilled agricultural and fishery workers which equal to 49.68 percent in 2016 while male who work as service workers and shop and market sales workers were increase but less than female (Table 6).

Table 6: Percentage of Distribution of Female Employment by Occupation, 2011-2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>White-Collar Workers</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Legislators senior officials and managers</td>
<td>6.04</td>
<td>4.01</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>3.27</td>
<td>3.53</td>
<td>2.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Professionals</td>
<td>2.46</td>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>2.21</td>
<td>2.13</td>
<td>2.29</td>
<td>2.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>White-Collar low-skilled workers</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Technicians and associate professionals</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>1.95</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>2.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Clerks</td>
<td>2.52</td>
<td>2.01</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>1.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Blue-collar workers</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Skilled agricultural and fishery workers</td>
<td>43.62</td>
<td>40.31</td>
<td>46.07</td>
<td>50.4</td>
<td>50.52</td>
<td>49.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Craft and related trades workers</td>
<td>17.68</td>
<td>17.47</td>
<td>19.18</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>15.32</td>
<td>15.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Other</td>
<td>16.62</td>
<td>17.6</td>
<td>16.4</td>
<td>16.33</td>
<td>14.13</td>
<td>14.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Calculated by the author using labor force surveys from 2011-2016

For the proportion of male in Chiang Rai classified by occupation found that male in Chiang Rai mostly work as skilled agricultural and fishery workers which equal to 49.68 percent in 2016 while male who work as service workers and shop and market sales workers were increase but less than female (Table 6).

Factors affecting women entrepreneurship in Special Economic Zone

From the in-depth interviewed of women entrepreneurs in SEZ, found that factors that cause them to become women entrepreneurs in SEZ were necessity in taking care of family, self-employed and inherit family business. Furthermore, there were pull factors influence them to become entrepreneurs are business opportunity and expansion of the city as Chiang Rai is set to be SEZ including cost of land, needs for freedom and want to be their own boss. Besides, the result of the study showed that the benefit arising from running business in SEZ were direct benefits that provided by government while indirect benefit was investors from other areas will better the overview of economic.

Conclusions and Recommendations

According to the study of women’s role in SEZ which used Chiang Rai as a sample of SEZ. This research used the qualitative and quantitative analysis. The result of the study showed the participation rate of female labor force in Chiang Rai was low compared to participation rate of male labor force in the province and compare to the participation rate of labor force of the country. If classified by employment status, found that the participation rate of female labor force was equal to 30.48 percent from all female labor force while the proportion of male entrepreneurs was 2 times greater than female labor force. The participation rate of male
labor force was slightly higher than female. If consider by the average wage, it showed that female working in formal section receive higher wage than male. Hung, M. N., Hhung, N.T and Tuan B.Q. (2011) stated that the SEZ and border trade policies effect in female higher rate of wage. However, there was nearly 50 percent of female working in informal sector. Most of them were unpaid family workers, therefore, the policy makers should focus on providing welfare for female in such sector. When considering by occupation of female in SEZ, found that in the last 5 years the proportion of female in trade occupation was increased gradually. This showed the possibility of entering the labor force of women in SEZ, which conform with the qualitative data that being female was not an obstacle in running business because women are equal to men in mostly every way. Hence, the increase of Thai entrepreneurs, the difference in sex will not be an obstacle for the development (Tripopsakul, S.; 2015)

Factors affecting women entrepreneurs in Chiang Rai SEZ were time for taking care families which conform with the study of Leetrakun, P., Permpoomwiwant, C. and Suwanrada, W (2015) which stated that women want balance between work and family so they quit their jobs and become business owners. Besides, there were pull factors influence them to become entrepreneurs were opportunity and expansion of the city as Chiang Rai is set to be SEZ including cost of land, needs for freedom and want to be their own boss which conform to Tripopsakul, S. (2015a). Chiang Rai as being set up as SEZ, opens up an opportunity for female labor force. However, the participation rate of labor force was low while the participation rate of educated female labor force was higher than male. This reflects that female was quality labor out of the labor force. Policy makers should have measures to support women to enter labor force such as privilege for women to enter new business and provide training about business operation and etc.

References


The OECD DAC Network on Gender Equality.2012.Women’s Economic Empowerment. Poverty reduction and pro-poor growth the role of empowerment. OECD


Challenges to Women’s Entrepreneurial Performance:  
A cross-country comparison in the Arab region

Dr. Beverley McNally  
Prince Mohammad Bin Fahd University  
Saudi Arabia  
bmcnally@pmu.edu.sa

Dr. Grace Khoury  
Birzeit University  
Palestine  
gkhoury@birzeit.edu

Abstract

Purpose: This research explores the features within the context of two Arab countries that support or constrain successful female entrepreneurship. Situated in Palestine and Saudi Arabia, the paper identifies the critical success factors deemed necessary to support entrepreneurial success and to overcome the challenges confronting entrepreneurial endeavors. In doing so the aim is to negate the myth of female entrepreneurship underperformance in Arab countries.

Design/Methodology/ Approach: The study utilized a qualitative and comparative methodology. Data collection involved holding in-depth interviews and focus groups with those directly involved in female entrepreneurship. Content and thematic analysis, employing an interpretive inductive approach, was used to analyze the data.

Findings: The findings disclosed that while there were barriers and challenges within the entrepreneurs’ context, many of these applied equally to men as to women. Nevertheless, there were a set of challenges explicitly confronting female entrepreneurs. However, family support, experience, higher education qualifications and skills, were critical if female entrepreneurs were to be successful in overcoming the identified challenges.

Practical Implications: Governments and organizations in the MENA region can gain insight into the critical success factors required to overcome the barriers and challenges confronting entrepreneurial endeavors.

Originality/ Value: The research is some of the first of its kind providing a diversified context-based approach to the study of female entrepreneurship in challenging socio/cultural and political transitioning environments.

Keywords: female entrepreneurship, institutional structures, cultural values, context, entrepreneurial success

Introduction

The aim of this conference paper is to report on the initial results of an exploratory study examining the contributing factors and the key challenges confronting successful women entrepreneurs in two different Arab countries; Palestine and Saudi Arabia. In doing so the authors aim to progress beyond the role of gender to examine the macro level factors that may influence successful entrepreneurial activity. This is in contrast to prior work that has tended to take an individual-centric approach at a micro-level as mentioned by (Jamali, 2008).
When commencing this endeavor the authors found that there was a view that all Arab women are the same and the same policies and approaches can be employed across the Middle East/North African (MENA) region. Yet, each country has different historical and cultural traditions – all contributing to a diversity of institutional and social contexts. Thereby, making this an invalid assumption. Moreover, as Jamali (2008) noted, much of the entrepreneurial research ignores the mediating role of context in women’s entrepreneurship. This has led to a myth of female entrepreneurial underperformance ‘in a context of masculine normativity’(Marlow & McAdam, 2012, p. 114). For the purposes of this study, context was defined as a temporal construct in that is bound by time and place (Al-Rasheed, 2015). Given that women’s entrepreneurial activity is deeply embedded in the structural characteristics of the country in which it was situated, it is important that entrepreneurship is interpreted according to that context (Welter, Smallbone, Aculai, Isakova, & Schakirova, 2003) as cited in Jamali (2008). As such the influence of context must be acknowledged in order to better understand entrepreneurs’ behavior and success (Pathak, Goltz, & Buche, 2013; Shane & Venkataraman, 2000). Consequently, the following research questions were formulated:

1. What are the critical influences that have allowed women entrepreneurs in Saudi Arabia and Palestine to overcome the challenges imposed by their respective contexts?
2. What are the commonalities and differences in the context that support successful female entrepreneurship in both countries?

Contextual background and Literature Review

Within the realms of institutional and cultural values theories, entrepreneurship is deemed to be the result of the relationship between the individual attributes and the local context (Solesvik, Westhead, & Matlay, 2014). Therefore, any examination of female entrepreneurship must include consideration of institutional structures and cultural values within the environment in which it is situated. Specifically how female entrepreneurship is influenced by the norms, values and principles of the social context and the priority ascribed to the employment of women (Welter, 2004). Within Arab societies a women’s role is defined in a traditional sense in that it connected to household, care giving and family responsibilities (Jamali, 2008). These social values have an influence on women’s attitudes, intentions and self-perceptions with respect to their career choices (Krueger, Reilly, & Carsrud, 2000). Consequently, as identified by Arenius and Minniti (2005) positive self-perception, strong self-efficacy and confidence would contribute to successful entrepreneurial activity. However, there has been limited empirical research that uncovers the motivational processes that are the catalyst for individual success at a micro level in Arab countries. Explicitly, entrepreneurial activity occurring in less than favorable conditions (Bullough, Renko, & Myatt, 2014). Nevertheless, successful entrepreneurship is not only an outcome of individual characteristics, it is also an outcome of a supportive and vibrant social context at the macro level (Jamali, 2008). Consequently, there is a need for more research to identify these factors and the interplay between them on entrepreneurial behavior and success (Pathak et al., 2013; Shane & Venkataraman, 2000) especially in highly challenging environments.

Both Saudi Arabia and Palestine are what could be considered high-conflict, transitioning societies. Transitioning societies are engaged in the management of planned change (Levy, 1986) as cited in
Sparkman (2015). Palestine is deemed to be a transitioning society as it is moving from a high dependency on international aid to one of development and self-reliance (Paprock, 2006). Whereas, Saudi Arabia is transitioning from a high dependence on expatriate labour to a society reliant on its own people to make up the majority of the workforce. As transitioning societies both countries face challenges in achieving their strategic goals. According to the World-Bank (2016) Saudi Arabia sits at 82 of a 189 countries on the world rankings for the ease of doing business, whereas, Palestine ranks at 129th place on the same table. Furthermore, Saudi Arabia ranks at 130 for the ease of facilitating new business ventures while Palestine ranks at 170 out of the 189 countries. Consequently, it can be deemed to be more difficult to engage in entrepreneurial activity in Palestine than in Saudi Arabia. As highlighted by the World-Bank (2016) Palestine and Saudi Arabia are among the lowest ranked countries with respect to the participation of women in entrepreneurial activities (Abddullah & Hattawry, 2014; Yousuf, Helen, & Smith, 2012). Yet, both countries have successful women entrepreneurs who have succeeded in non-traditional ventures (Elmuti, Khoury, & Omran, 2012). Hitherto, the empirical literature examining the motivators, education, training and learning experiences is sparse (Elmuti et al., 2012). It is recognized that targeted education and training does help women develop the critical knowledge, skills and abilities (KSA’s) for successful business activity. However there is minimal empirical literature investigating how the specialist attributes required of these women for successful entrepreneurial activity, for example, personality, risk taking and perseverance, are gained (Elmuti, Khoury, & Abdul-Rahim, 2011). More importantly, the role of the context or entrepreneurial environment within which female entrepreneurs operate is under researched within the MENA region (Yousafzai, Saeed, & Muffatto, 2015). Therefore, as suggested by Ahl (2006) and (Sheriff & Muffatto, 2015) entrepreneurial research in the future should focus on context. Sheriff and Muffatto (2015) go on to state that cross-country comparisons show dissimilarities in national entrepreneurship environments which accounts for the differences in entrepreneurial economic growth. Both Palestine and Saudi Arabia have varied institutional and cultural factors working to enhance or inhibit women’s entrepreneurial activity.

Methodology
A qualitative research design was selected as it is appropriate for inductive studies dealing where the majority of the analysis is interpretative. Specifically, in studies examining peoples’ lived experiences, behaviors, emotions, feelings, organizational functioning and cultural phenomena (Bhattacherjee, 2012; Charmaz, 2003). Purposive sampling was used initially to build the sample. Purposive sampling is a non-probability sampling technique that involves the selection of participants according to the sample members’ possession of an appropriate characteristic (Zikmund, 2000). Thus, female entrepreneurs who were involved in managing their own business and who were perceived as successful by fellow industry professionals were approached. To further expand the sample snowball sampling was used in both countries. Snowball sampling allows the interviewees to suggest sample members who possess characteristics that are of interest to the research study (Biernacki & Waldorf, 1981). The use of this form of sampling in conjunction with the purposive sampling ameliorated some of the concerns expressed by Biernacki and Waldorf (1981) regarding the initiation of the sample gathering process and the tendency for snowball sampling to limit the diversity of samples and the generalization of the findings. The researchers returned to the purposive sample members
when there was a need to extend the sample gathering process. This resulted in a sample of seven women in Saudi Arabia and nine in Palestine.

Both primary and secondary data were collected. Primary data comprised semi-structured interviews of approximately 1-1.5 hours. A focus group was conducted in Saudi Arabia with three people who were directly involved in supporting entrepreneurial venture start-ups. Because of the limited amount of primary empirical research in the field, secondary data was an important part of the research process. This was captured through the thematic analysis of the empirical literature, government reports and publications, published case studies, web pages and personal conversations. The secondary data was analysed concurrently with the collection of the primary data. The findings from the secondary data analysis were used to develop questions for future primary data collection.

Content and thematic analysis was used for the purpose of analyzing the qualitative data. The aim was to identify the common themes within the sources of data. Thematic analysis involves the researcher identifying analyzing and reporting patterns (themes) within data (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Braun and Clarke (2006) go on to state, a theme captures something important about the data in relation to the research question and represents patterns of response on the part of the research participants. The concurrent data collection and analysis followed the six-steps recommended by Braun and Clarke (2006). These are: familiarization with the data, the generation of initial codes, searching of themes, reviewing of themes, defining and naming of themes and producing the report. The thematic analysis identified the following themes, family support, education and experience which contribute to motivation and self-esteem at the individual micro level. At a macro level the themes were political/government and economic, legal, social and cultural, and access to venture capital. These are now discussed in turn:

**Findings and discussion**

The findings showed that many of the challenges identified in this study were not exclusively restricted to women. Men were also impacted by these challenges, in particular the political and economic challenges. However there were barriers associated with patriarchal contexts that directly impacted on women, for which unique solutions have to be found.

**Micro-level factors**

Similar motivators were identified in both Saudi Arabia and Palestine for women to enter the entrepreneurial field. The consensus was that there were two main reasons why women decided to commence an entrepreneurial style business. First the ability to provide financial security for themselves and their children which highlights push or necessity factors. The second to enable women to fulfill their personal growth needs which indicates pull or opportunity factors (Jones & Lefort, 2014). As new areas of business are opening up to women the drive to achieve in these new endeavors leads to high levels of self-esteem and satisfaction increasing the motivation to succeed. There was also evidence of an element of social class influencing the entrée into entrepreneurship. The women who had the opportunity to engage in higher education and training and/or had travelled gaining exposure to other cultures were more likely to have a higher awareness of the opportunities for women. Those who received strong family support, for example a family role model, or
support from father or husband, were also more likely engage in entrepreneurial activities. This supports the assertion of Verheul, Stel, and Thurik (2006) who suggested that one of the most constant positive influences on entrepreneurship was a supportive family.

Almost half of the Palestinian interviewees mentioned the difficulty of work/life balance and its effect on them. Female entrepreneurs mentioned how stereotypes predominate of women as secretaries and housewives while they consider themselves handling major business and household financial responsibilities which require support from close family members. Similarly, in Saudi Arabia, there were challenges imposed by the work/life balance. The focus group spoke of international entrepreneurial forums where the work/life balance issue was also identified – so it was not an exclusively Saudi or Palestinian phenomenon. However, there was an acknowledgement that in Saudi with the tribal and family obligations there was an increased pressure on women and high levels of guilt were evident about the supposed neglecting of family responsibilities in preference to work responsibilities. Again the issue of social class emerged. If the woman was from a more affluent family or tribal group then it was possible for domestic help to be engaged. However, this did not dissipate the guilt these women felt. This is particularly so if the woman was engaged in a more non-traditional field. There is also a lack of perception as to what is an appropriate career for Saudi women. An appropriate career for women is perceived as being in an office behind a desk, for example, a bank or a business administration role. Not as an entrepreneur. This is in contrast to the study of Danish and Lawton-Smith (2012) which found that entrepreneurship was an attractive career option for women. This is one area where further investigation is required in Saudi Arabia about what is or is not an appropriate career choice for women.

The micro level factors identified in this study supported the findings of Danish and Lawton-Smith (2012) who found that women were very pragmatic in seeking out areas of economic activity. While the Danish and Lawton-Smith (2012) study was situated in Saudi Arabia, similar behaviors were evident in the Palestinian sample.

Macro-level factors

Political

The political situation within the two countries was significantly different. As a high-conflict, high risk region, entrepreneurial activity in Palestine, was particularly adversely affected. The political situation discouraged investors and restricted movement especially in times of heightened security. When combined with patriarchal social norms the political situation does create an extra set of challenges for women such as restrictions on movement of people and goods and the associated risks. This included delay in receiving raw materials, entry visas for international experts, difficulty in selling products, working late hours and the ability to move from one location to another. Whereas the political situation in Saudi Arabia was perceived as being more supportive of entrepreneurship. The initiatives being introduced as part of the Vision 2030 program signal that this will continue to improve as one of the main thrusts is to move away from Saudi’s reliance on oil revenue. Thus, placing a greater emphasis on the development of a vibrant private sector, including entrepreneurial endeavors (Vision-2030, 2016).
Government and economic support

The majority of the issues arising in this theme impacted primarily on Palestine. In Palestine it was considered important to provide economic support for women’s entrepreneurial initiatives. This would ensure that Palestinian women were able to enter the business sector and support the creation of jobs. However, much of the funding in Palestine is dependent on donor funding from aid agencies. Although having programs to provide finance for women to establish small businesses was an objective of the Ministry of Women’s Affairs and emphasized in the Palestinian Government plan of 2009, these programs also depend on donors (Masharqa, 2016). If this funding ceases then some female entrepreneurial ventures may be unsustainable. According to the interviewees the “lack of political stability in Palestine translates into a lack of economic stability”. The delay in the peace process has resulted in a decline in GDP per capita growth rate from 8.8% in 2011 to 2.4% in 2012. Accordingly, this situation has a negative impact on profitability of Palestinian businesses and creates challenges for entrepreneurs seeking venture finance. Consequently, some women are dissuaded from engaging in entrepreneurial activities (Palestine Country Report- GEM Project, 2012). Furthermore, Palestine does not have its own currency and is reliant on the US dollar, Israeli shekels and the Jordanian dinar as trading currencies. This means that entrepreneurial ventures are dependent on international currency stability. Whereas, the Saudi Riyal is ‘pegged’ to the US dollar affording a greater degree of stability.

In both countries often the governmental systems, policies and processes are not in place to support entrepreneurial activities. For example, bureaucratic structures are by their very nature risk avoiding. Therefore, it can be difficult to gain the necessary permissions as officials do not understand the inherent risks associated with entrepreneurial activities. For example, as Saudi society is changing in response to the Vision 2030 strategy, entrepreneurial women are more likely to identify areas where women’s needs are not being met. Thereby, rising to the challenge to develop products and services to meet these needs. In addition, in Saudi Arabia the bureaucracy is relatively young and when new ventures are initiated often barriers arise as it takes time to implement the necessary legislation, policies and procedures that will apply to these ventures. On a positive note, there are support mechanisms within Saudi Arabia that aim to encourage entrepreneurial ventures, for example, Saudi Aramco (the large Saudi petroleum company) has, as part of its corporate social responsibility activities, programs providing support for entrepreneurs.

Legal

Within Saudi Arabia the legislation supporting entrepreneurial ventures is in keeping with traditional patriarchal societies. Consequently, there are challenges confronting women when trying to negotiate this legislative framework. There is a recognition that the different Ministries have made substantial efforts to facilitate access electronically. However, when the different officials were contacted, conflicting advice was the norm. There was an expressed hope that the Saudi Small to Medium Authority established in October 2015 and the Vision 2030 strategies will commence addressing these challenges.

A similar situation faced the Palestinian women. Comments were received during the research about the lack of awareness of the requirements of different government bodies and NGOs. There was also a perceived lack
of co-ordination among the different ministries concerning the ease of registration and establishment of new ventures. The research participants expressed the desire to have a ‘one-stop-shop’ which assists them in navigating the process, paper work and registration processes in order to facilitate the starting of new business ventures. The interviewees demonstrated a lack of awareness of existing tax law provisions and incentives that are available to support new ventures.

Comment was also made that there was an urgent need within Saudi Arabia, as transitioning society, for legislation to keep pace with new initiatives and societal changes. This is particularly pertinent to businesses run by women. For example, within the Saudi environment the legal obligations create a need for substantial levels of start-up funding. There has been a heavy reliance on expatriate labour. These expatriates require visas. Yet it is not possible to apply for a Visa until the business is established and ready to commence trading. The Visa process could take up to 6 months. This was perceived to constrain small individual ventures both male and female. Whereas, companies with high levels of capital, e.g. international franchises were more able to meet this challenge. Female initiatives are usually constrained in this regard as they are smaller and have limited access to funding. There was a humorous aside made by some participants about the frequency of signage stating ‘opening soon’. Opening soon being six months or even longer.

**Social / Cultural**

One cultural barrier spoken of by the Palestinian women were the social mores that allow men more freedom to network, for example, in coffee houses or cafes. It is more socially acceptable for men to meet in this way to discuss business issues. Similar, concerns were expressed by the Saudi participants. Yet there was an acknowledgement that in Saudi Arabia public spaces designed for women were becoming more common (Le-Renard, 2014). However, it still remains more difficult for women to engage in networking and maximize relationship opportunities. It is accepted that informal gatherings are more difficult for women in Arab countries. In addition, there are social constraints in both countries on working at night or leaving children in nurseries. In Saudi Arabia there was more of an acceptance regarding the employment of a Nanny or leaving children with relatives.

In Palestine, there is also a shortage of some key skills as was mentioned by an entrepreneur in the public relations and event management sector. Her comment related to the two main reasons for this shortage. First, not all business majors are offered in Palestinian universities and higher education institutions, for example, event management or entrepreneurship. Second, there are a large number of NGO’s in Palestine. The ability of these organizations to pay higher salaries than SME’s attracts young graduates. This confirms the findings of Palestine Country Report (2012) and Khoury and McNally (2016) which mentioned the lack of alignment between the KSA’s possessed by graduates and the needs of the labor market. Similar concerns have been identified in Saudi Arabia as the Vision 2030 plan requires new sets of skills of its people.

**Access to venture capital**

Access to venture capital was stated as another challenge to women entrepreneurs. In Palestine, often this access is complex, requiring multiple layers of security and collateral to be provided. This often being
obtained from multiple sources and increases the risk of the entrepreneur being caught in a cash flow crisis or having the business endangered should one of the providers of finance choose to withdraw. There were a number of variables that acted to constrain Saudi women from accessing venture capital - not all of them extrinsic. While in Saudi Arabia there are a number of different funding mechanisms available, what emerged was that often the women were reluctant to ask for money. The ability to do so depended very much on each woman's personal circumstances, for example, supportive fathers or husbands who encouraged them to ask. There were some deeply held intrinsic reasons. One was a sense of shame and fear of losing money especially family money, 'If I get this money and I fail then I will embarrass my family and possibly deprive my children'. Despite these concerns there is evidence to show women have invested SAR 44 billion in business markets while their bank savings amount to SAR 100 billion (Al-Rasheed, 2015). Relative to Palestinian women, the women of Saudi Arabia have greater access to investment capital.

Conclusion
When the results of this exploratory study are considered alongside the findings of Jamali (2008) it is clear that each country in the MENA region has its own challenges with respect to the study of female entrepreneurship. There was a difference between the two countries – in Saudi Arabia the challenges were more cultural and legal. Whereas in Palestine the political situation created the more significant challenges. However, there were similarities that arose from the patriarchal systems and processes of both countries. Nevertheless, there is evidence to suggest that the micro factors of family support, experience, training and education and business skills can diminish the challenges of the macro factors.

The greatest challenge for the women involved in this study was to negotiate the traditional assumptions of the role of Arab women as solely homemakers confined to domestic duties (Danish & Lawton-Smith, 2012). However, further in-depth studies are required. Specifically, those examining more closely the macro-themes identified in this study. Doing so will move the empirical research away from the focus on the rectification of women's deficiencies (Ahl & Marlow, 2011) as cited in Marlow and McAdam (2012). The current geo-political environment contains a degree of uncertainty and only by coming to understand fully the different pressures and challenges of the diverse countries in the MENA region will entrepreneurial ventures be able to thrive and grow. Thus, there are implications for governments in the region to fully come to understand the macro features of the time and place where entrepreneurial activities take place. Then implement appropriate specific support and advice with the aim of supporting both men and women's entrepreneurial endeavors. Thereby supporting successful entrepreneurial endeavours. However, the challenge is not to perpetuate the patriarchal systems and structures. Therefore, this needs to be done in full consultation with female entrepreneurs. Doing so will assist in dispelling the myth of female entrepreneurial underperformance and support a thriving entrepreneurial sector.

References


Gender and Enterprise Network: Analysing a Feminist Social Change Venture through Autoethnography

Abstract
The Gender and Enterprise Network is an organisation bringing together gender and entrepreneurship researchers from around the UK. This paper will explore the formation and development of the organisation, and draws upon the notion of ‘entrepreneuring as social change’ (Calás et al. 2009) and Gherardi’s (2009) concept of ‘knowing-in-practice’ to analytically frame the exploration. We use a qualitative autoethnographic method to interrogate and explain the underlying processes and supporting practices of building a vibrant and supportive community around gender-focused entrepreneurship research. The paper draws upon feminist entrepreneurship and organisational learning literature, including the notion of founding ventures for social change (Calás et al. 2009) and practice-based knowing (Gherardi 2009) to analytically examine the feminist intervention and community-building that it documents.

Authors
Martinez Dy, Angela
Loughborough University London
a.dy@lboro.ac.uk

Jones, Sally
University of Leeds
S.Jones@leeds.ac.uk

Vershinina, Natalia
University of Birmingham
N.A.Vershinina@bham.ac.uk

Treanor, Lorna
University of Nottingham
Lorna.treanor@nottingham.ac.uk

Al-Dajani, Haya
University of Plymouth
haya.al-dajani@plymouth.ac.uk

Rouse, Julia
Manchester Metropolitan University
j.rouse@mmu.ac.uk

Villares Varela, Maria
University of Southampton
M.Villares-Varela@soton.ac.uk

Ekinsmyth, Carol
University of Portsmouth
carol.ekinsmyth@port.ac.uk

Keywords academia, gender, enterprise, entrepreneuring, organising, feminism
Introduction
Entrepreneurship as a phenomenon and academic discipline has historically been a masculinist subject, focused on heroic entrepreneurs who are nearly always men, white and eventually, rich as a result of their entrepreneurial activity (Ogbor 2000; Verduijn & Essers 2013). This image of the entrepreneur as a powerful economic actor is hegemonic and apparent throughout pop culture and contemporary politics. However, an emergent research tradition of feminist scholarship on entrepreneurship has offered a number of counters to this established conceptualisation. First, the study of women entrepreneurs has called attention to the diverse populations of women who engage in entrepreneurial activity (Jome et al. 2006; Achtenhagen & Welter 2011; Mirchandani 2000). Second, critical feminist work has explored and critiqued the patriarchal gendering both of the phenomenon and of the discipline of entrepreneurship studies itself (Ahl & Marlow 2012; Bruni et al. 2004; Tedmanson et al. 2012).

Propelling this research tradition forward are women scholars whose interest in gender and enterprise has brought them together as a significant subset of the academic community and as a movement. The Diana Conference is a biannual conference for the study of women’s entrepreneurship that is hosted and organised predominantly by North American academics focused on encouraging women’s entrepreneurship. At the 2010 conference, a set of UK-based scholars with research interests in this area developed the idea for a UK-based network for gender and enterprise scholars. From this idea, a Special Interest Group of the Institute for Small Business and Entrepreneurship (ISBE) was founded: the Gender and Enterprise Network (GEN).

In the past seven years, GEN has grown into a formal organisation with a steering committee and a number of significant achievements. With an international reach (LinkedIn group composed of more than 900 international members, e-mail list with 4000 recipients), we have published two special issues and hosted numerous academic and practitioner focused events and seminars. GEN promotes the creation of scholarly research on the relationship between small enterprise/entrepreneurship and gender, and knowledge exchange, with the aim of enabling the development of gender-aware entrepreneurship policy. We focus on the career development of GEN members and contribute to developing the Gender track at the annual ISBE conference. To this end, we host regular seminars, a conference/retreat for professional development and publication support, and impact events with policymakers and business support professionals. The group is run by a committee of ten members who are each responsible for different aspects of the organisation but contribute regularly across activities.

We begin the paper by outlining the context for women’s entrepreneurship and its gendered academic critique, alongside the marginality of gender scholars in business and management schools, as it is these phenomena which together form the background of the founding of our organisation. We then describe the autoethnographic method we employ and present evidence from autoethnographic vignettes from our steering committee members. We close the paper with a discussion and reflect on the implications of this work.

The Entrepreneurial Woman as Social Change Artist in a Postfeminist World
Entrepreneurialism is arguably the dominant organizational mode for the contemporary economic paradigm, and entrepreneurial behaviour is widely promoted by institutions and policymakers as a catalyst for economic renewal and growth. Innovation, flexibility, and risk-taking, activities associated with entrepreneurship, are now promoted across sectors, in the media and supported by public policy. In these discourses, entrepreneurial behaviour is nearly always portrayed positively, in contrast to that which is bureaucratic, slow-moving, and resistant to change (du Gay 1996, p.153).

However, this type of dichotomous thinking could be misleading. Scholars have pointed out that entrepreneurship can be instigated by a variety of motivations and produce a range of outcomes, both positive and negative (Acs 2006; Baumol 1996). In particular, Calás, Smircich and Bourne (2009: 553) caution that viewing entrepreneurship, enterprise ideology, and their various epiphenomena solely as positive economic activities may ‘conceal much else that entrepreneurship is and does’. They call attention to some of
the social goals that may underpin entrepreneurial behaviour; this paper takes their exploration of ‘entrepreneurship as social change’ as one of its key points of departure.

While women are less likely than men to be self-employed in most countries, the rate of women’s entrepreneurship is on the rise in most areas around the globe (Kelley et al. 2014). There is a correspondence in the expansion of academic interest in women’s enterprise, though feminist scholars critique much of this literature for endorsing the so-called ‘deficit thesis’, in which women entrepreneurs are seen as inherently lacking and their ventures underperforming, as a result of which they are encouraged to be more like men (Ahl & Marlow 2012; Marlow & McAdam 2013). A critical gendered perspective on the phenomenon is therefore essential, in which the concept of gender is considered to be a mental (cognitive and affective) perspective that is significantly socially constructed and not coterminous with biological sex (Carter et al. 2015). In a system in which men and masculinity are considered normative, gender is uncritically associated with women and femininity only, despite the pervasiveness of gender stereotypes, roles and expectations for both men and women. Feminist theorists (Butler 1990; hooks 1981; Mirchandani 1999) elucidate how narrow definitions of gender are used to shape and constrain the behaviour of women, men and children; maintaining the subordination of women and girls within the gender binary, and the further marginalisation of women of colour, working class and poor, disabled, and trans women in particular. However, an emergent notion that we live in a post-feminist Western world, in which feminism is no longer relevant since women’s equality has been supposedly achieved, arguably dominates the field of consciousness about gender (McRobbie 2004; Lewis 2014). Yet, given persistent subordination in the gender binary and associated socio-economic limitations, women, though not a minority group, may still be considered a marginalised class. Although they make up nearly half of the employed workforce in developed economies, they are still disadvantaged in waged work in terms of returns and status (McRobbie 2009; Marlow & McAdam 2012), limited to crowded, low-value added sectors through vertical and horizontal occupational segregation, and under-represented in the higher-performing and masculinised science, engineering and technology sectors (Kelan 2009; Marlow & McAdam 2012).

McRobbie (2009, p.7) identifies the figure of the ‘working girl’ as a technology for understanding femininity in a supposedly post-feminist era. She argues that this figure and what it represents, including freedom and gains in status and identity, is made available to women in place of real social power. We suggest that the working girl has an emergent permutation in the ‘entrepreneurial woman’, who, despite her educational and economic achievements, is still expected to operate within prescribed feminine boundaries through which she is constrained. Past media focus on women’s ventures has tended to spotlight those in which they commercialise their experiences and knowledge of femininity and, in particular, their roles as mothers (Ruth Eikhof et al. 2013). Such businesses have been popularised through internationally widespread notions like the ‘mumpreneur’ (Duberley & Carrigan 2012; Ekinsmyth 2013). It should be noted, however, that the entrepreneurial promise is not generic for all women, but is complicated by geographical location, race and ethnicity as well as socio-economic class, which intersect to affect the reasons participants begin ventures, as well as their experiences of being entrepreneurs. For example, Knight (2016) indicates that Black women may use the status of entrepreneur to escape racist, sexist workplaces and claim a respectable professional subjecthood that they are often denied, while Martinez Dy et al. (2016) note that being of a non-white race still poses a hindrance to women digital entrepreneurs.

Thus, women worldwide can be seen to experience combinations of structural privilege and oppression that both encourage, as well as constrain, their entrepreneurial activity; nonetheless, they exercise reflexivity and agency throughout these processes (Al-Dajani & Marlow 2013; Welter et al. 2013) in their attempts to achieve their entrepreneurial goals. It is this complex and nuanced context in which entrepreneurial women operate that the GEN leadership and membership is particularly interested, and which provides the backdrop for our respective research specialisms and areas of interest.

The Marginality of Gender Scholarship within Business and Management Studies
Despite more than a decade of feminist critique of the entrepreneurship, business and management literatures for persistent gender bias, lack of reflexivity, and focus on women’s supposed entrepreneurial deficiencies (Ahl 2006), there has been little uptake of this stance in the wider literature (Ahl & Marlow 2012). The emergence of gender tracks at predominant academic conferences, and separate conferences on women’s entrepreneurship, while useful in enabling conversations between gender scholars to take place, have also led to the ‘siphoning off’ of gender-related issues and concerns. In general, the ‘positive economic focus’ on entrepreneurship tends to result in a scholarship and policy that is supposedly gender neutral but in reality is gender blind, ignoring the pervasive effects and enablements of gendering processes on all entrepreneurial actors (Jones, 2014).

Established disciplines within the field, such as economics and strategic management, are well known for masculinist approaches that, subjected to feminist calls to attend to gender, have come to operationalise it as a variable, while newer disciplines, such as sustainability and social enterprise, are perhaps surprisingly lacking in any awareness of gender-related issues, having been founded in the post-feminist era. If considerations of gender do exist, they are most frequently either comparative of women vs men, essentialist or instrumental in their approaches, with a marked lack of awareness of feminist principles – for example, social enterprise tends to be uncritically associated with women because of our supposed pro-social orientations and caring tendencies. It is therefore the case that gender scholars in UK business schools often find themselves on the margins in their work; it is not unusual to be the only person in a department who works on gender studies or is familiar with critical feminist perspectives. As a result, we gender researchers often find ourselves ignored, silenced, unsupported, or continually on the defensive for the points we raise or the objectives we pursue. It is this context of the scholarly community to which we belong that enabled the founding of the GEN organisation, which has made a significant difference to our work and lives.

**Methodology and Method**

Although the members of our leadership committee adhere to various philosophical traditions, in this paper we adopt a constructivist ontology and interpretivist epistemology that focuses on the meanings individuals ascribed to lived experiences (Watson 2013). We take as methodological inspiration Gherardi’s assertion that knowledge ‘resides in social relations, and knowing is part of becoming an insider in a community of practice’ (2009, p.133). To this end, we adopt an autoethnographic method to examine and present our experiences. Research has highlighted the usefulness of autoethnography (Doloriert & Sambrook 2012; Humphreys 2005; Learmonth & Humphreys 2011) to explore previously private or mundane practices that nonetheless have significant effects on everyday life.

Autoethnography combines both evocative and analytic ethnography in its use of first person vignettes while maintaining a commitment to an analytical research agenda (Learmonth & Humphreys 2011); it therefore makes a more general contribution to theory. Our autoethnographies focus on the founding of the organisation, the ethos and philosophy behind it. We reflect on the development and focus of events and activities to support specific aspects of both in our membership’s career development. We also reflect on future possibilities, given our current focus on joining with and bringing together other gender and entrepreneurship groups. We adopt a self-critical and reflexive feminist approach that, while sympathetic, is still analytical of the self as researcher (England 1994). We use thematic analysis (Braun and Clarke 2006) on the autoethnographic texts.

**Findings and Discussion**

Here we outline some emerging themes from our reflections based around four areas of collective resonance and importance.

*An Active Response to Marginalisation*

In our vignettes, we identified a pervading sense of marginalisation as gender scholars. This is identified as the initial driving force for the creation of GEN as a community of gender scholars.
“Being a gender scholar can be disheartening; that feeling that you’re seen as a humourless irritation, doing research that is perceived as ‘fluffy’, with no immediate business application or economic impact. I sometimes feel my research is seen as an irrelevant self-indulgence” (Sally)

“Being a gender focused entrepreneurship scholar can be a lonely experience in a business school” (Haya)

“You do not notice any gendered effects on you until you start talking about your research interest in women” (Natalia)

Our marginalisation is arguably a result of studying a topic (gender) - which has been described, along with race and class, as a ‘zombie’ category (Beck and Beck-Gernsheim, 2001) - and also of our self-proclaimed and vocal feminism. Within an increasingly post-feminist cultural landscape this can position us, and our interest in gender studies, as outmoded (Hark, 2016; Tierari, 2014). Our marginalisation is also a reflection of the marginalisation of feminist women academics more broadly in academia (Van den Brink, 2015), a continuing concern given the large numbers of women in academia, but the small numbers at professorial level (Morley, 2013). Such marginalisation is not limited to more experienced academics, but is also evident in the experiences of doctoral students who study gender (Danowitz, 2016). Therefore, in our positions as feminist women academics studying a ‘woman’s’ subject, we recognise and seek to challenge the potentially damaging implications for our careers in the “monastic and homosocial cathedral of academia” (Hassauer, 2009:14 cited in Hark, 2016:84).

We came together to actively acknowledge our collective and individual positioning, to make visible and promote the value and importance of gender research generally, and gender and entrepreneurship research in particular. Indeed, a robust and critical engagement with feminist theories of gender brings much value to the field of entrepreneurship: for example, through developing new voices and new perspectives which highlight entrepreneurship as a diverse phenomenon encompassing a range of contexts, actors, motivations, and outcomes, and critique the masculinist conceptions of entrepreneurship we encounter in public conceptions and discourse.

As such, GEN’s formation was a response to gendered practices in academia, as well as in entrepreneurship research. Just as feminist gender and entrepreneurship scholars seek to challenge and redress the gender-blindness of entrepreneurship, so too GEN seeks to challenge gender-blindness in the broader academy and other institutional settings.

**Finding a Home**

“Julia approached Professor Sue Marlow who was supportive of the idea and, in her role as Trustee and VP Research of ISBE, she suggested we could form an ISBE Special Interest Group.” (Lorna)

It was recognised that, as a potentially marginalised group, we needed to be embedded within an already established organisation – one that had the potential to offer resources such as marketing, membership management and access to broader national and international networks and credibility. We did discuss the option of setting up a discrete, independent network and applying for funding to support this, but were concerned that this was unsustainable in the long run and would require much ongoing administrative, organisational and individual effort. As many of the founding members regularly attended the ISBE Gender track, ISBE was seen as an appropriate home for GEN. Indeed, as the SIG has developed it has supported the Gender and Enterprise track in its development and reviewing process as well as encouraging attendees at GEN events to join ISBE and present their research at the annual conference. Some of the members of the steering committee encountered GEN first at the ISBE conference:

“I remember a feeling of relief, being in the room with likeminded individuals, passionate about making a difference, listening to the ways in which ISBE SIG was going to help and support each other and new members. It was like coming home.” (Natalia)
However, at that point ISBE did not have any formalised SIGs. As we had no experience of establishing a SIG, this proved to be a valuable learning experience for all involved. It also meant that we were able to establish the ‘template’ and act as a role model for the other SIGs that followed us, and there are now seven ISBE SIGs.27

**Building a Community**

In the vignettes, founding committee members reflected on the importance of being part of a like-minded community, which reflects the broader scholarly community, and the many stages of experience therein, from practitioners and policy makers through to doctoral students and early career scholars and professors. This involves a conscious effort to be accessible, approachable, developmental and encouraging.

“No up until we met in Banff, we had engaged in many discussions about the need for a community of early career and mid career scholars focusing on gender and entrepreneurship research in this part of the world, who could contribute to enhancing the field by supporting each other and providing the space to foster collaboration. These aims continue to attract me to GEN especially as we seek to engage scholars and colleagues in less developed economies.” (Haya)

“We also liked the idea of a group of women supporting each other and helping to advance each other’s careers – an ‘old girls’ network that could review each other’s papers, notify others of potential jobs, events or articles of interest.” (Lorna)

“I still remember my trepidation as a PhD student and the warm welcome that I received… I couldn’t quite believe that I was accepted into this group of much more experienced and knowledgeable women” (Sally)

The idea of the ‘old girls’ network emerged from our engagement with the Diana Conference28 and observing how they had managed to establish themselves as the leading group of North American scholars on women and entrepreneurship. Such an approach is recognised as being particularly supportive when based on research-orientated female peer mentoring groups that offer “…friendship; feelings of connection to and membership of a group; and support for professional development” (Rees and Shaw, 2014: 5). Initially this approach was used within the founding committee and it has since been expanded to the full GEN community, through our events, web site and social media presence.

“At the AOM in 2016, I attended the Women in Entrepreneurship PDW, which was run by DIANA members, and senior women academics shared their experiences of how the network enabled professional career support for other gender researchers” (Natalia)

Outside of the gender track of the ISBE conference we also run regular events. We have developed two specific event formats aimed at building and supporting the gender and entrepreneurship scholarly community. Early on in our development we developed the Thinkspace format, with academic speakers from different disciplines (sociology, politics, geography) talking about gender theory. We have also developed a “confreat” format (conference-retreat), focused on supporting PhD students and early career researchers to develop their research for submission to conferences and journals. It involves peer mentoring and peer review and brings together gender scholars at all stages of their careers. As well as developing their academic profiles we also encourage delegates to build networks and become embedded within the broader gender and entrepreneurship research community.

**A Critical, Activist, Feminist Intervention**

---

27 For more details visit http://isbe.org.uk/special-interest-group/

28 For more information on the history of DIANA visit: http://www.babson.edu/Academics/centers/blank-center/global-research/diana/Pages/home.aspx
What is clear in our vignettes is that we see the creation of the GENSIG as a consciously feminist action. As such, it resonates with de Vries and van den Brink’s, (2016: 429) ‘bifocal approach’, which focuses on transformative organisational change and offers

“an alternative means of countering gender inequalities in organizations. While pre-existing transformative interventions focus on more immediately apparent structural change, the focus begins with the development of individuals.” (ibid)

We could be seen as the feminist conscience of the ISBE, challenging gender discrimination where we see it, whether this is evident in the programming of the conference, and “another male only panel” or in the attitudes and assumptions of other ISBE members or conference delegates. In doing so we actively unsettle underlying “masculine, white, elitist, hetero-normative assumptions” (de Vries and van den Brink, 2016: 430).

The last year’s conference was particularly unsettling due to a preponderance of white, men-only panels and plenaries. Given the numbers of knowledgeable and respected women, and black and minority ethnic ISBE members, we challenged the ISBE conference organisers to draw upon a more diverse range of experts.

“The top prizes at the 2016 ISBE conference were won by women of colour, including myself. When the organisers congratulated me on my personal achievements and pointed to GEN successes as a model for other SIGs, I couldn’t help but point out the lack of diversity and representation in the keynote events, and the fact that this did not reflect the ISBE membership. I suggested they be more conscious of this for next year” (Angela)

With this ask, we aimed to encourage the conference organisers to emphasise and make visible the broad range of experience, expertise and knowledge that we know exists in the ISBE entrepreneurship research, policy and practice communities and networks.

Therefore, we actively bring our engagement with and understanding of feminism, gender theory and the gendering of organisations, into the practices of our host organisation through organising, developing and increasing the visibility and impact of our SIG, internally and externally. However, we consider this as being more than simply a “salve to the organization conscience” (Knight and Pritchard, 1994:57) as our host organization increasingly seeks GEN’s input on SIG development generally and other aspects of of planning and promotion.

This could potentially position us as ‘difficult women’ (Carr, 2012), but as our reach and reputation has grown, we are increasingly recognised as an influential, respected and academically rigorous community and are seen as a model for the development of new and emerging SIGS. In this way we suggest that we are transforming both the gendered and communal practices of our host organisation.

Conclusion
Taking a ‘bifocal’ approach, which includes developing and transforming individuals and organisations has helped us to grow our ‘old girls’ network, to offer support, encouragement and a ‘home’ to marginalised gender scholars. It also underpins our relationship with our host organisation, where we have highlighted and transformed some of the gendered practices within ISBE; however, our job does not end there. This is an ongoing transformative project. We hope our focus on the individual, the collective and the organisation within which we sit will continue to develop and remake ourselves, our members and the scholarly community more broadly beyond the narratives “by women, for women about women” (Marlow, 2016), as we understand the dangers of such channelling to further side-line us and our members into a conceptual and professional ghetto. Organisations such as ISBE GEN exist to challenge the normative balance which for so long has been “by men, for men and about men”. We believe that documenting and analysing our experiences this paper contributes to the growing literature on practice-based knowing and founding ventures for social change, and can provide some practical insights for the development of similar groups in other contexts.
References


Women’s Entrepreneurship and Finance
Crowdfunding – a dawn of hope for women entrepreneurs and their start-ups in Thailand?

Hans Michael Guelich¹
Ulrike Guelich²

¹ Stamford International University, Bangkok / Thailand. Email: hans.guelich@stamford.edu
² Bangkok University School of Entrepreneurship and Management, Bangkok / Thailand. Email: ulrike.guelich@gmail.com

Keywords
Crowdfunding, entrepreneurial finance, gender, women entrepreneur, Thailand, Global Entrepreneurship Monitor

Abstract
The latest financial crisis had a profound impact on economics and the entrepreneurial landscape. Increasingly, entrepreneurs cite lack of access to finance as new obstacles, reports the Global Competitiveness Index 2015/16. Findings from the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor consistently confirm financial pressures as key constraints for entrepreneurs. Entrepreneurs in Thailand perceive an increase in financial pressures in the last five years from 52 percent in 2011 to 71 percent in 2015. Specifically women seem to suffer more from financial hardships than men, since -among others- seed funding is less available for their mostly small start-ups. On the other hand, studies indicate that crowdfunding is increasingly regarded as a viable funding alternative for entrepreneurs, especially in Asia-Pacific where its use tripled from 2014 to 2015. This empirical study investigates gender-related differences in the availability and the utilization of funding for start-ups. Since women in Thailand generally tend to make more use of innovative products and services, we also question if this could make them more prone to use alternative funding options such as online crowdfunding as their male counterparts.

Our findings highlight the importance of crowdfunding as an alternative for addressing existing gender inequities of traditional finance, where women entrepreneurs are often underserved. The initial findings also confirm gender-related differences regarding funding sources. Thai entrepreneurs seem to be generally innovative in using crowdfunding and rank high in a global comparison in online crowdfunding, primarily driven by women entrepreneurs.

Introduction
In recent years, crowdfunding has emerged as a viable alternative for entrepreneurs to secure funding, especially seed-funding from a relatively large number of individuals, often in return for future products or equity (Mollick, 2014), without having to go through traditional channels of investments such as banks or through venture capitalists. Through proliferation of websites this novel “social media version of fundraising” evolved which allows individual founders, such as nonprofits, artists, musicians and businesses to find finance for all types of new ventures, once their idea has the potential to create jobs and generate revenue however financial support to become a reality. There is a gap in literature about the dynamics of successful crowdfunding and its mechanisms. Crowdfunding might both support as it might contradict existing theories of how entrepreneurs raise capital and the success rates.

At the same time, entrepreneurs increasingly cite lack of access to finance as new obstacles and key constraints (Schwab & Sala-i-Martin, 2016; Xavier et al, 2016). The latest financial crisis had a profound impact on economics and the entrepreneurial landscape, likewise on entrepreneurs in Thailand who perceive an increase in financial pressures in the last five years from 52 percent in 2011 to 71 percent in 2015 (Marlow & Patton, 2005; Xavier et al., 2016). Specifically women entrepreneurs seem to suffer more from financial hardships than men, since -among other reasons- seed funding is less available for their mostly small-scale start-ups (Ahl, 2004). On the other hand, studies indicate that crowdfunding is increasingly regarded as a viable funding alternative for entrepreneurs.
Background

Entrepreneurial finance in the last years was negatively impacted by the recent financial crisis and stressed banks despite lowest interest rates. As a new alternative to equity and debt and driven by the internet, crowdfunding evolved which allows entrepreneurs to leverage “the crowd” in order to raise funds and other benefits (Belleflamme, Lambert, & Schwienbacher, 2014) and pitch to the masses. Crowdfunding also provides a strategy for startups or early stage companies to take their business to the next level, such as rolling out a product or service. Prior to crowdfunding, entrepreneurs depended on availability of individual angel investors or bank loans and fulfillment of their requirements. Recent studies point out that crowdfunding may rival bank finance in a way that it connects even savers with little money to risky new ventures with traditionally higher funding constraints (Belleflamme et al., 2014; Blaseg & Koetter, 2015; Mollick, 2014; Robb & Robinson, 2012).

Entrepreneurial Finance and Gender

Start-ups and young businesses requiring seed funding most often have two options: self-financing or external fundraising. The financial crisis of 2008 increased the typically prevalent challenges that startups and young businesses experience in raising external finance (Blaseg & Koetter, 2015). Since then, number and volume of rounds to finance equity declined dramatically (Block et al, 2010).

Despite an increasing demand in access to alternative funding, such as angel investments for women entrepreneurs (Mason & Harrison, 2000), women’s access to angel investors is under-studied (Amatucci & Sohl, 2004; Becker-Blease & Sohl, 2007). Women typically start their businesses with fewer funds than their male counterparts and rely more than men on informal investments, mainly through family and friends (Daniels et al, 2016) and “although finding and engaging angel investors is a challenge for anyone, women entrepreneurs have experienced particular difficulty” (Brush et al, 2004, p. 56).

Crowdfunding

The concept of crowdfunding is far from new, since in 1885 the Statue of Liberty’s pedestal in New York was reward-crowdfunded (Harrison, 2013). However, its current form as an online financial platform has its origins in 2009 with the launch of Kickstarter. In these last years, technological developments enabled a widespread adoption of crowdfunding. In addition to the previous circles of family and friends, crowdfunding enables an entrepreneur to reach an undefined number of potential funding investors. Crowdfunding also allows all kind of entrepreneurs, especially start-ups – be they for-profit, not-for-profit, or arts and culture- to fund their ventures by drawing on relatively small contributions from a relatively large number of individuals using the internet, without standard financial intermediaries (Mollick, 2014), facilitated by a growing number of webpages dedicated to crowdfunding. It seems to increasingly play an important role for the initial seed financing of entrepreneurial ventures or projects. A successful crowdfunding round provides needed cash, but often also creates a base of customers who feel as though they might have a stake in the business' success.

Crowdfunding reached a global volume of 34 billion USD in 2015, with a majority of 25 billion USD raised for peer to peer lending. Equity funding accounted for 2.5 billion. Annual growth rate of crowdfunding was highest for Asia in 2015 with 210 percent and accounts for 10.5 billion USD (Massolution, 2015). Crowdfunding is related to concepts like micro-finance (Morduch, 1999) and crowdsourcing (Poetz & Schreier, 2012), however represents its own unique category of fundraising including internet-based peer-to-peer lending (Lin & Viswanathan, 2015). Schwienbacher and Larralde (2010) define crowdfunding as "an open call, essentially through the internet, for the provision of financial resources either in form of donation or in exchange for some form of reward and/or voting rights in order to support initiatives for specific purposes.”

Crowdfunding enables entrepreneurs to raise funding within and across networks, but efforts to use crowdfunding to educate or to generate recurring revenue are less successful (Younkin & Kashkooli, 2016). Using crowdfunding is also significantly more likely for start-ups that interact with stressed banks who seem reluctant to give out funding. Innovative funding is thus particularly relevant when conventional financiers are facing crises (Blaseg & Koetter, 2015). In Asia-Pacific, the use of crowdfunding increased by 313 percent from 2014 to 2015 (Zhang et al., 2016). However, the level of success of crowdfunded enterprises is not clear. Some studies suggest that crowdfunding projects mostly succeed by narrow margins with a large

29 businesses operating up to 42 months
number of projects that fail to raise the funding (Mollick, 2014). Crowdfunding success seems to be linked to the quality of the offered investment project, with projects that signal a higher quality level are more likely to be funded. However, a large numbers of friends on online social networks are similarly associated with success in raising the funds.

Crowdfunding and Gender

Women in general are less likely to become entrepreneurs and they tend to be less represented as investors. They make up for less than 15 percent of the angel investors and less than 10 percent of venture capitalists in the United States (Coleman & Robb, 2012). A second glass ceiling stemming from gender bias obstructs small-sized women entrepreneurs to access funding required to start new firms or to grow their existing firms (Bosse & Taylor III, 2012). Gender-specific disadvantages in raising capital prevail for women entrepreneurs (Aldrich et al, 1995; Bellucci et al, 2010; Coleman & Robb, 2009; Marlow & Patton, 2005). Legal, regulatory and often social barriers restrict women’s ability to own assets, enter into contracts and obtain credits (UNESCAP, 2013). Even though micro-finance to women entrepreneurs has proven to be successful in terms of re-payments and enhancement of women, seed funding for the mainly very small start-ups is less available for women than for men (ADB, 2014).

On the contrary, women seem to be systematically more successful than men in online fundraising due to a different communication style of women, an outcome contrary to existing gender inequality in traditional fundraising (Gorbatai & Nelson, 2015). On the now leading online platform Kickstarter women make up about 35% of the project leaders and 44% of the investors. The gender of the project leader also tends to impact the percentage of the same gender investors. On Kickstarter, 23 percent of projects where men invested had female leads compared to 40 percent of projects where women invested had female leads. Even though men ask for significantly higher levels of capital than women for their projects and also tend to raise more funds, however women enjoy higher rates of success in funding their projects, which relates to findings from the entrepreneurial finance literature more generally (Marom et al, 2014). Especially in male-dominated categories, women tend to set lower levels in the forefront of funding than men, however are able to raise more than their goals compared to men which is consistent with previous research on women’s lower confidence level (Bandura, 1986; Croson & Gneezy, 2009) and higher risk averseness (Ahl, 2004) thank men. Private equity investors invest increasingly in small brands, healthy snacks, and ethnic foods as the three key industries in online platforms (Massolution, 2015; PENSCO, 2015), increasing opportunities for women in the consumer and retail sectors including women in rural areas to access funds in a novel way. Crowdfunding thus might enable women to access financial capital with women investors into their projects which could lead to a raise in available funding and growth opportunities, especially in male-dominated fields (Marom et al, 2014).

Methodology

Quantitative data were collected in the Adult Population Survey of the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor GEM survey 2015 in Thailand with 199 start-ups, thereof 102 male and 97 female entrepreneurs. The respondents answered questions if they received or expected to receive funding from different sources, such as own money, family funding, friends, investors or venture capitalists, banks, government programs, donations, grants or online crowdfunding. Additional questions explored if they innovated products, services or processes. Regression analysis was used to investigate gender-related differences in the availability and the utilization of funding for start-ups. In addition, we explored which means of funding were utilized by Thai entrepreneurs to finance their start-up efforts.

Results and Discussion

Regression results show the significance of gender (-.211/.035) and manufacturing-related innovation (.397/.007) to the use of crowdfunding. Innovations related to service or products were not significant. The initial findings also confirm gender-related differences regarding funding sources. Female start-up entrepreneurs rely heavily on funding by family members (76.3%), more than their male counterparts (58.8%). On the other hand, as Table 1 displays, they are less likely to receive funding through banks or financial institutions (female 26.8% vs. male 40.2%) and private investors or venture capitalists (female 7.3 vs. male 12.7%). Interestingly, more female than male start-ups fund through government programs, donations or grants (8.3%) and crowdfunding (8.2%). Only 4.9% of the male entrepreneurs used crowdfunding for their start-ups. In a global comparison, Thai entrepreneurs seem to be generally innovative in using crowdfunding, since 9.4% of all start-ups and young businesses used crowdfunding., Thai entrepreneurs rank No. 9 out of
60 countries worldwide and No. 1 in Asia-Pacific in online crowdfunding, which is primarily driven by women entrepreneurs (Daniels et al., 2016).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Funding sources of start-ups and young businesses in Thailand, 2015</th>
<th>male</th>
<th>female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>family members</td>
<td>58.8%</td>
<td>76.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>friends or neighbors</td>
<td>19.6%</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>employer or work colleagues</td>
<td>11.8%</td>
<td>14.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>banks or other financial institutions</td>
<td>40.2%</td>
<td>26.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>private investors or venture capital</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>7.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>government programs, donations or grants</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>online crowdfunding</td>
<td>4.9%</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Women in Thailand tend to make more innovative use of new technologies and services than men and are more prone to utilize mobile technology (Marlow & Patton, 2005). Driven by female users, Thais spend on average 4 hours per day on their smartphone (Figure 1), thereof nearly 40 percent in communication and 26 percent in applications. Women tend to exchange technology use to other women more than their male counterparts.

Figure 1: Smartphone use in Thailand, 2015

Source: Google, Thailand, 2015

Conclusion and Implications

Our promising first findings highlight the importance of crowdfunding as an alternative for addressing existing gender inequities of traditional finance, where women entrepreneurs are often underserved and may experience a "second glass ceiling" (Bosse & Taylor III, 2012). Our exploratory study’s surprising finding that more women start-ups in Thailand use crowdfunding than their male counterpart, setting its use ahead of venture capital or private investors, sheds light on the existing dilemma of available finance for small-scale women entrepreneurs. The fact that Thai women are more tech-savvy than their male counterparts may contribute to the fast adoption of new technologies, especially in an area such as financial resources, where they normally experience constraints.

Since previous research suggests that women tend to ask for smaller amounts of money than men, angel investments might not meet women entrepreneurs’ demand due to usually higher sums. In addition, especially the smaller enterprises of females, are often operating in the informal sector which excludes them from access to finance through the banking sector. Crowdfunding therefore might seem to be a viable and easy-to-use alternative with growth potential for these underserved women entrepreneurs. Given the high annual growth rates of crowdfunding in Asia of 210 percent (Massolution, 2015), its importance and availability can be an option to overcome financing problems of women entrepreneurs especially where they
are under constraints regarding collateral in traditional bank funding (ADB, 2014; UNESCAP, 2013). Our findings confirm that crowdfunding can indeed be a dawn of hope for women entrepreneurs and their startups in Thailand.

Our exploratory study targeted to study gender-related differences in availability and utilization of crowdfunding and is only a first kickstart into this topic. However, findings are promising, that especially for Thailand, crowdfunding is larger than generally assumed. Altogether, this new, important and growing area of entrepreneurial activity is still understudied, even as both practice and policy continue to rapidly advance in this topic. Limitations of our exploratory study is the relatively small number of entrepreneurs raising money through crowdfunding in Thailand, even though it is a rather high number compared to other countries around the world. Future research can address additional values of crowdfunding for entrepreneurs utilizing it, such as more public attention for themselves and their products, more media coverage and better interaction with customers.

References


Who gives, to whom and for what? The impact of gender stereotyping on crowdfunding success

Natalie Sappleton
Manchester Metropolitan University, UK

Principle Topic: Although there has been a huge upsurge in the number and proportion of female entrepreneurs in recent years, women owned businesses continue to be concentrated into narrow sectors of the economy, particularly in personal services and retail, sectors that have low barriers to entry, intense levels of competition and high failure rates (Sappleton 2009). One explanation that has been advanced for the outward inability of women entrepreneurs to break into male-dominated sectors is the challenge that they face in raising the levels of finance needed to establish and support business ownership in such sectors (Sappleton 2014). Business ownership is highly sex segregated and it is possible that, given the prevalence and pervasiveness of gender stereotypes, women business owners based in stereotypically female sectors are more successful in obtaining finance than those attempting to start, or running firms in male-dominated sectors. Therefore, it is argued in this project, women may find greater acceptance from financiers where they run firms in industries which align with the stereotypical work activities of women.

Method: This research study employs an experimental vignette design to examine whether those with experience of supporting crowdfunded entrepreneurial ventures are dissuaded from supporting female-led entrepreneurial ventures in male-typed business areas or sectors. Funders are provided with a series of hypothetical vignettes in which gender of entrepreneur and gender-type of entrepreneurial venture are manipulated. Respondents are asked to indicate whether they would be likely to support the venture, their level of support for the venture, and the likelihood of its success. The analysis examines whether women led ventures in male-typed business areas and sectors are likely to enjoy similar levels of success as their female-typed counterparts.

Results and implications: The results of the paper will demonstrate whether there exists an interaction between gender of entrepreneur, sex type of entrepreneurial venture and ability to raise finance from crowdfunding efforts. Evidence is provided that women starting up male-dominated enterprises face discrimination due to gender stereotypes.
Gender Stereotyping and Crowdfunding

INTRODUCTION
In the past three decades, women have entered self-employment and business ownership in unprecedented numbers, a development has spurred scholarly interest in the phenomenon of the female entrepreneur. In this context, considerable research has examined whether women entrepreneurs experience discrimination and prejudice when they are seeking to locate and leverage financial support (Marlow and Patton 2005; Mitchell and Pearce 2005; Muravyev, Talavera and Schafer 2009; Bellucci, Borisov and Zazzaro 2010). These studies have reached mixed and often contradictory conclusions, with authors variously concluding that discriminatory lending against female business owners is widespread and significant, innate and institutionalized, artificial, nonexistent, unsystematic, or a figment of complainants’ imaginations. The lack of a consensus on this issue could indicate that gender is not the relevant characteristic on which entrepreneurs should be compared. Some academics (e.g Loscocco and Robinson 1991; Loscocco, Robinson, Hall and Allen 1991) have noted that greater differences are observed when comparing the firms of women and men (as opposed to the entrepreneurs themselves). Perhaps then, “it is not so much sex that differentiates one company owner from another; rather it’s the type of business and the industry in which the company operates” (Allen 1996: 4).

In particular, it is argued here that the relevant characteristic is in fact the business sector in which the firm is located, and more specifically the gender-type of that sector. It is no longer unusual to see a woman in self-employment or entrepreneurship in many economies. In the Netherlands and the UK, for instance, there has been a steady increase in the proportion of working women in self-employment since 2005 (Hatfield 2015). According to the latest available US data (US Census Bureau 2015), women-owned firms accounted for 35.8 percent of all U.S. firms, up from 5 percent in 1972 (Hanson and Blake 2005). However, while there has been a massive upsurge in self-employment/business ownership among women in recent years, women-owned businesses remain concentrated in certain sectors of the economy, particularly in feminized retail and services, a phenomenon known as entrepreneurial segregation (Sappleton 2009). In the US, the proportion of firms owned by women outstrips the proportion owned by men in the health care and social assistance sector (62.5 percent), the educational services sector (54.2 percent), and the other services sector (51.8 percent) (US Census Bureau 2015). In the UK, the recent increase in rates of female-self-employment has largely been driven by growth in two key sectors - administrative and support service activities (where there has been an overall growth in self-employment of 37 per cent) and human health and social work activities (20 per cent growth) (Hatfield 2015).

Social constructionists emphasise the cyclical and self-reinforcing relationship between gender segregation and gender stereotypes (Fagenson and Marcus 1991; Cejka and Eagly 1999; Heilman 2001). Stereotypes are widely held, cognitively inexpensive ways of making sense of the social world that are both descriptive and prescriptive (Heilman and Block 1989; Heilman 2001). The observation that women take up business ownership in sectors like childcare and cleaning services therefore prescribes that this is something that women should do. Thus gender segregation in entrepreneurship and self-employment might influence financiers’ decision-making when they are deciding whether or not to extend finance to women seeking to establish or grow ventures in male-dominated sectors. If this is indeed the case, the these twin forces might prevent women from being able to break down gendered barriers in such sectors, further reinforcing entrepreneurial segregation (Sappleton 2014).

Crowdfunding has been described as democratizing access to capital (Mollick and Robb 2016). Indeed, research does show that women tend to be more successful than men in obtaining financial backing through reward-based crowdfunding platforms such as Kickstarter, even when goal amount and category of investment are controlled (Marom, Robb and Sade 2016; Greenberg and Mollick forthcoming). The proliferation of crowdfunding platforms, and the observation that women founders are better able to generate funding using this mechanism provides an excellent opportunity to examine whether crowdfunding can overcome the challenge of gender incongruity for women seeking backing for projects in male-dominated
realms. Against this background, this paper describes the results of a vignette based study that seeks to test whether gender stereotypic beliefs about women in business drive the decision-making of crowdfunders. The results of the demonstrate that there exists an interaction between gender of entrepreneur, gender type of entrepreneurial venture and the ability of the entrepreneur to raise finance from crowdfunding efforts providing evidence that women attempting to start up or grow enterprises in male-dominated sectors face discrimination due to the persistence of gender stereotypes.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Gender, segregation, stereotyping and access to finance

In assessing the risks and costs associated with investing in or extending a loan to a small business, financiers supposedly base their decisions on a set of generalized, objective criteria (Haines, Orser and Riding 1999). These criteria include the characteristics of the firm (such as sector, size, and stage of business cycle) as well as characteristics of the owner (such as age, experience and assets). Given information asymmetries and time constraints (Haines et al. 1999 estimate that the average account manager in a Canadian bank has little more than one working day to spend with each client), decision makers may rely on cultural stereotypes when making lending decisions. Yet empirical studies on gender and access to finance fail to control for the impact of gender-type of business sector. Sector is important because “gendered beliefs about the proper roles for women may discourage bankers from lending capital to women in nontraditional industries” (Godwin, Stevens and Brenner 2005: 30-1). Back in 1989, Brophy (1989: 73) argued that women’s financing difficulties have:

“been due to attitudes held by representatives of male-dominated institutions – and often reinforced by businesswomen themselves – regarding the proper role of women in business. That role has been seen as staff or part-time employee or business hobbyist, and – if an entrepreneur at all – one confined to businesses traditionally run by women: retail and service businesses for the most part.”

A more recent quote from a venture capitalist that specializes in financing computing firms indicates this view has not dissipated:

“I would never invest in a women-led business. Don’t get me wrong, women are great for day care centers and have done a lot for customer service, but as an investor, you can’t take a chance that they might leave to get married or pregnant” (cited in Brush, Carter, Gatewood, Greene and Hart 2004: 72).

Among the vast corpus of empirical studies that have been conducted on gender, entrepreneurship and access to financial capital, it is quite surprising that few researchers have explicitly examined whether there is an interaction between the gender of the finance seeker and the gender-typicality of business venture. For example, Buttner and Rosen (1989) reported no evidence of gender discrimination in their study of loan decisions given by 51 commercial loan officers (40 of whom were male) and 69 undergraduates (34 males). Interestingly, the hypothetical business plan that the subjects were asked to evaluate was in a patently male-typed sector (toxic waste disposal) and the gender of the decision-maker was not examined as an intervening variable.

Gender role congruity theory provides an excellent theoretical model for understanding why decision makers might be implicitly biased in deciding whether or not to invest in a woman or a man’s business venture. Linton (1936) defined a ‘role’ as a performance: a cluster of expected behaviour patterns and obligations attached to a particular social status in which expectations are culturally and socially defined and individuals are pressured, rewarded and punished to adopt certain roles and to reject others. West and Zimmerman (1987) argued that gender is one such role, and individuals ‘do’ gender by acting in accordance with commonly accepted sex-appropriate behaviours. The proponents of gender role congruity theory, Nieva and Gutek (1980) argued that performing gender-typed tasks is one way in which individuals meet these expectations. Individuals have many roles (gender, race, family status and so on) only the role that is most salient in a given situation is used to make inferences about their suitability for, and capabilities with respect to, a particular
role. Where occupations are heavily gender-segregated, gender is both the most readily observable and salient characteristic of the occupation, and is thus used to denote expectations about the behaviour of the incumbents of the occupation. In other words, incongruity makes the incumbent’s gender more salient as a basis for evaluation. Legitimacy is derived when an actor behaves in accordance with stereotypically held inferences about them. Conversely, individuals that violate gender norms are evaluated poorly and experience negative social and economic penalties. For instance, research shows that men are preferred over women in applications to male-dominated jobs (Koch, D’mello and Sackett 2015), women entrepreneurs fare less well in business pitches when they adopt a masculine style of pitching (Balachandra, Briggs, Eddleston and Brush 2013), and subordinates tend to prefer supervisors whose gender is congruent with the role they are performing (Eagly, Karau and Makhijani 1995).

There is some limited evidence from the literature to suggest that gender role congruity can explain financing decisions in entrepreneurship, but much of the research is now outdated. For instance, research from the early 1980s found that businesswomen in manufacturing and other male-dominated industries faced more difficulties in obtaining external finance than women in retailing and services (Hisrich and O’Brien 1981). In one simulated experiment, male and female undergraduates evaluated a hypothetical loan application and business plan (Buttner and Rosen 1988). Sex of entrepreneur and sector of business were manipulated. The results indicated that male decision makers were more supportive of women seeking finance for a traditionally female firm, and more supportive of males establishing a traditionally male company. Female decision-makers, on the other hand, supported entrepreneurs of both sexes regardless of the gender typicality of the sector. The authors concluded that nontraditional women business owners are disadvantaged when seeking start-up capital and recommended that they seek out a female financier. This study was a laboratory experiment and undergraduates are not decision makers. But in interviews with male and female bankers, Blake (2006) found further evidence that certain sectors (such as construction) were seen as more appropriate for male owners while other sectors were deemed more suitable for women. She went as far as to conclude that “to succeed at securing a business loan in these environments women must … be starting a business that is perceived as needed within the local context, but which is not perceived to be something that ‘men do’” (Blake 2006: 196, emphasis added). A male loan officer in that study cited the example of a female who began a cleaning firm with a loan from his bank. Despite the applicant’s previous job in auto repair, the banker admitted that he would have had “a greater degree of difficulty granting the loan to her if she had wanted to start a business as a mechanic” (Blake 2006: 196). This example is important because it belies the notion commonly held by financiers that prior experience is an important prerequisite to venture success. Blake (2006) argues that because lenders see the firm and the owners as one-and-the-same, loan officers consider the legitimacy of the individual concurrently with the legitimacy of the enterprise:

“Women’s participation in entrepreneurship, especially in traditionally male-dominated sectors, is likely to challenge notions held by banks loan officers and other regarding definitions of who is an entrepreneur. Women are therefore subject to a kind of gendered legitimacy that men do not face as they start and run their businesses. When there is confusion regarding the legitimacy of a person for an activity that they are undertaking…doubt is likely to be cast over the legitimacy of the whole enterprise (Blake, 2006: 188).

One-quarter of the women in Borooah et al.’s (1997: 86) study of Northern Irish business owners described their gender as hindering their access to external finance; many complained that banks “took them seriously only when the chosen business was in a ‘women’s’ area.” Marlow and Strange (1994: 181) contended that “bank managers are still reluctant to fund female ventures, particularly those which stray beyond traditional feminized occupations.” More recently, a study of New York City-based women entrepreneurs operating firms in the construction and sound recording (male-dominated) and childcare (female-dominated) sectors found that women owners of childcare firms reported fewer incidents of discrimination by customers, suppliers, employees, colleagues, financial institutions and others (Sapleton 2014). Moreover, they were more than 11 times more successful in obtaining a loan or investment in their firm than women operating businesses in the male-dominated construction and sound recording industries. In short, the evidence suggests that gendered
notions about the ‘proper’ role of women in business, “a woman entrepreneur within a male-dominated industry or culture may carry the invisible-yet-cumbersome baggage of sex-based stereotypes when she attempts to secure resources, develop business networks, and gain legitimacy for her business venture” (Godwin et al. 2005: 624).

**Gender and crowdfunding**

Recent years have witnessed a growing number of entrepreneurial ventures being supported through crowdfunding efforts. Crowdfunding refers to efforts, usually undertaken online, through which an entrepreneur seeks to raise finance from a relatively large number of investors, many of whom will be unfamiliar to business investment. There is already a small yet burgeoning corpus of research that has identified gender disparities in the success of crowdfunding efforts (Barasinska and Schäfer 2014; Scholz 2015; Marom et al. 2016; Greenberg and Mollick forthcoming). Interestingly, however, it is women who are more successful in their crowdfunding efforts than men. Mollick and Robb (2016) suggest that crowdfunders are just as able to perceive the quality of business opportunities as specialist investors such as angels and venture capitalists, lending support to the idea that these platforms help investors to leverage “the wisdom of the crowd”. However, there is limited research on the decision making process of crowds, and so far, no studies that have explicitly examined whether gender stereotypes drive biased decision making by crowdfunders. Research on professional investors (i.e. angel investors and venture capitalists) shows that these individual use gender of entrepreneur and sector of investment as signals of the quality of the business opportunity (Greene, Brush, Hart and Saparito 2001). As pointed out by Mollick and Robb (2016: 74), “if crowdfunding responds to known quality signals in the same way as venture capitalists, it…would suggest that crowdfunding would be no more democratic than other forms of fundraising”. The growth of crowdfunding provides researchers with valuable opportunities to test empirically whether there exists an interaction between gender of entrepreneur, gender type of entrepreneurial venture and ability to raise finance via this platform.

Drawing on the insights from this research, the following hypotheses are proposed:

H1: Women entrepreneurs are more successful in leveraging finance via crowdfunding efforts than men entrepreneurs;
H2: Women entrepreneurs in male-dominated/male-typed sectors are less successful in leveraging finance via crowdfunding efforts than women entrepreneurs in female-dominated/female-typed sectors

**METHODOLOGY**

**Research design**

A key challenge associated with testing for the existence of taste-based discrimination empirically is the tendency for respondents to offer socially desirable responses which downplay the extent to which individual attitudes and behaviours are driven by stereotypical beliefs (Batson, Naifeh and Pate 1978). In order to overcome this impediment, an experimental vignette methodology was used to gather the data. Experimental vignette studies involve presenting research participants with carefully designed descriptions of situations or scenarios in which certain variables are manipulated. Vignettes are widely used to assess individual intentions, attitudes, decision-making and behaviours (Aguinis and Bradley 2014) and are a common approach in the stereotyping literature (Yoder 1994). Research shows that when when carefully constructed and perceived as realistic to respondents, experimental vignette studies fare well in terms of experimental realism and ecological validity (Aguinis and Bradley 2014) and may even yield more valid results than respondents’ own accounts of their actual attitudes and behaviour (Taylor 2006).

8 vignette scenarios were created, to support a 2 X 2 X 2 factorial design crossing the gender of the entrepreneur (male, female) the gender-type of the business (male-typed, female-types), and the business stage of the enterprise (new, growing). This latter dimension was included based on the knowledge that the crowd uses signals of the quality of the project in determining their investment decision (Mollick and Robb,
To further aid decision making, information was supplied that suggested that the enterprise would be successful.

First, in order to select business enterprises that are appropriately construed as male-typed and female-typed, a brief questionnaire was issued to 28 business management undergraduates. The questionnaire described 10 business enterprises and respondents were asked to indicate whether they believed that the venture sounded like it should be run by a man, a woman or either gender. On the basis of this, four projects were selected, two male-typed projects (a video games company and an audio equipment company) and two female-typed projects (a cat café and a children’s toy).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender of entrepreneur</th>
<th>Male (Matt, Robert)</th>
<th>Female (Jennifer, Abigail)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Business activity</td>
<td>Video games company/Audio equipment company</td>
<td>Cat café/Children’s toy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Stage</td>
<td>Start</td>
<td>Grow</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After reading the question, respondents were asked two questions. First, they were asked to indicate the extent to which they would invest in the project, on a 5-point Likert scale from "I definitely would not invest" to "I definitely would invest". Next, those who would invest were asked to indicate the amount that they would invest (with those indicating they would not invest asked to select “nothing”). The respondents could select an amount from four categories: £5, £25, £50 or £100.

A sample vignette is below:

Jennifer is seeking investment to start a new video games company. Media reports and forum discussions suggest that this will be a successful venture, and that growth potential for this type of enterprise is high.

1. To what extent would you be likely to invest in Jennifer’s crowdfunding campaign?

   I definitely would not invest  1  2  3  4  5  I definitely would invest

2. How much would you be willing to invest? (if you definitely would not invest, please choose £0).

   £0  £5  £25  £50  £100

Data collection
The hypotheses are tested using data from an online survey of crowdfunding enthusiasts. Online forums represent a relatively new way of soliciting survey respondents (Cassese, Huddy, Hartman, Mason and Weber 2013). Yet they are growing in popularity due to the ability to solicit a vast number of responses in a relatively short space of time, and for researchers to target interested communities (Bhutta 2012). The URL of the survey was copied to social media discussion boards and forums where crowdfunding was being discussed, in order to attempt to access those that had knowledge of, and experience in crowdfunding. The questionnaire was divided into two separate sections. The first section collected basic information that could be used to determine the level of involvement of the respondent in crowdfunding activities. Data collected at this stage was used to ensure that only respondents that are currently active or interested in crowdfunding...
entrepreneurial projects completed the questionnaire. The core part of the survey included the vignette studies. In order to prevent respondent burden, each respondent was presented with a randomised subset of four vignettes. The gender of the funder was collected at the end of the survey.

FINDINGS

128 usable questionnaires were received. Females represented 58 per cent of the sample, and males 42 per cent. The mean age of respondents was 31.7, and the mean previous number of projects in which the sample had personally funded was 2.1. In the first instance, hypothesis 1 was tested, which stated that women entrepreneurs are more successful in leveraging finance via crowdfunding efforts than men entrepreneurs. The mean score for the variable measuring willingness to invest for men entrepreneurs was 4.13 (standard deviation = .88), while for women entrepreneurs it was 3.11 (standard deviation = 1.17), and the differences are significant, $F=29.45, p<.001$. The mean score for the variable measuring level of investment was 2.93 (standard deviation = 1.47) for men entrepreneurs and 2.28 (standard deviation = 1.36), and the differences are significant, $F=6.87, p<.005$. In this sample, women received less support than men, and when they did attract support, the level of investment was lower than that offered to men. There is therefore no support for hypothesis 1.

Table 2 displays the means and standard deviations for the key variables.

| Table 2: Means and standard deviations, gender of entrepreneur and gender-type of project |
|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|
|                                  | Male entrepreneurs              | Female entrepreneurs            |                                  |                                  |
|                                  | Male-typed project              | Female-typed project            | Male-typed project              | Female-typed project            |
| Willingness to invest            | 4.34 (.82)                      | 3.9 (.91)                      | 2.34 (1.14)                     | 3.74 (.85)                      |
| Level of investment              | 2.90 (1.5)                      | 2.97 (1.47)                    | 1.72 (1.4)                      | 2.74 (1.14)                    |

The data shows that female entrepreneurs seeking funds for a male-typed project receive the lowest mean scores of all four categories of entrepreneur (mean = 2.34) and that male founders seeking funding to support a male-typed project receive the highest level of support (mean = 4.34). The full 2 x 2 x 2 ANOVA analysis results are displayed in table 3. In addition to the gender of entrepreneur effect, there is a significant effect for gender-type of project with female-typed projects attracting lower levels of support ($F=5.96, p<.05$) and lower levels of investment overall ($F=6.87, p<.05$). There is no independent effect for business stage. One significant interaction effect is found. Confirming hypothesis 2, there is an interaction between gender of entrepreneur and gender-type of project ($F=30.41, p<.001$) on the willingness to invest. However, there is no significant effect on the level of investment attracted.

Table 3: 2 x 2 x 2 ANOVA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent variable</th>
<th>Willingness to invest (F)</th>
<th>Level of investment (F)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender of entrepreneur (A)</td>
<td>29.45***</td>
<td>6.87*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender type of project (B)</td>
<td>5.96*</td>
<td>4.65*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business stage (C)</td>
<td>2.14</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A x B</td>
<td>30.41***</td>
<td>1.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A x C</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B x C</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td>3.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A x B x C</td>
<td>.39</td>
<td>1.67</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*** p<.001, *p<.05

DISCUSSION

Although there has been a huge upsurge in the number and proportion of female entrepreneurs in recent years, women owned businesses continue to be concentrated into narrow sectors of the economy, particularly in personal services and retail, sectors that have low barriers to entry, intense levels of competition and high failure rates (Sappleton 2009). One explanation that has been advanced for the outward inability of women entrepreneurs to break into male-dominated sectors is the challenge that they face in raising the levels of finance needed to establish and support business ownership in such sectors (Sappleton 2014). Business ownership is highly gender segregated and it is possible that, given the prevalence and
pervasiveness of gender stereotypes, women business owners based in stereotypically female sectors are more successful in obtaining finance than those attempting to start, or running firms in male-dominated sectors. Therefore, it has been argued above that women may find greater acceptance from crowdfunders where they run firms in industries which align with the stereotypical work activities of women.

The results confirm this hypothesis. Women who are seeking to start firms in male-dominated realms are significantly less likely to be able to convince the crowd to invest in their projects. While crowdfunding is said to have democratized access to capital, the evidence suggests that crowds are influenced in gender stereotypes in making their decisions about who should, and who should not receive funding. This provides further evidence that the underrepresentation of women business owners in male-dominated sectors could – at least partially – be attributed to the discrimination that they face and their inability to secure the finance they need (Sappleton, 2009; 2014). A key message that should be taken from this explorative study is that rather than focusing on two-group comparisons of gender differences, researchers in entrepreneurship should address within-category differences between groups of female, and male business owners. The gender-as-a-variable approach that has been prevalent in entrepreneurship research may have served to mask the considerable differences between groups of women (and men) business owners. Previously, findings derived from undifferentiated samples have been extrapolated to the wider entrepreneurial population without misgivings. This serves to mask the particular challenges that are faced by women entrepreneurs attempting to break down the barriers in male-typed and male-dominated industries. This tendency to treat women business owners as one homogeneous subset of the wider entrepreneurial population, and as one that differs from men business owners may have distorted previous research findings. The conflicting findings in the literature on financial discrimination may therefore be linked to such a singular approach.

CONCLUSIONS AND NEXT STEPS
The findings reported herein should be understood to be preliminary in nature, and further analysis of a multilevel nature will be conducted on this dataset. A fourth layer of analysis will be added to the data, for it is possible to test for the presence of interactions between the gender of the crowdfunding decision maker, gender of entrepreneur, gender-type of business opportunity and business stage. Inclusion of the variable pertaining to the gender of the crowdfunding decision maker is important because research has demonstrated that homophilic preferences play a role in the decision making of financiers (Marom et al. 2016). For instance, one study found that 56 per cent of investors were reluctant to invest in an idea even if it was marketable and had a high propensity for success if they could not personally understand the need for it (Hewlett, Marshall, Sherbin and Gonsalves 2013). Marom et al’s (2016) study of gender dynamics on Kickstarter found that not only are men less likely to invest in female-led projects generally, but they are particularly unlikely to invest in female-led projects in non-traditional sectors for women, such as Games and Comics. Furthermore, studies tracking changes in the so-called “think manager, think male” phenomenon (Schein 1973), have found that women are less likely to stereotype leadership (Powell, Butterfield and Parent 2002) and entrepreneurial roles than are men (Gupta and Bhawe 2007). At the same time, Greenberg and Mollick (forthcoming) find that women crowdfunders are particularly willing to support female-led projects, even in nontraditional realms, as they view such support as a way of counteracting the historical disadvantage experienced by women, leading Mollick and Robb (2016: 81) to suggest that “women in predominately male-dominated industries may receive an advantage from activist support by other women”.

REFERENCES


Small Businesses and access to start-up capital: exploring gender differences

Professor Carol Woodhams & Dr Graham Perkins
University of Exeter Business School
Exeter, UK.

Introduction
It is commonly reported that new businesses in the UK have difficulty in accessing finance (Stiglitz and Weiss, 1981; Storey, 1994; Levenson and Willard, 2000). Such businesses can engage in ‘bootstrapping’ activities - imaginative and parsimonious strategies for marshalling and gaining control of resources - as a way of compensating for the lack of finance and other resources (Thorne, 1989, Harrison et al., 2004; Timmons 1999). Literature suggests that female entrepreneurs are more likely to turn to bootstrapping techniques (see Constantinidis et al., 2006; Manolova et al., 2006; Stanger, 1990) because they face significant disadvantage compared to their male counterparts in accessing resources from orthodox channels, such as banks (Roper and Scott, 2009; Marlow and Carter (2006).

Nevertheless, there is variation dependant on the type of bootstrapping method utilised. Jayawarna, Woodhams and Jones, (2013) found significant differences between male and female entrepreneurs with women more like to use joint-utilisation bootstrapping techniques i.e. more likely to share employees, use flexible employee resourcing methods and borrow equipment from other businesses. These techniques are not particularly financially risky but may be costly in terms of time taken to perform high-maintenance networking and relationship management skills. They are also more likely to utilise owner-related bootstrapping techniques making significantly more use of personal credit cards for business expenses and withhold their salary in times of difficulty. Women entrepreneurs also make more use of loans from relatives/friends. These techniques carry the greatest risk to personal finances and close, personal (strong) ties.

Men, on the other hand, engaged in more payment-related bootstrapping activities than women. Gender differences were particularly prominent for activities that secured working financial capital (e.g. obtain payment in advance from customers, delay payments to suppliers, and speed-up invoicing). These techniques utilise distant relationships (weak ties), they are relatively favourable in terms of the ratio of risk to damage to personal ties: beneficial and lucrative outcomes. There is ambiguity and disagreement about the determinants of this effect (Birley, 1989; Carter, et al., 2003; Hill, et al., 2006; Hisrich & Brush, 1985; Shaw, et al., 2001; Verheul & Thurik, 2001) and a need for further investigation.

The first explanation is that women are essentially risk averse and/or unambitious and don't seek to finance their business activities via the most lucrative financing and bootstrapping activities. The fault, within this analysis, lies with the women and attempts can be made to “fix” her to provide a solution. A contrasting explanation is aligned to the ontology that entrepreneurship is essentially a masculine activity. It follows that and that if women could only act contrary to their stereotype and engage with financing strategies ‘like a man' with all the accompanying credibility, then they would not underperform in growing their business. This liberal feminist perspective, whilst well-meaning, led to a number of positive funding schemes however it misses tackling the key structural disadvantage within the field of entrepreneurship. A more nuanced and theoretically informed critique is emerging (Marlow, 2013, Ahl, 2006) from the position that the liberal approach merely reproduces the assumption of women requiring assistance to remedy their ‘deficit’. Instead, it is suggested, women entrepreneurs should be seen as constructed in relation to masculine norms of the idealised and heroic entrepreneur and will always be deficient for this. The argument is that however unique are they and their business, they are part of an inescapable social category (female/ woman entrepreneur) and therefore
not, in fact, an entrepreneur. Understandings of entrepreneurship, then, are gendered, institutionalised and deeply embedded.

The aim of this paper is to qualitatively explore differences in financing behaviour between men and women entrepreneurs achieving greater theoretical depth on gender differences. The research question that informs this investigation is: to what extent do men and women nascent entrepreneurs conform to gendered stereotypical characteristics in their resource acquisition strategies?

Methodology and methods
It is ontologically and conceptually challenging to investigate gender and entrepreneurship with reproducing the social relations that we criticise. In the spirit of emancipatory research, we do so reflexively and using an appropriate methodology. In order to focus on building and developing theory, a qualitative and inductive methodology was deemed most appropriate (Alvesson and Sköldberg, 2009). Driven by a relativist ontological stance and recognising the socially constructed nature of reality, it was important to design a method of data collection that would facilitate access to participant’s underlying views and stories concerning how and why financed their activities in the ways discussed. While small qualitative samples do not lend themselves easily to the production of generalisable findings (Kempster and Cope, 2010), this study has nonetheless accessed a rich and diverse data source which facilitated theorisation. This study therefore complements existing quantitative work (Jayawarna, Jones and Marlow, 2015), by illuminating the factors from individual histories and stories that demonstrate why men and women entrepreneurs engage differently with sources of finance.

In accessing a relevant sample, the authors targeted individuals who had participated in the New Entrepreneurship Scholarship (NES) scheme; a UK-based, government funded programme designed to overcome social exclusion through the development of enterprise and entrepreneurial behaviour (Taylor et al, 2004). This approach enabled access to a unique sample of entrepreneurs who were based in an area of significant social deprivation in North West England. In total sixteen individuals participated in this study, including seven men and nine women.

In order to collect rich stories data were collected for this study through semi-structured interviews (Alvesson, 2011). This approach facilitated a purposeful, but conversational approach to data collection, and enabled the probing of responses and collection of narratives which would have been problematic had other approaches been chosen. To facilitate timely data collection respondents participated in telephone interviews in January 2013, which were audio recorded and then subsequently transcribed by the research team. Questions asked during the data collection process were typified by examples such as “Can you tell me a little bit about the business that you initially started through the NES programme?” and “In what ways have sources of finance supported your business?”

With the researchers concerned with understanding and unpacking ‘the how’ and ‘the why’ (Yin, 2013), analysis proceeded through iterative stages of thematic analysis (Guest et al, 2012), with the researchers examining the dataset for patterns in the collected transcripts and individual histories which explained the strategies and positions adopted by the entrepreneurs. Data analysis progressed through a series of stages including familiarisation, immersion, categorisation, association (pattern recognition), interpretation and finally explanation as utilised by others when attempting to unpack similarly complex problems (Kempster and Cope, 2010; Perkins et al, 2017). A comparison between the accounts provided enabled the researchers to highlight and discuss the differences in approaches adopted by the entrepreneurs. Illustrative quotations are included in the findings section to support the key arguments made by the researchers.

Results and implications.
1. Gender and formal investment strategies.
A recent survey by PeoplePerHour states that the average cost of starting a business is less than £2,000. In the large majority of cases, start-ups are self-financed and in all likelihood limited in scope for this. Inexperience, lack of a track record and no security for loans mean that all new entrepreneurs have difficulty accessing debt and equity finance (Cassar, 2004) particularly from the banks. However, persistence pays. Alan, an electrical portable appliance tester with two employees said:

“At first they didn’t want to lend me money when I started the business up because obviously there were loads of people starting businesses and I didn’t have any customers, I didn’t have lots of experience in the field so they wouldn’t lend money. Now I have got the experience, I’ve got the customers, I’ve got the long term contracts with customers, turnover had grown year on year every year since we started and now the banks want to lend.”

Stuart, the owner of a company that supplies and maintains display aquariums (4 employees), had similar success with the bank:

“I talked to them because we wanted an overdraft facility and I have asked to have that upped and they have upped it for me and we did have a bank loan at a stage and I repaid that, I subsequently asked for another one and I haven’t had a problem with that so I can’t really say too much about the bank”.

Stuart also utilised government grants and raising money through franchising:

“My wife and myself started the business with the help of this programme (NES). We try to put some money aside and reinvest and do it that way ourselves, as for a heavy growth plan we tried that in the early days with the franchising which I brought in business partners to do, grew the company to 26 staff and 5 franchises at that time, that was through another government programme.

Kelvin, a business development sole-trader shared a similar experience

“There are also pots of money available for certain businesses within this… the Barnsley region, made available from the European funding. So there were little pots of money for certain industries that I was aware of and I helped other people put a proposal together for that, and was successful. For myself, it has just been go to the bank and have a chat [. . .] and that’s about all.”

Official figures are not differentiated by gender, but there is widespread agreement that women face greater challenges raising start-up capital from formalised sources. Lisa, a sole trader who procures caring services recounts negative experiences trying to secure a bank loan

“Half the time they… if you went in there [the bank] with a good business plan and despite the posters there saying they are there to help businesses, but when it comes down to it unless you are willing to take on their PPI products - at the time when I was looking for finance, or their extra protection and all these different things, they weren’t interested in even negotiating anything with you.”

And her views are reflected by Elizabeth a sole trader who runs a creative workshop and tattooing business agreed with her:

“I did actually ask the first bank that I was with, Barclays and they were just “no” and then I moved to Bank of Scotland and again the response was “no” and that was back when people actually did give you loans”

2. Gender and resourceful connections

It is generally accepted that networks are important to entrepreneurs because they facilitate the efficient movement of resources (knowledge, financial capital) (Hanson & Blake, 2009: 141) that are not easily accessed through market mechanisms (Aldrich & Zimer, 1986; Granovetter, 1985; Curran, et al., 1993). Such networks also transmit information about their business to a wider network which facilitating access to new resources. Many of our male entrepreneurs demonstrated how this is achieved.
Alan, the PAT tester with two employees needed to take on another member of staff so that he could spend less time working in his business and more time building fruitful relationships outside of his business:

“I used to go to some [networking meetings], British Chamber of Commerce ones and ones around the area but not now because we are virtually fully booked now and we just don’t have the time to travel to them. (…) This is why I tried to take on another employee so that I could do more networking.”

Kelvin, the business development consultant couldn’t offer his service without it “Because of the work I do, more the business development side of it, it is really important. People don’t like to do business with people they don’t know so if you can form a personal relationship with anybody with regards to your business then somewhere along the line it could be a benefit.

Networks were also key in avoiding cash flow problems. Here our entrepreneurs utilised strategies including the ability to make payments at a later date, obtain advance payments from customers, and negotiate longer terms with suppliers. This method of bootstrapping is reputation-based and dependent on the owner’s ability to negotiate preferential terms that have mutual benefits (Ebben & Johnson, 2006). As they utilize distant relationships (weak ties), they are favourable in terms of the ratio of risk of damage to personal ties: beneficial and lucrative outcomes. In the main this activity was adopted unproblematically, instrumentally and recognised as central to entrepreneurial ‘work’. Every one of our male entrepreneurs could reflect on the usefulness of these strategies. Kelvin, the business development consultant found it useful to network with suppliers:

If it is a supplier then maybe they may be a little bit more receptive to your conversation about delaying payment. If it is a potential work provider then knowing you and what you do and how you operate can only be a benefit. So I think it is really important. Wherever possible you try to get the money in that is owed to you as soon as possible and you try to pay money out as late as possible. That is for most small businesses, they are very creative at accountancy. I used pro-forma invoices, I have gone to my suppliers, although they were very few and far between because of the nature of the work I was in, and asked for sixty days credit as opposed to thirty or ninety days credit as opposed to sixty. Networking events can only be good.

Stuart reflected on the cash flow advantages of repeat client relationships

“We’ve recently in the last year been involved with one of the world’s most expensive superyachts doing our work. It is really quite interesting and these clients tend to pay upfront, that is quite standard, they would expect you to ask for the money upfront”.

Similarly Jean-François, an events organiser, also managed establish up-front payment relationship to pay his suppliers and sub-contractors

“Most of the events I have organised I have been paid in advance anyway. There is very little normally, actually nothing that ends up not being paid (for) in advance.”

Jean-François had a similar approach weak-ties approach to employees:

I have used lots of interns for example that are actually sort of free… ”

It was fascinating that women entrepreneurs did not volunteer this method of financing as useful, and a couple of them outright rejected it. Elizabeth was passionate in her opinion:

I would never delay payments to suppliers, I usually pay straight away because I don’t want it (the bill) hanging over my head and really for the amount of money that you’d get if you don’t pay from one month to the next in terms of tax and things, you know interest, it is nothing”

In fact, women entrepreneurs in this case illustrated by Hannah, Tamera, Elizabeth and Vicci, were reflective and demonstrated reluctance to leverage weak network ties to release resources:

Hannah, who was owner of a company developing fresh baby food, considered it unavoidable:
“It always comes back to networking; it is one of the key things. (...) Relationships with manufacturers, and suppliers because (...) if you can get better, cheaper raw materials that is very important and if you can get a better deal with a manufacturer that is good. Networking is just a hygiene factor in business really. You are not taking advantage of your resources if you are not fully networked.”

And Tamera who manufactures mother and baby gifts that are based on castings and has two part-time employees was more positive, but also reflected on the conscious effort required:

“I have a policy that I... if I have like a new wholesale customer I will speak to them on the phone, I won’t just do it via email and also when I get a new supplier I will usually find an excuse to phone them and just chat to them and then you kind of build up a relationship. If you get to speak to someone often enough and you kind of build up a bit of a relationship so that if say their (order) cut off is midday and you phone them at 1:30 or something then... because they know you are ok and they know who you are they will say “oh yeah, we can still get that out same day for you”.

For Elizabeth and Vicci, a sign-language interpreter, leveraging weak ties did not bring the outcomes that justified the effort:

“I did find that networking events were useless. I didn’t seem to find that I got anything from them.”
(Elizabeth)

“I just go to the Federation of Businesses events but [. . .] the events don’t seem to meet any of my needs really.” (Vicci)

Only Maggie who buys and sells vintage theatrical costumes engaged in weak-ties networking events with enthusiasm:

“I think kind of networking is so important, particularly if you are a sole trader and you are working on your own, it is really great to go and meet up with other people in a similar situations because it can be a bit of a shock when you first start up to find that you have got nobody to ask about anything really. So having that kind of network of other people in a similar position can be great for sharing ideas and sharing information and you know… I had loads of really useful tips from people”.

A couple of the women entrepreneurs turned instead to remote networking (Lisa, who more recently runs a craft business)

“Twitter is a new thing I have got into since November, I am making quite a strong network there, I have got 300+ followers already so there is quite a lot of business networking going on. None of it has been financially there for me just yet but I am a bit timid about putting pictures up!

3. Gender and Joint utilisation of resources

The final means of procuring the means to grow a business is via the joint utilisation of resources. It has previously been suggested that women entrepreneurs are more likely to utilise bootstrapping activities involving actions such as sharing employees, assets or business space, or co-ordinating purchases with other firms to take advantage of economies of scale. These are less financially risky but may be costly in terms of time taken to perform high-maintenance networking and relationship management skills.

This trend was reflected in our sample. Men did not draw on these experiences. Women entrepreneurs, however and particularly Lisa, and Sue, a sole trading texting designer saw value in networks in facilitating these types of relationship:

“If there was a network to share resources, to come together and do collaborative work then that would be the type of network that would be useful. The networking I have been a part of in the past has been a lot about "I’m looking out for me, I’ll get what I need and after that I’m not really that interested." At the moment with me I am trying to piggy back with another business that has maybe got room within retail premises [. . .]. So it’s… yeah… I think sharing resources is definitely the way forward. Stronger together, definitely (Lisa).
“Some of the trade shows actually were quite expensive unless I went with West Midlands business group … you know it was cheaper for us all to be together. Doing it independently was quite expensive.” (Sue).

Elizabeth was typical “I have actually got a friend at the moment who does circus skills, parties and things and we share our contact details for clients and basically put a good word in for each other. Kind of help to double our networking and that is very valuable (…) Networking in that way is brilliant.

“Even though we are in competition it is all very, yeah, you scratch my back, I scratch yours kind of thing. We often share materials, ideas and tools, those kinds of things. For tools I always used to ask families and friends if they have got this or that but over the years I have built up quite a nice selection of tools now.” Elizabeth.

4. Gender and Owner-related bootstrapping methods

Our final means of procuring resource to support business growth are called owner-related methods and include financing using the owner’s savings, personal loans taken by the owner, or loans from the owner’s family and friends. These techniques carry the greatest risk to personal finances and close personal (strong) ties: ‘it is unlikely that small business owners would place their personal wealth at risk via credit card or foregone salary when other financing is available. The same is likely to be true regarding money and other resources obtained from the owner’s family and friends’ (Ebben & Johnson, 2006: 857). Because owner-related bootstrapping techniques do not require entrepreneurs to mobilize their social networks to access resources from ‘identity-based ties’ (Larson & Starr, 1993) or ‘strong ties’ (Granovetter, 1973), it is argued, they are likely to be associated with women.

Tamera provides us with a good example of this method

“I did have a few cash flow difficulties when I first started because I had my online merchant account with Worldpay and they said that they wouldn’t give me my money from the sales until 4 weeks later. So what happened at Christmas was that I had to do… a lot of the jewellery that I make, it takes time to make it, so those orders had to be in by November. I had somebody that makes jewellery up for me and so I’d have to pay her and obviously we’d get lots of sales because of Christmas and obviously I’d have to stock up in November because I knew I’d be busy selling the baby casting kits in December. So I’d have a big outlay in November and I wouldn’t get the money from the sales until January. That really mucked me up and that was the most difficult thing. I ended up having to borrow some money off a friend to sort of see me through and I had to do daily cash flow forecasts just to make sure everything was going to be there when it needed to be.

And

“luckily my… I have got a cousin who is an accountant”

Linda, a market researcher with a single employee – now let go – did the same:

“I borrowed some funds from family members. [ . . . ] After I did actually approach a bank for a loan and was turned down.

And Elizabeth went back to live with her parents.

The risks of talking this route are evident (Tamera)

“I do hear of lots of people that have borrowed money off of their dad, or boyfriend, or friend or whatever and then they can’t pay it back and then it ruins their relationship with that person. So that is quite a big disadvantage, you have to be sure that you are going to be able to pay it back (Tamera)
“Taking money from friends and family can strain relationships. I wouldn’t advise anybody to do it, I didn’t do it mainly because I just didn’t want to have that pressure, because it is one thing owing the bank, if you owe the bank and you can’t afford it, whatever, you just tell them and then they will have to lump it or like it or come to an arrangement with you, because you can’t do anything. But if you are owing friends or family then you have got a personal vested interest and that is always going to be a dicey thing to deal with.” (Lisa)

Hannah had rejected this route of raising finance

“It is difficult to get money; I think it is worth pushing for loans rather than using your own money. Partly it makes you refine your idea and make sure it is incredibly strong, because if it is not strong enough for someone to invest in there is probably a very good reason why not!”

Both men and women entrepreneurs were prepared to borrow against their personal credit card:

“I have used a credit card to pay the tax man because money hadn’t come in from somebody that owed me and I will have to do that again tomorrow.” (Vicci)

“In effect what happened was that I borrowed money on credit cards which actually I should never have done and I got behind (with payments). I found myself in a really difficult situation with that. I am coping though.” Jean-Francois

Though the women entrepreneurs were far more prepared to sacrifice their salary. Tamera said:

“I don’t remember, you see I tend to… mostly I take £1,000 a month from the business but… because I don’t work full time so I just think it doesn’t matter too much. It is fine if I kind of go… like make it a bit later, like a couple of weeks later or something.”

“I didn’t draw a salary, for most of the time I didn’t draw a salary I just sort of scraped by.” Lisa I didn’t use personal credit cards but I did pay myself a minimum salary… In fact I didn’t pay myself initially and then I took a very small amount to keep funds in the business. (Linda).

It was rare that the men entrepreneurs shared similar stories. Kelvin was an exception

“I had to use my savings; I had to forego pay on certain occasions. I never had to borrow money off family or friends or anything but the credit card was maxed out for a good couple of years … but it is what you do at the time.”

Both sets of entrepreneurs saw available finance as a source of confidence. Maureen, an author, saw it as external validation:

The bottom line is that it is what it is, it is not the cash in itself; it is the fact that someone is willing to invest, that is what the cash represents. That it is worth something to somebody.”

Whilst Alan B, who offered high-end horticultural services, was emboldened by the safety net

I had an overdraft agreement with the bank but I never used it. It was there so in a way it was just another form of insurance isn’t it, security… So you are more likely to be able to do something else because you know that you have got that backing. It was just personal choice, that was just the way I guess I am. I would always try to use up my personal assets first but I think… at the time things didn’t seem to be much of a problem with the economy, I think they would have lent me some money if I had wanted it.

Conclusion
By and large, our findings show that financing for men entrepreneurs was not unproblematic, however in the main they managed to avoid highly-emotionally-risky or emotionally labour intensive investment approaches, finding it most beneficial to warm up “weak” connections. They took an agentic and planned approach.
Women small business owners, in contrast, did not access the more formal, advantageous payment-related techniques, relying instead on strong ties and collaborative sharing strategies. Prior experiences with the gendered power relations (McDowell & Court, 1994) and masculinist priorities of the finance sector (Kerfoot & Knights, 1993) alongside unfair treatment during finance encounters Hill et al. (2006) have shaped the women’s experience and set out the boundaries of what might be achievable. Finding both formal financing approaches and networking meetings to be alien contexts, our data demonstrate the difficulties women entrepreneurs faced in scything a path through the gendered terrain associated with financing and maintaining the capital required to succeed in small business activities. We uncovered little evidence that women were agentic in their different routes to financing their business; indeed we find evidence weighted in favour of structural barriers. Faced with a social context that is rife with gendered power relations we argue that women cannot merely be characterised as ‘discouraged borrowers’ (Kon & Storey, 2003) such that they can be persuaded to change via encouragement. We suggest, instead, that women entrepreneurs are faced with a context that draws on gender stereotypes to create a financing context that is almost impossible to successfully navigate.

References.


PeoplePerHour (accessed 19.03.2017) https://www.taxassist.co.uk/resources/show-news-amp/title/majority-of-startups-cost-less-than--in-funding-says-survey/id/900000104/


Women’s Entrepreneurship and Networking
Negotiating the female leader role in the family business succession in Mainland China

Nan Jiang, n.jiang@my.westminster.ac.uk
University of Westminster, United Kingdom

Dr Huiping Xian, h.xian@sheffield.ac.uk
University of Sheffield, United Kingdom

Abstract

This research has drawn on the concept of identity as being socially constructed. Accordingly, the social structures and social interactions through which a person's role is ascribed, created and recreated is critical to understand the process of identity construction. In this research, the construction of identity as it is driven by role negotiation is a phenomenon that has been explored in the context of family business leadership succession in the Mainland China. Since socialist market economic reform was introduced, there has been increasing changes of female role in the social structures in Mainland China. However, little has been researched on the complexity of current gender role structure in Mainland China and how this might be played out in the identity of female successor and their leadership in Chinese family business succession.

Method

Twenty face-to-face semi-structured interviews were conducted with female successors to understand the roles they played in the Chinese family firms. Thematic analysis was applied to understand various views of respondents on issues in relation to gender, the family business leadership and succession. Interpretive approach was taken to explain how these disparate views influence the characteristics of behaviours, relationships with family members, as well as their strategies to negotiate the role of female successor in becoming a leader in the Chinese family business.

Results and Implications

A key finding from this research is that the conservative Confucian belief to assume disparate roles between women and men still predominantly operated in Chinese family business succession for having harmonious leadership successions.

However, these conservative values and social norms regarding the gender roles have been increasingly challenged by socialist and capitalist values in China’s current socialist market reform, such as gender equality, liberty and competitiveness, believed by younger generation of Chinese women. This indicates that identity among female successors in Chinese family firms become more that of the radical and rebel. They would confront the elder male founders and managers to negotiate prescribed conservative gender roles. For example, they would challenge the family decision on a filial daughter should not claim the ownership of the family business, or compete with the male heirs for the leadership.

On the other hand, their radical actions have been perceived to disrupt the harmony that is ultimately valued in the Chinese family and society. Therefore, some female successors felt disconnected from the family, and some were ambivalent towards their action to pursuit the independent self, as well as being discouraged to take leadership in the family business.

These findings implied that traditional Chinese family is under pressure to transform in the balance with capitalist values that stress egalitarian roles for men and woman, and individual needs as opposed to collective values. Yet, there are lessons for some female successors to establish and improve themselves as a leader of family business while not at the cost of family harmony, such as act as the "second leader" to help the male heir to succeed.

Keywords: Gender role, entrepreneurial identity, female leadership succession
Introduction

In this study, the construction of individual’s leader identity was perceived as a process of role negotiation influenced by family and non-family social structures. This process of role negotiation has been explored in the context of family business leadership succession in the Mainland China. Since socialist market economic reform was introduced in mainland China back to 1970s, there has been increasing changes of female role in the gender structures in Mainland China (Lin and Mac an Ghaill, 2013). However, little has been researched on the complexity of current gender role structure in Mainland China (Seo and Huang, 2017) and how this might be played out in the identity of female successor and their leadership in Chinese family business succession.

Literature Review

Role identity is a dynamic concept. According to the social constructionist approach, role identity is formed through processes where ‘society shapes self’ and the ‘self gets shaped by society’ (Burke, 2006, Mead, 1934). Subsequently, other researchers have further extended this concept. Sheldon and Burke (2000) showed that identity is formed by the interactions of the self with the surrounding society, and suggested to look into the process of role negotiation. The broad inference shared by these conceptual researchers is that society impacts the self and the self also impacts society through processes of shared language and meanings, from which the dynamics of role identity can be observed (Thoits, 2012). That is, the social structures and social interactions through which a person’s role is ascribed, created and recreated is critical to understand the process of identity construction. This study is to take consideration of the unique research context of family business in Mainland China, and recognised that leader role identity formation as a process being structured and shaped as the co-construction between family and non-family structures (the broader social milieu) (Hall, 2012).

First-generation Chinese business families emerged in the 1970s, when the Chinese government endorsed private ownership under ‘socialist market economy reform’ and a ‘market-oriented economic system’ operating in a socialist political system (Pistrui et al., 2006). Confucian values and a market environment characterised by institutional deficiencies in supporting private ownership are main external influences on the first generation of Chinese business family to start up (Carney et al., 2011). Hence, the overwhelming focus on family values, maximisation of family wealth, and focus on family control of ownership and management (Au and Ho Kwong, 2009).

Family businesses form a critical component of China’s economic engine (Ling and Xi, 2014). Research conducted by Ye et al. (2011) indicates that the importance of family businesses in China is currently threatened due to their inability to transfer management successfully to the next generation. These findings are corroborated by Tao and Yi (2012), whose research found that while the current owners of family businesses in China want the next generation to take over the business, only 35 present of the next generation intend doing so. Therefore, there are several problems amongst most these younger generations of family business members that jeopardise their willingness to take over or work in their family concerns; particularly, the specific issues related to the female successors.

Given that identity formation is a social process, we noticed that there are several major influences in Chinese culture that can potentially impact on the family business successors. According to Hwang (2012), these include the impact of Confucianism, promotion of the collective good as opposed to promotion of individual good, respect for age, hierarchy, authority, and the importance given to hard work and thrift. An investigation of the ways in which Chinese family businesses are managed shows that they place immense importance on values such as honesty, patriotism and filial piety (Guo, 2008,p56). The collectivist principles of Confucianism mean that harmony must characterise all interpersonal (including business) relationships (Zurndorfer, 2004). Organisational goals are collective targets, not personal objectives. Another influence on Chinese society has been Maoism/Communism, which has dominated political ideology in China since 1949 and whose impact continues to this day.
Research conducted by Leung (2010) indicates that second generation family members of business families in China have ambivalent feelings on the involvement of the founders to enforce the traditions of the family business. The current generation of Chinese family business members, constituted by those who have entered their family businesses since the 1990s, have grown up in a society characterised by both economic and cultural changes. As China has embraced capitalism (while continuing to adhere to Communist collectivistic ideology) and with the intensification of competition, traditional concepts, values and ways of operating are being threatened by new values and ideas. According to Dowling and Brown (2009), these include such new realities as job insecurity, increased privatisation, profits or losses in private businesses, increasing inequalities of income, budget constraints, and in both domestic and international competition. Young Chinese today have absorbed many values that are highly regarded in Western culture (Ding-qiang and Chao, 2008). These include creativity, innovation, negotiation, confrontation, transparent communication, tolerance, opportunism and professionalism. These may at times be antithetical to Chinese values. The survivor mentality that characterised behaviour in an economically unstable environment has given way to the aspiration for self-actualisation, reflecting Western philosophy and ways of being (Zhang and Lee, 2012).

The unique socialist market economy reform in China exerts great influence on interactions within family and broader society in shaping the core self of young generation (Li, 2014). It is likely to result in distinctive cognitive, linguistic and behavioural features, but previous research has not fully explored the impact of this complex Chinese social context on the group of female family business successors, who entered family firms post 1990’s and have grown up in the family and society characterised by these changes (Shi and Dana, 2013).

Therefore, this research seeks to answer the questions:
Firstly, to understand the extent of which the process of negotiating female family business leadership was influenced by the conservative female roles ascribed by Confucian values and family collectivism.
Secondly, the extent of which the process of negotiating female family business leadership was impacted by the female roles that are aspired d by modern feminist views.

Methodology
Twenty in-depth interviews were conducted with female successors to understand the roles they played in the Chinese family firms. Thematic analysis was applied to understand various views of respondents on issues in relation to gender, the family business leadership and succession. Interpretive approach was taken to explain how these disparate views influence the characteristics of behaviours, relationships with family members, as well as their strategies to negotiate the role of female successor in becoming a leader in the Chinese family business.

Finding
Respondents were asked how they consider their roles in the family businesses to be influenced by their gender. Two different views were conceptualised amongst female successors interviewed for this research. Each view differs on the extent of which women and men are treated differently for the opportunity to manage, own and lead family business during the leadership succession. Moreover, these female respondents differ on the importance they placed on the value of family harmony in the leadership succession, and the level of rebellious behaviours in the approaches they took to negotiate the leader role.

The leader role of conservative female family business members
Tu (1998) stated that traditional Chinese families have strict gender roles to which children are expected to conform. The expectation of sons is that they must carry on the family name and bring honour and glory to the family. Male heirs when reach puberty are regarded as the master of the householder, while female family members are expected to compromise for this common family goal. Per Chinese culture, men must take care of things outside the home, while women take care of things within the house (ibid). These views are manifested in finding below.

Finding indicated that the conservative Confucian belief to assume disparate roles between women and men still predominantly operated in Chinese family business succession for having harmonious leadership
successions. These conservative stereotypes on the role of women were reinstated in four respondents' statements that

"sons are precious, as they bring wealth to the house and stays in the house, while girls take wealth away from the house."

For example, one of these conservative female respondents mentioned on her decision to work for the family businesses:

“I understand the concern of my parents. I am the daughter and would eventually marry and leave the family. To Chinese people, a married daughter is like water that has been poured, no return. Through my marriage, the family wealthy would have different family name. If my brother succeeds, it would still be kept in the family. To be honest, I kind agree with them just to think how hard they work for what we had today.”

Apparently, this female respondent, who currently manages the family business before her brother finishes the university education and takes over, defends conservative views on the female roles in the Chinese family. She supported that the decision on the successor should consider the impact of daughter marriages on the ownership of family business assets.

In addition, some respondents mentioned how the female role becomes problematic not only to succeed the ownership of tangible assets, but more challenging for the succession of intangible assert, such as the family networks. One respondent defended her parents on the decision made on putting her to be "the boss behind the curtain". She explained that in the conservative community where her family businesses reply on to survive, it is difficult for the role of a female family business successor to be socially verified:

“I was the smart one in the family. I know the purpose that my parents were paying for my education abroad was that my brother would have good hands to help manage the business. I would not mind being the boss behind the curtain, because it is difficult for a young woman to be taken seriously in the business. Sometime, people would say 'why the company sent a little girl, please go and get your father or brother, I do not talk to someone who cannot make decision.'... they do not even give me a chance to communicate, and insist to see the men in the house. The truth is my father would still ask my opinion after he had meetings with them.”

In the type of business community from which her roles hails has the conventional culture that women assume roles in the house, while men are expected to pursue positions outside the house to earn for the family. Given the dependent roles females assumed in interactions in and outside the family, women were often regarded as being inferior to men, thus are expected to be submissive to men, and often results inequality for their rights (Pan et al., 2012). It is not a social norm for females to take over the males’ roles in the conventional business seniors. Therefore, in the case above, when a daughter representing the male roles in the family business, it was difficult for the others in this structured community to perceive and respondent. Therefore, the female respondent was displaced in the family business and marginalized in her business community, because there is little space for a female family business leader in a conservative business society. She may be more educated than her brother to lead the family businesses, and capable of communicating with the stakeholders and make business decisions. She was not the preferred successor. It was against conventional social norms regarding the leader role of family business in the conservative Chinese family and society, which would be preferably male.

However, according to the interviews with these conservative female respondents, they did not feel being mistreated. In fact, they defended her conservative family and others who have undermined their social positions. As we could see from the statements, they concerned about the expectation and feelings of their parents and the collective goals in the family business to preserve the family wealth. This was largely related to the Confucian family values, the filial piety (Lü, 2006), that has been underpinning the conservative views of female leader roles. As the principle of filial piety concerned, children in the family are expected to listen to their parents and recommend strong adherence to these precepts for the good and unity of the family (Lau et al., 1990). Accordingly, these conservative female respondents prioritised the role of being filial daughter, for
which they did not question the socially prescribed family business leader role for males in the conservative family.

In fact, these conservative female family business members were not passively espousing traditional views on gender, but felt it was their obligation to the family and a designated life to live as a filial daughter to support the males in the family business leadership. A respondent stated:

"I think what is good for the family is the best for me. The last thing I wish is to go against my family. I would feel ashamed, as it would be scandalous in this small town to fight with my parents and brother for the ownership of the family business. In the case that I won, others would not respect me. People would think I am not to be trusted if I could treat family like outsiders, and eventually would affect the business."

The respondent considered herself to be a filial daughter before any of the self-interests and even felt ashamed if their behaviour were deviated from the role of filial daughter in accordance with the Confucian family values. They in fact considered these liberal behaviours as the misbehaviour that would have disrupted the family harmony and damaged their social reputations in the business community.

Among these conservative female respondents, some of them even have a firm belief that Chinese tradition in the family and the society has irreplaceable value to the survival of the business and its sustainable development. A respondent argued that:

"In this ever changing and competitive business world today in China, only family could be trusted in this materialistic world, when everyone works for money, and no one cares about morality and the tradition. In China, for thousands of years, men and women have their own positions. It becomes a problem in China today when men and women do not know their places. A lot of families are broken because of that. How could any business continue, if a family could not live together?"

This respondent thought these conservative social norms regarding different roles for men and women have been a functional structure for the long history of Chinese society. She thought respecting the tradition should not be a choice, because becoming a choice would be disruptive to the modern family life. Such a conservative attitude of female family members is unlikely to causes conflict for the family business succession to support only the male heir. These conservative respondents believe that following the tradition would avoid confusion and ambiguity in performing roles and preserve peace and harmony in the family. Family harmony is critical for the business to survive across generations (Kidwell et al., 2012). These attitudes and believes have shown absolute agreement and compliance with the conservative views of the family on men and women. There is no outright rebellion.

Overall, none of conservative female family business members disagree with the traditional Chinese views. Neither do they have ambition of their own, other than to follow in the footsteps of their parents, and feel proud that they could scarifies themselves for the family and believe that their sacrifices are good for the survive of the family business. These conservative respondents were very risk-averse and there is little evidence to take over the family businesses.

**The leader role of modern female family business members**

However, these conservative values and social norms regarding the female leader role in the family businesses are challenged by capitalist values in China’s current socialist market reform, such as gender equality, liberty and competitiveness (Poston and Glover, 2005). These modern values are believed by the young generation of Chinese women. Interviews with these modern female family members have shown that the females in Chinese family firms transformed to be more that of the radical and rebel.

Coming to our surprises in interviews, as China becomes a more materialistic society, the conventional views on the female family business leader role were reinforced by the materialistic views of women from the
capitalist culture in the Anglo-American world (Cai et al., 2012). A respondent said in an ironic tone and sounded confused:

“If I cannot marry a man from an equally wealthy family or greater, I become the shame of the family or a loser in society. Sometime, I am confused why my parents send me to study abroad, if they do not expect me to do well by myself and not give a chance to work for the family business. What is the value of being a woman, whose purpose of life is to find a husband who can help my parents in the family business, and take care of me? I felt ashamed and worthless.”

It seems that, in modern China, female offspring were often commoditised as the family asserts for acquiring more resources for the family business through marriage (Constantin, 2016). On the other hand, there is no such pressure or social responsibility for the male heirs, because the conservative role of men was to earn for the family. Therefore, male heirs are expected to fulfil this family expectation and find a suitable wife to support this goal of their designated leading roles in the family.

Moreover, in the family business succession, the male heir would be more likely to receive the family business ownership and succeed the leader role, while females are given relatively small amount of cash to marry out of the family. A respondent complained:

“I do not understand why my elder brother is so entitled. What makes me more upset is that my parents think this arrangement is reasonable. Am I not their child? Why I shall be left out for the share of family business. I do not think I am less capable to do anything for the business (as a woman). I have been very successful in other jobs. It feels really sad when not being trusted by one’s own parents.”

This female respondent expressed her deeply frustration with the inequality between male and female heirs in terms of their rights to claim the ownership and the leader role in the family business. Radical rebel female respondents thus actively improve their positions in the family and may seek to pursue unconventional female roles outsider the family.

These radical respondents often appealed to their families over the equal share of family wealth. They used the words such as “war” and “fight”, when describing how they interact with the family during the succession. A respondent told a story that:

“After my father died, I fight for the control of family assert. Everyone thinks that I should not have challenged my father’s will to pass the business to my brothers. As a woman, I shall bear it and not to stir things in the family. However, I do not understand why I cannot, if my incapable brothers are about to destroy the business, while I could do something. Thus, I fight like a tiger, and everyone thinks that I am cold blood.”

This respondent showed a great determination to negotiate the female leader role for the family business, for which she has challenged the social norms in relation to the conventional submissive Chinese female image. She went a great length to negotiate with other family members on her right to claim the business leadership. She showed her strength as an independent modern woman who has her own judgment and was courageous in her action. Those are characteristics of her dominant rebel identity, which has driven her to act as the agent of change of conventional female roles in the social world of Chinese family business.

Nevertheless, when these Radical Rebel women challenged these social norms, they are often criticised for their reckless attitudes to change. Their independent thoughts were not well received, and their behaviours to pursue the personal goals were too rebellious to be supported by the family. Some languages were used to demonise their roles of becoming an independent woman pursuing their own interests in the family, such as “cold blood” as mentioned by the respondent above, and “leftovers” or “material woman”. We observed that, in the process of negotiating their independence as a female family business leader, most of them were not sentiment about these criticisms, some of them were struggling, and some of them had hard feelings for their radical actions. One respondent stated:

“Everyone thinks that I live the perfect life a woman could dream of. My parents and my husband said: ‘why you cannot live like a normal woman who would only stay home and take care of the family.’ They cannot
understand why I am so keen to do businesses, while it is unnecessary for me to earn. I am a very independent person. I hate sitting at home and being taken care of. Moreover, it is not a good feeling to hear people saying that I live good life only because I was born in a good family and married to a successful business man.”

This statement implied that little support from the family and society for the modern aspirations of these female respondents to become an independent woman and run a business like a man. The liberation of these female respondents from their conventional family roles was perceived to be “(not) understandable”, “(not) normal” and “unnecessary”.

Indeed, the modern western capitalism influences have not radically transformed the conventional family gender roles structure, and woman becomes more aware of their independence and equal right as these of men (Xian and Woodhams, 2008). A respondent sadly reported that:

“After I returned from UK with my master degree in marketing, I became an event organiser and had 10 employees. In those years, I was too busy to have any social life until I reached (age) 28. People started asking my plan for marriage. My father gave me a last warning. He said ‘please do not become the shame to the family. You are not going to be one of these ‘leftovers.’ He actually threated that he would pull his investment out from my company, so that I would have nothing to worry but the matter of marriage.”

This rebellious female respondent was frustrated with the situation that the modern Chinese society still values the traditional role of women as being a filial daughter and a good wife (Nilan, 2009). Because of these conservative views, society would punish a modern career women who priorities their professional roles, and shames them with a name “leftover” for neglecting the social expectation for them to fulfil these conservative roles in the family and for marriage.

Given that, some female respondents took moderate rebel approaches to negotiate the female family business leader role, because they did not wish to disrupt the harmony that is ultimately valued in the Chinese family and society. This reflects conservative Chinese collectivistic values. From collectivistic point of view, the preservation of family harmony during the process is the pathway to a successful family business succession (Li et al., 2010). Considering maintaining the family harmony, even though moderate rebel female respondents did not agree with these traditional views on women and their roles in the family and society, they did not necessarily rebel against these views. Instead, they try to bring about change from within the family. Some female respondents suggested changing family views through dialogue and soft approaches instead of confronting radical approaches. A respondent reported:

“I worked hard alongside my parents several years ago, when they wished to restructure the family firm to a modern company. I had a good job in a large state owned organisation by then, but I volunteered to help them because they need me who was the only business undergraduate in the family. I help my parents transform every single bit of the business throughout the years. No one knows better than me about this family business. I did not replace my brother to lead the family business. The business cannot run without me.”

This moderate rebellious female family member tried to gain the trust of family members on her capability to lead the family business. She has achieved this leadership through performing well on these prescribed conservative roles of a filial daughter, who helped parents manage the business transformation. From her education and pervious job experiences, she has obtained irreplaceable capabilities for leading the modernisation of a family business, and her knowledge and skills learnt in this experience are then transferable for leading the transformed family business in the modern world.

Overall, data collected from the modern female family business members’ interviews has shown that they have different approaches in terms of different characteristics of rebel behaviours. These behaviour characteristics indicated that different radical levels in dealing with the role conflict of being a filial daughter, who wish to become the leader of Chinese family businesses. The marriage pressure was so incredibly
intense for these female respondents to comply with the conventional female roles as a wife to support the male in the family. A female family member must have a very strong will and strong personality to withstand that kind of discrimination and marriage pressure coming from all sides. To achieve this, they challenged the family decision that a filial daughter should not claim the ownership of the family business, and competed with the male heirs for the leadership. They would confront the elder male founders and managers to negotiate prescribed conservative masculine leader roles. Many people in the modern Chinese society were still conservative regarding the female leader role, because radical approaches some women believed, so that they were confronting and fight for the equal right as the opportunities of such for men in the family business. These respondents in this study were marginalised and displaced in the society for their unconventional belief and actions. However, there are few who were creative in taking some soft approaches that align the contradictory roles between the filial daughter in the family and the leader to change the convention within the family businesses.

**Conclusion and Discussion**

Society shares meanings and language with individuals that lead to their identification of possible roles (Hall, 2012). Society facilitates the social processes that enable individuals to self-reflect, and this process constitutes the essence of selfhood (Stets and Burke, 2003). The implication is that identity leads to action that changes society. This concept of socially constructed identities can be extended to the understanding of female family business leader role negotiation: individual family business members impact their families and their businesses (Knapp et al., 2013). Their actions can serve as an effective catalyst of performance within Chinese business families, driving change from within. This is the true value of studies on role and identity, and demonstrates why this research is being undertaken. We observed different patterns of behaviours with respect to interviews with female Chinese business family members who either comply or negotiate the conventional female roles in the family and broader society. Moreover, there is sufficient evidence from the interview of some female respondents aspire to become the agent of change during the family business leadership succession.

They are more likely to be independent from the family before joining in the firm and have a strong desire to lead innovation in the existing family business. This intention is moderated by the role of traditional Chinese family values and culture held by others associated with the family business. The young generation of female family business were constrained in conservative Chinese society, and some fight for their rights. On the other hand, some of them took soft approach to define the leader role within their family businesses and demand the understanding and support of their families. To obtain this goal, they work, learn and train themselves outside the family business and share unconventional values and ideas with those conservative family members to alleviate resistance to their radical approaches and unconventional changes. These findings implied that traditional Chinese family is under pressure to transform in the balance with capitalist values that stress egalitarian roles for men and woman, and individual needs as opposed to collective values. Yet, there are lessons for some female family members to establish and improve themselves as a leader of family business while not at the cost of family harmony.

Many practical implications for supporting the need of female family business members to perform their roles within the PRC family firms have been drawn from finding. Given that these female respondents were well educated and has been exposed to the outside world, as well as the fact that there are many opportunities for growth and development in China nowadays, family businesses must become more flexible and adaptable if the female family members wish to stay and succeed in the business. If families are very rigid in their attitude, some of the identities, such as that of entrepreneurship, may never have a chance to develop. Similarly, female children who can potentially turn around the business may never get a chance to do so, simply because family/societal values proscribe women from entering the businesses.

Developing such adaptability and flexibility is also crucial if the family is to adjust to rapid changes in the external market environment. The Chinese domestic markets will not be protected from external competition for much longer. Most family businesses must eventually compete in international markets where the western
ideology and values become dominant and communication would be built on common values, such as respecting the equality between women and men. In this scenario, holding the view that shuts the door to outside influences, ideas, interventions and sources of finance and skillsets will negatively impact the family business. The markets are extremely dynamic, and this calls for a family system and attitude that is both structurally and functionally adaptive to the requirements of both the market and its members. In a society that is growing increasingly individualistic, the family must – for its own survival – learn to work in a less loosely knitted structure than what operates in conventional families. This would result in a more balanced family with more open styles of leadership, communication patterns and sharing of roles, especially more feminine approaches. We think this will in turn lead to improved family relationships in modern China, which is a very important criterion for the success of the family business enterprise.

There are several sources of conflict for the leader role of female family business members living in the Mainland China. The traditional, Confucian society will eventually give way to one dominated by centrally planned capitalism, and collectivism values. This is a society where there is increasing irreverence towards elders, where respect must be earned and is not unconditionally given, where women are demand to be treated on a par with men, and where the individual and his/her education, dreams, aspirations and careers are accorded more importance than the collective good. The implication is that most Chinese families have had to change and adapt, and move away from traditional modes of thinking and acting, in accordance with changes in the external society and environment. In addition, some of the traditional values are being challenged, especially those related to roles within the family, and questions of ownership, succession and management of the family business. Prescribing roles for female/younger children, and expecting them to comply, is going to be increasingly challenged, as is the custom of passing on ownership of property and the business to male children. In this context, conflict within Chinese business families is almost inevitable, and may pose a threat to the social harmony of the family, which could lead to the failure of the family business.

Finding indicated that respondents with “radical approaches” were often seen as too self-centred and the disruption of the harmony in the traditional collectivistic family and society in PRC. From this, I would argue that the “soft approaches” developed some female respondents may be more applicable and effective, in terms of obtaining supports from these traditional PRC family and society for any changes to happen. Concerning the emotional consequence that these respondents, who have suffered from their approach of avoiding conflicts to maintain harmony within the family or social relationship, I would suggest that the need of harmony has to be carefully considered with regards to the importance of individual needs. The understanding and tolerant attitudes from family and public for their distinctive behaviours within family business is critical.

Nevertheless, some female respondents had sufficient family business experiences, which have provided them the quality of being versatile and flexible. Their potentials were retained because they voluntarily segregated different roles with contradictory values, to minimise conflict. They have good skills to manage identity boundaries for their role enactment within the family business, but less motivated to challenge status quo. They could leverage their potential through training themselves for the irreplaceable capabilities in the development stage of the family business.

Limitations and Scope for Future Research
A key finding from this research is that inequality between men and women is till predominant in PRC, which is increasingly driven by capitalist values. This is indicated in the fact that identity among these women becomes more that of the radical and rebel, and may therefore disrupt the harmony of PRC family and society. These changes need to be further investigated about the aspirations of women in PRC family firms, and their desire for gender equality in an increasingly capitalist society. How Confucianism must be reinterpreted in terms of modern values that operate in China, or how to show whether Confucianism is still relevant in modern Chinese society, offers scope for future study. This study has demonstrated that it is because of Confucianism that most Chinese families avoid dispute, conflict and disruption. The relevance of other Confucian values must be explored, to understand how young people in China today remain in touch
with their culture. Similarly, it is necessary to perceive how the collectivistic values from socialist influences can be interpreted to suit the requirements of young people in China.

References


LÜ, M. 2006. Religious Dimensions of Filial Piety as Developed in Late Ming Interpretations of the Xiaojing. Late Imperial China, 27, 1-37.


Opportunity discovery and creation of female entrepreneurs in Welsh and Turkish entrepreneurial ecosystem: A social capital perspective

Shandana Sheikh, Aybeniz Akdeniz, Shumaila Yousafzai and Saadat Saeed

1. Introduction

While, women entrepreneurship (WE) is identified as the ‘way forward’ (World Economic Forum, 2012), the discourse on the ‘underperformance’ of women enterprises compared to their male counterparts still holds (Ahl, 2006; Marlow et al., 2008; Powell and Eddleston, 2008). Much of this debate results from the adopting a narrow approach to studying WE, one that focuses only on individual factors and disregards the impact of macro-level factors on WE, thus ignoring the factors that affect women performance. Such tendency is even more common in case of small scale women entrepreneurs, those who may start a business from home or remain small due to resource constraints or personal preferences. Due to their size and visibility, small-scale women entrepreneurs are tainted with hues of underperformance, although these women may be creating several opportunities in their business. Considering the dangers of an individual level approach to study WE and the lack of contextual orientation within it, scholars have highlighted the need to move towards a contextually embedded approach to study WE, its antecedents, processes and outcomes (Zahra et al, 2014; Welter, 2011; Autio et al 2014). Hence, it is crucial to recognize that all women entrepreneurial activity is embedded in their entrepreneurial ecosystem (Isenberg, 2011); a set of interrelated factors (Human Capital, Finance, Markets, Social support, Policy and Culture) that individually or interactively impact the performance and success of women owned businesses. Past research documents that women entrepreneurs face several constraints within their entrepreneurial environment including financial, socio-cultural and institutional constraints that hinder their ability to perform well in business. Additionally, scholars have also discussed the gender-based discrimination that impacts entrepreneurial activity of women. Thus, analyzing WE from a broader, multi-level approach, may help to understand that women entrepreneurs do not ‘underperform’ but are instead ‘constrained’ in their performance (Marlow et al 2013; Van de Ven, 1993; Spilling, 1996).

Acknowledging the constrained performance of women in entrepreneurship and in line with the contextual embedded approach, we contend that although women face considerable challenges from their entrepreneurial environment or ecosystem, their social networks (formal and informal) enable them to be successful in their business and create opportunities within it. Our objective in this study is to identify the perceived weakness/weaknesses of the entrepreneurial ecosystem among Welsh and Turkish entrepreneurial ecosystem, thus highlighting the different elements that impact entrepreneurial activity of women in each ecosystem. Our second objective is to study how social capital (SC), primarily formal and informal social networks enable Welsh and Turkish women to create opportunities in their business, despite of the weaknesses of their respective ecosystem. Based on the creation theory of entrepreneurial action, we focus on opportunity creation which seeks to explain the actions that entrepreneurs take to create and exploit opportunities (Venkataraman, 2003; Shane and Venkataraman, 2000: 211; Alvarez and Barney, 2007). In exploring the role of SC in opportunity creation, we focus on the relational, structural and cognitive embeddedness of SC and explain how these impact opportunity creation of women.

In line with the social constructionist epistemology and interpretive stance, we adopt a qualitative methodology to achieve the objectives set forth above. We incorporate 6 cases of small women enterprises, 3 each from Wales and Turkey and explore the extent to which SC enables women entrepreneurs to create opportunities in their business. Our findings suggest that while both Welsh and Turkish women entrepreneurs have different perceptions about their entrepreneurial ecosystem and its individual components, they create opportunities in their business through their SC. Specifically, we find that women utilize both formal and informal SC to create opportunities in multiple contexts including Business context, Financial context, Human Capital context and Social context. Our findings also suggest that while all dimensions (structural and

30 Corresponding Author: SheikhSS@cardiff.ac.uk
relational and cognitive) of SC affect the extent of opportunity creation in women businesses, cognitive SC restricts opportunity creation among women and thus impacts their business performance.

2. Women entrepreneurship in Wales and Turkey

Small business activity is a vital source of economic and social contribution in an economy. For the Welsh economy, small businesses are a ‘lifeline’ (Wales Online, 2015), accounting for 99% of all businesses in Wales. However, despite of the importance of small businesses, the number of businesses, specifically those owned by women are low (Thomas, 2015). Recent Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (GEM) figures suggest that only 4.2% of working age women are engaged in setting up a business while 3.1% expect to do so in future years (GEM, 2013). Moreover, women businesses have a higher exit and failure rate as compared to men wherein most women tend to exit from entrepreneurship due to personal reasons or business failure itself. Research suggests that Welsh women tend to have less positive attitudes towards starting a business compared to men (30% vs 38%), resulting in lower rates of women owned enterprises (Federation of small businesses, 2016). Major factors accounting for lower entrepreneurship rates among women in Wales include lack of encouragement and support in case of failure, (Meechan, 2013) and lack of role models (Thomas, 2015). Additionally, female entrepreneurs face specific resource constraints including access to funding and finance (Verheul & Thurik, 2001), which is due to the small-scale nature of women businesses (Carter and Rosa, 1998) and due to the gender discrimination against women enterprises which makes it difficult for women to access funding from financial institutions. Therefore, women entrepreneurs tend to borrow less and in smaller amounts, compared to men. Beyond financial constraints, women are under-represented on the government board of the Welsh enterprise Zones and thus are less often viewed in the capacity of leadership positions, resulting in limited success stories and role models for prospective women who aspire to start a business. This in turn results in the low rate of entrepreneurship among women in Wales and hence less value contribution in the economy.

As in other countries and particularly in Turkey, gender gap in entrepreneurship is high with only 7.4% of all businesses being owned by women (Okten, 2013). Women led enterprises in Turkey are concentrated in sectors that are low-profit generating including financial services, education and social services (Okten, 2013; Singh et al, 2001). Prominent factors that account for the lower WE rate in Turkey include fear of failure (41% for women versus 33% for men), access to finance (Ince, 2012; Okten, 2013; Boudet and Agar, 2014), higher tax rates, malpractices of informal competitors, corruption and tax administration (37% for men and 38% for women), political instability (17% for women) perceived capability of starting a business (35% for women versus 53% for men). Moreover, the underlying social and cultural norms also deter women from achieving their entrepreneurial goals in Turkish entrepreneurial ecosystem. Social barriers including gender-biased policies and regulations, lack of child-care provision and other support services for women present significant challenges for women to perform in their entrepreneurial ventures (Cebeci and Essmat, 2015).

Taking into account the challenges of their respective entrepreneurial ecosystems, Welsh and Turkish, considerable efforts at the government level have been initiated to encourage and increase women entrepreneurial intentions and efforts, create employment and generate economic and social value through WE in Welsh and Turkish economies (Ecevit, 2000; Meechan, 2013).

3. Social Capital and women entrepreneurship

SC is a significant contributor to knowledge production, research exchange, research and development processes and education (Westlund, 2006) and thus is considered a key driver of entrepreneurship (Doh and Zolnik, 2011). Through networks, entrepreneurs can create new opportunities and learn new skills which significantly promote entrepreneurial activity (Kogut, 1988; Hamel, 1991). Although various definitions of SC are present in literature, our research builds upon Coleman’s (1990) definition which refers to SC as “an attribute of the social structure in which a person is embedded” and it is not “the private property of any of the persons who benefit from it”. Thus, we consider the individual SC which arises because of an entrepreneur’s personal and professional network relationships.
Female entrepreneurs face considerable constraints with regards to participation in formal networks (e.g., business associations, societies and chambers of business leaders) and thus may not have the opportunity to build relationships with a mentor and learn from their experience. Thus, women entrepreneurs do not benefit from the essential skills and expertise that members of professional networks (Fielden et al., 2003; Klyver and Terjesen 2007; Kumra and Vinnicombe 2010). Therefore, they tend to rely on informal networks including industry networks such as current or past customers, suppliers as well as employees of financial institutions. Such informal networks may provide them with access to information and enable them to identify and exploit opportunities (Johannisson, 2000). Informal networks such as family and spousal support are a significant source of SC for female entrepreneurs (McGowan et al., 2015; Carter et al., 2001; Neergaard et al., 2005).

3.1. Social Capital and Opportunity Creation. Entrepreneurship is the process of ‘by whom’, ‘how’, and ‘what’ affects opportunities to create future good and services are discovered, evaluated and exploited’ (Shane and Venkataraman, 2000). Actions taken by entrepreneurs determine the extent to which opportunities are created (Weick, 1979). Entrepreneurs interact with various elements of their entrepreneurial environment and socially construct the opportunities for their businesses (Alvaraz and Barney, 2007). This reflects the exogenous nature of opportunities suggesting that opportunities do not pre-exist in the market or industry but instead are created by entrepreneurs by utilizing the available resources in their entrepreneurial environment (Gartner, 1985; Sarasvathy, 2001; Aldrich and Kenworthy, 1999; Berger and Luckmann, 1967). It also suggests that different entrepreneurs create different opportunities which differ in context, number as well as their impact on business. Previous scholars have discussed several factors that significantly affect opportunity recognition including individual traits of the entrepreneur (Zahra et al, 2006; Li, 2011), entrepreneurial alertness (Gaglio and Katz, 2001) and human and SC (DeTienne and Chandler 2007; Ramos-Rodríguez et al. 2010; Alvarez and Busenitz, 2001; Ozgen and Baron, 2007), entrepreneurial environment (Cooper and Park, 2008; Tang, 2010; Casson and Wadeson, 2007). For example, entrepreneurs with higher cognitive skills may have the advantage to create more opportunities than others (Busenitz and Barney, 1997) may create more opportunities than others.

Research on SC and opportunity recognition suggests that social networks of entrepreneurs help them to access scarce resources from their environment and help them to create opportunities (Fuentes et al. 2010). Entrepreneurs may utilize their social networks to build human capital which may help them to create more opportunities for their business (Alvarez and Barney, 2007). Social networks of entrepreneurs play a central role in opportunity recognition, primarily by increasing the cognitive skills of entrepreneurs thus enabling them to create and exploit more opportunities (Baron, 2006). Of course, the extent of opportunity creation and exploitation depends upon the strength of ties in an entrepreneur’s network, wherein weak ties tend to bring more informational benefits for entrepreneurs than strong ties (Alvarez and Busenitz, 2001; Ardichvili et al., 2003; Arenius and Clercq, 2005; and García- Cabrera and García-Soto, 2009). Alternatively, strong ties bring strategic benefits for entrepreneurs, giving them greater access to resources and hence more opportunities (Granovetter, 1973; Hite, 2005).

3.2. Dimensions of Social Capital. Although SC has been viewed as a uni-dimensional construct, recent discussions incorporating SC have adopted a multi-dimensional approach to studying SC and its role in entrepreneurial activity. Based on Nahapiet and Ghoshal, 1998 categorization, we discuss three dimensions of SC including Cognitive SC, Structural SC and Relational SC with regards to their role in opportunity creation in WE.

3.2.1. Cognitive SC refers to the shared understanding that individuals develop amongst each other because of the common language, norms and culture (Nahapiet and Ghoshal, 1998). Shared culture and goals facilitate the flow of knowledge between entrepreneurs, thus enabling them to benefit from each other’s perceptual processes and sharing common ways of making sense of new information (Carolis and Saparito, 2006; Nonaka, 1994). Hence, we suggest that women entrepreneur networks that are high in cognitive dimension may enable them to create more opportunities as network members aid the flow of knowledge and information in an effort to achieve common goals.
P1: Female entrepreneurs may create more opportunities when they have high cognitive SC.

3.2.2. **Structural SC** incorporates structural embeddedness or the overall pattern of the entrepreneur’s network (Nahapiet and Ghoshal, 1998). It entails two components, notably ‘Closure’ which refers to the extent of connectedness within a network group and ‘Brokerage’ which represents the number of indirect ties between a network actor and other network members (Burt, 1992). Closure is based on the idea of information symmetry and becomes a source of SC due to the connectedness of social actors within a network group. Hence, entrepreneurs with high closure networks have greater access to information since all information is equally accessible and known to each member within the network group.

Brokerage or structural holes within networks relates to the asymmetry of information which results in advantages for individuals who may perform a **Bridging role** in their networks (Burt, 2000:356). Unlike closure where members within a group have access to the same information, structural holes enable to separate redundant information which may arise from cohesive or equivalent contacts in a group who share similar information. Thus, an individual, referred to as the ‘tertius gaudens’ or the ‘third one who benefits’ (Burt, 1992:30-32) has access to networks that are rich in structural holes will greatly benefit through leveraging the non-redundant information. Based on this, we suggest that women entrepreneur networks that consist of structural holes may benefit from early access information than other network members. Early access to a range of skills, resources and perspectives helps in creating opportunities with respect to customers, suppliers, employees, financing and other business aspects (Burt, 2000:370).

P2: Female entrepreneurs may create more opportunities when they have less closure in their structural SC.

P3: Female entrepreneurs may create more opportunities when they have more brokerage in their structural SC.

(c) **Relational SC** refers to the ‘personal relationships people have developed with each other through a history of interactions’ (Nahapiet and Ghoshal, 1998: p. 244). It is characterized by two main components including ‘Closeness’ and ‘Trust’, which determine the quality of relational exchange between network members. A high level of personal familiarity (relational closeness) (Uzzi, 1996) and a sense of reliability and faith (trust) (Coleman, 1990; McAllister, 1995; Nahapiet and Ghoshal, 1998; McAllister, 1995; Rousseau et al., 1998) in a network contact determines the quality of relationships between network members and the strength of ties within it (Moran, 2005; Granovetter, 1985; Nahapiet and Ghoshal, 1998). Strong ties typically reflect a greater investment of time, emotions, intimacy, intensity and reciprocity among network members (Granovetter, 1985) and thus may enable entrepreneurs to create more opportunities than weak ties.

An important component underlying relational capital relates to the norms, trust, faith and obligations that guide behavior of individuals and the resulting network relationships, primarily the notion that “I will do this for you now, but you will do something or me later” (Adler and Kwon, 2002; Lesser, 2000; Carolis and Saparito, 2006). Thus, female entrepreneurial networks lacking relational trust (trust, norms and sanctions) in their networks face challenges in understanding the expected behaviour of other network contacts (O’Connor and Rice, 2001), accrue less benefits from their networks and create fewer opportunities.

P4: Female entrepreneurs may create greater opportunities if their networks consist of Strong ties than weak ties

P5: Female entrepreneurs may create greater opportunities when their networks are characterized with high quality, high level of trust, shared beliefs and cognition.

4. Research methodology

Adopting a social constructionist approach perspective, our aim is to explore the role of SC of Welsh and Turkish women entrepreneurs in opportunity creation in business. To achieve this objective, we focus on a single unit of analysis, i.e. the female entrepreneur (Cope and Watts, 2000; Godel, 2000; Lynn, 1973; McMullan and Vesper, 2000). Our approach is in line with Perren and Ram’s (2004) ‘entrepreneurial personal story explorations’ which relates to an entrepreneur’s subjective understanding of the real world, without dismissing the existence of other social actors within it. Hence, our study highlights the experiences of women entrepreneurs of using their SC to create opportunities in business. A cross country comparison of Turkey and Wales thus helps to reflect the contextual embeddedness of WE, delving deep insights into lives.
experiences of women entrepreneurs in both countries, their SC structure and sources and the opportunities they create in their entrepreneurial ecosystem.

We adopted a multiple case study research design for three reasons (Bromley, 1986). First, entrepreneurship is a dynamic field and involves varied experiences of individuals and more specifically women entrepreneurs in our context. Comparing Welsh and Turkish entrepreneurs involves two different contexts with unique experiences of women and rich insights to explore the phenomenon under research. A multiple case study design would aid in predicting contrasting results i.e., direct replication across all cases (Yin, 2012) since each entrepreneur would construct reality in a different way. Additionally, a case based approach within the context of entrepreneurship is valuable as it does not disintegrate the context from the phenomenon under study (Hartley, 1994). Furthermore, adopting a multiple case design provides more compelling theoretical generalizations than a single case, thus enabling the research to reveal the similarities and differences within and across cases (Yin, 2009). Our methodological choice is also in line with the call of previous researchers suggesting the incorporation of creative techniques and novel methodological approaches like case studies in the field of entrepreneurship (Henry and Foss, 2015).

4.1. Data collection. Our study considers the lived experiences of 6 women entrepreneurs (3 Turkish and 3 Welsh women entrepreneurs) and seeks to understand the critical role of SC in opportunity creation within their businesses which are embedded in the broader EES. Face to Face and Skype interviews were conducted with all participants. All respondents were briefed about the purpose and objectives of the research and in line with this, they were asked to share their perceptions about their entrepreneurial ecosystem (Strong/Weak). Next, the respondents were asked to narrate their experiences of how their SC helped them to create opportunities in business. All interviews lasted between 60 to 90 minutes with little interruption from the researcher’s side, thus avoiding the influence of pre-conceived ideas of the researcher and allowing rich construction of stories by the respondents. All interviews were tape recorded and later transcribed to address issues of credibility and accuracy of accounts (Lincoln and Guba, 1985).

4.2. Data Analysis. To analyse the data from interviews, four major steps were undertaken by the authors. First all recorded interviews were transcribed word by word to ensure that no aspect of the conversation was omitted. Second, the authors read and re read the transcripts to develop familiarity with the text and to identify themes within it. Next, broader level themes emerging from the data were highlighted within each case and then an across case analysis was conducted to identify any similarities and differences between the different cases. Thematic and ideographic analysis of the cases helped the researchers to identify any new insights underlying the phenomenon under study, thus aiding the process of potential theory creation or development (Eisenhardt, 1989; Silverman, 2000).

5. Findings

Analysis of the interviews revealed important themes underlying the role of SC in opportunity creation in businesses of women. Table 1 present an overview of the six cases included in the study.

---Insert Table 1 about here---

5.1. Perception of Entrepreneurial Ecosystem among women entrepreneurs. Analysis of the accounts of women entrepreneurs revealed that women in Wales and Turkey had different perceptions regarding their respective entrepreneurial ecosystem (EES). Having different experiences of setting up a business and operating in an environment characterized by unique financial, cultural, governmental, support systems, human capital pool and market factors, women in Turkey generally perceived the EES as weak to sustain and support entrepreneurial activity while women in Wales considered it to be strong and hence supportive towards entrepreneurial ventures. For example, one of the Turkish women entrepreneurs (TA), who had prior experience of working in US expressed her perceptions of the Turkish EES as:

'I would definitely define the ecosystem in Turkey as weak. There are times when we think that it would have been better if we had started a business in the US.' (TA, internet business:29)
Welsh women overall had a positive perception about their entrepreneurial environment mainly due to their experiences of starting up a business in a relatively supportive environment as compared to Turkey. Overall Welsh respondents felt that the EES in Wales had improved over the years and hence was supportive of entrepreneurial activity, as one of the Welsh women entrepreneurs (WT) narrated:

‘I think more people are starting their own business in Wales, with all the different awards recognizing people and helping them achieve, mentality is changing. Support is there otherwise people won’t be trying it. Recession pushed a lot of people initially but people have the confidence and have started a business and others, then follow them’ (WT, Interior designer: 33)

5.2. Perceived strengths of Welsh and Turkish EES. Despite of different overall perceptions regarding their respective entrepreneurial ecosystem, women entrepreneurs in Wales and Turkey had different perceptions regarding the individual elements of their respective ecosystem. All women perceived the availability of support systems, human capital resource, and access to markets to be a strong element in their EES.

Support services including social support from professional networks and from friends and family was revealed as an important factor contributing towards the success of women businesses in Turkey and Wales. With regards to Human Capital, all women in Turkey and Wales perceived Human capital to be a significant resource in running a business and creating opportunities within it. Both personal education and experience as well as the staff/employees hired in the business were highlighted as important sources of start-up and current business management among Turkish and Welsh women entrepreneurs. The highest qualification that all but two women (TP, fertilizer production business: 32; WY, substance misuse training and design development: 59) had was Bachelor’s degree while one woman had a Master degree (WL, content writing and media: 26). Despite of their educational qualifications, women perceived that their prior experience in business or paid employment was more beneficial in starting a business and creating opportunities within it. For example, a Turkish entrepreneur (TP, fertilizer production business: 32) narrated about her experience from international exposure while travelling to other countries for business purposes. Her observations of people, businesses and markets abroad helped her identified a gap in Turkey, and start her business. Thus, while a degree in a relevant field contributed to the specialized knowledge of concepts, the respondents suggested that learning through direct observations and practical work experience on the job, was perceived more valuable as one Welsh respondent narrated:

‘Experience counted more for me definitely, because you can’t match on experience, dealing with real clients, real issues, real projects, trying to solve those, you don’t get that from education alone’ (WT, Interior designer: 33)

Moreover, access to markets was perceived as crucial for identifying a clear gap for their products/services in the Welsh and Turkish market.

5.3. Perceived weaknesses of Welsh and Turkish EES. Amongst the weaknesses of the entrepreneurial ecosystem, both Welsh and Turkish women perceived Policy and Finance to be weak elements in their ecosystem. Additionally, Turkish women also perceived Culture as a weak element in the Turkish EES.

While Welsh women perceived culture to be a driving force behind the increase in the number of women entrepreneurs in Wales, Turkish women perceived culture to be a negative factor impacting their business activity. For example, one respondent (TP) expressed negative sentiments about cultural support, suggesting that the culture in Turkey discriminated against women entrepreneurs and hence was not supportive towards their entrepreneurial efforts. She narrated her feelings as:

‘Turkey is not a good place for entrepreneurial spirit and it is even more difficult if you are a woman. It is just like two frogs who fall into a well, one comes out and the other dies. Then they say something to one who survives but it can’t listen since he is deaf. This is what we need to do to ignore what people say to avoid failure’ (TP, fertilizer production business: 32)

With regards to cultural support, Turkish women expressed a zero or very low tolerance for failure in Turkish culture. While women thought of failure as a pathway to success, the society did not have such perceptions and thus Turkish women felt a lot of pressure on themselves to be successful and not fail in their business.
Failure was an individual’s failure rather than a business or venture failure, suggesting the one-sided approach to analyse the performance of women entrepreneurial activity, wherein external factors are discounted. Contrary to this, Welsh women perceived that their culture had a high tolerance for risk and encouraged more people to start a business and learn from the mistakes within it.

Beyond cultural constraints, Policy was perceived as a negative/weak element in both Turkish and Welsh EES. Women entrepreneurs in both ecosystems perceived government policies to be discriminatory and stringent thus making it difficult for them to create opportunities and be successful in business. Specifically, Turkish women expressed their dissatisfaction with government policies regarding women business support. Women entrepreneurs (TA, internet business, 29; TT, internet business:42) perceived government policies as highly bureaucratic and discriminatory and felt that the Turkish government only supported in the initial stages of business start-up and not in the later stage.

With regards to government laden constraints, Taxes and employee regulations were highlighted to be barriers for business development and for creating opportunities for business success. Women entrepreneurs in both ecosystems perceived the taxes levied on small businesses to be ‘unfair’ as expressed by one respondent:

‘we strive in this environment to do a business and it is as if the state is a founding partner in it. I pay 40% of my revenue to the state at year end and hence I feel it definitely needs to support me’ (TT, internet business:42)

Financial constraints were highlighted by women as a common weakness of both Turkish and Welsh EES. Welsh and Turkish women perceived lack of funding to be a major constraint in achieving their business goals. All women except for Two Turkish entrepreneurs (TA, internet business:29 who had an angel investor; TP, fertilizer production business:32 received funding from a small and medium development organization in Turkey: KOSGEB), started their business with personal savings, funding from family or spouse. Major reasons for women to rely on personal savings include small scale nature of their business which did not require massive investments, preference of avoiding dependency on financial institutions, and high cost of borrowing in the form of interest payments. Even in cases where some funding was received from external sources, women entrepreneurs perceived it to be inadequate or not readily available when required for business performance and growth. Thus, most women preferred family and personal sources of financing as these were perceived more reliable and readily available (TT, internet business:42). In expressing their dissatisfaction regarding availability of financial resources, some women entrepreneurs, particularly Turkish entrepreneurs highlighted the limited support of government in helping them to overcome financial constraints in business. Narratives of accounts revealed that while some Welsh women entrepreneurs received support such as grants and training programs for business, Turkish women did not receive any government support. As one respondent narrated:

‘The state definitely helps women entrepreneurs. First they provide trainings for women who wish to become entrepreneurs and then if you have innovative ideas, you will be given 35000TL as a grant which is without interest and repayable after one year. However, I did not benefit from any such support’ (TA, internet business:29)

5.4. Structural, Relational and Cognitive embeddedness of SC in Opportunity creation. The extent to which women entrepreneurs could create opportunities through their social networks was dependent upon the Structural, relational and cognitive embeddedness of their SC.

5.4.1. Structural SC: Overall, our findings suggest that women entrepreneurs benefit from knowledge exchange in their networks when they participate in large networking groups characterized with less closure. The average size of women networks ranged between 30 and 600 members. Although network density of some networks was high, the networks were characterized as moderately closed, especially large networks. Thus, women entrepreneurs part of large networks were able to benefit from new information and knowledge exchange thus enabling them to create new opportunities in financial, human capital, social and business context. However, more frequent interactions with new members led to familiarity among members, which suggested that over a period and with frequent interactions, networks became of high closure. This affected
the extent to which women could create opportunities for their business through the networking events. Some women often considered this to be a positive element especially in mixed networks (males and females), or male dominated networks, where the presence of a previously known contact would become a source of comfort amid other members who would not be familiar and may appear as daunting (Participant WT, Interior Design and Consultancy business:33, Wales).

For women who were part of smaller networks (less than 30 members), information and knowledge exchange was limited and much of the information was redundant, thus reducing the benefits of networks for opportunity creation. This was due to high closure since network members were closely connected to each other and that most events were attended by the same network members.

With regards to network positions of women entrepreneurs in all the networks were of both bonding and bridging nature. All women entrepreneurs expressed their role in networks as bonding with other members, actively seeking information from contacts and identifying and exploiting opportunities in business. Additionally, women also performed the brokerage role in networks by bridging the flow of information to other contacts who previously would not have access to information. This was particularly in case of Welsh respondents wherein women entrepreneurs benefited from various networking events because of an increased flow of information between contacts.

The extent to which women entrepreneurs performed a bridging role in networks was dependent on the trust and familiarity of relationship with a contact. For example, a contact would be recommended to another network member only if a woman trusts him, has knowledge about him and his work, and believes that other people think positively about him (Participant WT, Interior design and consultancy business:33, Wales). Beyond trust and familiarity, motivation for being in a bridge in networks arises from reciprocity of relationships, the belief that bridging connections between people would lead to the same favour for one’s own self in future (Participant WL, Content writing ad media business:26, Wales).

The analysis also revealed that Welsh and Turkish women’s perception of information sharing within their networks was somewhat neutral. All women entrepreneurs but one (Participant TT, Word of Mouth marketing business:42, Turkey) believed that information was moderately shared between networking contacts, meaning that some contacts would share information openly while others would not. This was more common in Turkish than welsh women entrepreneurial networks. Particularly, information constraints were industry specific and organizations specific.

‘Contacts do share information openly but there are people over others you click with and they refer you first’ (Participant WL, Content writing and media business:26, Wales).

‘There are some tricky organizations who wont share information because they want to get all the funding for themselves. Its easier for us, because the model that we have is different to anyone’ (WY, substance misuse development and training business:59, Wales)

‘I feel that women in construction sometimes can feel intimidated in male networking. They feel like knowing someone in the networks then so that when they go to these events they already know someone, because the construction industry is mainly male dominated and there are mostly men in these networks. When they know that you are the only female there, they are quite sexist and can pass comments’ (Participant WT, Interior design and consultancy business:33, Wales)

Further, information constraints also arose due to networking dynamics, specifically for welsh women participating in mixed networks or networks that were highly male dominated.

5.4.2. The relational embeddedness of SC which determined the extent of closeness between contacts in networks of women entrepreneurs was suggested to be neutral and thus opportunities created based on relational embeddedness of SC often too a long time to initiate. While Turkish women felt very close to their work contacts (those actively involved in the business), they kept a distance with others in their wider professional networks until a decent level of trust was developed in a contact. Welsh women overall felt close to their contacts in their professional networks, especially those whom they met frequently in networking events. Also, while Welsh women entrepreneurial networks were characterized with a lot of trust and honesty,
Turkish women did not perceive their networks to be very trustworthy. There were some contacts in networks who were not trusted at all (Participant TP, fertilizer production business: 32, Turkey) while others were perceived as very honest and trustworthy (Participant TA, E-commerce business: 29, Turkey; Participant TT, Word of mouth marketing business: 42, Turkey).

However, once trust was established, women entrepreneurs performed a bonding and bridging role in their networks and thus created opportunities to grow their business. As a Welsh respondent explained:

> ‘Even if I do know people myself, the value of knowing that person is not as much as them introducing me to another key person, because my friend knows me and trusts me so has no problem referring and recommending me to someone else’ ( Participant WY, substance misuse development and training business: 59, Wales)

Our findings suggest that women entrepreneurs benefited from their formal and informal networks which enabled them to create opportunities in four main contexts including Human Capital, Financial, Social and Business. However, narratives of women entrepreneurs also revealed the negative impact of their SC which impacted their ability to create opportunities for their enterprises and also created challenges for them to succeed in their business.

**i) Threat to business reputation:** Women entrepreneurs specifically Welsh women experienced threat from contacts in the form of replicating the product/service they offered, backstabbing and negative impact on reputation. Contacts which were unknown and not familiar would use the name of the business and portray that they are working with the founder, thus associating with her. This was considered as a threat to the reputation of the business and the founder since the nature and work ethics of the contact were not known. Thus, although new contacts could potentially be a source of opportunity recognition for women, they were also a threat to business reputation.

**ii) Backstabbing** was another negative spill over effect of networking identified in the interpretation of women entrepreneurs’ narratives. wherein previously familiar contacts who were also good friends, tried to tarnish the reputation of a business to attract clients/customers to their own business.

> ‘I have had people whom I worked with before and I considered them friends. They tell people who I know through networking, that they don’t know I know, that I only work on certain kinds of projects and they do this this kind of stuff. So, totally cutting me out. The person then called me and told me ‘I have networked with so and so today and she told me that you just do specific projects’. I know that this particular person (friend) is going to all the NW groups that I go to, and I know they look at my Linkedin profile and connect with the people I know’ (Participant WT, Interior design and consultancy business: 33, Wales)

Due to such threats, women were more cautious and hence more active in maintaining relationships with clients and networking with other contacts. The presence in a network and hence in people’s minds was essential to remain competitive in business, maintain existing clients and gain new opportunities.

**iii) Replication of product/service:** Another threat from networks of women originated from replication of products and services, wherein other contacts would replicate the design, process, product or service of a business. This was experienced by founder of WY who observed someone else copying her design and training programs and delivering a service. As a result of this, the founder stopped sharing any information about her training design and development with contacts, which consequently suggests a reduction in bonding role of the founder. Thus, even though close relationships with contacts were maintained, core information about the business was not shared with either formal or informal networks.

5.4.3. Cognitive SC of women entrepreneurs was found to be low among women entrepreneurs, specifically Turkish women entrepreneurs and thus affected the extent to which women could create opportunities in any context. Turkish women had difficulties with professional networking contacts and work contacts since these did not share the same goals as the women did. Contrary to this Welsh woman were satisfied and positively acknowledged the shared beliefs and goals of their contacts. Women believed that a shared belief among contacts was to help others and get help from others. However, there were exceptions to this, when some contacts or networks would not share the same goals as others. This was mainly observed in mixed or male
dominated networks or industries which had a high level of competition wherein some contacts would consider others as threat to their business success.

5.4. Role of SC in Opportunity creation of women entrepreneurs. In the presence of the unique challenges faced by women entrepreneurs in their respective entrepreneurial ecosystem, all women highlighted the critical role of their SC in helping them to create opportunities for their business. Despite being constrained in various aspects of business, women entrepreneurs aimed to do well in their business and create opportunities that will promote business growth, primarily by utilizing their formal and informal sources of SC.

Analysis of the accounts revealed that women entrepreneurs tap into their personal networks to create opportunities in four main contexts including Human Capital context, Business Context, Financial Context and Social Context (Figure 1). By utilizing formal or informal networks, women created opportunities that helped them to grow in business. However, incorporating the dimensions of SC, our findings suggest that while SC provides an advantage to women to overcome the challenges of their ecosystem and create opportunities, it also constraints the extent of opportunity creation among women entrepreneurs.

---Insert Figure 1 about here---

5.5. Role of SC in Opportunity creation in Human Capital Context. Our findings indicate that women entrepreneurs utilize their social networks to create opportunities for knowledge exchange, which in turn enabled them to build their customer base and grow their business. Primarily, formal networks of women in both ecosystems helped them to form linkages with academic institutions which facilitated the flow of information between universities and the business, while also enabling women to establish a presence and gaining recognition in the academic institutions. Women entrepreneurs shared knowledge of their business experiences with students, motivating them to develop positive entrepreneurial attitudes and mind-set and simultaneously benefited from the research conducted by universities. Presence in academic institutions also helped women entrepreneurs to indirectly market their business to others, thus building their reputation in the market. As one respondent narrated below:

‘After becoming a member of ‘Turkish Win’ (professional network), the entrepreneurship clubs of some universities accessed me and I visited universities and spoke to students about how I started my business and brands associated with it. The universities had no contribution to us (business) in terms of creating links and contacts, and actually I find universities very underdeveloped in this regard’ (Participant TA, e-commerce business:29: Turkey)

Beyond knowledge exchange, professional social networks also enabled a few women, particularly Welsh women to build their human capital. For example, WY, a social enterprise, managed to attract human capital (volunteers) through its links with the universities.

‘I deliver lectures and workshops twice a year at Cardiff university and Cardiff Metropolitan University and these help me to get volunteers from universities who assist me in the workshops designed on substance misuse’ (WY, substance misuse training: 59: Wales)

5.6. Social Networks and Opportunity creation in Business Context. Operating in challenging environments of their respective EES, our findings suggest that SC of Welsh and Turkish women entrepreneurs plays a significant role in providing business related support. Women perceived that their social networks enabled them to overcome challenges in their broader entrepreneurial environment, both in the start-up stage and current stage of business. For example, because of the stringent and unsupportive regulatory policies regarding business set-up, women entrepreneurs’ social networks enabled them to understand the business start-up procedures in the initial stages of their business. As one Turkish respondent narrated:

‘If you are doing a different business in Turkey, public authorities cannot help you. I wasted four months of my time at the time when I was starting my business and dealing with them. It was hard as I did not have any support to help me with complicated business procedures. Later, I found a consultant through a networking
event I attended and he helped me with the significant parts of setting up my business’ (Participant TP, worm fertilizer production business: 32, Turkey)

Additionally, women entrepreneurs expressed their dissatisfaction regarding the strict government policies including stringent tax systems and employee regulations that impose a burden on small businesses. These created hurdles for women entrepreneurs to achieve their business goals and grow their business. However, despite of such regulatory burdens, our findings suggest that women entrepreneurs make use of the available resources, primarily their network base to manage various aspects of their business. For example, one Welsh respondent explained how she used her formal networks to manage business responsibilities since government’s employee regulations and policies made it difficult for her to hire new employees.

‘Taxes, taxes, taxes! Oh my God! this is one of the reason I don’t hire anyone and haven’t expanded because I pay a lot of tax being a small business. If you look at companies like Starbucks, they pay less tax than me and that’s really frustrating. It cripples the small businesses. If I take on a fixed employee, I will be responsible for paying their wage, their sick pay, their maternity pays and that would really affect my business. So, I just hire free lancers through people I know from my networks, or by connecting with people on social media, like Linked in’ (Participant WT, Interior Design and Consultancy: 33, Wales)

Narratives of women entrepreneurs also revealed lack of business related support including information of setting up, business regulations and standard procedures, and availability of mentors and key personnel to guide through the initial stages of business set-up. Majority of Welsh and Turkish entrepreneurs felt that the government did not provide any business-related support to help them understand the basic procedures involved in setting up a business and that women had to search for information and look for existing entrepreneurs or consultants who could guide them on how to set-up a business. In this regard, women tapped their network base for mentoring purpose wherein women sought help from mentors in various aspects of business including registration process, tax systems, and accounting procedures. For example, a welsh respondent explained how her informal networks (her father’s network base) enabled her in initial setting up stage of her business.

‘When I was thinking about starting my business, my father (informal networks) put me in touch with a professional who helped me with the practicalities of setting up, page structure, company registration process and all’ (WL, content writing and media business: 26, Wales).

Similarly, a Turkish respondent narrated her experience of how her formal networks helped her to solve problems that she encounters in business.

‘There is someone I met through a networking event 3 years ago, and she is now in my group of friends but I still consider her as a mentor so if I am working on a new idea or project and I have got any questions, I will send an email to her and ask her about her opinion and she will get back to me’ (WL, content writing and media business: 26, Wales).

5.7. Social Networks and Opportunity creation in Financial Context. Due to the weak financial ecosystem, both Welsh and Turkish women entrepreneurs faced significant constraints in their business. Majority of the women entrepreneurs relied on personal savings and other informal sources of finance to start their business with only one Turkish women who could benefit from a government grant and a loan from a formal financial institution. A major reason for women not tapping into formal finance sources was perceived inability to avail finances from formal sources. This was particularly true for Turkish women who felt that the cultural norms discriminated against women businesses and thus made it difficult for women to secure financial resources. Additionally, some women entrepreneurs, by virtue of their small-scale businesses and limited finances preferred to avoid large interest premiums associated with repayment of loans and thus did not apply for funding from external sources. However, despite of starting small-scale with minimum investment, all women entrepreneurs realised and expressed the need to acquire more finances to expand their business and create new opportunities in it. To achieve this, women entrepreneurs tapped on their social networks which enabled them to identify financial sources for their business needs. As expressed by a Welsh respondent
Formal networks including professional clients also helped women to build a recognition for themselves and their business. This in turn led to good will for the business and enhanced funding opportunities. In some cases, relationships that started professionally turned into informal friendships for women entrepreneurs and hence increased the probability of exploring financial opportunities for the business. As expressed below

“Our first partner, Mr. A from U.S.A. loved business idea and showed his interested in partnering with us. Thanks to this, we had our first investment for our business. Later on, a very successful businessman Mr. B who appreciates our ideas and business and has heard us speak at events emailed and asked us to contact Mr. C, a person from one of the richest families in Turkey. Upon conversing with Mr. C, I gained a lot of confidence and self-esteem and secured an investment of 1 million dollars against some shares. Further, while reading the newspaper, I came to know that Mr. X was looking to invest in technology companies and hence I reached out to Mr. X through LinkedIn. We met over a cup of coffee and later on had the investment from him’ (TA, E-commerce business:29, Turkey)

“I met my previous consultant yesterday with whom my relationship started very professionally but has now turned into friendship. While speaking to him, I felt that he may bring me an investor for my business. That’s how social capital opens up opportunities for you’ (Participant TP, Worm fertilizer production business: 32, Turkey)

Our findings also suggest that in the presence of lack of funding sources from formal networks such as venture capitalists and angel investment, women use their informal networks to overcome financial difficulties and grow their business. In this regard, family SC plays a significant role since women entrepreneurs acquire access to key financial resources either directly from family (parents and spouse) or from secondary contacts of family members.

“We started our business by taking support from KOSGEB, however we could not obtain that financial support immediately so we were in a very difficult situation at which point the support of the family was used and we handled our financial needs’ (Participant TT, Word of Mouth marketing business: 42, Turkey)

5.8. Social Networks and Opportunity Exploration in Social Context. Formal and informal networks do not only provide business and financial support to women entrepreneurs but also act as a source of social support. In the presence of weak regulatory policies and lack of government support for business, women entrepreneurs relied on the support from their family and friends. Additionally, by participating in formal networks, women get moral support which enables them to sustain their business activity and solve day to day business problems. For example, other entrepreneurs having similar industry experience (formal networks) act as a significant source of social support for women, giving them advice and assisting them through their own experiences in business. Moreover, through formal networks, women get the necessary push into the networks, which once obtained can trigger new connections and opportunities, for example access to new markets and customers.

“Formal networks like Turkish WIN provide an opportunity to get yourselves known to others, to promote your work. Personally, I had a friend who was working in Procter and Gamble and I received a briefing from this friend related to my current business and these advices helped me start my business. These networks have utmost benefit in terms of personal introduction to new contacts and hence new opportunities’ (Participant TT, Word of Mouth marketing business: 42, Turkey)

Additionally, women get emotional support and confidence from their networks, which helps them to be consistent in their efforts of recognizing new business opportunities and overcome the weaknesses of their respective entrepreneurial ecosystem. For example, our findings suggest how women gain confidence of doing business through their formal and informal networks (Respondent WT, Wales) and cope with
challenges presented by a weak cultural ecosystem, thus restoring their belief in their ability to do business (Respondent TP, Turkey).

‘Friends have recommended me on projects or just made that introduction to potential clients. Also support from other entrepreneurs is a big one, this has helped me big time and I think without that, I wouldn’t have the confidence to carry on’ (Participant WT, Interior Design and Consultancy; 33, Wales)

‘I hear demotivating expressions from people like, “Come on now, give it up, sit at home and take care of your children, you are doing that for nothing, you have incurred all those expenses and what if you fail and go bankrupt, you are wasting your time” Since I have a significant amount of motivation for success, due to the full support of my husband and people around me I can ignore what people say’ (Participant TP, Worm Fertilizer production business; 32, Turkey)

With regards to informal networks, family and friends networks were identified as a critical factor of social support during various stages of business. Women entrepreneurs in Wales and Turkey relied on their family as this was perceived to be a reliable, trustworthy and readily available source of support, especially when other sources of network support were absent.

‘My brother is a very smart person who knows the industry very well. He also has information to help me on this subject. When I have issues regarding business, I immediately call him and receive his support. Without him, there is nobody else from whom I can receive help, unless I spend some money’ (Participant TT, Word of Mouth marketing business; 42, Turkey)

‘I have got people in the US whom I am not doing business with but I am always in touch with them, talking to them about different ideas. I am fortunate about that they have got experience in different parts of business so I can ask them for advice. Then there is my best friend runs her own business so, we get together and discuss stuff with one another’ (Participant WL, Content writing and Media business; 26, Wales)

6. Conclusion.

Our research aims to highlight the important role of social capital of women entrepreneurs in opportunity creation of women entrepreneurs. Through our findings we suggest that despite the challenges of their respective entrepreneurial ecosystems, women entrepreneurs utilize their social capital and recognize and create opportunities in the social, business, financial and knowledge context. While women are tainted with the under-hypothesis image in entrepreneurship literature, our research reveals insights into the constrained performance of women entrepreneurs in two distinct entrepreneurial ecosystems, which present different set of challenges to women. Yet, women continue to over these challenges and succeed in business by utilizing their social capital, thus breaking the stereotypical image associated with them as entrepreneurs.

References:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perceived Turkish Entrepreneurial Ecosystem weakness</th>
<th>Perceived Welsh Entrepreneurial Ecosystem weakness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy</td>
<td>Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Social Capital
Formal /Informal
Figure 1: Suggestive model of findings
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Industry (Business)</th>
<th>Overview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WY</td>
<td>Social entrepreneurship (Substance misuse training design and development) - UK &amp; Africa</td>
<td>WY is a social enterprise not-just-for-profit organization providing substance misuse awareness, education and training. Having considerable experience in the social care and health industry, the founder of WY set up the business with the aim of designing and delivering bespoke training using the skills, knowledge and experience of volunteers, who are initially trained by the founder of WY. The business serves clients including statutory, voluntary and private sectors. The income generated from sales is used to build the capacity and skills base of the volunteers, meet our operational costs and to grow the business throughout Wales and internationally, through community partnerships projects in Africa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WT</td>
<td>Design and Architecture (Interior Design Consultancy) - UK</td>
<td>WT is a professional interior designing consultancy providing interior solutions to all its clients including individual, large companies as well as government agencies. It services include Interior design consultation, Space planning, 3D visualization, Mood boards, and Technical/ working drawings. The founder of WL has considerable experience in design and architecture and aims to provide her customers with versatile interior designs within the constraints of their budget. She is also an active participant in the contribution to the design and property industries in Wales.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WL</td>
<td>Marketing and Communications (Content Writing, Social Media and Communications) - Wales &amp; USA</td>
<td>WL provides content writing, proofreading and and copywriting services through social media. Its clients are a number of private and public sector organizations, offering them communication services that help them to set them apart from other competitors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA</td>
<td>Internet (Electronic Commerce, Online Retailing) - Turkey</td>
<td>TA is an online retailing company which was previously started in Silicon Valley, USA and has now and has 90,000 members is ‘Turkey’s greatest location platform’. It draws attention of customers to its e-commerce website by providing them with great offers from restaurants, accommodation facilities and occasional activities, make reservations, order goods or services and get information and reviews about potential places. TA which received a 1.5-million-dollar credit from Aslanoba Capital for investment and got into a partnership with Foursquare Turkey has gained an important place in the Turkish market. It has collaboration with famous brands including Shangri La Bosphorus, Lacivert, Hayal Kahvesi, Divan, Bath and Body Works.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TT</td>
<td>Marketing and Promotion (Word of Mouth Marketing)– Turkey</td>
<td>TT is a Word of Mouth agency, incorporating three business models, all of which support the power of Word of Mouth marketing. One of the models within the TA business constitutes a community of more than 80,000 women from 81 cities of Turkey. TA serves companies including L'Oreal, Philips, Procter and Gamble, Unilever, Tefal and Rowenta.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TP</td>
<td>Agriculture (Worm Fertilizer Production) - Turkey</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TP was founded from a gap identified in the Turkish market for worm fertilizer production. Having extensive exposure through travelling opportunities, founder of TP saw worm manure abroad for the first time and upon her return to Turkey, she pre-tested the idea of her business by producing worm manure in the bathroom of her house, moving onto the garage and then garden of her house. Finally, in 2014, after considerable testing of her business idea and achieving efficiency, founder of TP started her business. Currently, TP covers an area of 380 meter squares, has more than 250 million worms and an annual manure production of 250 tons. In future, TP aims to expand its facility and is increasing the closed area to over 1000 meter squares.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BEHIND EVERY SUCCESSFUL WOMAN, IS THERE IS A MAN?

Dr. Klaudia Schmidt

As the saying goes, “Behind every successful man is a woman.” This woman is not necessarily the wife.

As we know from history; former Prime Minister of the United Kingdom, Margaret Thatcher and; Angela Merkel, the current Prime Minister of Germany were mainly supported and pushed forward by certain men. For Angela Merkel this central man was Helmut Kohl, the ex-chancellor of Germany. By the side of Margaret Thatcher was her husband Denis Thatcher and two PR advisors who trained her to improve her image by deepening her voice and changing her look so that she could gain more confidence and respect within the political field including the voting public. The advice of these men was key to influencing the career paths of these two successful leading women.

What about in business? Is the career of business women in leading positions also mainly shaped, supported and influenced by men? Since women have similar access to education and business environments like men, in modern societies they work in all kinds of positions and hierarchies represented. However, top leading positions are still dominated by men.

Do the minority of women who make their way up to the executive board achieve this partly due to the support of men?

These are questions this article will have a closer look at by doing a literature review in this field. The results can be game-changing for women in understanding how to set up a career successfully.

Keywords: Career, Career Sponsoring, Coaching, Gender, Leadership, Mentoring, Networking, Women Career development.

1. Introduction

There are many ideas, guidelines and article written on how to make a successful management career as a women (Glaeser and Ma, 2014; Rarick and Ladany, 2013; de Lemus, Spears, Bukowski, Moya and Lupiáñez, 2013; Eagly and Carli, 2007). This paper is focusing on careers for women in executive management positions (CEOs, Vice President, General Manager, Managing Director positions, Senior Manager). The main interest of this paper is to identify the enablers that advance women into top leading positions. Possible responses are coming from three biographies of prominent American women in business but not only from this source. This paper goes back to the literature and research that is supporting to find answers to key conditions and requirements to reach the top level as a woman. Business is often referred to as a "man's world". The majority of top management positions are held by men (Patton, 2013; Grant Thornton, 2015, Leanin.org, 2016). Women are catching up in terms of education. According to Snyder the number of women enrolled in graduate programs in the U.S. even exceeded the number of men (Snyder, 2009), and yet women are underrepresented in the business world, in leading positions specifically (Patton, 2013; Vinkenburg et al., 2011; Leanin.org, 2016). Women hold only 4% of CEO positions at fortune 500 American organizations (Catalyst, 2017; O'Neil et al., 2013).

Is this in general a bad thing for women with ambitions to rise to the top? In this paper I answer this question with a clear no. No it is not in general a bad thing but it shows that to become a woman in a
top leading position it is more useful to plan a career with men, and not against them, nor by excluding them and focusing only on the help of women.

As stated most eloquently by Spencer (2012) with only 2.8% of women CEO's in the top 1000 companies we aren't moving forward, we are moving backward. Our strategies to get to the top aren’t working. It is incumbent upon us “old broads” to advise younger women what works and what doesn’t so that women will have a greater voice. Using our communication talents to the fullest in a positive way can foment change and change is long overdue (Spencer, 2012).

Furthermore it is important to understand that top careers nowadays are no longer done only by focusing on classical male characteristics like strength, aggressive and assertive behavior etc. but rather together with so called female attributes like caring, listening and understanding. It is these female attributes that are considered key for successful leadership in conjunction with classical male characteristics. So the idea of this paper is to demonstrate that in order to break barriers, the so called glass ceiling, describing elements of stereotyping and discriminatory bias (Hymowitz and Schellhardt, 1986; Davidson and Burke, 2011; Davies, 2017) and advance in a career as a woman and really move to the top it seems to be necessary to focus on two principles:

- Plan and organize your career with men in central key positions (networking, mentoring, career sponsoring and coaching)
- Win the way to the top by balancing female attributes and male characteristics

Networking means to access strategic information and build a group of supporters (Vongalis, 2012). The cases of three prominent US top business management women in section 3 of this paper shows that their career is supported by men in different ways. Either as a life partner or as a boss, so there are good reasons to learn from and with men. A big concern in this context is the lack of role models and mentors for women (Hewlett et al., 2011a; Hewlett et al., 2011b; King and Knight, 2011; O’Neil et al., 2013; McCauley-Bush, 2012). The benefits of mentors for business people are well documented and are considered as an effective mechanism to promote a career (Kram, 1985; Allen et al., 2008; Allen and Eby, 2010). While men take huge advantage of mentoring, women do not excel in their careers in the same way as their male counterparts (Davidson and Burke, 2011; Vinnicombe et al., 2013; Mulligan-Ferry et al., 2014). According to Clutterbuck women get the same amount of mentoring opportunities but they do not consider them rewarding in the same way. (Clutterbuck, 2005; Leanin.org, 2016). They miss advice on navigating the workplace, professional and career development, and hence advancing in their careers (Vongalis, 2012; O’Neil et al., 2013). This involves working toward increasing your visibility within a network. A career oriented woman can accomplish this task by socializing at company events, taking on high-profile assignments, or volunteering for committees that do work that will appeal to most members of the network (King and Knight, 2011). Being able to create a network that supports a career is also one important criteria for the term, “social capital”. There is a lot of literature written in recent years that highlight the correlation between career development for women and human capital (skills, knowledge, experience, ambition, ability) and social capital (mentoring, networking, access to promotions) (Hamilton and Murphy, 2011; Tlaiss and Kauser, 2011; O’ Neil, Hopkins and Sullivan, 2011, Shortland, 2011). This link seems to be the most critical factor for successful career development for women. While it is evidential that women have increased their human capital and social capital over the years, there are still only a few women at the top of managerial positions. What are possible obstacles for women on the way to the top?
2. Women in Leadership: Enablers and Obstacles on the way to the top

It seems that women who strive for roles in C-suites and boardrooms still face barriers moving up the career ladder.

2.1 Networking and Mentoring: Why Women can do better

According to a 2015 study by LeanIn.org and McKinsey and Co., just ten percent of senior women executives said they had the help from four or more bosses to get up the career ladder. By contrast, nearly one in five senior men executives said they had help mainly from other networks of other males. Vongalis (2012) found out by analyzing the networking behavior of 74 middle management women that there is a lack of understanding networking regarding two areas:

- lack of collaboration
- lack of clear communication regarding career goals

Women in Vongalis (2012) research do not see networking as a way and a chance to collaborate with others on joint projects to enhance trust and knowledge. Furthermore they do not communicate clearly their career goals. Vongalis (2012) concludes referring to the research results that business women do not fully utilize the power of networking for their own career aspirations. Men and women are expected to “manage their own career” writes Savickas (1997). It seems that men still understand this task better than women (King and Knight, 2011). In business there are still too many prejudices against women and their capabilities of leading people (Bongiorno, Bain and David, 2014). To build and protect a positive reputation is particularly important for women, as they have to show that they are capable to be as good as men. Networking helps any leader but for women it helps beyond that in managing negative misperceptions related to gender. Bad reputation can be simply driven by the fact that a woman is too different from male leaders before (Lyness and Heilman, 2006; King and Knight, 2011). Networking is a strategy to influence how people see you in order to set up useful connections to upgrade your career. It is a process to increase visibility, take on high-profile assignments or volunteer for committees. A network study in an advertising company showed that men tend to have stronger relationship ties with men than women do with women (King and Knight, 2011). In addition, a survey of 140 employees of a newspaper publishing company suggested that with regard to interaction networks, overall, women were less central in the overall organization network, in networks dominated by men, and in the network of power-holders (King and Knight, 2011). That is, women were less central in some networks than men. This results to the fact that women were less likely than men to be promoted (King and Knight, 2011).

In addition to networking, mentoring is another important area to organize a career for women reaching the top management positions. Mentoring describes a relationship in business where a more experienced and more knowledgeable, successful person (mentor) gives advice and support to a colleague or junior with less experience (mentee) in certain business areas and topics. A mentee is supposed to learn from the knowledge and experience of a mentor in order to enhance his career. It is a long term relationship with focus on career development. A mentor meets his mentee usually on a regular base in a face-to-face meeting (Kram, 1985). Many companies offer mentoring programs to their employees as part of diversity activities. Ibarra, Carter and Silva (2010) claim that compared with men, women do not take the full advantage of mentoring. According to the study, men have influential mentors who give them exposure, connect them with the right people to promote their careers and make sure that they grow with them and move forward. This type of mentor is also called sponsor because their mentors do not only advise them in business topics they have. They actively use their social capital (connections, network) to move their career forward.
They go beyond mentoring what is also called sponsoring (Hewlett, 2013a). While on the contrary women get emotional support and advice on personal matters but no real career sponsoring. It has more the character of a professional coaching than a career sponsoring (King and Knight, 2011; O’Neil et al., 2013; Berhane, 2015). While a mentoring connection is relationship oriented and career sponsoring promotion oriented, coaching is task oriented (speaking skills, strategic thinking skills e.g.) and short term (Kram, 1985; Hewlett, 2013b; Richards, 2015). The terms coaching and mentoring are often treated interchangeable even so they cover different meanings (Richards, 2015). Sponsoring is still a recent phenomenon in the business world. Not many organizations offer sponsoring programs yet (Hewlett, 2013a). Due to the fact that sponsoring is a new concept mentoring and sponsoring might be used interchangeable as well (Hewlett, 2013a).

Terjesen and Sullivan (2011) found out that women in the entrepreneurial environment had less mentors than did men. Similar results are given by a report from Harvard Business Review from 2011 (Hewlett et al. 2011a). As the Harvard Business Review research revealed, both men and women undervalue or fail to nurture a network of professional sponsors. In research only a few of the employees that were surveyed—19% of men and 13% of women—reported having a sponsor (Hewlett et. al, 2011b). Women are 54% less likely than men to have a sponsor (Hewlett et al., 2011a).

2.2 Leadership: Female attributes on the rise?
How did Marissa Mayer make it to the CEO position, the top of Yahoo? The press suggests that she likely was confident in her professional value, developed appropriate knowledge, skills, abilities, and balanced feminine and masculine behaviors (King and Knight, 2011; Miller, L. 2012; Entis, L. 2015). As we can see in the career from Marissa Mayer the answer to successful leadership behavior might be the right balance between feminine and male attributes. A closer look in leadership literature shows that modern concepts like transformational leadership are a combination of both male and female attributes. It is not about being too feminine nor about being cruel and abusive as the other extreme of famous miserable male CEOs (Tenuto, 2013). The balance and harmonious combination seems to be the key to success for effective leadership as men and/or woman in the 21st century. When groups span equal numbers of men and women, men are somewhat more likely than women to step forward as leaders. Researchers have long theorized that one of the reasons that women are not represented at the highest levels of organizations is because men might engage in and be rewarded for different, more leader like, behaviors in group settings (Schuh et al., 2014; (Eagly and Karau, 2002). Moreover, a review of the literature before 1990 suggested that women were less likely than men to emerge as leaders, particularly in short-term groups that did not involve a lot of social interaction. This tendency is likely a consequence of beliefs that the characteristics and the stereotype of being a woman (e.g., nurturing, kind) are not linked with the characteristics of being a good leader (e.g., assertive, strong) (Ibarra et al., 2013). Consequently management is perceived as a masculine role performed by dominant, aggressive, decisive and competitive individuals hence more suitable for male sex. In contrast, women are expected to be more submissive, expressive and sensitive, which are attributes considered less suited to management and leadership positions (Cunliffe and Erikson, 2011; van Engen and Gartzia, 2012). To this day little empirical evidence suggests any major differences in leadership ability that indicate one gender is more effective than the other (Shadare et al., 2011). It is widely acknowledged nowadays that one-sided explanations of gender-typical traits are insufficient and improper to explain why only a minority of women break through the glass ceiling and make it to the top (Vinkenburg et al., 2011). Think of CEOs’ transformational leadership style which has been studied as an effective leadership style in driving
organization success where the characteristics are strongly referred to classical women qualities (McCauley-Bush, 2012; Ling, Simsek, Lubatkin & Veiga, 2008a, 2008b; Waldman, Ramírez, House, and Puranam, 2001; Vinkenburg et al., 2011; Wolfram and Gratton, 2013). There has been much debate if this leadership style and their success is reflecting more feminine than masculine attributes. One study has shown a positive correlation with feminine attributes and transformational leadership (Vinkenburg et al, 2011). However, others have argued that transformational leadership is a result of a balance between masculinity and femininity creating an androgynous leadership style (Hackman et al., 1992; Wolfram and Gratton, 2013). Emphasizing this finding, Manning (2002) concludes that transformational leadership "may provide a way that women and men can integrate gender roles and structural role demands". Research has shown that effective leadership also requires interpersonal skills and feminine attributes as such as being supportive and empowering (Yukl, 2006). This reflects the discussion that female leadership characteristics such as interpersonal communication, nurturing and mutual respect are beginning to receive more value (Still, 2006; Wilson, 2013) but more in combination with masculine attributes what leads to creating an androgynous leadership style (Hackman et al., 1992; Wolfram and Gratton, 2013). According to Wolfram and Gratton androgynous female leaders will be effective in spite of their high femininity since they possess the required masculine attributes along with feminine attributes that may help “temper their agency with communion” (Eagly and Carli, 2007; Wolfram and Gratton, 2013). For female leaders to be perceived as effective they need to demonstrate both sensitivity and strength, whereas male leaders only need to demonstrate strength (Johnson, Murphy, Zewdie, and Reichard, 2008). Women are expected to mix individualized consideration and inspirational motivation like team and activity-oriented aspects of leadership style to reach a route to promotion (Eagly and Carli, 2007).

3. How can Women reach the Top level and Why not?
The approach to get a better understanding about how women can move to the top of a company is to focus on three areas and see them as a package to the solution for a successful top women management career.

1. How did three famous business women made it to the climax of big American corporates? Sheryl Sandberg, Virginia Rometty and Meg Whitman
2. How can women learn from and with men especially regarding networking, mentoring and career sponsoring?
3. Which female attributes contribute to a successful leadership career?

Secondary literature supports the argumentation.
According to Zweigenhaft many women bailout from career advancement because they do not want to give the all-out commitment to work and career needed from women and men who want to reach the top. It is not a life they want (Domhof et al., 2011). But some women do and they reach the pinnacle but not without a support system and men play a key role in their career aspiration.

3.1 Famous Business Women in Top Leading Positions: Sheryl Sandberg, Virginia Rometty and Meg Whitman
This paper uses a case study approach. A closer look into the career of three famous Business women can give some clues as to how women can set up a corporate career based on their own experience.
3.1.1 Sheryl Sandberg is the Chief Operating Officer (COO) at Facebook. She has a bachelor in economics and a Master of Business Administration from Harvard Business School. Furthermore she is leading a non-profit organization called leanin.org with that she supports women in the workplace and women’s empowerment groups. While she was student at Harvard College she met then Professor Larry Summers who became her mentor and Thesis adviser. He also recruited her to be his research assistant at the World Bank. After graduation from the Master Business Program she spent one year with McKinsey. After this short period she worked again for Larry Summers who was then serving as the United States Secretary of the Treasury under President Bill Clinton. When the Republicans gained the US presidency in 2000 she changed to Google. Eric Schmidt, CEO of Google at that time recruited her and later gave her the critical assignments that gave her the chance to build her personal brand at Google (Berhane, 2015). At a Christmas Party in 2007 she met Mark Zuckerberg. In March 2008 she changed from Google to Facebook in the role of a Chief Operating Officer. She is holding this position till today.

3.1.2 Virginia Rometty known as Ginni is the current Chairwoman, President, and CEO of IBM. She is the first woman in the history of IBM who runs this organization as CEO. Some in the industry expected the post might have gone to Steven Mills, the senior vice president who at this time run IBM’s software division, another big area of growth in recent years but the decision was for Virginia Rometty (Metz, 2011). She is succeeding Mr. Palmisano who says about the choice of Rometty that gender did not play a role in the choice. “Ginni got it because she deserved it. It has zero to do with progressive social policies” Mr. Palmisano said (Stewart, 2011). Rometty, 54, graduated from Northwestern University in 1979 with a Bachelor of Science degree in computer science and electrical engineering, before joining the General Motors Institute. In a speech at her alma mater at Northwestern she shares a story about how important her husband was and is in her career development. She said that early in her career she was offered a big leading position but that she was hesitant in doing it because of a lack of experience. She said that she feels not ready for it and prefers to gain more experience first. She needs to go home and think about it. She went home to tell her husband about it. He looked at her and said: “Do you think a man would have ever answered that question that way?” Rometty said that we women can learn a lot from men and how they approach many situations (Bort, 2015). Till today acquaintance of the couple confirm that Mr. Rometty plays a key role as personal adviser and supporter of his wife career to the top of IBM. In an interview Rometty said: "I felt, and I still feel that I wanted my tenure to be defined as being the CEO of IBM, not about being woman CEO of IBM" (Chafkin, 2016)

3.1.3 Meg Whitman
She has a bachelor in economics and obtained an M.B.A from Harvard business school. Headhunters offered her many different leading positions so she has worked at Bain, Disney, Hasbro, FTD, Stride Rite and eBay. She started her career in roles like manager, consultant, vice president, CEO, and General Manager with different companies and industries. Currently she is Hewlett Packard Enterprise CEO. In an interview by Harvard Business Review she said that she gave up thinking about being a female in the workplace many years ago as this is a fact that she cannot change instead she prefers to focus on finance and communication as these are areas where she can change. “I’m a CEO who happens to be female” (Ignatius, 2016). She has built her reputation in a corporate world still largely run by men. She said in an interview that she never felt hugely disadvantaged as a woman in her career process. The ingredients for her success she explains as follows “I just had to deliver results, be fun to work with, be easy to work with and
enthusiastic. I had played a lot of sports as a girl, so I knew how to be part of a team” (Ignatius, 2016). She is number 7 on Fortune’s 2015 list of the world’s most powerful women. According to Whitman one turning point in her career was when she worked at Disney in the late 1980s. Disney in those years was a male oriented culture. Frank Wells who was COO of Disney told Whitman “You are just as smart as these guys. You have to speak up in meetings. You have to make yourself say stuff” (Dolan, 2016). Whitman said that this advice was a key lesson to her. She really learned to stand up for herself. Before she was always thinking say nothing unless it is brilliant even though three quarters of other colleagues were saying stupid stuff (Dolan, 2016).

3.2 A Top Career Is Possible With Men And Other Ingredients
The biographies of Sheryl Sandberg, Virginia Rometty and Meg Whitman show that their career paths were supported by key enablers like networking, mentoring, career sponsoring and coaching where men played a key role. Not all of these enablers are represented nor have the same meaning and importance in each professional career. It seems to be that for the career of Sheryl Sandberg networking, mentoring and career sponsoring were the key elements that brought her all the way up to the top. She had Larry Summers as mentor and career sponsor. Furthermore she met Mark Zuckerberg at a Christmas party. This network contact obviously helped her to switch careers from Google to Facebook. For the career path of Virginia Rometty it seems to be that her husband as mentor plays a key role in her advancement. He appears to be the one who gives her good advice especially in situations where she had to decide on next career steps. He helped her to grow to the pinnacle of IBM and most likely supports her to maintain this position. The career of Meg Whitman looks well planned. Every company change is accompanied by a higher position. It looks like she is very good in strategic thinking. Nevertheless she mentions the advice of former boss Frank Wells as important for changing her attitude in terms of communication and improving her career in that way. This element can be assigned under the topic of coaching. Networking, Mentoring, Career sponsoring and coaching are the key elements to plan and excel a career to the top level of any organization. The importance and emphasis can be different from woman to woman. However enablers and obstacles in a female career can be explained by having a closer look at those elements.

Consequently an issue for many women in moving forward might be a lack of strategic thinking in setting up a useful network and choosing supportive mentors and career sponsors. A deficit in strategic thinking and understanding in dealing with networking, mentoring, career sponsoring and coaching could be an explanation why career developments for women are often limited.

When White House Chief of Staff Leon Panetta’s asked Madeleine Albright who was at that time U.S. ambassador to the United Nations after her future plans she responded: "I would love to continue serving at the UN, but I would also be interested in becoming secretary of state" (Berhane, 2015). President Clinton made her then the first woman secretary of state (Berhane, 2015). In case she hadn’t spoken up about her career interests she might have never got this position. It is assumed that Loretta Lynch the first African-American woman U.S. attorney general got support for this promotion from Barack Obama (Berhane, 2015). When it comes to women’s advancement, men obviously matter. The reality is that only 21% of senior business positions in the U.S. and 22% globally are occupied with women conclusively making men the most powerful stakeholders in leading corporations (Grant Thornton, 2015). Recognizing that workforce demographics are evolving slowly but steadily, women should work with men to plan their career (Berhane, 2015). It is a reality in the lives of many female corporate leaders that the glass ceilings exist but cracks have begun to appear in it and there needs to be awareness about it. “Advance preparation has always been one of
the best ways to increase the likelihood of eventual success as a leader”, says Vanderbroeck (2014). This chapter will summarize aspects to plan a top management career for women and represent the findings in the following two figures.

Figure 1. With Female Feast to the Top: Women Break the Glass Ceiling

![Diagram showing networking, mentoring, career sponsoring, and coaching]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Networking</th>
<th>Mentoring</th>
<th>Career Sponsoring</th>
<th>Coaching: Skill focus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increase knowledge</td>
<td>Long term relationship that offers Business advice and guidance</td>
<td>Network/useful connections/contacts for career development</td>
<td>Conflict management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to new clients, projects, business partners</td>
<td>Open doors to out of reach opportunities: projects, positions</td>
<td>Promotion</td>
<td>Appearance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Career opportunities</td>
<td>Communication: awareness, using words, speeches, strategic thinking skills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A woman who is strategically thinking and planning her career considering tools like networking, mentoring, sponsoring and coaching has a good chance to target and reach a top management position. This includes a proactive approach to plan and manage own career including informing senior management directly about positive work results. Getting visibility is part of planning, organizing and implementing a leadership career. This action is part of leadership responsibility of every woman willing to move forward and up (Vanderbroeck, 2014). Strategically organized
networking, sponsoring or mentoring and coaching are preconditions to a successful top management career for women.

4. Conclusion and Outlook
I would never argue that senior leadership positions are suitable for every woman. Above all the majority of women in the US is not interested in reaching top executive positions. One goal of this paper is to understand why there are only just a few women who broke through the glass ceiling up to the executive management level and which role play men by moving up the career ladder. Followed by the second goal for this paper. What can a woman do if she wants to move up the career ladder? I’m aware that the reasons can be very complex and vary from different individual circumstances and biographies of women. Nevertheless I think that there is a relationship between networking, mentoring, sponsoring and coaching and the underrepresentation of women in top business positions. This link can be driven either by a lack of access or by a lack of awareness regarding the deeper meaning of networking, mentoring and sponsoring as useful and necessary tools to plan a career or even a mix of both.

I hope this article offers some answers and tools that can help women to increase their awareness in organizing a career to the top.

Another point that should not be neglected in the discussion is the relationship within women. Having the same gender is no guarantee for sympathy nor collaboration and help. According to some studies women are just as likely to show sexism in hiring practices, compensation, advancement, and coaching. Other studies have shown that women prefer a male boss over a female superior. One explanation can be that females have stereotypes of females based on competitive pressures to be the only “minority” getting attention. Others might fear that reporting to a woman will not help advance one's career as quickly as reporting to a man who may have more influence in the corporation.

To better understand and have a complete view of why women are still a minority in leading positions I would recommend investigating what criteria and reasons are from the perspective of men in leading positions, either to block career advancement of women, or to support their career. Business is still a man’s world but as we have seen in the cases of successful business women in top leading positions this is not necessarily an obstacle. Men are willing to sponsor women careers but how are they choosing women as mentee for example? What are their criteria? What can they do and what are they willing to do in order to support more women in their career advancement? Furthermore mentoring, sponsoring and networking possibilities should be revised in companies and questioned in terms of effectiveness. Are they really sponsoring careers within an organization? Women should have access to coaching programs to develop a basic level of preconditions to excel a career. Awareness should already start in the education system where students in general and female students in particular should be trained how to develop a useful network and who might be a key figure in supporting their career advancement.

In terms of research there is too much confusion regarding the differentiation of the meaning of mentoring and career sponsoring. Additional theoretical research is necessary to have a clearer separation of these two concepts. Further research, for example, of a bigger sample of case studies on business women in top leading positions is necessary to understand the barriers of moving up the
career for women in more detail and get valid results from that. Further research is also necessary to understand the impact of gender related attributes on leadership style but not in playing off male attributes against women qualities rather in gaining a deeper understanding of what attributes are needed when and in which context.

References


Clark, Dorie (2013). Why so few women and minorities at the top? Here is the real reason. Forbes, September 3rd.


Case studies focusing on female entrepreneurs
Limitation of Young Female Entrepreneurs in Thailand

By Arthon Prompatanapak
School of Entrepreneurship and Management
Bangkok University

Abstract:
It’s common for Thai young entrepreneurs to be coming entrepreneurs since their teenage years. They are keen to earn own money in order to gain financial freedom especially from their parents. According to Global Entrepreneur Monitor (GEM) data in 2016, 57.8% of the entrepreneurs say their reasons to start their own business in Thailand is “to have more income” and 79% of the sample can see the opportunities which allow them to build their own businesses in their home country. This shows a positive sign for the entrepreneurs in general.

Thai economy is open for everyone. It has no barriers on culture, age or agenda. Young women are likely to Start-up more new businesses than men. GEM data shows that the biggest financial support to these start-up teenagers is their families (67.3% and 70.8% in year 2014 and 2015, respectively). It is interesting to know how young entrepreneurs learn their entrepreneurial skills from their family, school, university or even by themselves.

The purpose of this paper is to explore the marketing strategies of online businesses operated by a young female entrepreneur. The authors apply an entrepreneurial marketing lens to explore how such young female entrepreneurs draw on the resources to market their business.

The paper primarily draws on evidences from an exploratory case study of a young female entrepreneur who operate online business in the healthcare and cosmetic sectors in Thailand. Qualitative data collected from semi-structured 3 interviews were conducted and analyzed.

Findings of the study highlight that the nature of entrepreneurial marketing used by online business is limited. Young female entrepreneurs implement only some method of online marketing. The key themes of the discussion are how young female entrepreneurs adapted their entrepreneurial marketing frameworks to suit their enterprises and how they used innovation to improve their business activity. The results also provide that young female entrepreneurs are not trying to use and develop innovative marketing in their business.
**Introduction**

Thai Government is encouraging new start-up in the country. Women has played the main role in Thai economy. Female merchants or “Maykar” are commonly active in the Thai fresh market. Women seem to have more drive than men. They have to fight for their family and make sure that their beloved are living well.

By the Government policy, there is also no limitation of age for the new start-up in Thailand. However, seniority seem very important for the Asian society. This research is to find whether young female start-up had/has any problems to start her business.

This research is based on interviewing a young female entrepreneur who at the same time is studying Entrepreneurship at Bangkok University. At her young age, Miss Ranchida Kamonchadniti or Milk is a very successful business lady. She started her trade since her age of 14. The interviewer wants to know the difficulties that she has been through. We want to find out whether she met any limitation to set up or running her business.

Milk will also discuss with us about her marketing channel. She will explain about changes on her online business. The changes that she had to adapt to fit we the fashion world and tricks to win the market share.

**Literature review**

**Timmons Model Of the Entrepreneurial Process**

The entrepreneurs always start-up by seeing opportunity from the problem. Jeffry Timmons's (2004) framework explained that the success entrepreneurs are people who can match opportunity with the resources that he has.

![Figure 1: Timmons Model (2004)](image)

The founder of the business can see opportunity which is the problem in the market or kind of missing service to fulfill needs of consumers. He searched for a team who can develop such product or service to serve those tasks. On this first stage of product development, ambiguity creativity is the must for the team to come up with new ideas. The flash idea will lead to the new product for the market. In order to get investment from sponsor or investors, the team has to make a perfect pitch to convince the investor to invest in this new start-up. There sources that the team needs are not only money, but also personal connection, facility and other kind of resources.
Moore-Bygrave model of the Entrepreneurial Process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal</th>
<th>Personal</th>
<th>Sociological</th>
<th>Personal</th>
<th>Organisational</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Achievement</td>
<td>Risk Taking</td>
<td>Networks</td>
<td>Entrepreneur</td>
<td>Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locus of control</td>
<td>Dissatisfaction</td>
<td>Jobs</td>
<td>Leader</td>
<td>Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ambiguity tolerance</td>
<td>Job Loss</td>
<td>Team</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>Structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk Taking</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>Commitment</td>
<td>Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Values</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Family</td>
<td>Vision</td>
<td>Products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Role Models</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Commitment</td>
<td>Advisors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Opportunity recognition  
Resources

Innovation  
Triggering Event  
Implementation  
Growth

Environment
 Opportunity
Role models
Creativity

Environmental
 Economy
Competition
Resources
Incubator
Government Policy

Environmental
 Competitions
Customers
Suppliers
Investors
Bankers
Lawyers
Resources
Government policy
Economy

Figure 2: A model of the entrepreneurial process
Source: Based on Carol Moore’s Model (1986)

Carol Moore’s Model shows that for starting new enterprise, the business need to go through each point in the Carol Moore’s Model as represented in Figure 2.

Methodology
This case study is basing on the in-depth interviews with a successful young female entrepreneur. The questions of the interview are covering these areas:
1) Passion of the interviewee from starting her business to the current business model
2) The development of her business models
3) Difficulties that she has faced
4) The foreseen future of her business

Result of in-depth interview
Information about interviewee, Miss Ranchida Kamonchadniti or Milk

Milk, 19 years old is a first-year student at Bangkok University’s School of Entrepreneurship and Management. She is one of five Young Entrepreneur scholar students who already had existing business’ or interesting business plans before joining Bangkok University.

Milk established her business in year 2011, during Matayom 2 (8th Grade) at her high school. She was a bit more fashionable than her classmates. By this modern look, it made her very popular at school. The triggering event that move Milk to start her very first business was when her parents refused to buy an I-phone. She started to look in to the wardrobe for not longer used clothing. She sold those clothes to friends and collected money to buy an I-phone as her wish.
Milk also used cosmetic and give recommendation to all the friends. She has an image of an expert on beauty at the age of 14. She took pre-order from friends and order products from internet. She added a bit of profit margin for herself as the administration cost which her friends were happy to pay for.

Public Schools in Thailand are working hard to make all the students feel equal in wealth and status in their school society. The school uniform and fashionable accessories are strictly controlled. Due to strict school regulation on cosmetics, such as lipstick, powder, and brush on are not allowed to apply at school. Young female students who want to use these products to show their maturity must carefully select products to enhance their beauty. If the teacher find out that they put make up on, their disciplinary points will be deducted.

Milk found common problems in the community. She and her colleagues at school had the following desire:

1) They wanted to use cosmetic to portray their maturity and attractiveness to their classmates.
2) They can’t be caught by the teacher for using cosmetic.
3) Most of good cosmetic’s prices are too high for high school students like themselves.

Milk was searching for ranges of cosmetics which can sort her customers’ problem (and also her own)

a) The shades of products must be light in colours. They can apply well to the condition of Thai students’ skin. Her clients must look good and at the same time teachers would not be able to catch them for using cosmetics.

b) Affordable price for the students who still are financially dependent on their parents. Their pocket money is mainly spent on food and transportation. They do not have big budget left for their beauty.

c) The products should be allergen free with no chemical additive.

Milk clearly saw the opportunity that she could solve these common problems. She ordered all interesting cosmetics by online shopping and search from the vendors in shopping malls. She has tried all the products by herself to make sure that it works for her skin. Milk started to sell them to friends via her recommendation. All the friends saw the difference on Milk’s skin & looks and started to buy the products from her. Her customers feel confidence that the goods have been used by its business owner. Milk used products on her own self and ask friends to communicate the quality of her beauty products.

Milk’s small business has expanded out effectively. Her first group of customers were friends in the same gang then expanded to female friends in the same year students and spread to the whole community of girls in the high schools. Even without realizing, word of mouth was Milk’s very first marketing tools. Milk also shares her opinions of her selective products on her personal Facebook account. The number of Facebook followers have increased rapidly.

After the range of Milk’s selection of products have been accepted by the target market, she should hold more stock to serve the increasing market’s demand. However, her money capital is very limited. She asked for more funding from her parents. This finding coincides with Gem’s data (2016) that indicate 90% of the new start-up business borrow their first funding from their family (parents or relatives).

Milk’s parents were sub construction contractor. They were fully supported their second daughter’s entrepreneurial mind set. Milk made a small presentation about her business on the family dining table and ended up her talk by asking 3,000 baht (USD 85) of cash. This amount of money is not
small for a young business owner like Milk’s father. To support the entrepreneurial spirit of their
daughter, her parents gave their savings as her first capital. Milk might not realize that her very first
resource is not the money that her parents invest on her business but the very first resource of this
business is the network of friends. They give her opinion, feedback, suggestion on her Marketing’s
Mix, and spread out the business context to other societies.

After having bigger investment, Milk start to buy products in bulk and repack the good in her own
packaging. She also packed product in a small tab and distribute to friends as free sample. The
brand Fairy Milky established through this change. Milk’s older sister; Beer gave assistance to the
operation side of the business. Milk’s mother helps to do the bookkeeping job. Milk is having a
good team whom she can trust. The value of her team is all members can communicate with each
other. Their common interest is the wealth of the family not only supporting founder of the business.
The team has open and honest communication practice. They discuss with one another every time
that any decisions needs to be made such as new investment, product range adjustment, etc.
Although eventually Milk is the one who make final decision.

The key innovation on Fairy Milky brand was to serve young Thai ladies who were looking for some
common characteristics of products which were not much available in the market. They did not have
anyone to select those products for them. Milk realized that the teenagers are spending most of
their free time on social media. Milk advertise her goods on Instagram and Facebook. In 2011,
there were only 2 cosmetic brands on Facebook Thailand and Fairy Milky was the only brand on
Instagram. Her customers find it easy to buy products from the social medias.

In the latest stage of business cycle, Milk also innovated her own range of products to serve to local
Thai female students. She is strongly trade via Facebook. Milk is now developing Fairy Milky
website to offer convenience online marketing to her customers.

She is working closely with cosmetic manufactures to develop her own range of cosmetic. The
ingredients of her products will be based on local herb and Thai flowers. Milk is studying about a
cream which can refresh skins overnight. She registered the copies right of her products’ recopies
under her own name.

Apart from seeking for financial freedom, Milk found the trigger points of her business as follow:
1) The products serve to the needs of her customers (15-25 year old ladies)
2) The products have been used and the result has been proven by a consumer who has a
similar age, agenda, size of budget and are facing with the same society’s rule as the
customers.
3) The attractive prices serve budget of the target customers.
4) Door to Door delivery service is the service provide to the customer. Most of the customers
are students who have limited freedom and budget of traveling. Milk also could not afford to
rent space in shopping mall or shop for display of her products. Therefore, the post service
is the most commercial way to the customer and distributor.

Social network is playing important role to Milky brand expansion. Now her customers are not only
from her school but customers of this young ladies are now from everywhere in Thailand. Fairly
Milky brand was getting popular among Thai female students. Due to high demand, the products
that she trade were always out of stock. The cosmetic distributors came up with one common
excuses that the manufacturer could not deliver the product to them on time. They put all the blame
to the manufacturers.

At that stage, Milk started to think about ways to correct shortage of stock problem. She also
needed to increase profit margin on her business. Milk used to act as the trader who was limited by
the cost transfer between distributors and manufacturers. She only added on profit margin to become the selling price to offer to her customers.

Milk started to search for the manufacturers who could produce products while exclusively serving to her specification. She paid many visits to the labs and cosmetic factories. She came up with her own range of products.

She started to travel to Korea, where it is the central of Asian cosmetics. She can learn the new market trend which is usually a few years ahead of Thailand. She bought the products back and discuss with the lab for new product development. Then the new formula would transfer to the manufacture to become an actual product.

At this moment 95% of Fairly Milky products are produced by 5 local Thai cosmetic manufacturers. The suppliers had to be certified by the Thai Department of Food and Drugs Administration (FDA). Every single item of Milky products has the FDA code stated on the label of the packaging.

The founder of After You Public Company, Mr. Matab Tor Suwan mentioned that "Start-up business' have to think in the children way but work in the Adult way". He expressed that children have unlimited imagination. So, their lively idea is always an excitement to the market. However, when the start-up wants to start their project, they have to do it in an adult professional way. They need to pay attention to the small details. The new entrepreneur must be proactive to the customer’s needs. This would bring a professional image to the products which means a ‘trustworthy’ value to the enterprise. This is one of the key factors to Milk’s success. She is helping teenage students (children) get rid of their problem but at the same time show how much she cares about the high quality of her products.

Hence Fairy Milky Brand grew from few thousands to few million Baht per month. None of the businesses would not grow without any problems. The researcher asked about issues that Milk faced during her business path. The young entrepreneur admitted that the growth stage is having more problems than others.

Milk would like to apply for some loan to spend on product research and development. Most of the bankers or Government body are refusing to make a serious discussion with her. In Thailand, young females are the symbol of fun and flash. They are not considered to be somebody who want to sustain her business. Most people surrounding Milk said “She would be bored by this business soon”. Even her parents admitted that they under estimate their daughter.

After Milk earned her first return from her first investment, she gained some self-confidence which she expressed as “Over Confidence”. The young entrepreneur did not pay much attention to the comment of her customers as she used to. Milk admitted that she did not value those customer’s response as the asset. After failure on some product item, Milk realized that she should take all the comment to improve and maintain the attributes of the products. Due to the lack of business experiences, Milk did not have any negotiation skills to communicate with her suppliers. These kind of soft business skills are not taught in Thai schools. She must accept prices and minimum quantity that the manufacturers quoted to her. This is one of the reasons that made her decided to join Bangkok University's School of Entrepreneurship and Management (BUSEM).

Milk had limited set of skill to make her Facebook and Instagram pages attractive. She need web master to help her to develop an effective website for the customer to excess and press order. Milk wants to employ a person to look after the traffic on Fairy Milky Facebook and Instagram pages. Fairy Milky business’s model is shifting from sole trader to become multilevel marketing. Currently, it has 300 representatives all over Thailand, Cambodia and Laos. Milk cannot keep all the partners on
Milk at this moment:

In year 2015, Milk decided to apply for Young Entrepreneur Scholarship. If she win the scholarship, Milk will be sponsored to spend 4 years to complete her degree of Bachelor of Business Management on Entrepreneurship at BUSEM.

Like other candidates, Milk had to go through process of interviews with scholar committees. Due to high score on Entrepreneurial Mid set interview, the President of Bangkok University had an interview with her personally. Among 200 applicants, Milk earned the scholarship with no question. She won the competition with her big vision. She always tries to help her customers to sort out their problems. This attitude made her dialogue by far advance than other applicants.

The researcher asked our young scholar about her changes after joining BUSEM. Milk admitted that she found it hard at the first term of her time as freshman. After few weeks of adjustment to the new environment, Milk has learnt lots of entrepreneurial skill and understands how each business function works. Product Life Cycle management is the part that interested her the most. She uses the knowledge in the class to manage her product in its life cycle.

In the future, Milk is planning to have her own shopping mall where offer cosmetic and health products to the teenagers and tourists. Even the visitors from oversea cannot miss to shop at her mall before they go back to their home countries.

Milk told us “I understand those teenagers are the group of people who spend on their desire. They only think of happiness today. They want to have fun and willing to pay on what they want. But I always keep in mind that most of them have very small budget. This is the challenge that I love. My business will be alive as long as this world still have female teenagers.”

Discussion
The main purpose of this study is to investigate the barriers to become entrepreneurs of youth females in Thailand. Qualitative research method was used by the in-depth interviews with a successful young female entrepreneur. The questions of the interview are covering 4 areas; namely, Passion from starting business to the current business model, the development of business models, Difficulties to become youth female entrepreneur, and the foreseen future of business.

According to the result of in depth interview, we found that youth entrepreneurs start with business ideas from their interesting such as favorite hobby or their daily life products. In this case, we can refer that youth entrepreneurs often employ “inside-out strategy” rather than “outside-in”. Youth entrepreneurs’ strategy relies on their core competencies (what they love or activities they indulge with) to create their business rather than searching for business opportunities from external environment trend.

Youth entrepreneurs tend to more educated than senior one. Technology exploitation such as social media and internet website is one of the prevalence strategies to expand and contact potential customers. In this case study, the youth female entrepreneurs, Milk, propose her products to existing and potential customers by utilizing online application which help her to save the cost of advertising comparing with traditional below the line strategies.

The most predominant barrier found in this study for becoming youth entrepreneurs is the seniority. Thailand is one of high power distance culture which value seniority than competence. The respectful of age and seniority seem to be one of the most significant obstacles for youth to start and run their businesses. Milk underwent the difficult situation at the beginning when she started up her
business as a result of her young. However, the seniority barrier seems to be less affect in the later stage of entrepreneurial process. The reliability and reputation of her business can compensate this situation.

Conclusion
This case study shows that Thailand is an easy country to start new business. This country has no barrier for any genders to be an entrepreneur. However, seniority still be a concern to some of traditional business people. At the beginning, Milk found it hard to build trust with her suppliers. Continuing business transactions and increasing on sales volume were the key for Milk to gain trust from her suppliers and customers. The challenges that the young entrepreneur has to face are:
   a. Sustainability Business: how she can maintain her success in business.
   b. Ability to adapt: how quickly she can react to fashionable market changes.
   c. Make everyone happy: the hardest challenge for Milk is how to make everyone in her family feel happily work for her enterprise.
These are the next chapter that Milk has to taking care of. We are wishing her well and all the best to our beloved student.

Reference
A case study of female entrepreneurship and the construction of strategy and customers in the service industry.

Ph.D. Jesper Doepping
MAHIDOL UNIVERSITY INTERNATIONAL COLLEGE
JDOEPING@ME.COM

Topics: Women’s entrepreneurship. Agencement, formativeness, practice theory. Case studies focusing on female entrepreneurs

ABSTRACT
Principal Topic:
This case study seeks to understand how a female entrepreneur seeks to create her business in a field that from the outside looks like and generally is categorized as less innovative in quantitative categorizations. In the case it is shown how the female entrepreneur and her employees perceive the business in different terms and as not in any direct competition with other providers. The study further shows how they co-construct the service offering with their clients. In this process both the entrepreneur had to develop a new identity, which varied radically form their previous identity as professional dancers.

Method:
Qualitative case study applying ethnographic observations and interviews. The study apply a grounded theory methodology to interpret the data.

Results and Implications:
The study implies that female entrepreneurs do think in innovative terms when they construct their business. The study shows that the development of a business value proposition, not only demands a fair amount of work in order to create a relevant market, but that to understand this market the concept of “agencement” can be very useful in understanding, how social networks, traditional marketing, customers, employees and technologies actively construct and reconstruct what the business value proposition is and should be. The study further implies that not only the organization and the entrepreneur will change their identity, but that employment in a new organization can alter the employees and “customers” identity and self-concept.

Keywords: Women’s entrepreneurship. Agencement, formativeness, practice theory. Case studies focusing on female entrepreneurs
Introduction:

In Julia Elyashar’s book “Markets of dispossession” (2005), she describes how the young Egyptian entrepreneur walks through the world desperately trying to find “the market”, a market that seems to have vanished in to the blue sky, despite the intensive training sponsored by the IMF, the World Bank, United States and the European union. The entrepreneurs wanted desperately to find the market, that would create prosperity, but most of all a living for themselves. “Finding the market, they believed, entailed gaining access to the internet, learning about advertising, and taking marketing classes” (Elyashar 2005, p. 120). In contrast, next door the traditional workshop masters and their apprentices saw markets and opportunities every day when they walked the same streets in Cairo. Elyashars anthropological description and analysis shows: “that the market is not a technical instrument that be put to use for the benefit of all. Expansion of the neoliberal market is not the application of an instrument or model that has been scientifically proven to work best. Markets are social and political worlds with their own cosmologies. Each is a cosmos of its own, an intricately functioning field of power” (ibid, p.213).

The cosmology, here understood as the assumptions we make about the parts, elements, processes and structures that constitute the “universe of entrepreneurs”, of much discussion of entrepreneurship seems to assume that the entrepreneurial activity is a capacity for innovation. An activity that traditional leads to the assumptions of large amounts of “personal creativity and energy”. Schumpeter for instance describe the entrepreneur as someone endowed “with super-normal qualities of intellect and will” (Schumpeter, 1939, p. 82). Bruni, Gherardi and Poggio (2004) those not only describes how our traditional conception of the entrepreneur tend to be gendered, but also how the gendering continuously is established and practiced towards female and male entrepreneurs in actual entrepreneurial practices. It is those not uncommon to see female entrepreneurs (as a general category), described as less innovative, as less economical important, and less changing of the market and the world.

In this study it is tried to move out of the more traditional opportunity recognition frameworks, because the opportunity recognition framework according to Fletcher (2006, p. 425) is limited, and that these limitations are specifically related to the assumptions that 1. Opportunities are generated by market disequilibria, which are located out there in “the market, 2. That the majority of agency is attributed to individual judgement of “gaps” in the market, and that the opportunity frameworks do not seem to take into account the networks, individual experiences, wider economical, societal or cultural process and patterns that takes part in the constitution of the entrepreneurial practices.

The study those try to answer how, what, when and where is the specific cosmology of an entrepreneurial business made. It does so by following female entrepreneurial practices as they establish a business, and creates a market. The female entrepreneurial practice is chosen in order to challenge the idea of the entrepreneur as the heroic, conquering, exceptional man.

Theoretical framework

In order to answer the question of which specific cosmology the entrepreneuring process constitutes and construct, this paper deliberately try to accomplish, a break with the methodological individualism of “Robinson Crusoe economics” where the individual entrepreneur are conceptualized
inside an environmental opportunity gap (Steyaert 2007). This break is also a break with the figure of the male knight in armor entrepreneur that personally conquer the world (for a critical discussion see Johnsen & Sorensen (2017) inside an individual-opportunity nexus. It is thus assumed, that both the opportunity and the individual(s) are the vary thing that we need to explain in entrepreneuring. This turn of events follow Latour (2005) in arguing that the approach can’t use the concept of the social, economy, individual to explain the entrepreneuring on the contrary it is the social, economical and individual in entrepreneuring that most be explained. This tradition comes with the cultural and linguistic turns. Gherardi (2016) claims that it is with the rediscovery of Wittgenstein within practice studies, that the connection between the linguistic and the practice turn is to be found:

“In fact, in wider acception of the linguistic turn, the taken-for-granted distinction between ontology and epistemology collapses once we recognize the role of language in the constructing the object of being. In other words, it is through epistemic practices that researchers construct both the object of knowledge – ontology – and the methods for producing knowledge, that is, epistemology. Researchers are inside the practices that the study.” (Gherardi 2016, p. 684).

In the practice turn a prism of observation can be stated through 8 tentative principles or basic assumption, which here are a rewritten and refocused version of Niebuhr’s (2016), basic principles. The principles are:

1. Agency in businesses and markets is sociotechnically distributed
2. The design of businesses and markets is a collective project
3. Businesses and markets are always in the making
4. Businesses and market-making is about translations
5. Businesses and market-making has disciplinary effects
6. Businesses and markets materialize in (traveling) policies
7. Businesses and markets are relational constructs
8. Hence, business and markets are performative effects

The fundamental premises here to talk about businesses and markets is that businesses and markets is constituted through and by a practice which leads to the first prism and assumption:

Agency in businesses and markets is considered sociotechnically distributed. The practices is considered as a process that are intertwined between human and non-human actants. This mean that a business or a market can be considered to be an actor, and so can the individual entrepreneur. However as an actor the constituted individual entrepreneur or business or market is “made up of human bodies but also prostheses, tools, equipment, technical devices, algorythms, etc. – in other words, is made up of agencement” (Callon 2005, p. 4). The concept of agencement is traditional translated into English as assemblage, which denotes a level of fixation in time and space. A more recent conceptualization of agencement stresses that agencement as a processual term, that underlines the continued connection between heterogeneous elements an processes each of which contributes to the constitution of the specific business or market (Gherardi 2016). This part leads us directly to the second prism
The design of businesses and markets is a collective project. With the concept of practice it is from the outset assumed that the business and the market is the result of many actants activities and agency negotiated, contested and carved out through continuous interactions. As such a business and a market is always collectively constituted.

Businesses and markets are always in the making. This idea is summarized in Law (1994, p. 101) fundamental conclusion in his research of an organization that: "There is no social order. Rather, there are endless attempts at ordering" This concept have strong similarities to the organizational theoretical frame argued by Hernes (2014). In this frame it is assumed that organization and implicitly markets are always on the move, meaning that perceived stable arrangements has a fundamental perishability in the flow of time. “The essense of persisting in a world on the move is not change (as change goes on all the time), but tentative ongoing stabilization of past experiences and future possibilities in view of their possibilities of becoming otherwise” (Hernes, 2014, p. 189).

Businesses and market-making is about translations. That focus our view of the process of aligning things and processes that previously different. Translation focus our view on how activities are organized and set up as organizational activities that provides services, and how in the process the business translate otherwise not related actants into costumers for that business. It is through the translation and agencement that the assemblage of a successful business and its markets is for a while stabilized in time and space.

Businesses and market-making has disciplinary effects. By disciplinary effects what is considered is what Foucault coined the “microphycis of power”, it points towards how actants as entrepreneurs, trainers, instructors, office staff, and customer are disciplined in to assuming and identifying with certain positions and relations in the business and market. The disciplinary powers question asks how certain procedures, "experiences", services etc are imposed upon the business and its markets of costumers.

Businesses and markets materialize in (traveling) policies. Reports, training programs, figures are materialized in order for them to be possible to travel around the globe. The question here is how these get materialized and get the form of “immutable mobiles” (Latour 1987), that as a case in point ensures that the costumer will get the same or similar experience when the purchase a fitness class in New York, Los Angelos, Bangkok, Dubai etc.. Given that the entrepreneurs are establishing a franchise this issue becomes fundamental for the whole idea of the market and the value that they are claiming to provide to otherwise very different people.

Businesses and markets are relational constructs. Establishing a business through entrepreneuring is those assumed to be a matter of in practice creating relations between multiple processes, actants, locations in short distributed practices that are on the move at all times. Entrepreneuring is those researched here as a way of relating in a way that hopefully can create value.

Hence, business and markets are performative effects. The premise in this prism of observation and theorizing is that they very business and markets are entities that come to life through the performance of practices. It is established through agency, agencement, heterogeneity and translations that makes it possible at specific time to see an entrepreneurial business out of otherwise seemingly unconnected activities and ways of living.
The case - Physique 57

The case follow the establishment of a franchise of the New Your based barre concept for exercising established in New York in 2006. The traditional concept of a franchise is that the business model, service concept and training is provided by the franchise giver and that this concept is then implemented locally. As an entrepreneurial heroic and conquering enterprise it those fall far beside the traditional description of entrepreneurship, since the franchise just have to translate and adapt the knowledge (see Kellog et al 2006, Bruni et al 2006) of doing Physique 57 from New York to Bangkok.

The background for the Physique 57 Bangkok is that 4 Thai born women distributed across United States by coincident are talking about starting their own business in Thailand. All 4 women work in the finance field ranging from positions as risk manager, financial consultants in a major accounting firm, to senior accountants in different companies. All of them have lived, studied and worked in US for +10 years. When the project of Physique 57 start to take shape one of the women in the group has taken on a role in Thailand as investment relation manager for a listed company in Thailand, 2 in the group are at present not capable of moving to Thailand for job and social reasons. The fourth quit her job and bring her husband to Thailand in order to start the project, before any contracts are actually signed.

From a very early start in their Sunday skype conversations it becomes clear that they all like the idea of investing in the fitness industry in Thailand. An industry they all see as interesting and potentially growing in Thailand. In their discussions and searches for data they find that only 1% of Thais have a fitness membership, together with that large running events are increasing in numbers and participants. Running events just 10 years ago was largely an expat events, where expats had running events early in the morning to avoid the heat.

In order to start Physique 57, it took that Physique 57 New York representatives would come from New York and approve potential locations, have trial classes and auditions for potential instructors. If approved a specific contract would be negotiated and 4 instructors and 1 of the entrepreneurs would go to New York to be trained. Later a New York Instructor would arrive to continue the training of instructors and support the establishment of the Physique 57 studio.

Methods:

The research data for this paper was gathered as part of an ongoing project in a study of female managers and entrepreneurs. The research was conducted through participant observation for 2 years (since the prestart) and semi structured interviews.

The data consisted of ethnographic data reports, interview transcripts, marketing material and postings on facebook and Instagram.

The data has been analyzed by using a grounded theory approach (Glaser & Strauss 1967, Glaser 1978, Strauss 1987, and Corbin & Strauss 2008). Grounded theory methodology has historically been split between the two original founders (see for instance Heath & Cowley 2004). The approach taken here does rely more on the Corbin & Strauss approach, in which the analyst simultaneously
will move between a 1st order coding of arenas, actants, relations/networks/practices, 2nd order coding/analysis in the form of memo writing and conceptualization. Many of the technical steps and establishment of categories is however, taken from in particular Glaser (1978).

The approach does, however, differ from both approaches that I apply 3 sensitizing categories (Dopping 1998). These categories are practice, actants (Latour 2005), agencement and formativeness (Strauss 1993) and Arenas (Strauss 1993 and Latour 2013).

The evolving strategy: experience and prolonged decisions

With a background in economics and all 4 of the entrepreneur’s professional background. The first ideas were not only discussed, but also tested out economically. One of the ideas was indoor cycling classes, which are well known in Europe and US often located inside fitness centers. However, very early on it becomes clear that importing indoor bikes of a reasonable quality with electronic measurements would be much more expensive than the group had imagined, and that the cost would exceed their available funds even before actual fitting of a place, marketing and hiring staff.

Turning to experiences and lived lives.

After this it is voiced in the group: “what about Barre classes? It is both fun, short and produce results”. In the group it was further claimed that a clear indicator of the value of this class was that 2 of entrepreneurs had been doing it every weekend for more than 2 years, and that especially one of them “who don’t like to exercise, has been able to keep it up for all that time!”, “and it fits great into going to exercise and then for instance go for brunch, shopping or hang out in the city” and “setting up Barres in Bangkok cant be that expensive!” The key proponent in an interview later said

“I tried to say that Physique 57 and barre was interesting for a long time. Being back in Bangkok I tried doing Physique 57 exercises in the gym, but lying down in the gym and doing hairpin was really wired, but I guess my way of suggesting was to indirect in the start.”

In the continued discussion this seems to be the first change, where the idea of the actual experience and fun for the costumers becomes a driving force for moving forward. One of the entrepreneurs formulates it like this: “X is really kind of the person which just know what is fashionable, what movie to see, where to go, she is really worldly and New York, that together with that Y, who generally do not like to exercise continued going and found it fun convinced me to look closer at it”.

These statements can be interpreted as a shift away from thinking the business in terms of an economical rational decision, towards what kind of experiences the fitness would provide for the beneficiaries. Similar to what Vargos and Lush (2011) defines as a service logic. This change in the groups way of thinking and conceptualizing their business is underlined by the statement: “You know I don’t really have any competitors in the fitness industry, we are both completely different from them and our customers don’t really choose between where to do fitness they choose between a (Physique, added by author) class and going out to eat, the movies or other entertainment activities”.

This realization later also shows up as major issue in keeping customers, despite the idea that
especially for Thai women in the Thai culture the institution of beauty plays a major role. Women are to a far larger extent judged on their slenderness, toned body, all aspects that institutionally should support the benefits of exactly physique 57 way of training, and provide results that would reduce “cellulites”, “floppy arms” and to big thigs and create firm bodies, flat stomach, toning and health.

The continuous decision: building models and creating connections.

The recreation of a healthy, fitness oriented and worldly lifestyle in Bangkok is a shift that in the end makes the group of entrepreneurs write an e-mail to the New York office asking for consultancy in relation to making a barre studio in Bangkok. After The new York office announce that they do not do consultancy agreements anymore, they only do franchises, but continuous “that it could be very interesting to continue the discussion as representatives of the New York office have just been at a conference in Hong Kong where it was stated that South East Asia was just about to boom in the fitness market. Based on this a continuous process of modelling a business model for the Bangkok team of entrepreneurs starts.

The skype based conversation between people in different parts of US starts. These conversation on the one hand seems to be a very practical discussion on what it takes: in terms facilities, equipment, instructors, marketing, training etc. to discussions on number of classes per day, peak times and downtimes, what was New York’s experience of speed of growth. In these discussions the entrepreneurs sincerely get the feeling that the New York office wanted us to be successful, they saved us in many areas by telling about their mistakes, their experiences and their successes. At the same time the entrepreneurs immediately starts to financially model and formalize the business in to an elaborated model that keeps expanding and becoming more and more complicated. During the continued talks the model gets modified and changed, based on both Physique 57 input but also the different perspectives from each of the entrepreneurs.

This leads to that one of the entrepreneurs after a discussion with the group starts resigning and planning to go back to Bangkok in order to fulltime work on the project. This is however, done with no formal contract actually signed or agreed. In fact the incorporation of the Physique 57 Bangkok company do not start before the cost that would be incurred by having the New York group in Bangkok.

They start preparing a Bangkok visit at the same time as they try to find locations, start a design process of the actual studio, searching for and advertising for instructors. At the Bangkok trial friends and connections from all 4 entrepreneurs are enlisted to take a trial class and interviewed about what they think. At the same time 3 locations are presented and New York agrees to the location that the Bangkok team prefer, because it seems to fit in with the image and experience both groups want to give potential and international customers.

During this process, the entrepreneurs do check for alternatives both in Barre training and similar, but they are immediately discouraged by how easy it is to get a franchise or a concept form other providers. They just needed to sign a contract and send a specified amount of money to be set up. In principle with their present assumptions, design and time spend they could take this offer and in the “abstract” model make a ‘rational’ decision alternative. For the entrepreneurs this practice gets across as “they actually did not really care if we succeeded or not! They just wanted the money and
then everything was up to us, no help, no support!” This means that all alternatives quickly vanish and are hardly considered – it becomes physique 57 or nothing.

What we see is that not only is Bangkok abstracted and translated in to a model which speaks to the financial and potential economical revenues, costs and profits. It becomes a “financial business” step by step even though actual license fees, training costs and other elements is an ongoing project to specify. It becomes an abstract and detached strategy, that can be discussed, evaluated both by themselves and others. But at the same time the model is saved and protected from challenges, because the practice of a “Physique studio is revealed, and offered as codeable knowledge” and the practical part ensures the increasing trust in the project, but without any formal decision. In this process what we see is a formative process of knowing/doing, where the business of Physique 57 Bangkok detach itself from the conversation, the statistics of South East Asian fitness usage, physical localities, special neighborhoods, and social statistics, the physical activities in the New York office – it becomes an entity in and of itself as a doing more than an expressing or contemplating (Gherardi & Perrotta, 2013, p. 233). Physique 57 Bangkok those imposes itself as:

“[…] presence that is indifferent to its specific situation in a universe that is unfolded and organized according to space and time. That is the basis of its existence. As an art of existing, it is the conquest and realization, the effective possession of this presence that is indifferent to its situation.” (Souriau, 2015, p. 143)

The existence of Physique 57 Bangkok is those there, but it doesn’t exist outside the concrete assemblage of activities, processes, actants. Without the continued work of adding a place, design, buildings, statistics, previous experience of knowing and doing from the New York office in to time tables it would not exist. Now for certain the entrepreneur Y does play a significant role as she build the financial model, based on others work, and according to the other interviewees “constant what if, and detailed questions, that at time could get me really upset….. So much that others (and in particular X) had to work as intermediaries to check that Z or Y was ok!”, but the model and the implicit strategy in it is not pressured on a blank peace of paper but rather created through intraactions of “affordances” from previously used models, opportunities and constrains in the excel sheet, “tools” that negotiate with the Y about how things can be done (Jarzabkowski & Kaplan, 2015). However, contrary to the views on strategy expressed by Chia & Holt (2009):

"The overt designs of strategists manifest in targets, positions, goals and the like are tempered with an understanding of belonging in which what is being made present is always something coming to fruition, whose limits are not well-defined end points but a bringing into being something that has not yet appeared, and that might be held together, amid other things also holding themselves together. This is what we are hinting at by considering how strategy might be made more akin to dwelling rather than just building; this is what we are reaching after with ‘strategy without design’.

What we do see is that it is the interplay, the constant moving back and forth between dwelling and building that both carry the project along but also without the building, the “existence in time and space” would vanish, it would not be possible to carry over to its own mode of existence (Latour 2013).

The strategy and the financial models when assembled through processes of assemblage, makes it
possible to move the project on to the discussion of actual license fees and legal conditions. When the actual cost of license and the contract is revealed, the price is considerably higher than they ever expected. In fact the cost as one entrepreneur stated it: “it made the cycle project look attractive, and we were suddenly a place where we had to go out and find other investors before we could sign.”

The important factor is here that by making the strategy and the financial model makes it possible to negotiate with external investors, and create a relatively speaking easy path towards getting the finances.

Those seen from a practice perspective the decision is a continuous process, where pros and cons can’t be decided inside a rational economical model of decisions. Instead accountabilities, abstractions, and practicalities, a constant movement between dwelling and building continuously push the project forward and only very late in the process creates a legal entity that can negotiate, and not before the contract offer is rally at hand almost 12 month later is a formal decision made with signatures, but here the signatures only symbolize the finalization of a mutual continuous decision process that involves, financial modelling, actual physical visits to potential sites in Bangkok, connecting to investors, designing a studio, estimating costs, preparing for the actual building, finding other instructors, resigning from jobs and the connectivities continuous and without all of these the actual business would not have found its first location, with a plan to continue to expand.

**The flat curve and suspicions.**

The financial model after the opening still exist and are still used in the continuous process of creating accountabilities and insurance for the running of the business and creating costumers. The model as a build construction and “the" representative of the entity of Physique 57, that the work “dwelled in” is shifted to the physical location, the activities of instructors, connections with IT people, people at the counter and trainers and customers. According to the entrepreneurs especially for the first 4 month the “financial model just fitted to a degree you could not imagine, it just predicted everything…”. However, for the only entrepreneur that at this stage was the only person being there on a daily basis, things changed.

“Actually, I in the process I had taken a physique 57 class in New York, and just wasn’t me. After the class I just felt like I needed to go and get run, to meet my daily fitness need….. But I could see what it was that X and Y liked about Physique, and I thought many would like it.”

But located in a new setting working in a new mode of existence, the entrepreneur realized:

“I knew nothing, I could not understand what the trainer from New York was saying, what the instructors and the trainer was discussing – I really had to start studying”

The studying meant taking classes with customers, listen in on most meetings, learning the language which seemed foreign even for a person living a fitness lifestyle and being an experienced runner. The entrepreneur those deliberately start on a journey where she knows she is standing outside of the community of practice and looking in – she so to speak becomes an apprenticeship in her own business (see Lave and Wenger, 1989). Despite her strong strategic, financial and management background all elements, which have made the process so far hard but doable, doesn’t
give the inside nor the dwelling inside the practice. The point that can be given here to the strategy-in-practice traditions critique of traditional strategy thinking and at times practice is that the distance between the strategy abstraction and the lived and located management/entrepreneurial practice becomes very hard to travel.

In the case of Physique 57 Bangkok, what does happen is that after 4 months the financial model and the actual customers. It shows in a flat line. Now the reaction from the instructors and entrepreneurs are different, varied and discussed. At the same time they start using a lot of money on traditional marketing, celebrity endorsement, magazine exposure. Things which later is considered not worth it, not for real, bad exposure because the articles don’t give the feeling of the fun, the lifestyle of healthiness etc.. The diverse perspectives is shown in 2 directions with one of the entrepreneurs pushing towards creating a higher level for the loyal costumers. The other approach comes out of a lived experience with a friend. This male friend had taken private class once and never wanted to comeback – it hurt to much. The entrepreneur Y remember the response to her question why do people not come to my classes:
“Because it is to hard, think about it like this you know that only 1% of Thais goes to the gym (him being one of them), of those 1 percent, only 10% can take your beginner class, and all the others feel like me that they failed”

The entrepreneurs also starting to notice that “people come out of the classes and they were tired, but most of them was not tired in a good way… you know like tired smiling, happy – they were just tired”. Despite sending out feedback and fast questionnaires, but the response was very low. They started calling people about scheduling their already paid classes and got the response like “no it is not for me, it is too hard, I hurt so bad after the first time” or as other customers said to the researcher – “next day I could hardly walk down the stairs”, “My body was so sore that I had to stay away from work for two days”, “I was so sore that I needed my mother to help me out of bed”.

What the above illustrates is that the organizational narrative about the costumer and the market from very early on is based on what Downing (2005, p. 193) calls a storyline, defined as: “emotional resonant stories that are remembered and repeated. They reflect the actors’ positioning of individual and collective identities and understanding of actions and events.” These storylines are inscribed into the way the organization classify statements and deal with upcoming issues on a daily basis (Douglas 1986). Client statements like “it was really hart and it hurt” (entrepreneur Y) is dealt with, by thinking “what did you expect? If it hurts that means it is working” and later added “you know, the reason why I liked it was that the pain was a sign I was getting rid of the ‘cellulitis’, yes all those things we as women don’t like”. The statement is those collectively interpreted as a plot where people do not really want to do the work and live the lives of the healthy person that transforms her body. The emplotment creates causality in a flow of processes by connecting statements and practices (Czarniawska, 1997). Part of the same emplotment of causality can be seen in another statement connected to this collective story: “I have friends that say they work out, and that they want to have a more healthy body, but at the same time they just eat unbelievable amounts, and the kind of stuff they eat is just like ….. you know!”. The storylines and plots becomes gathered it in competing narrative structures which are lived, contested and negotiated between instructors, trainer, entrepreneurs, clients and customers bodies and stories in the everyday practice of the study (Downing, 2005).
In fact the competing story lines becomes different ways of finding way or making sense of the situation. It is interesting here to notice that the strategy-as-practice has a key point. In this situation there isn’t a recourse to the abstract model and a discussion, in Chia and Holt’s (2007, p. 139) words: “instead of being something explicitly and boldly stated upfront, emerges organically, takes shape and infuses itself into the everyday actions of individuals and institutions.” There isn’t a strategy in the abstract sense of finding the goal, and then navigate towards this goal, instead there is a process of wayfinding, where the entrepreneurs, instructors and trainers, clients and customers get to know as they go. In practice in Physique 57 Bangkok, that means that they both try and learn and develop the next level called “signature” and more slowly the strategy of making a class below beginner later labelled “fundamentals”. In this paper only the fundamentals road will be illustrated.

Disciplining the body – and creating markets and customers

Slowly, in the group of instructors and trainers, entrepreneurs and other staff it became more and more obvious that when the “potential market” said they worked out, the really meant that they worked out “2 times per two weeks”, working out sometimes meant more like – about once a month. In the context of a fitness lifestyle that the entrepreneurs, the instructors, the trainer embodied really meant “I have never really trained”.

Seen from an “outside Asia perspective” this lack of training and exercise is fairly surprising as the body ideal presented in advertising, discussions, and everyday practice is very slender and thin, it could be claimed that the ideal female body has strong similarities to the western ballerina. As stated by a continuous customer for 1½ year, “I danced ballet I was 5 until 20, so when I read about Physique and that it was build on ballet, yoga and strength, I immediately came … I really wanted to get that strength and body back”. Between friends it is not unusual either to openly touch a stomach and state “ughh, you have gained weight (bumbui) – a practice that most westerners first time they experience it find intimidating and stepping over the most personal boundaries.

In the process it is never really clear when the idea of a fundamental class is developed. But it emerges out of trying to make some classes easier, creating small victories for especially the new clients to ensure that they try Physique classes 2-4 times. At the same time the instructors starts to change their instructions and talk during the classes. Suddenly in all classes the statement “at Physique we not only train your body, we train your mind as well, so (name of typically a new customer) you can do it, just keep it up and take charge”. This plot talks directly in to an everyday Theravada Buddhist tradition where mind over body, and letting go of the pain is a standard theme. It also builds on a Physique tradition, where the instructors without mentioning names states, when the exercise is getting hard: “you can take a break, but the important thing is that you comeback as quickly as you can”, interestingly the later sentence was primarily used in the beginning and continuously in the American trainers classes. Those in the classes the talk are connected to other general discourses that the customers and clients are familiar with and generally like.

The plot of being boggy – meaning to muscular – is also continuously being discussed in relation to the clients and customers, because the customers as soon as they see the dumbbells and weights fear they will be masculinized. So increasingly it is observed that the clients are told what kind of training will make the muscle lean and long, and what kind of training will make the body bulky.
The biggest change observed in the period after August is that all the instructors not only say: “Thank you for your energy! If you have any questions, please come and ask me!”, they proactively increasingly go and ask the newer clients, how they feel in their body, and the most outgoing also start explaining what they should feel in their body, and why it is important to come back.

What we are seeing is those an increased focus on educating and disciplining the clients, into a healthy lifestyle, where the client learns the difference between good pain and bad pain (injuries). Soreness is good it shows that your building strength and burning fat, and bad pains are injuries, we together must take care of in such a way you can still train. The defining moment is when the New York office send the main trainer and she also believes that the present clients have a level where they are not ready for the beginner class. The processes we are those seeing is a specific kind of formative process, where bodies, minds, instruction are gathered together in a new way of doing/knowing. By creating this formativeness of the clients, starting up the fundamental class and demanding that untrained bodies are socialized in the fundamental class for a minimum of 3 times. The clients coming are more slowly introduced to the pain, they learn to differentiate good and bad pain, and increasingly seems to feel that they now can handle it, they become tired, successful, and smiling customers, that still speak about how hard fundamental classes are and quickly gain a new proudness of what they have accomplished.

Conclusion:

In this paper I have by using a practice theory approach, shown that the agencement as a concept for practice that over time and space connect different streams of processes, bodies, interest, that create new actants, that makes it possible to conceive of an independent business. The formative process of creating bodies that can be trained is a way of creating a market where there wasn’t a market in the first place.

Litteratur:


Fletcher, D. 2006 Entrepreneurial processes and the social construction of opportunity, Entrepreneurship & Regional Development, 18: 421–440


Souriau, Etienne 2015. Inquiries Into modes of existence. Univocal. Minneapolis


---

¹ Latour 2013 does NOT use arena as a concept in his Inquiry into modes of existence. However, his question about how things are related and made to exist in places are here interpreted as a way of asking to “arenas” extension, sizes and times.